# HANDFUL OF LEAVES 1

# HANDFUL *of* LEAVES

Volume One

An Anthology from the

DIGHA NIKĀYA

Translated by

*Ṭhānissaro Bhikkhu*

*(Geoffrey DeGraff)*

*Once the Blessed One was staying at Kosambī in the siṁsapā forest. Then, picking up a few siṁsapā leaves with his hand, he asked the monks, "What do you think, monks? Which are more numerous, the few siṁsapā leaves in my hand or those overhead in the siṁsapā forest?"*

*"The leaves in the hand of the Blessed One are few in number, lord. Those overhead in the forest are far more numerous."*

*"In the same way, monks, those things that I have known with direct knowledge but haven't taught are far more numerous (than what I have taught). And why haven't I taught them? Because they aren't connected with the goal, don't relate to the rudiments of the holy life, and don't lead to disenchantment, to dispassion, to cessation, to stilling, to direct knowledge, to self-awakening, to unbinding. That's why I haven't taught them.*

*"And what have I taught? 'This is stress … This is the origination of stress … This is the cessation of stress … This is the path of practice leading to the cessation of stress': This is what I have taught. And why have I taught these things? Because they are connected with the goal, relate to the rudiments of the holy life, and lead to disenchantment, to dispassion, to cessation, to stilling, to direct knowledge, to self-awakening, to unbinding. This is why I have taught them."*

—*SN 56:31*

### Copyright 2014 Ṭhānissaro Bhikkhu, Revised edition 2017

This work is licensed under the Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial 4.0 Unported. To see a copy of this license visit http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/. "Commercial" shall mean any sale, whether for commercial or non-profit purposes or entities.

### Questions about this book may be addressed to

Metta Forest Monastery
Valley Center, CA 92082-1409
U.S.A.

### Additional resources

More Dhamma talks, books and translations by Ṭhānissaro Bhikkhu are available to download in digital audio and various ebook formats at dhammatalks.org.

### Printed copy

A paperback copy of this book is available free of charge. To request one, write to: Book Request, Metta Forest Monastery, PO Box 1409, Valley Center, CA 92082 USA.

# *Abbreviations*

| | |
|---|---|
| *AN* | *Aṅguttara Nikāya* |
| *CDB* | *The Connected Discourses of the Buddha* |
| *Cv* | *Cullavagga* |
| *Dhp* | *Dhammapada* |
| *DhpA* | *Dhammapada Commentary* |
| *DN* | *Dīgha Nikāya* |
| *GS* | *The Book of Gradual Sayings* |
| *Iti* | *Itivuttaka* |
| *Khp* | *Khuddakapāṭha* |
| *KS* | *The Book of Kindred Sayings* |
| *LDB* | *The Long Discourses of the Buddha* |
| *MLDB* | *The Middle Length Discourses of the Buddha* |
| *MLS* | *The Collection of the Middle Length Sayings* |
| *MN* | *Majjhima Nikāya* |
| *Mv* | *Mahāvagga* |
| *Nd I* | *Mahāniddesa* |
| *Nd II* | *Cullaniddesa* |
| *NDB* | *The Numerical Discourses of the Buddha* |
| *PTS* | *Pali Text Society* |
| *Pv* | *Petavatthu* |
| *SN* | *Saṁyutta Nikāya* |
| *Sn* | *Sutta Nipāta* |

| | |
|---|---|
| *Thag* | *Theragāthā* |
| *Thig* | *Therīgāthā* |
| *Ud* | *Udāna* |

*References to DN, Iti, and MN are to discourse (sutta). Those to Dhp are to verse. Those to Cv and Mv are to chapter, section, and sub-section. References to other texts are to section (saṁyutta, nipāta, or vagga) and discourse.*

*An "A" after any of these abbreviations denotes the Commentary (Aṭṭhakathā) to that text.*

*All translations are based on the Royal Thai Edition of the Pali Canon (Bangkok: Mahāmakut Rājavidyālaya, 1982).*

## Other abbreviations:

| | |
|---|---|
| *ChU* | *Chāndogya Upaniṣad* |
| *GD* | *The Group of Discourses* |

# *Acknowledgements*

In early 1996, John Bullitt asked me to provide a few translations from the Pali Canon for his fledgling website, Access to Insight. What began as a casual project quickly grew to a major production in the years 1997–98, as the positive response to the initial translations showed a widespread desire for clear, reliable English translations of the Buddha's teachings, available free of charge. Although I have pursued other projects in the years since, I have continued providing translations as time has allowed. Currently the sutta translations on Access to Insight number more than 1,000, most of them mine. The website as a whole—thanks to John's scrupulous care and selfless gift of his time—has become a premier source for people all over the world who are interested in reliable reading materials on the Theravāda tradition.

Now that John's interests have moved in another direction, Access to Insight is currently closed to new input. As a result, I have decided to gather my translations of suttas from the Dīgha, Majjhima, Saṁyutta, Aṅguttara, and Khuddaka Nikāyas on Access to Insight, plus new translations of suttas done since the website was frozen, and offer them in the format of sutta anthologies that will be available on the website, Dhammatalks.org. I expect that these anthologies will grow as I find time to translate even more suttas.

In preparing these anthologies, I have taken the opportunity to standardize the translations as much as possible, bringing my earlier translations into line with more recent ones and making them more accurate. Vens. Guṇaddho Bhikkhu, Khematto Bhikkhu, Vijjākaro Bhikkhu, and Kusalī Bhikkhu, along with Isabella Trauttmansdorff, have been especially helpful in this part of the endeavor. Any mistakes that remain in these volumes are entirely my own. If you notice any, please inform me so that they can be corrected in the future.

Please also note that the translations in these anthologies supplant both the versions available on Access to Insight and those in the anthologies of

my sutta translations printed under the name *Handful of Leaves* in the years 2002–2007.

Peace.

*Ṭhānissaro Bhikkhu*
*(Geoffrey DeGraff)*

METTA FOREST MONASTERY
VALLEY CENTER, CA 92082–1409 USA
APRIL, 2014

# *Introduction*

This volume is the first in a four-volume anthology of suttas (discourses) drawn from the Sutta Piṭaka (Discourse Basket or Repository) of the Pali Canon. This volume contains suttas drawn from the first of the five collections comprising the Sutta Piṭaka: the Dīgha Nikāya, or Long Collection. Suttas from the next three collections—the Majjhima Nikāya (Middle Collection), Saṁyutta Nikāya (Connected Collection), and Aṅguttara Nikāya (Numerical Collection)—constitute the remaining three volumes of the anthology. As for the fifth collection, the Khuddaka Nikāya (Short Collection), complete translations of the first five books—the Khuddakapāṭha, Dhammapada, Udāna, Itivuttaka, and Sutta Nipāta—have been published separately, as has an anthology drawn from the Theragāthā and Therīgāthā.

The suttas I have selected and translated for these volumes were chosen for the interest they might hold for a person intent on understanding and practicing the Buddhist teachings, or Dhamma. Some have been chosen for their detailed discussions of basic doctrines; others, for the vivid stories or similes they use to illustrate those doctrines. Although they constitute only a small portion of the Sutta Piṭaka, taken together they present a fairly comprehensive picture of the Piṭaka's essential teachings.

And it's a remarkable picture. The Buddha as portrayed in the suttas is one of the most inspiring human beings imaginable: noble, brave, and compassionate in his character; precise, helpful, and profound in his teachings. The teachings, too, are remarkable. In addition to asserting the ability of human beings to bring about their own happiness, they also offer a program of training to direct that ability to the Deathless: the total transcendence of all suffering and stress.

The Theravāda tradition, dominant in Sri Lanka, Myanmar, and Thailand, regards these suttas as the authentic and authoritative record of the Buddha's own words. When Western scholars—piqued by issues of authority and authenticity—first learned of these claims in the 19th

century, they began employing the historical method to test them. And although every conceivable scrap of literary or archaeological evidence seems to have been examined, no air-tight historical proof or disproof of these claims has surfaced. What has surfaced is a mass of minor facts and probabilities—showing that the Pali Canon is probably the closest detailed record we have of the Buddha's teachings—but nothing more certain than that.

Archaeological evidence shows that Pali was probably not the Buddha's native language, but is this proof that he did not use Pali when talking to native speakers of that language?

The Canon contains grammatical irregularities, but are these signs of an early stage in the language, before it was standardized, or a later stage of degeneration? And in which stage of the language's development did the Buddha's life fall?

Fragments of other early Buddhist canons have been found, with slight deviations from the Pali Canon in their wording, but not in their basic doctrines. Is their unanimity in doctrine a sign that they all come from the Buddha himself, or was it the product of a later conspiracy to remake and standardize the doctrine in line with changed beliefs and tastes?

Brick and stone remains from the types of monasteries described in the early canons date back only to the beginning of the Common Era. Does this mean that the canons were not composed earlier, or do these remains simply indicate when brick and stone monasteries became popular?

Scholars have been eager to take sides on these issues, but the inevitable use of inference, conjecture, and probabilities in their arguments lends an air of uncertainty to the whole process.

Many have seen this uncertainty as sign of the inadequacy of the Theravadin claims to authenticity, but simply to dismiss the teachings of the suttas for this reason would be to deprive ourselves of the opportunity to test their practical worth. Perhaps we should instead question the methods of the historians, and view the uncertainty of their conclusions as a sign of the inadequacy of the historical method as a tool for ascertaining the true Dhamma. The suttas themselves make this point in their own recommendations for how the authenticity and authority of the Dhamma is best ascertained. In a famous passage, they quote the Buddha as saying:

> "Kālāmas, don't go by reports, by legends, by traditions, by scripture, by logical conjecture, by inference, by analogies, by agreement through pondering views, by probability, or by the thought, 'This contemplative is our teacher.' When you know for yourselves that, 'These dhammas are unskillful; these dhammas are blameworthy; these dhammas are criticized by the wise; these dhammas, when adopted & carried out, lead to harm & to suffering'—then you should abandon them.… When you know for yourselves that, 'These dhammas are skillful; these dhammas are blameless; these dhammas are praised by the wise; these dhammas, when adopted & carried out, lead to welfare & to happiness'—then you should enter & remain in them." – *AN 3:65*

Because this passage is contained in a religious scripture, the statements attracting the most attention have been those rejecting the authority of religious teachers, legends, traditions, and scripture; along with those insisting on the importance of knowing for oneself. These remarkably anti-dogmatic statements—sometimes termed the Buddha's Charter of Free Inquiry—have tended to divert attention from the severe strictures that the passage places on what "knowing for oneself" entails. In questioning the authority of reports, it dismisses the basic material on which the historical method is based. In questioning the authority of inference and probability, it dismisses some of the method's basic techniques. In questioning the authority of logical conjecture, analogies, and agreement through pondering views, it dismisses the methods of free-thinking rationalism in general.

This leaves only two methods for ascertaining the Dhamma, both of them related to the question raised in this passage and central to other teachings in the Canon: What is skillful, what is unskillful? In developing any skill, you must (1) pay attention to the results of your own actions; and (2) listen to those who have already mastered the skill. Similarly, in ascertaining the Dhamma, you must (1) examine the results that come from putting a particular teaching into practice; and (2) check those results against the opinions of the wise.

Two aspects of the Dhamma, however, make it a skill apart. The first is reflected in the fact that the word Dhamma means not only teaching, but also quality of the mind. Thus the above passage could also be translated:

> "When you know for yourselves that, 'These qualities are unskillful; these qualities are blameworthy; these qualities are criticized by the wise; these qualities, when adopted & carried out, lead to harm & to suffering'—then you should abandon them.... When you know for yourselves that, 'These qualities are skillful; these qualities are blameless; these qualities are praised by the wise; these qualities, when adopted & carried out, lead to welfare & to happiness'—then you should enter & remain in them."

In fact, this would appear to be a more accurate translation, as the discussion following this passage focuses on the results of acting on qualities of the mind: greed, aversion, and delusion in the unskillful set; and lack of greed, lack of aversion, and lack of delusion in the skillful one. This points to the fact that Dhamma practice is primarily a skill of the mind.

The second aspect that sets the Dhamma apart as a skill is its goal: nothing less than the total ending of suffering.

While this second aspect of the Dhamma makes it an attractive skill to master, the first aspect presents difficulties in determining who has mastered the skill and is thus qualified to speak about it with authority. After all, we can't look into the minds of others to see what qualities are there and what the internal results of the practice are. At best, we can detect hints of these things in their actions, but nothing more. Thus, if we look to others for the last word on the Dhamma, we will always be in a position of uncertainty. The only way to overcome uncertainty is to practice the Dhamma to see if it brings about an end to suffering within our own minds.

Traditionally, the texts state that uncertainty about the Dhamma ends only with the attainment of stream-entry, the first of the four levels of awakening. Even though a person who has reached this level of awakening is not totally free from suffering, he/she has seen enough of the end of suffering to know without a doubt that that is where the practice of the Dhamma leads. So it is not surprising that the four factors the suttas identify as bringing about stream-entry are also the four methods they recommend for ascertaining whether they themselves are a truly authoritative and authentic guide to the end of suffering.

Those factors, listed in SN 55:5, are:

> association with people of integrity,
> listening to the true Dhamma,
> appropriate attention, and
> practice in accordance with the Dhamma.

Passages from the suttas dealing with each of these factors help show how the two sources of skill—the counsel of the wise and the lessons learned by observing the results of your own actions—can be properly balanced and integrated so as to ascertain what the true Dhamma is. And because listening to the true Dhamma now includes reading the true Dhamma, a knowledge of these factors and their interrelationships gives guidance in how to read the suttas collected in these volumes. In particular, these factors show how the suttas themselves say they should be read, and what other actions provide the skillful context for getting the most benefit from reading them.

As you explore the explanations of these factors, you find that their presentation as a short list is deceptively simple, inasmuch as each factor contains elements of the other factors as well. For instance, associating with people of integrity is of great help in practicing the Dhamma, but for a person to recognize people of genuine integrity requires that he or she have some experience in practicing the Dhamma. Thus, although the form of the list suggests a simple linear progression, the individual factors of the list are inter-related in complex ways. What this means in practice is that the process of ascertaining the Dhamma is a complex one, requiring sensitivity and discernment in balancing and integrating the factors in an appropriate way.

### Association with people of integrity

Because the Dhamma consists primarily of qualities of the mind, any written account of the Dhamma is only a pale shadow of the real thing. Thus, to gain a sense of the Dhamma's full dimensions, you need to find people who embody the Dhamma in their thoughts, words, and deeds, and associate with them in a way that enables you to absorb as much of that embodied Dhamma as possible. The passages explaining this factor thus offer advice in two areas: how to recognize people of integrity and how best to associate with them once you have found them.

The immediate sign of integrity is gratitude.

> "A person of integrity is grateful & acknowledges the help given to him. This gratitude, this acknowledgment is second nature among admirable people. It is entirely on the level of people of integrity." – *AN 2:31*

Gratitude is a necessary sign of integrity in that people who don't recognize and value the goodness and integrity in others are unlikely to make the effort to develop integrity within themselves. On its own, though, gratitude does not constitute integrity. The essence of integrity lies in three qualities: truth, harmlessness, and discernment.

> "There is the case where a monk lives in dependence on a certain village or town. Then a householder or householder's son goes to him and observes him with regard to three qualities—qualities based on greed, qualities based on aversion, qualities based on delusion: 'Are there in this venerable one any such qualities based on greed… aversion… delusion that, with his mind overcome by these qualities, he might say, "I know," while not knowing, or say, "I see," while not seeing; or that he might urge another to act in a way that was for his/her long-term harm & pain?' As he observes him, he comes to know, 'There are in this venerable one no such qualities based on greed… aversion… delusion.… His bodily behavior & verbal behavior are those of one not greedy… not aversive… not deluded. And the Dhamma he teaches is deep, hard to see, hard to realize, tranquil, refined, beyond the scope of conjecture, subtle, to-be-experienced by the wise." – *MN 95*

As this passage shows, knowledge of a person's truthfulness requires that you be so observant of his/her behavior that you can confidently infer the quality of his/her mind. This level of confidence, in turn, requires that you not only be observant, but also discerning and willing to take time, for as another passage points out, the appearance of spiritual integrity is easy to fake.

> Then King Pasenadi Kosala went to the Blessed One and, on arrival, having bowed down to him, sat to one side. Then seven coiled-hair ascetics, seven Jain ascetics, seven naked ascetics, seven one-cloth ascetics, & seven wanderers—their nails grown long, their body-hair grown long—walked past not far from the Blessed One.… On seeing them, King Pasenadi arranged his upper robe over one shoulder, knelt down with his right knee on the ground, saluted the ascetics with his hands before his heart, and announced his name to them three times: "I am the king, venerable sirs, Pasenadi Kosala. I am the king, venerable sirs, Pasenadi Kosala. I am the king, venerable sirs, Pasenadi Kosala." Then not long after the ascetics had passed, he returned to the Blessed One and, on arrival, having bowed down to him, sat to one side. As he was sitting there he said to the Blessed One, "Of those in the world who are arahants or on the path to arahantship, are these among them?"
>
> "Your majesty, as a layman enjoying sensual pleasures; living crowded with wives & children; using Kāsi fabrics and sandalwood; wearing garlands, scents, & creams; handling gold & silver, it is hard for you to know whether these are arahants or on the path to arahantship.
>
> [1] "It's through living together that a person's virtue may be known, and then only after a long period, not a short period; by one who is attentive, not by one who is inattentive; by one who is discerning, not by one who is not discerning.
>
> [2] "It's through trading with a person that his purity may be known, and then only after a long period, not a short period; by one who is attentive, not by one who is inattentive; by one who is discerning, not by one who is not discerning.
>
> [3] "It's through adversity that a person's endurance may be known, and then only after a long period, not a short period; by one who is

attentive, not by one who is inattentive; by one who is discerning, not by one who is not discerning.

[4] "It's through discussion that a person's discernment may be known, and then only after a long period, not a short period; by one who is attentive, not by one who is inattentive; by one who is discerning, not by one who is not discerning."

"How amazing, lord! How astounding! How well that was put by the Blessed One! … These men, lord, are my spies, my scouts, returning after going out through the countryside. They go out first, and then I go. Now, when they have scrubbed off the dirt & mud, are well-bathed & well-perfumed, have trimmed their hair & beards, and have put on white clothes, they will go about endowed and provided with the five strings of sensuality." – *Ud 6:2*

AN 4:192 expands on these points and indicates that the ability to recognize a person of integrity requires you to have a strong sense of integrity yourself. In fact, MN 110 insists that you must be a person of integrity in your actions, views, and friendships if you are to recognize integrity in another.

### Listening to the True Dhamma

Once you have determined to the best of your ability that certain people embody integrity, the suttas advise listening to their Dhamma, both to learn *about* them—to further test their integrity—and to learn *from* them, to gain a sense of what the Dhamma might be. And again, the suttas recommend both how to listen to the Dhamma and how to recognize true Dhamma when you hear it.

MN 95 recommends that you spend time near people of integrity, develop a sense of respect for them, and pay close attention to their Dhamma.

SN 6:2 and AN 8:2 explain the purpose for respect here: it's a prerequisite for learning. Neither passage elaborates on this point, but its truth is fairly obvious. You find it easier to learn from someone you respect than from someone you don't. Respect is what opens your mind and loosens your preconceived opinions to make room for new knowledge and

skills. This is especially important in mastering the skills of the Dhamma, for they involve overcoming your attachment to views and conceit. At the same time, a person with a valuable teaching to offer will feel more inclined to teach it to someone who shows respect than to someone who doesn't.

However, respect does not necessarily mean giving your full approval to the teaching. After all, part of the purpose in listening to the Dhamma is to test whether the person teaching the Dhamma has integrity in his/her views. Full approval can come only when you have put the teaching in practice and tasted its results. This is why the Vinaya, the monastic discipline, never requires that a student take vows of obedience to a teacher. Here respect means, in the words of Sn 2:9, a lack of stubbornness. Or, in the words of AN 6:88, "the patience to comply with the teaching": the willingness to listen with an open mind and to take the time and effort needed to give any teachings that seem reasonable a serious try.

The reasonability of the teaching can be gauged by the central principle in views of integrity as explained above in MN 110. That principle is conviction in kamma, the efficacy of human action: that people are responsible for their actions, that their intentions determine the quality—the skillfulness or unskillfulness—of their actions, that actions give results, and that the quality of the action determines the quality of the result. A person who does not believe in these principles cannot be trusted.

Because the distinction between skillfulness and unskillfulness is central to the principle of kamma—and also to the project of putting an end to suffering and stress—MN 135 recommends approaching potential teachers and asking them:

> "What is skillful? What is unskillful? What is blameworthy? What is blameless? What should be cultivated? What should not be cultivated? What, having been done by me, will be for my long-term harm & suffering? Or what, having been done by me, will be for my long-term welfare & happiness?"

The texts give a few examples of what might be called the lowest common denominator for judging whether answers to this question embody integrity. In essence, these teachings constitute "what works" in eliminating blatant levels of suffering and stress in one's life.

"Now what is unskillful? Taking life is unskillful, taking what is not given… sexual misconduct… lying… abusive speech… divisive tale-bearing… idle chatter is unskillful. Covetousness… ill will… wrong views are unskillful. These things are termed unskillful.

"And what are the roots of unskillful things? Greed is a root of unskillful things, aversion is a root of unskillful things, delusion is a root of unskillful things. These are termed the roots of unskillful things.

"And what is skillful? Abstaining from taking life is skillful, abstaining from taking what is not given… from sexual misconduct… from lying… from abusive speech… from divisive tale-bearing… abstaining from idle chatter is skillful. Lack of covetousness… lack of ill will… right views are skillful. These things are termed skillful.

"And what are the roots of skillful things? Lack of greed is a root of skillful things, lack of aversion is a root of skillful things, lack of delusion is a root of skillful things. These are termed the roots of skillful things." – *MN 9*

"These three things have been promulgated by wise people, by people who are truly good. Which three? Generosity… going-forth [from the home life]… & service to one's mother & father. These three things have been promulgated by wise people, by people who are truly good." – *AN 3:45*

However, the true Dhamma has a dimension going far beyond the lowest common denominator. To repeat the words of MN 95, it is "deep, hard to see, hard to realize, tranquil, refined, beyond the scope of conjecture, subtle, to-be-experienced by the wise." The principle of skillfulness—of cause and effect that can be tested in your own actions—still applies in this dimension, but the standards for "what works" on this level are correspondingly subtler and more refined. Two famous passages indicate what these standards are.

"Gotamī, the dhammas of which you may know, 'These dhammas lead—

to passion, not to dispassion;

to being fettered, not to being unfettered;
to accumulating, not to shedding;
to self-aggrandizement, not to modesty;
to discontent, not to contentment;
to entanglement, not to seclusion;
to laziness, not to aroused persistence;
to being burdensome, not to being unburdensome':
You may categorically hold, 'This is not the Dhamma, this is not the Vinaya, this is not the Teacher's instruction.'

"As for the dhammas of which you may know, 'These dhammas lead—
to dispassion, not to passion;
to being unfettered, not to being fettered;
to shedding, not to accumulating;
to modesty, not to self-aggrandizement;
to contentment, not to discontent;
to seclusion, not to entanglement;
to aroused persistence, not to laziness;
to being unburdensome, not to being burdensome':
You may categorically hold, 'This is the Dhamma, this is the Vinaya, this is the Teacher's instruction.'" – *AN 8:53*

"Upāli, the dhammas of which you may know, 'These dhammas do not lead to utter disenchantment, to dispassion, to cessation, to calm, to direct knowledge, to self-awakening, nor to unbinding': You may categorically hold, 'This is not the Dhamma, this is not the Vinaya, this is not the Teacher's instruction.'

"As for the dhammas of which you may know, 'These dhammas lead to utter disenchantment, to dispassion, to cessation, to calm, to direct knowledge, to self-awakening, to unbinding': You may categorically hold, 'This is the Dhamma, this is the Vinaya, this is the Teacher's instruction.'" – *AN 7:80*

AN 8:30 expands on some of the principles in the first of these two passages. But here we will focus on the points where these two passages intersect—in the requirement that the Dhamma lead to dispassion and to

being unfettered—for the standard test for a genuine experience of awakening is that it arises from dispassion and cuts the fetters of the mind.

> "There are these ten fetters. Which ten? Five lower fetters & five higher fetters. And which are the five lower fetters? Self-identification views, uncertainty, grasping at habits & practices, sensual desire, and ill will. These are the five lower fetters. And which are the five higher fetters? Passion for form, passion for what is formless, conceit, restlessness, and ignorance. These are the five higher fetters." – *AN 10:13*

As MN 118 explains, stream-entry cuts the first three fetters; once-returning, the second level of awakening, weakens passion, aversion, and delusion; non-returning, the third level, cuts the fetters of sensual desire and ill will; and arahantship, the final level of awakening, cuts the remaining five.

Ultimately, of course, the only proof for whether a teaching leads in this direction comes when, having put the teaching into practice, you actually begin to cut these fetters from the mind. But as a preliminary exercise, you can contemplate a teaching to make sense of it and to see if there are good reasons for believing that it will lead in the right direction.

> "Hearing the Dhamma, one remembers it. Remembering it, one penetrates the meaning of those dhammas. Penetrating the meaning, one comes to an agreement through pondering those dhammas. There being an agreement through pondering those dhammas, desire arises. With the arising of desire, one becomes willing. Willing, he contemplates [lit: 'weighs,' 'compares']." – *MN 95*

The process of pondering, weighing, and comparing the teachings is based on adopting the right attitude and asking the right questions about them. As AN 2:25 points out, some of the teachings are meant to have their meaning inferred, whereas others are not, and to misapprehend which of these two classes a particular teaching belongs to is a serious mistake. This is where the next factor for stream-entry plays a role.

### Appropriate attention

MN 2 draws the line between appropriate and inappropriate attention on the basis of the questions you choose to pursue in contemplating the Dhamma.

> "There is the case where an uninstructed, run-of-the-mill person… doesn't discern what ideas are fit for attention, or what ideas are unfit for attention.… This is how he attends inappropriately: 'Was I in the past? Was I not in the past? What was I in the past? How was I in the past? Having been what, what was I in the past? Shall I be in the future? Shall I not be in the future? What shall I be in the future? How shall I be in the future? Having been what, what shall I be in the future?' Or else he is inwardly perplexed about the immediate present: 'Am I? Am I not? What am I? How am I? Where has this being come from? Where is it bound?'
>
> "As he attends inappropriately in this way, one of six kinds of view arises in him: The view *I have a self* arises in him as true & established, or the view *I have no self*… or the view *It is precisely by means of self that I perceive self*… or the view *It is precisely by means of self that I perceive not-self*… or the view *It is precisely by means of not-self that I perceive self* arises in him as true & established, or else he has a view like this: *This very self of mine—the knower that is sensitive here & there to the ripening of good & bad actions—is the self of mine that is constant, everlasting, eternal, not subject to change, and will endure as long as eternity.* This is called a thicket of views, a wilderness of views, a contortion of views, a writhing of views, a fetter of views. Bound by a fetter of views, the uninstructed run-of-the-mill person is not freed from birth, aging, & death, from sorrow, lamentation, pain, distress, & despair. He is not freed, I tell you, from stress.
>
> "The well-instructed disciple of the noble ones… discerns what ideas are fit for attention, and what ideas are unfit for attention.… He attends appropriately, *This is stress … This is the origination of stress … This is the cessation of stress … This is the way leading to the cessation of stress.* As he attends appropriately in this way, three fetters are abandoned in him: self-identification views, uncertainty, and grasping at habits & practices." – *MN 2*

Some of the most useless controversies in the history of Buddhist thought have come from ignoring this teaching on what is and is not an appropriate object for attention. Buddhists have debated fruitlessly for centuries, and continue to debate today, on how to define a person's identity—the answer to the question, "What am I?"—or whether a person does or does not have a self—the answer to the questions, "Am I? Am I not?" The fruitlessness of these arguments has proven repeatedly the point made by this passage: that any answer to these questions leads to entanglement in the fetters that the Dhamma is meant to cut away.

To avoid these controversies, the passage recommends focusing on four truths that constitute the appropriate object for attention—stress, its origination, its cessation, and the way leading to its cessation. These truths are directly related to the question of skillfulness, which divides reality into two sets of variables: cause and effect, skillful and unskillful. The origination of stress is an unskillful cause, and stress its result. The way leading to the cessation of stress is a skillful cause, and the cessation of stress its result. To look at experience in terms of these four truths is to attend appropriately in a way that can help cut the fetters underlying unskillfulness in the mind.

Appropriate attention, however, doesn't stop with just looking. It also carries an imperative of looking in a way that falls in line with the duties appropriate for each of the truths, as stated in SN 56:11: Stress is to be comprehended, its origination abandoned, its cessation realized, and the path to its cessation developed.

For instance, SN 56:11 defines the truth of stress as the five clinging-aggregates. SN 22:23 defines comprehension as knowledge that ends passion, aversion, and delusion with regard to the clinging. As SN 22:112 shows, this, too, is a function of appropriate attention.

> "A virtuous monk should attend in an appropriate way to the five clinging-aggregates as inconstant, stressful, a disease, a cancer, an arrow, painful, an affliction, alien, a dissolution, an emptiness, not-self. Which five? The form clinging-aggregate, the feeling clinging-aggregate, the perception clinging-aggregate, the fabrications clinging-aggregate, the consciousness clinging-aggregate. A virtuous monk should attend in an appropriate way to these five clinging-

aggregates as inconstant, stressful, a disease, a cancer, an arrow, painful, an affliction, alien, a dissolution, an emptiness, not-self. For it is possible that a virtuous monk, attending in an appropriate way to these five clinging-aggregates as inconstant… not-self, would realize the fruit of stream-entry."

Similarly, SN 46:51 notes that appropriate attention involves looking at qualities that foster the factors for awakening in a way that helps to develop them, and looking at the qualities that counteract the hindrances in a way that helps to starve the hindrances. In this way, appropriate attention is a tool in developing the path and abandoning the origination of stress.

*The factors for awakening.* "Now, what is the food for the arising of unarisen *mindfulness* as a factor for awakening, or for the growth & increase of mindfulness as a factor for awakening once it has arisen? There are qualities that act as a foothold for mindfulness as a factor for awakening [well-purified virtue & views made straight]. To foster appropriate attention to them: This is the food for the arising of unarisen mindfulness as a factor for awakening, or for the growth & increase of mindfulness as a factor for awakening once it has arisen.

"And what is the food for the arising of unarisen *analysis of qualities* as a factor for awakening, or for the growth & increase of analysis of qualities… once it has arisen? There are qualities that are skillful & unskillful, blameworthy & blameless, gross & refined, siding with darkness & with light. To foster appropriate attention to them: This is the food for the arising of unarisen analysis of qualities as a factor for awakening, or for the growth & increase of analysis of qualities… once it has arisen.

"And what is the food for the arising of unarisen *persistence* as a factor for awakening, or for the growth & increase of persistence… once it has arisen? There is the potential for effort, the potential for exertion, the potential for striving. To foster appropriate attention to them: This is the food for the arising of unarisen persistence as a factor for awakening, or for the growth & increase of persistence… once it has arisen.

"And what is the food for the arising of unarisen *rapture* as a factor for awakening, or for the growth & increase of rapture… once it has

arisen? There are qualities that act as a foothold for rapture as a factor for awakening. To foster appropriate attention to them: This is the food for the arising of unarisen rapture as a factor for awakening, or for the growth & increase of rapture… once it has arisen.

"And what is the food for the arising of unarisen *calm* as a factor for awakening, or for the growth & increase of calm… once it has arisen? There is physical calm & there is mental calm. To foster appropriate attention to them: This is the food for the arising of unarisen calm as a factor for awakening, or for the growth & increase of calm… once it has arisen.

"And what is the food for the arising of unarisen *concentration* as a factor for awakening, or for the growth & increase of concentration… once it has arisen? There are themes for calm, themes for non-distraction [these are the four establishings of mindfulness—see MN 44]. To foster appropriate attention to them: This is the food for the arising of unarisen concentration as a factor for awakening, or for the growth & increase of concentration… once it has arisen.

"And what is the food for the arising of unarisen *equanimity* as a factor for awakening, or for the growth & increase of equanimity… once it has arisen? There are qualities that act as a foothold for equanimity as a factor for awakening. To foster appropriate attention to them: This is the food for the arising of unarisen equanimity as a factor for awakening, or for the growth & increase of equanimity as a factor for awakening once it has arisen.

*The hindrances.* "Now, what is lack of food for the arising of unarisen *sensual desire,* or for the growth & increase of sensual desire once it has arisen? There is the theme of unattractiveness. To foster appropriate attention to it: This is lack of food for the arising of unarisen sensual desire, or for the growth & increase of sensual desire once it has arisen.

"And what is lack of food for the arising of unarisen *ill will,* or for the growth & increase of ill will once it has arisen? There is awareness-release [through good will, compassion, empathetic joy, or equanimity]. To foster appropriate attention to that: This is lack of

food for the arising of unarisen ill will, or for the growth & increase of ill will once it has arisen.

"And what is lack of food for the arising of unarisen *sloth & drowsiness,* or for the growth & increase of sloth & drowsiness once it has arisen? There is the potential for effort, the potential for exertion, the potential for striving. To foster appropriate attention to them: This is lack of food for the arising of unarisen sloth & drowsiness, or for the growth & increase of sloth & drowsiness once it has arisen.

"And what is lack of food for the arising of unarisen *restlessness & anxiety,* or for the growth & increase of restlessness & anxiety once it has arisen? There is stillness of awareness. To foster appropriate attention to that: This is lack of food for the arising of unarisen restlessness & anxiety, or for the growth & increase of restlessness & anxiety once it has arisen.

"And what is lack of food for the arising of unarisen *uncertainty,* or for the growth & increase of uncertainty once it has arisen? There are qualities that are skillful & unskillful, blameworthy & blameless, gross & refined, siding with darkness & with light. To foster appropriate attention to them: This is lack of food for the arising of unarisen uncertainty, or for the growth & increase of uncertainty once it has arisen."

Thus appropriate attention provides a framework for looking at the Dhamma not only as it is presented in a teaching, but also as it presents itself directly—as dhammas—as experiences encountered by the mind. And the framework doesn't stop with the act of looking: The way you look is actually a type of kamma that, when done appropriately, shapes those experiences in a way that promotes the goal of the practice. In this way appropriate attention shades into the fourth factor for stream-entry.

### Practice in accordance with the Dhamma

Once you have gained a sense of the Dhamma and the duties it entails through appropriate attention, the remaining step is to practice in accordance with the Dhamma so as to bring those duties to completion. The suttas define this step as follows:

> "If a monk practices for the sake of disenchantment, dispassion, & cessation with regard to aging-&-death… birth… becoming… clinging/sustenance… craving… feeling… contact… the six sense media… name-&-form… consciousness… fabrications… ignorance, he deserves to be called a monk who practices the Dhamma in accordance with the Dhamma." – *SN 12:67*

> "For a monk practicing the Dhamma in accordance with the Dhamma, what accords with the Dhamma is this: that he keep cultivating disenchantment with regard to form, that he keep cultivating disenchantment with regard to feeling, that he keep cultivating disenchantment with regard to perception, that he keep cultivating disenchantment with regard to fabrications, that he keep cultivating disenchantment with regard to consciousness." – *SN 22:39*

SN 22:40–41 add that this is to be done by remaining focused on stress, inconstancy, and not-self with regard to the five aggregates.

As with the first two factors for stream-entry, the ability to develop dispassion for things that ordinarily incite passion requires a twofold practice: adapting your actions to follow in line with the Dhamma (rather than trying to adapt the Dhamma to follow your own preferences), and refining your understanding of the Dhamma as it is tested in experience.

MN 61 offers explicit instructions on how this is to be done.

> "What do you think, Rāhula: What is a mirror for?"
>
> "For reflection, sir."
>
> "In the same way, Rāhula, bodily actions, verbal actions, & mental actions are to be done with repeated reflection.
>
> "Whenever you want to perform a bodily action, you should reflect on it: 'This bodily action I want to perform—would it lead to self-affliction, to the affliction of others, or to both? Is it an unskillful bodily action, with painful consequences, painful results?' If, on reflection, you know that it would lead to self-affliction, to the affliction of others, or to both; it would be an unskillful bodily action with painful consequences, painful results, then any bodily action of that sort is absolutely unfit for you to do. But if on reflection you

know that it would not cause affliction… it would be a skillful bodily action with happy consequences, happy results, then any bodily act of that sort is fit for you to do.

"While you are performing a bodily action, you should reflect on it: 'This bodily action I am doing—is it leading to self-affliction, to the affliction of others, or to both? Is it an unskillful bodily action, with painful consequences, painful results?' If, on reflection, you know that it is leading to self-affliction, to affliction of others, or both… you should give it up. But if on reflection you know that it is not… you may continue with it.

"Having performed a bodily action, you should reflect on it… If, on reflection, you know that it led to self-affliction, to the affliction of others, or to both; it was an unskillful bodily action with painful consequences, painful results, then you should confess it, reveal it, lay it open to the Teacher or to a knowledgeable companion in the holy life. Having confessed it… you should exercise restraint in the future. But if on reflection you know that it did not lead to affliction… it was a skillful bodily action with happy consequences, happy results, then you should stay mentally refreshed & joyful, training day & night in skillful qualities.

[Similarly for verbal actions and mental actions, although the final paragraph concerning mental actions says:]

"Having performed a mental action, you should reflect on it.… If, on reflection, you know that it led to self-affliction, to the affliction of others, or to both; it was an unskillful mental action with painful consequences, painful results, then you should feel distressed, ashamed, & disgusted with it. Feeling distressed… you should exercise restraint in the future. But if on reflection you know that it did not lead to affliction… it was a skillful mental action with happy consequences, happy results, then you should stay mentally refreshed & joyful, training day & night in skillful qualities." – *MN 61*

The process of self-examination recommended in this passage includes the principles discussed under the first three factors for stream-entry. You pay appropriate attention to your own intentions and actions, and to their results, to see whether they qualify as skillful or unskillful. If you notice

that any of your bodily or verbal actions have led to harmful results, you approach a person of integrity and listen to his/her advice. In this way you combine the two principles that Iti 16–17 recommend as the most helpful internal and external principles for awakening: appropriate attention and friendship with admirable people. It's no coincidence that these are precisely the two principles recommended in the discourse to the Kālāmas.

Self-examination of this sort, however, shares yet another feature with the first factor for stream-entry: the need for integrity. Just as your integrity is a prerequisite for your ability to detect integrity in others, so too it is a prerequisite for your ability to gauge the true nature of your intentions and the results of your actions. These are commonly the two areas of experience where people are least honest with themselves. Yet, for your practice to accord with the Dhamma, you must resist any habitual tendency to be less than totally scrupulous about them. This is why, as a preface to the above advice, the sutta shows the Buddha lecturing on the importance of truthfulness as the most essential quality for a person on the path.

Although Rāhula reportedly received the above advice when he was a child, MN 19 maintains that the principles it contains can lead all the way to full awakening. This means, of course, that they can lead to the first level of awakening, which is stream-entry.

Stream-entry is often called the arising of the Dhamma eye. What stream-enterers see with this Dhamma eye is always expressed in the same terms:

> Then Ven. Assaji gave this exposition of Dhamma to Sāriputta the wanderer:
>
> "Whatever phenomena arise from a cause:
> their cause
> & their cessation.
> Such is the teaching of the Tathāgata,
> the Great Contemplative."
>
> Then to Sāriputta the wanderer, as he heard this exposition of Dhamma, there arose the dustless, stainless Dhamma eye: "*Whatever is subject to origination is all subject to cessation.*" – *Mv I.23.5*

A subsequent passage shows that the concept "all that is subject to origination" occurs in conjunction with a glimpse of what stands in opposition to "all that is subject to origination"—in other words, the unfabricated: deathlessness.

> [Immediately after attaining the stream] Sāriputta the wanderer went to Moggallāna the wanderer. Moggallāna the wanderer saw him coming from afar and, on seeing him, said, "Bright are your faculties, my friend; pure & clear your complexion. Could it be that you have attained the Deathless?"
>
> "Yes, my friend, I have." – *Mv I.23.5*

The suttas describe the experience of the Deathless in only the sketchiest terms. What little description there is, is intended to show that the Deathless lies beyond most linguistic categories. However, there are a few indicators to show what the Deathless is not.

To begin with, it cannot be described as a state of either existence nor non-existence.

> Ven. Mahā Koṭṭhita: "With the remainderless fading & cessation of the six spheres of contact [vision, hearing, smell, taste, touch, & intellection] is it the case that there is anything else?"
>
> Ven. Sāriputta: "Don't say that, my friend."
>
> Ven. Mahā Koṭṭhita: "With the remainderless fading & cessation of the six spheres of contact, is it the case that there is not anything else?"
>
> Ven. Sāriputta: "Don't say that, my friend."
>
> Ven. Mahā Koṭṭhita: "… is it the case that there both is & is not anything else?"
>
> Ven. Sāriputta: "Don't say that, my friend."
>
> Ven. Mahā Koṭṭhita: "… is it the case that there neither is nor is not anything else?"
>
> Ven. Sāriputta: "Don't say that, my friend."
>
> Ven. Mahā Koṭṭhita: "Being asked… if there is anything else, you say, 'Don't say that, my friend.' Being asked… if there is not anything

else… if there both is & is not anything else… if there neither is nor is not anything else, you say, 'Don't say that, my friend.' Now, how is the meaning of this statement to be understood?"

Ven. Sāriputta: "Saying '… is it the case that there is anything else… is it the case that there is not anything else… is it the case that there both is & is not anything else… is it the case that there neither is nor is not anything else,' one is objectifying non-objectification. However far the six spheres of contact go, that is how far objectification goes. However far objectification goes, that is how far the six spheres of contact go. With the remainderless fading & cessation of the six spheres of contact, there comes to be the cessation, the allaying of objectification." – *AN 4:173*

Second, the dimension of the Deathless is not devoid of awareness, although the awareness here—because it is unfabricated—lies apart from the consciousness included in the five aggregates of fabricated experience.

"Monks, that dimension should be experienced where the eye [vision] ceases and the perception [mental label] of form fades. That dimension should be experienced where the ear ceases and the perception of sound fades… where the nose ceases and the perception of aroma fades… where the tongue ceases and the perception of flavor fades… where the body ceases and the perception of tactile sensation fades… where the intellect ceases and the perception of idea fades: That dimension should be experienced." – *SN 35:114*

"Having directly known the extent of designation and the extent of the objects of designation, the extent of expression and the extent of the objects of expression, the extent of description and the extent of the objects of description, the extent of discernment and the extent of the objects of discernment, the extent to which the cycle revolves: Having directly known that, the monk is released. [To say that,] '"The monk released, having directly known that, does not see, does not know" is his opinion,' that would be mistaken." – *DN 15*

"'Consciousness without surface,
without end,

luminous all around:
Here water, earth, fire, & wind
have no footing.
Here long & short,
coarse & fine,
fair & foul,
here name & form
are all brought to a stop without trace.
With the cessation of (the aggregate of) consciousness
each is here brought to a stop.'" – *DN 11*

"Consciousness without surface, without end, luminous all around, is not experienced through the solidity of earth, the liquidity of water, the radiance of fire, the windiness of wind, the divinity of devas [and so on through a list of the various levels of godhood and then to] the allness of the All [i.e., the six sense spheres]." – *MN 49*

"Even so, Vaccha, any form… feeling… perception… fabrication… consciousness by which one describing the Tathāgata would describe him: That the Tathāgata has abandoned, its root destroyed, made like a palymra stump, deprived of the conditions of development, not destined for future arising. Freed from the classification of form… feeling… perception… fabrications… consciousness, Vaccha, the Tathāgata is deep, boundless, hard to fathom, like the sea. 'Reappears' doesn't apply. 'Does not reappear' doesn't apply. 'Both does & does not reappear' doesn't apply. 'Neither reappears nor does not reappear' doesn't apply." – *MN 72*

"Freed, dissociated, & released from ten things, Bāhuna, the Tathāgata dwells with unrestricted awareness. Which ten? Freed, dissociated, & released from form, the Tathāgata dwells with unrestricted awareness. Freed, dissociated, & released from feeling… Freed, dissociated, & released from perception… Freed, dissociated, & released from fabrications… Freed, dissociated, & released from consciousness… Freed, dissociated, & released from birth… Freed, dissociated, & released from aging… Freed, dissociated, & released from death… Freed, dissociated, & released from stress… Freed, dissociated, &

> released from defilement, the Tathāgata dwells with unrestricted awareness.
>
> "Just as a red, blue, or white lotus born in the water and growing in the water, rises up above the water and stands with no water adhering to it, in the same way the Tathāgata—freed, dissociated, & released from these ten things—dwells with unrestricted awareness." – *AN 10:81*

These are not the words of a person who has found release in unconsciousness.

Finally, although the Deathless is sometimes called consciousness without surface, without end, it is not to be confused with the formless stage of concentration called the dimension of the infinitude of consciousness. One of the main differences between the two is that the dimension of the infinitude of consciousness is fabricated and willed (see MN 140). The element of will, though, can be very attenuated while one is in that dimension, and only the subtlest discernment can ferret it out. One way of testing for it is to see if there is any sense of identification with the knowing. If there is, then there is still the conceit of I-making and my-making applied to that state. Another test is to see if there is any sense that the knowing contains all things or is their source. If there is, then there is still fabrication in that state of mind, for when the Deathless is fully comprehended, the sense of unrestricted awareness as containing or acting as the source of other things is seen to be an ignorant conceit.

> "There is the case, monks, where an uninstructed run-of-the-mill person… perceives unbinding as unbinding. Perceiving unbinding as unbinding, he supposes things about unbinding, he supposes things in unbinding, he supposes things coming out of unbinding, he supposes unbinding as 'mine,' he delights in unbinding. Why is that? Because he has not comprehended it, I tell you.…
>
> "A monk who is a Worthy One, devoid of effluents—who has attained completion, finished the task, laid down the burden, attained the true goal, destroyed the fetters of becoming, and is released through right knowledge… directly knows unbinding as unbinding. Directly knowing unbinding as unbinding, he doesn't suppose things about unbinding, doesn't suppose things in

> unbinding, doesn't suppose things coming out of unbinding, doesn't suppose unbinding as 'mine,' doesn't delight in unbinding. Why is that? Because he has comprehended it, I tell you." – *MN 1*

However, in line with the instructions to Gotamī and Upāli, the true test of an experience of stream-entry is not in its description, but the results it produces. The texts describe these in two ways: four factors that characterize a person who has entered the stream, and three fetters that stream-entry automatically cuts.

The four factors, according to AN 10:92, are: verified conviction in the Buddha, verified conviction in the Dhamma, verified conviction in the Saṅgha, and "virtues that are appealing to the noble ones—untorn, unbroken, unspotted, unsplattered, liberating, praised by the wise, ungrapsed at, leading to concentration." The three fetters are: self-identification views, uncertainty, and grasping at habits & practices.

The two lists find common ground in the experience of the path to stream-entry. As the path—the noble eightfold path—yields to the fruit of stream-entry, you see that although ordinary action can lead to pleasant, unpleasant, or mixed results on the level of fabricated experience, the noble eightfold path is a form of action that goes beyond, to the end of action (see AN 4:237). This experience cuts through any doubt or uncertainty about the truth of the Buddha's awakening, thus verifying your conviction in the Buddha, Dhamma, and Saṅgha. Having seen the results that ordinary actions do have on the fabricated level, however, you wouldn't dare transgress the five precepts, the habits that embody the virtues appealing to the noble ones (see AN 8:39). Still, because the Deathless is the end of action, you don't grasp at habits and practices as the goal in & of themselves. And because you have seen the aggregates of form, feeling, perception, fabrications, and consciousness fade away in the experience of the Deathless, you would never construct a view of self-identification around them.

The texts describe the results of stream-entry in some detail:

> To Upāli the householder, as he was sitting right there, there arose the dustless, stainless Dhamma eye: "*Whatever is subject to origination is all subject to cessation.*" Then—having seen the Dhamma, having reached the Dhamma, known the Dhamma, plunged entirely into the

Dhamma, having crossed over & beyond doubt, having had no more questioning—Upāli the householder gained fearlessness and became independent of others with regard to the Teacher's message. – *MN 56*

"And how is one afflicted in body but unafflicted in mind? There is the case where a well-instructed disciple of the noble ones… doesn't assume form to be the self, or the self as possessing form, or form as in the self, or the self as in form. He isn't obsessed with the idea that 'I am form' or 'Form is mine.' As he isn't obsessed with these ideas, his form changes & alters, but he doesn't fall into sorrow, lamentation, pain, distress, or despair over its change & alteration.

"He doesn't assume feeling… perception… fabrications to be the self.…

"He doesn't assume consciousness to be the self, or the self as possessing consciousness, or consciousness as in the self, or the self as in consciousness. He isn't obsessed with the idea that 'I am consciousness' or 'Consciousness is mine.' As he isn't obsessed with these ideas, his consciousness changes & alters, but he doesn't fall into sorrow, lamentation, pain, distress, or despair over its change & alteration.

"This, householder, is how one is afflicted in body but unafflicted in mind." – *SN 22:1*

That, too, say the skilled,
is a binding knot: that
in dependence on which
you regard another
as inferior.
So a monk shouldn't be dependent
    on what's seen, heard, or sensed,
    or on habits & practices;
nor should he conjure a view in the world
    in connection with knowledge
    or habits & practices;
shouldn't take himself
    to be "equal";
shouldn't think himself

inferior or superlative.…

A brahman not led
by habits or practices,
gone to the beyond
—Such—
doesn't fall back. – *Sn 4:5*

Although the traditional lists of the results of stream-entry provide stringent standards for judging one's own attainment, the texts—and living Buddhist traditions today—record many instances of people who have over-estimated their attainment. Thus when you have what seems to be an attainment of this sort, you have to examine it carefully and test the mind to see if the three fetters are actually cut. And because the attainment itself is what proves or disproves the authority and authenticity of the texts, as well as the integrity of your teachers, you are ultimately left with only one guarantee of your attainment: your own integrity, which you hope has been adequately developed along the path. In keeping with the principle that the Dhamma is ultimately a quality of the mind as embodied in the entire person, the only way you can ultimately gauge the truth of the Dhamma is if you as a person are true.

Because the attainment of stream-entry can make such an enormous difference in your life, it is worth every ounce of integrity needed to attain it and to ascertain the attainment.

Then the Blessed One, picking up a little bit of dust with the tip of his fingernail, said to the monks, "What do you think, monks? Which is greater: the little bit of dust I have picked up with the tip of my fingernail, or the great earth?"

"The great earth is far greater, lord. The little bit of dust the Blessed One has picked up with the tip of his fingernail is next to nothing. It's not a hundredth, a thousandth, a one hundred-thousandth… when compared with the great earth."

"In the same way, monks, for a disciple of the noble ones who is consummate in view, an individual who has broken through [to stream-entry], the suffering & stress totally ended & extinguished is far greater. That which remains in the state of having at most seven

> remaining lifetimes is next to nothing. It's not a hundredth, a thousandth, a one hundred-thousandth, when compared with the previous mass of suffering. That's how great the benefit is of breaking through to the Dhamma, monks. That's how great the benefit is of obtaining the Dhamma eye." – *SN 13:1*

For a person who has been relieved of this much suffering, the question of the historical Buddha becomes irrelevant. If the genuine Deathless is not the historical Buddha's attainment, it's what a genuine Buddha would have attained. The Dhamma leading to this attainment could not have come from anyone else. As SN 22:87 quotes the Buddha as saying, "One who sees the Dhamma sees me," i.e., the aspect of the Buddha that really matters, the aspect signaling that total freedom, the total end of suffering, is an attainable goal.

> Sole dominion over the earth,
> going to heaven,
> lordship over all worlds:
> the fruit of stream-entry
> excels them. – *Dhp 178*

These are audacious claims, and they obviously require an approach more audacious than the historical method to test them. As the suttas indicate, nothing less than genuine integrity of character, developed through careful training and practice, will suffice. Given that "dhamma" means both teaching and quality of mind, it stands to reason that truth of character is needed to measure the truth of the teaching. Only true people can know the truth of the suttas' claims. This may seem an exclusionary or elitist thing to say, but actually it's not. The sort of education needed to master the historical method isn't open to everyone, but integrity is—if you want to develop it. The suttas say that the best things in life are available to those who are true. The only question is whether you're true enough to want to know if they're right.

## A Note on the Translations

The translations contained in these volumes are based on the Thai edition of the Pali Canon, although I occasionally made use of variant readings found in other editions.

People who are not familiar with the suttas may find their style difficult to relate to. The Pali Canon was, originally, an entirely oral tradition. As a result, it tends to be terse in some areas and repetitive in others. I've made an effort to cut as many of the repetitions as possible, but I'll have to ask your patience for those that remain. Think of them as the refrains in a piece of music. Also, when the Buddha is referring to monks doing this and that, keep in mind that his audience was frequently composed entirely of monks. The commentaries state that the word "monk" includes anyone—male or female, lay or ordained—who is serious about the practice, and this meaning should always be kept in mind. I apologize for the gender bias in the translations. Although I have tried to figure out ways to minimize it, I find myself stymied because it is so thoroughly embedded in a literature originally addressed to male monastics.

Some of the suttas have their own introductions, and some have explanatory notes, which are placed in each case at the end of the sutta. These notes are based primarily on passages found in other suttas, and occasionally on passages from the extensive commentarial literature that has formed around the suttas over the centuries. Many, but not all, Theravadins regard the commentaries as authoritative, but the questions asked and answered by the commentators often fall into the list of questions that MN 2 classifies as inappropriate for attention. Two examples are the questions of whether or not there is a self; and, if there is no self, what constitutes a human being. To make the suttas answer these questions is like deforming a round peg to fit it into a square hole: You might get something to fill the square, but the whole point of designing the peg in the first place was to make it round. Thus a more reliable way at getting at the meaning of an individual passage in the suttas is first to see what light other passages in the same stratum of literature, addressing the same questions, may throw on it. The commentaries, in the areas where they seem to accord with the line of inquiry in the suttas, can then be consulted as secondary sources. Thus the approach taken here.

The format of the suttas—as dialogues and discourses given at specific times and places—helps to emphasize one of their analogies for the

Buddha's teachings: as medicine for specific illnesses of the mind. To see the teachings applied to specific situations helps give them context, providing a sense of which medicine is appropriate for which disease. However, the weakness of this approach is that overarching principles and interrelationships can sometimes get lost in the particulars. To overcome this shortcoming, many of the suttas here are cross-referenced to other suttas in the collection. I recommend that you follow these cross-references wherever you find them at the end of a sutta that holds special interest for you, to get a sense of the larger patterns among the teachings. This in turn will give you a better perspective on how to put the teachings of the suttas to best use, to see if they can help cure the suffering and stress afflicting your own mind.

*The Dīgha Nikāya, or Long Collection, is named after the length not of the collection, but of its individual suttas. There are 34 in all, many of them among the most polished literary compositions in the Pali Canon. This anthology contains complete translations of nine suttas, and partial translations of two.*

# *The Brahmā Net*
# *Brahmajāla Sutta (DN 1)*

## Introduction

*This sutta—the first of the entire Sutta Piṭaka—introduces the Buddha as a practitioner and as a teacher. Because its portrait focuses on the Dhamma qualities that he exemplifies, it acts as an introduction to the Dhamma he teaches as well.*

*The portrait falls into four sections, each presenting an aspect of the Buddha's accomplishments:*

*his attitude toward praise and criticism,*
*his virtue,*
*his discernment,*
*his release.*

***Praise & criticism.*** *In the first section of the sutta, the Buddha meets with the monks after a day and night in which he and the monks have had to listen to two wanderers of other sects arguing as to whether the Buddha should be criticized or praised. He counsels the monks not to let their minds be affected by such discussions, his reasoning being that only if the mind is unaffected can it see clearly what is true or false in the words of criticism or praise—and only then can it respond appropriately. He goes on to say that once the monks have clearly evaluated what is said, they can explain what is false in the criticism and true in the praise. Of course, the converse is also possible—that the criticism could be true or the praise false—and there are other passages in the Canon, such as Dhp 76–77, that underline the importance of appreciating and benefitting from criticism when it points out genuine faults. But here, given that the remainder of the sutta is devoted to praise of the Buddha, the emphasis is on the truth of the praise. The main question, both in this section and in the remainder of the sutta, is what sort of praise does the Buddha justice.*

*It's also worth noting that here, as in the rest of the Sutta Piṭaka, the Buddha doesn't respond to praise with a show of false modesty (see, for instance, MN 36 and Sn 3:7). The proper response to praise is either to remain silent or, when it would be helpful as a teaching strategy, to note where the praise is true.*

***Virtue.*** *The many virtues attributed to the Buddha in the second section of the sutta are attributed in other suttas in the Dīgha Nikāya to the ideal members of his monastic Saṅgha as well. Although the list is long, it comes nowhere near to covering all the rules that the Buddha formulated for his monks. Instead, it focuses on the rules that would be most apparent to Buddhist lay followers and to followers of other religions. In the Vinaya, the section of the Canon dealing with monastic rules, the Buddha's reasons for formulating the rules fall into three main categories: to inspire faith in others, to help the monks and nuns cleanse their minds of defilement, and to foster harmony within the monastic communities. In the context of this sutta, the list of virtues seems focused primarily on rules falling into the first category, but the discussions of the same list in other suttas of the Dīgha Nikāya show that they fall into the second category as well.*

*A special feature of the list is the amount of space it devotes to types of wrong livelihood that the Buddha and his monks avoid. The detailed listing given here is much more extensive than even the Vinaya's discussion of the topic.*

***Discernment.*** *The longest section of the sutta is devoted to the Buddha's analysis of 62 views and his reasons for rejecting them. Rather than saying that all views lead to the same goal, the Buddha makes clear that although all views inspire action, the actions they inspire lead to many different destinations. This point is so important that the compilers of the Dīgha Nikāya not only chose this sutta to open the collection, but also followed it with another sutta focused on the same theme. The compilers of the Majjhima Nikāya also opened their collection with two suttas that clearly point out what the teaching is not, at the same time using their explanation of why it's not that, to demonstrate what it is. This teaching strategy is in line with the Buddha's statement in MN 117, that the role of right view begins by distinguishing right view from wrong.*

*The 62 views that the Buddha analyzes fall loosely into two main groups: theories of the past and theories of the future. I say "loosely" because some of the theories, even though they are listed in one of these two groups, don't clearly fall*

*into either. Theories of the past that clearly belong to the first group deal with the question of whether the soul and cosmos are eternal, partially eternal, or arose fortuitously out of nothing. However, this group also includes theories addressing the question of whether the cosmos is finite or infinite, along with a series of agnostic positions—called "eel-wriggling"—where their proponents, through fear or stupidity, refuse to take a position on any issue. Theories of the future that clearly belong to the second group deal with the question of whether the self survives death and, if so, what shape it takes in its survival. However, this group also includes theories of how the self attains unbinding (nibbāna) in the here-and-now.*

*Taken on their own, these theories clear up four important misunderstandings about early Buddhism and the context in which it was taught. To begin with, the existence of theories denying past lifetimes on the one hand (17–18) and future lives on the other (51–57) disproves the common misunderstanding that everyone in the Buddha's time believed in rebirth, and that the Buddha adopted the idea of rebirth by unthinkingly picking it up from this culture. The fact that the topic was debated showed that the possibility of no rebirth was in the air, and that the Buddha's choice to teach rebirth was conscious and deliberate.*

*Second, the term "unbinding" in these theories is defined as the peace found in the pleasures of the senses and the four jhānas (states of mental absorption). So, obviously, it carries no connotations of extinction. This lends support to the point that the Buddha's use of the word unbinding for his goal also did not mean extinction, a point further supported by the fact that he refused to define the arahant after death as existing, not existing, both, or neither. Because, in the Buddha's perspective, beings are defined by their attachments (SN 23:2), and because arahants have no attachments, there is no way that they can be defined or described in any way at all.*

*Third, the way "self"* (attā) *is defined in the annihilationist views (51–57) shows that the concept of self in the Buddha's time did not—contrary to what is often believed—always have to mean an eternally existing self. In each of these views, the self is defined in such a way that it will be annihilated at death.*

*Fourth, 20 of the views (1–3, 5–7, 9–11, 17, 52–57, and 59–62) are based on meditative experiences: jhāna, the formless states, and knowledge of previous lives that can be gained based on jhāna. This fact corrects two*

*misunderstandings: one, that the practice of jhāna began with the Buddha; and two, that any insight coming from a concentrated mind can be trusted to be true. If the Buddha were the first to have discovered jhāna, none of these cases would have occurred in time for the Buddha to refute them. If all insights coming from concentration were reliable, no one would misinterpret what their meditative experiences meant.*

*A feature common to almost all of the 62 theories is that they are phrased in terms of self and cosmos—in other words, in the same terms as what the Buddha describes as "becoming"* (bhava): *the act of taking on an identity in a particular world of experience (see* The Paradox of Becoming*). Because the craving that leads to further becoming is the cause of suffering and stress, the Buddha does not attempt to refute these theories by taking a different position framed in the same terms. Instead, he approaches and rejects these theories from another framework entirely: that of kamma and dependent co-arising* (paṭicca samuppāda).

*Within this framework, the question becomes not "Can these views be reasonably defended?" It becomes, "Is it skillful kamma to hold to these views?" This falls in line with Vajjiya Māhita's statement in AN 10:94 where, in defending the Buddha against some wanderers who accuse the Buddha of being a nihilist who doesn't teach anything, he says "I tell you, venerable sirs, that the Blessed One righteously declares that 'This is skillful.' He declares that 'This is unskillful.' Declaring that 'This is skillful' and 'This is unskillful,' he is one who has declared (a teaching). He is not a nihilist, one who doesn't declare anything." At the end of that sutta, the Buddha affirms that Vajjiya has defended him well. But of course, the teaching doesn't end there. In AN 2:19 the Buddha exhorts the monks to abandon what is unskillful and to develop what is skillful. So the question comes down to: Should these views, as a type of mental kamma, be abandoned or developed?*

*This is why the Buddha's analysis of views here in DN 1 focuses less on the* content *of the views and more on the* kamma *of holding to them: the actions that lead to them, and the kammic destination that holding them can lead to. The verdict in all 62 cases is that the views should be abandoned. The Buddha's analysis of the kamma of these views in this section of the sutta is an example, then, of right view in action: how to use the teachings on kamma and dependent co-arising to let go of actions leading to suffering. Taken together with the following section, on the Buddha's release, this section provides a clear*

*contrast to the 62 views by showing the excellent kammic consequences of adopting the Buddha's general approach to views as a form of kamma.*

*His approach is obviously inspired by the three knowledges he gained on the night of his awakening:*

*(a) knowledge of previous lives;*
*(b) knowledge of the death and rebirth of beings based on their actions (kamma), which in turn are based on their views; and*
*(c) release from rebirth that comes from adopting right view, i.e., viewing action in terms of the four noble truths.*

*a. From the first knowledge: As the Buddha points out, views are based on previous actions and experiences, and in many instances—cited explicitly in the section on views dealing with the past, and implicitly in the views on annihilation and nibbāna here-and-now—these actions and experiences can be traced to previous lives and/or to a misinterpretation of experiences gained through meditation. (See MN 136 on other misunderstandings that can come from misinterpreting past-life memories gained in concentration.)*

*b. From the second knowledge: The act of holding to a view is an act of clinging ("agitation & vacillation" in the words of the sutta) that will inspire actions leading to a particular realm in the round of rebirth. It's worth noting that although the Buddha goes into great detail on the actions giving rise to some of the 62 views, he gives only a brief, general reference to his knowledge of the destination to which all the views lead. However, the importance of this latter knowledge is emphasized by the fact that it forms a refrain repeated again and again throughout this section of the sutta. The main point of the refrain is that right view, as it overcomes clinging even to itself, leads to a destination that surpasses the destinations to which the 62 views lead.*

*c. From the third knowledge: Views can be overcome by noting that the act of clinging is based on craving, craving is based on feeling, and feeling is based on contact at the six sense media. This sequence of conditions is drawn from the Buddha's teaching on dependent co-arising, which is an elaborated version of the four noble truths. By replacing ignorance of this sequence with knowledge—knowing the origination, passing away, allure, drawbacks of, and escape from*

*feelings and sensory contact—one gains release from all clingings, even to the results of this knowledge, and from all destinations in the realm of becoming.*

*Other suttas—such as MN 102 and SN 22:81—take a similar approach to views, focusing on the way in which knowledge of the way in which views are fabricated and clung to can lead the mind to stop clinging to views altogether. Two suttas, however, are especially helpful in expanding on the approach taken here in DN 1: SN 41:3 and AN 10:93.*

*SN 41:3, in a direct reference to DN 1, notes that the 62 views listed here, as well as other views, all come from self-identity views, which define the self around any of the five aggregates of form, feeling, perception, fabrications, and consciousness: either identical with the aggregate, possessing the aggregate, in the aggregate, or containing the aggregate. The connection between self-identity views and the 62 views in this sutta can be clearly seen in the topics of the views listed here: Once you assume a self, you get caught up in questions of what it is, the dimensions of the world in which it can find its nourishment, its past, its future after death, and what constitutes its happiness here and now. Even the four cases of "eel-wriggling," or agnosticism listed here can be understood as motivated by the desire to protect the self from the harassment that comes from expounding a view to others.*

*The antidote to this kind of thinking is not to assume that there is no self—MN 2 counsels against trying to give any answer to such questions as "What am I?" and "Do I exist? Do I not exist?" (see the articles, "The Not-self Strategy" and "The Limits of Description" on this point). Instead, SN 41:3 recommends a more subtle strategy: learning from people of integrity how not to assume a self in any way around the five aggregates. But it does not explain how this is done. SN 12:15 advises contemplating the origination and passing away of events in the world of the six senses until even the notions of "existence" and "non-existence" don't occur to the mind. At that point, all that seems to arise and pass away is stress, a realization that allows the mind to let go of all fabrications. This is its definition of right view.*

*The most important aspect of right view, as noted above, is that it reaches a point where it undercuts clinging even to itself and to the release that comes when that level of clinging is abandoned. DN 1 itself doesn't explain how, but AN 10:93 gives a clue. After seeing that all other views, because they are fabricated, are stressful, and that because they are stressful, they don't deserve to*

*be claimed as "me" or "mine," right view then applies the same analysis to itself as a fabricated phenomenon. That's how it finds the full escape that comes from dispassion for every fabrication, even the fabrication of the path.*

*The fact that clinging to views is overcome through knowledge, and not through the simple decision not to formulate views, is worth emphasizing again and again. As SN 22:81 points out, such an agnostic decision is a fabrication based on ignorance, and so it cannot escape from suffering and stress.*

*The same point applies to the "eel-wrigglers" mentioned in DN 1. Interestingly enough, one of the issues that eel-wrigglers waffle on is precisely an issue on which the Buddha himself refuses to take a position: the status of an arahant after death. The difference is that the eel-wrigglers' refusal is because of their stupidity and fear; the Buddha's refusal, however, is because of his knowledge that any attempt to answer the question is unskillful kamma not conducive to the end of suffering. What this means, of course, is that refusing to take a position on an issue is not always a case of eel-wriggling, as has sometimes been claimed. It's eel-wriggling only when done out of ignorance, stupidity, or fear.*

***Release.*** *In the final section of the sutta, the Buddha states the reward of developing discernment into the kamma of views: The Tathāgata—a term for the Buddha and, in some suttas, for his arahant disciples—will never be reborn. Freed from all clinging, he is totally released from suffering and stress.*

***Connections.*** *DN 1 connects these four aspect of the Buddha's behavior—his attitude toward praise and criticism, his virtue, his discernment, and his release—by saying that ordinary people, when praising the Buddha, focus on nothing more than his virtue; only someone of acute discernment can praise him in a way that does justice to his discernment and—through that—to his release.*

*Other suttas in the Piṭaka, however, show that, in practice, the connections among these four aspects go much deeper than that.*

*For instance, there is a direct relationship between the Buddha's discernment and his attitude toward criticism and praise. As Sn 4:8 points out, India in the Buddha's time had a tradition where proponents of different philosophies would engage in public debates. The sutta further says, though, that the actual purpose*

*of such debates wasn't to arrive at the truth. It was to gain praise. This was why the Buddha counseled his students not to engage in such debates. However, as DN 1 shows, the true purpose of developing knowledge about the kamma of views isn't to gain praise from the public. It's to gain release from suffering and stress. Similarly, the purpose of discussion—and this applies to the type of debates that the Buddha* would *engage in—is to lead to the liberation of the mind (AN 3:68).*

*There is also a direct relationship between the Buddha's attitude toward praise and criticism on the one hand, and his release on the other. Praise and criticism are "worldly conditions" (AN 8:6–8). As Sn 2:4 states, one of the fruits of arahantship is that the mind, when touched by worldly conditions, isn't shaken.*

*Finally, there is the relationship between the Buddha's virtue and his discernment. As DN 4 points out, virtue purifies discernment, and discernment purifies virtue, in the same way that the right hand washes the left hand, and the left hand washes the right. This relationship, too, is echoed in the Buddha's standards for debate: A person was worthy of talking to, he said, only if that person conducted the discussion in a fair, truthful, and ethical way (AN 3:68).*

*The connections among the four aspects of the Buddha's accomplishments mentioned here are only a few of the many possible ones that could be cited from the other suttas in the Piṭaka. However, they are enough to show that the Brahmajāla, though long, is only an introduction to the virtues of the Buddha and the riches of the Dhamma he taught. In particular, it has to be augmented by the following sutta, DN 2, to give a sense of the Buddha's skill in the practice of concentration. Still, because the Brahmajāla raises such important issues, helping to make clear what kind of teacher the Buddha was and was not, what the Dhamma is and what it is not—along with the fact that the final release attained and taught by the Buddha lies beyond all this—it's easy to see why it was such a strong candidate to be placed first in the Sutta Piṭaka as a gateway to the entire collection.*

[ I ]

I have heard that on one occasion the Blessed One was traveling on the highway between Rājagaha & Nālanda with a large Saṅgha of monks, approximately 500 monks.

And Suppiya the wanderer was traveling on the highway between Rājagaha & Nālanda with his apprentice, Brahmadatta the young brahman.

Along the way, Suppiya the wanderer spoke in many ways in dispraise of the Buddha, in dispraise of the Dhamma, in dispraise of the Saṅgha. But Suppiya the wanderer's apprentice, Brahmadatta the young brahman, spoke in many ways in praise of the Buddha, in praise of the Dhamma, in praise of the Saṅgha. Thus both of these, mentor & apprentice, speaking in direct contradiction to each other, followed right behind the Blessed One and the Saṅgha of monks.

Then the Blessed One, together with the Saṅgha of monks, entered the royal resthouse at Mango Stone to spend the night. And Suppiya the wanderer, together with his apprentice, Brahmadatta the young brahman, entered the royal resthouse at Mango Stone to spend the night. There, too, Suppiya the wanderer spoke in many ways in dispraise of the Buddha, in dispraise of the Dhamma, in dispraise of the Saṅgha. But Suppiya the wanderer's apprentice, Brahmadatta the young brahman, spoke in many ways in praise of the Buddha, in praise of the Dhamma, in praise of the Saṅgha. Thus both of these, mentor & apprentice, speaking in direct contradiction to each other, followed right behind the Blessed One and the Saṅgha of monks.

Then, among a large number of monks who had arisen in the last watch of the night and were sitting gathered together in a pavilion, this discussion arose: "Isn't it amazing! Isn't it astounding!—how the Blessed One, the one who knows, the one who sees, worthy & rightly self-awakened, has truly experienced the differing convictions of beings. For this Suppiya the wanderer speaks in many ways in dispraise of the Buddha, in dispraise of the Dhamma, in dispraise of the Saṅgha. But Suppiya the wanderer's apprentice, Brahmadatta the young brahman, speaks in many ways in praise of the Buddha, in praise of the Dhamma, in praise of the Saṅgha. Thus both of these, mentor & apprentice, speaking in direct contradiction to each other, follow right behind the Blessed One and the Saṅgha of monks."

Then the Blessed One, knowing this discussion of the monks, went to the pavilion and, on arrival, sat down on a seat laid out. Seated, he

addressed the monks: "For what topic of conversation are you sitting gathered together here? What is the topic of your conversation that has been interrupted midway?"

When this was said, the monks said to the Blessed One, "Just now, lord, among us—as we had arisen in the last watch of the night and were sitting gathered together in (this) pavilion—this discussion arose: 'Isn't it amazing! Isn't it astounding!—how the Blessed One, the one who knows, the one who sees, worthy & rightly self-awakened, has truly experienced the differing convictions of beings. For this Suppiya the wanderer speaks in many ways in dispraise of the Buddha, in dispraise of the Dhamma, in dispraise of the Saṅgha. But Suppiya the wanderer's apprentice, Brahmadatta the young brahman, speaks in many ways in praise of the Buddha, in praise of the Dhamma, in praise of the Saṅgha. Thus both of these, mentor & apprentice, speaking in direct contradiction to each other, follow right behind the Blessed One and the Saṅgha of monks.' This was the topic of our conversation that was interrupted midway when the Blessed One arrived."

"Monks, if others were to speak in dispraise of me, in dispraise of the Dhamma, or in dispraise of the Saṅgha, neither hatred nor antagonism nor displeasure of mind would be proper. If others were to speak in dispraise of me, in dispraise of the Dhamma, or in dispraise of the Saṅgha, and at that you would be upset and angered, that would be an obstruction for you yourselves. If others were to speak in dispraise of me, in dispraise of the Dhamma, or in dispraise of the Saṅgha, and at that you would be upset and angered, would you know what of those others was well-said or poorly said?"

"No, lord."

"If others were to speak in dispraise of me, in dispraise of the Dhamma, or in dispraise of the Saṅgha, you should unravel and explicate what is unfactual as unfactual: 'This is unfactual, this is inaccurate, there is nothing of that in us, and that is not to be found in us.'

"If others were to speak in praise of me, in praise of the Dhamma, or in praise of the Saṅgha, neither joy nor gladness nor exhilaration of mind would be proper. If others were to speak in praise of me, in praise of the Dhamma, or in praise of the Saṅgha, and at that you would be joyful,

glad, & exhilarated, that would be an obstruction for you yourselves. If others were to speak in praise of me, in praise of the Dhamma, or in praise of the Saṅgha, and at that you would be joyful, glad, & exhilarated, would you know what of those others was well-said or poorly said?"

"No, lord."

"If others were to speak in praise of me, in praise of the Dhamma, or in praise of the Saṅgha, you should unravel and explicate what is factual as factual: 'This is factual, this is accurate, there is that in us, and that is to be found in us.'

"It would be of minor matters, lower matters, matters of virtue, that a run-of-the-mill person, when praising the Tathāgata, would speak. And which are the minor matters, lower matters, matters of virtue, of which a run-of-the-mill person, when praising the Tathāgata, would speak?

*The Lesser Section on Virtue*

"'Abandoning the taking of life, the contemplative Gotama abstains from the taking of life. He dwells with his rod laid down, his knife laid down, scrupulous, merciful, compassionate for the welfare of all living beings.' It's of this, monks, that a run-of-the-mill person, when praising the Tathāgata, would speak.

"Or: 'Abandoning the taking of what is not given, the contemplative Gotama abstains from taking what is not given. He takes only what is given, accepts only what is given, lives not by stealth but by means of a self that has become pure.' It's of this, monks, that a run-of-the-mill person, when praising the Tathāgata, would speak.

"Or: 'Abandoning uncelibacy, the contemplative Gotama lives a celibate life, aloof, refraining from the sexual act that is the villager's way.' It's of this, monks, that a run-of-the-mill person, when praising the Tathāgata, would speak.

"Or: 'Abandoning false speech, the contemplative Gotama abstains from false speech. He speaks the truth, holds to the truth, is firm, reliable, no deceiver of the world.' It's of this, monks, that a run-of-the-mill person, when praising the Tathāgata, would speak.

"Or: 'Abandoning divisive speech, the contemplative Gotama abstains from divisive speech. What he has heard here he does not tell there to break those people apart from these people here. What he has heard there he does not tell here to break these people apart from those people there. Thus reconciling those who have broken apart or cementing those who are united, he loves concord, delights in concord, enjoys concord, speaks things that create concord.' It's of this, monks, that a run-of-the-mill person, when praising the Tathāgata, would speak.

"Or: 'Abandoning abusive speech, the contemplative Gotama abstains from abusive speech. He speaks words that are soothing to the ear, that are affectionate, that go to the heart, that are polite, appealing, & pleasing to people at large.' It's of this, monks, that a run-of-the-mill person, when praising the Tathāgata, would speak.

"Or: 'Abandoning idle chatter, he abstains from idle chatter. He speaks in season, speaks what is factual, what is in accordance with the goal *[attha],* the Dhamma, & the Vinaya. He speaks words worth treasuring, seasonable, reasonable, circumscribed, connected with what is profitable *[attha].*' It's of this, monks, that a run-of-the-mill person, when praising the Tathāgata, would speak.

"Or: 'The contemplative Gotama abstains from damaging seed & plant life.'…

"Or: 'The contemplative Gotama eats only once a day, refraining from the evening meal and from food at the wrong time of day.'…

"Or: 'The contemplative Gotama abstains from dancing, singing, instrumental music, and from watching shows.'…

"Or: 'The contemplative Gotama abstains from wearing garlands and from beautifying himself with scents & cosmetics.'…

"Or: 'The contemplative Gotama abstains from high and luxurious beds & seats.'…

"Or: 'The contemplative Gotama abstains from accepting gold & money.'…

"Or: 'The contemplative Gotama abstains from accepting uncooked grain… raw meat… women & girls… male & female slaves… goats &

sheep… fowl & pigs… elephants, cattle, steeds, & mares… fields & property.'…

"Or: 'The contemplative Gotama abstains from running messages… from buying & selling… from dealing with false scales, false metals, & false measures… from bribery, deception, & fraud.'…

"Or: 'The contemplative Gotama abstains from mutilating, executing, imprisoning, highway robbery, plunder, & violence.'

"It's of this, monks, that a run-of-the-mill person, when praising the Tathāgata, would speak.

*The Intermediate Section on Virtue*

"Or: 'Whereas some contemplatives & brahmans, living off food given in faith, remain addicted to damaging seed & plant life such as these—plants propagated from roots, stems, joints, buddings, & seeds—the contemplative Gotama abstains from damaging seed and plant life such as these.' It's of this, monks, that a run-of-the-mill person, when praising the Tathāgata, would speak.

"Or: 'Whereas some contemplatives & brahmans, living off food given in faith, remain addicted to consuming stored-up goods such as these—stored-up food, stored-up drinks, stored-up clothing, stored-up vehicles, stored-up bedding, stored-up scents, & stored-up meat—the contemplative Gotama abstains from consuming stored-up goods such as these.' It's of this, monks, that a run-of-the-mill person, when praising the Tathāgata, would speak.

"Or: 'Whereas some contemplatives & brahmans, living off food given in faith, remain addicted to watching shows such as these—dancing, singing, instrumental music, plays, ballad recitations, hand-clapping, cymbals & drums, magic-lantern scenes, acrobatic and conjuring tricks, elephant fights, horse fights, buffalo fights, bull fights, goat fights, ram fights, cock fights, quail fights; fighting with staves, boxing, wrestling, war-games, roll calls, battle arrays, & regimental reviews—the contemplative Gotama abstains from watching shows such as these.' It's of this, monks, that a run-of-the-mill person, when praising the Tathāgata, would speak.

"Or: 'Whereas some contemplatives & brahmans, living off food given in faith, remain addicted to heedless & idle games such as these—eight-row chess, ten-row chess, chess in the air, hopscotch, spillikins, dice, stick games, hand-pictures, ball-games, blowing through toy pipes, playing with toy plows, turning somersaults, playing with toy windmills, toy measures, toy chariots, toy bows, guessing letters drawn in the air, guessing thoughts, mimicking deformities—the contemplative Gotama abstains from heedless & idle games such as these.' It's of this, monks, that a run-of-the-mill person, when praising the Tathāgata, would speak.

"Or: 'Whereas some contemplatives & brahmans, living off food given in faith, remain addicted to high & luxurious furnishings such as these—over-sized couches, couches adorned with carved animals, long-haired coverlets, multi-colored patchwork coverlets, white woolen coverlets, woolen coverlets embroidered with flowers or animal figures, stuffed quilts, coverlets with fringe, silk coverlets embroidered with gems; large woolen carpets; elephant, horse, and chariot rugs, antelope-hide rugs, deer-hide rugs; couches with canopies, couches with red cushions for the head & feet—the contemplative Gotama abstains from using high and luxurious furnishings such as these.' It's of this, monks, that a run-of-the-mill person, when praising the Tathāgata, would speak.

"Or: 'Whereas some contemplatives & brahmans, living off food given in faith, remain addicted to scents, cosmetics, and means of beautification such as these—rubbing powders into the body, massaging with oils, bathing in perfumed water, kneading the limbs, using mirrors, ointments, garlands, scents, creams, face-powders, mascara, bracelets, head-bands, decorated walking sticks, ornamented water-bottles, swords, fancy sunshades, decorated sandals, turbans, gems, yak-tail whisks, long-fringed white robes—the contemplative Gotama abstains from using scents, cosmetics, and means of beautification such as these.' It's of this, monks, that a run-of-the-mill person, when praising the Tathāgata, would speak.

"Or: 'Whereas some contemplatives & brahmans, living off food given in faith, remain addicted to talking about "animal" topics such as these—talking about kings, robbers, ministers of state; armies, alarms, and battles; food and drink; clothing, furniture, garlands, and scents; relatives; vehicles; villages, towns, cities, the countryside; women and heroes; the gossip of the street and the well; tales of the dead; tales of diversity

[philosophical discussions of the past and future], the creation of the world & of the sea, and talk of whether things exist or not—the contemplative Gotama abstains from talking about "animal" topics such as these.' It's of this, monks, that a run-of-the-mill person, when praising the Tathāgata, would speak.

"Or: 'Whereas some contemplatives & brahmans, living off food given in faith, remain addicted to debates such as these—"*You* understand this doctrine & discipline? *I'm* the one who understands this doctrine & discipline. How could you understand this doctrine & discipline? You're practicing wrongly. I'm practicing rightly. I'm being consistent. You're not. What should be said first you said last. What should be said last you said first. What you took so long to think out has been refuted. Your doctrine has been overthrown. You're defeated. Go and try to salvage your doctrine or extricate yourself if you can!"—the contemplative Gotama abstains from debates such as these.' It's of this, monks, that a run-of-the-mill person, when praising the Tathāgata, would speak.

"Or: 'Whereas some contemplatives & brahmans, living off food given in faith, remain addicted to running messages & errands for people such as these—kings, ministers of state, noble warriors, brahmans, householders, or youths (who say), "Go here. Go there. Take this there. Fetch that here"—the contemplative Gotama abstains from running messages & errands for people such as these.' It's of this, monks, that a run-of-the-mill person, when praising the Tathāgata, would speak.

"Or: 'Whereas some contemplatives & brahmans, living off food given in faith, engage in scheming, persuading, hinting, belittling, & pursuing gain with gain, the contemplative Gotama abstains from forms of scheming & persuading [improper ways of trying to gain material support from donors] such as these.'

"It's of this, monks, that a run-of-the-mill person, when praising the Tathāgata, would speak.

*The Great Section on Virtue*

"Or: 'Whereas some contemplatives & brahmans, living off food given in faith, maintain themselves by wrong livelihood, by such "animal" arts as:

reading marks on the limbs [e.g., palmistry];
reading omens & signs;
interpreting celestial events [falling stars, comets];
interpreting dreams;
reading features of the body [e.g., phrenology];
reading marks on cloth gnawed by mice;
offering fire oblations, oblations from a ladle, oblations of husks, rice powder, rice grains, ghee, & oil;
offering oblations from the mouth;
offering blood-sacrifices;
making predictions based on the fingertips;
geomancy;
making predictions for state officials;
laying demons in a cemetery;
placing spells on spirits;
earth-skills [divining water and gems?];
snake-skills, poison-skills, scorpion-skills, rat-skills, bird-skills, crow-skills;
predicting life spans;
giving protective charms;
casting horoscopes—
the contemplative Gotama abstains from wrong livelihood, from "animal" arts such as these.'

"Or: 'Whereas some contemplatives & brahmans, living off food given in faith, maintain themselves by wrong livelihood, by such "animal" arts as: determining lucky & unlucky gems, staffs, garments, swords, arrows, bows, & other weapons; women, men, boys, girls, male slaves, female slaves; elephants, horses, buffaloes, bulls, cows, goats, rams, fowl, quails, lizards, rabbits, tortoises, & other animals—the contemplative Gotama abstains from wrong livelihood, from "animal" arts such as these.'

"Or: 'Whereas some contemplatives & brahmans, living off food given in faith, maintain themselves by wrong livelihood, by such "animal" arts as

(forecasting):

the rulers will march forth;
the rulers will not march forth;
our rulers will attack, and their rulers will retreat;
their rulers will attack, and our rulers will retreat;
there will be triumph for our rulers and defeat for their rulers;
there will be triumph for their rulers and defeat for our rulers;
thus there will be triumph for this one, defeat for that one—
the contemplative Gotama abstains from wrong livelihood, from "animal" arts such as these.'

"Or: 'Whereas some contemplatives & brahmans, living off food given in faith, maintain themselves by wrong livelihood, by such "animal" arts as (forecasting):

there will be a lunar eclipse;
there will be a solar eclipse;
there will be an occultation of [a conjunction of the moon or a planet with] an asterism;
the sun & moon will be favorable;
the sun & moon will be unfavorable;
the asterisms will be favorable;
the asterisms will be unfavorable;
there will be a meteor shower;
there will be a flickering light on the horizon [an aurora?];
there will be an earthquake;
there will be thunder coming from dry clouds;
there will be a rising, a setting, a darkening, a brightening of the sun, moon, & asterisms;
such will be the result of the lunar eclipse… the rising, setting, darkening, brightening of the sun, moon, & asterisms—
the contemplative Gotama abstains from wrong livelihood, from "animal" arts such as these.'

"Or: 'Whereas some contemplatives & brahmans, living off food given in faith, maintain themselves by wrong livelihood, by such "animal" arts as (forecasting):

there will be abundant rain; there will be a drought;
there will be plenty; there will be famine;
there will be rest and security; there will be danger;
there will be disease; there will be freedom from disease;
or they earn their living by accounting, counting, calculation, composing poetry, or teaching hedonistic arts & doctrines *[lokāyata]*—
the contemplative Gotama abstains from wrong livelihood, from "animal" arts such as these.'

"Or: 'Whereas some contemplatives & brahmans, living off food given in faith, maintain themselves by wrong livelihood, by such "animal" arts as:

calculating auspicious dates for marriages—both those in which the bride is brought home and those in which she is sent out; calculating auspicious dates for betrothals and divorces; for collecting debts or making investments and loans; reciting charms to make people attractive or unattractive; curing women who have undergone miscarriages or abortions;
reciting spells to bind a man's tongue, to paralyze his jaws, to make him lose control over his hands, or to bring on deafness;
getting oracular answers to questions addressed to a spirit in a mirror, in a young girl, or to a spirit medium;
worshipping the sun, worshipping the Great Brahmā, bringing forth flames from the mouth, invoking the goddess of luck—
the contemplative Gotama abstains from wrong livelihood, from "animal" arts such as these.'

"Or: 'Whereas some contemplatives & brahmans, living off food given in faith, maintain themselves by wrong livelihood, by such "animal" arts as:

promising gifts to deities in return for favors; fulfilling such promises;
demonology;
reciting spells in earth houses [see earth skills, above];
inducing virility and impotence;

preparing sites for construction;
consecrating sites for construction;
giving ceremonial mouthwashes & ceremonial baths;
offering sacrificial fires;
administering emetics, purges, purges from above, purges from below, head-purges; ear-oil, eye-drops, treatments through the nose, ointments, and counter-ointments; practicing eye-surgery [or: extractive surgery], general surgery, pediatrics; administering root-medicines and binding medicinal herbs—
the contemplative Gotama abstains from wrong livelihood, from "animal" arts such as these.'

"It's of this, monks, that a run-of-the-mill person, when praising the Tathāgata, would speak.

"These are the minor matters, lower matters, matters of virtue, of which a run-of-the-mill person, when praising the Tathāgata, would speak.

*View Standpoints*

"There are, monks, other dhammas—deep, hard to see, hard to realize, tranquil, refined, beyond the scope of conjecture, subtle, to-be-experienced by the wise—that the Tathāgata proclaims, having directly known & realized them for himself, and that those who, rightly speaking in praise of the Tathāgata in line with what is factual, would speak. And what are those dhammas—deep, hard to see, hard to realize, tranquil, refined, beyond the scope of conjecture, subtle, to-be-experienced by the wise—that the Tathāgata proclaims, having directly known & realized them for himself, and that those who, rightly speaking in praise of the Tathāgata in line with what is factual, would speak?

*Theorists about the Past*

"There are some contemplatives & brahmans who are theorists about the past, who hold views about the past, who approve of various beliefs with reference to the past on 18 grounds. And with reference to what, coming from what, are these honorable contemplatives & brahmans theorists about the past who hold views about the past, who approve of various beliefs with reference to the past on 18 grounds?

***Eternalism***

"There are some contemplatives & brahmans who are adherents of eternalism, who proclaim an eternal self & cosmos[1] on four grounds. And with reference to what, coming from what, are these honorable contemplatives & brahmans adherents of eternalism who proclaim an eternal self & cosmos on four grounds?

1. "There is the case where a certain contemplative or brahman—through ardency, through exertion, through commitment, through heedfulness, through right attention—touches an awareness-concentration such that in his concentrated mind—purified, bright, unblemished, rid of defilement[2]—he remembers many past lives, i.e., one birth, two… five, ten… fifty, a hundred, a thousand, a hundred thousand, many hundreds, many thousands, many hundred thousands:[3] 'There I had such a name, belonged to such a clan, had such an appearance. Such was my food, such my experience of pleasure & pain, such the end of my life. Passing away from that state, I re-arose there. There too I had such a name, belonged to such a clan, had such an appearance. Such was my food, such my experience of pleasure & pain, such the end of my life. Passing away from that state, I re-arose here.' Thus he recollects his manifold past lives in their modes & details.

"He says: 'The self & the cosmos are eternal, barren, stable as a mountain-peak, standing firm like a pillar. And although beings transmigrate, wander on, die, & reappear, there still is that which is for eternity. Why is that? Because I—through ardency, through exertion, through commitment, through heedfulness, through right attention—touch an awareness-concentration such that in my concentrated mind—purified, bright, unblemished, rid of defilement—I remember many past lives, i.e., one birth, two… five, ten… fifty, a hundred, a thousand, a hundred thousand, many hundreds, many thousands, many hundred

thousands: 'There I had such a name, belonged to such a clan, had such an appearance. Such was my food, such my experience of pleasure & pain, such the end of my life. Passing away from that state, I re-arose there. There too I had such a name, belonged to such a clan, had such an appearance. Such was my food, such my experience of pleasure & pain, such the end of my life. Passing away from that state, I re-arose here.' Thus I recollect my manifold past lives in their modes & details. By means of this I know how the self & the cosmos are eternal, barren, stable as a mountain-peak, standing firm like a pillar. And although beings transmigrate, wander on, die, & reappear, there still is that which is for eternity.'

"This is the first basis—with reference to which, coming from which—some contemplatives & brahmans are adherents of eternalism who proclaim an eternal self & cosmos.

2. "As for the second: With reference to what, coming from what, are honorable contemplatives & brahmans adherents of eternalism who proclaim an eternal self & cosmos?

"There is the case where a certain contemplative or brahman—through ardency, through exertion, through commitment, through heedfulness, through right attention—touches an awareness-concentration such that in his concentrated mind—purified, bright, unblemished, rid of defilement—he remembers many past lives, i.e., one eon of cosmic contraction & expansion, two eons… three… four… five… six… seven… eight… nine… ten eons of cosmic contraction & expansion.…

"He says: 'The self & the cosmos are eternal, barren, stable as a mountain-peak, standing firm like a pillar. And although beings transmigrate, wander on, die, & reappear, there is still that which is for eternity. Why is that? Because I—through ardency, through exertion, through commitment, through heedfulness, through right attention—touch an awareness-concentration such that in my concentrated mind—purified, bright, unblemished, rid of defilement—I remember many past lives… By means of this I know how the self & the cosmos are eternal, barren, stable as a mountain-peak, standing firm like a pillar. And although beings transmigrate, wander on, die, & reappear, there still is that which is for eternity.'

"This is the second basis—with reference to which, coming from which—some contemplatives & brahmans are adherents of eternalism who proclaim an eternal self & cosmos.

3. "As for the third: With reference to what, coming from what, are honorable contemplatives & brahmans adherents of eternalism who proclaim an eternal self & cosmos?

"There is the case where a certain contemplative or brahman—through ardency, through exertion, through commitment, through heedfulness, through right attention—touches an awareness-concentration such that in his concentrated mind—purified, bright, unblemished, rid of defilement—he remembers many past lives, i.e., ten eons of cosmic contraction & expansion, twenty… thirty… forty eons of cosmic contraction & expansion.…

"He says: 'The self & the cosmos are eternal, barren, stable as a mountain-peak, standing firm like a pillar. And although beings transmigrate, wander on, die, & reappear, there is still that which is for eternity. Why is that? Because I—through ardency, through exertion, through commitment, through heedfulness, through right attention—touch an awareness-concentration such that in my concentrated mind—purified, bright, unblemished, rid of defilement—I remember many past lives… By means of this I know how the self & the cosmos are eternal, barren, stable as a mountain-peak, standing firm like a pillar. And although beings transmigrate, wander on, die, & reappear, there still is that which is for eternity.'

"This is the third basis—with reference to which, coming from which—some contemplatives & brahmans are adherents of eternalism who proclaim an eternal self & cosmos.

4. "As for the fourth: With reference to what, coming from what, are honorable contemplatives & brahmans adherents of eternalism who proclaim an eternal self & cosmos?

"There is the case where a certain contemplative or brahman is a logician,[4] an inquirer. He states his own improvisation, hammered out by logic, deduced from his inquiries: 'The self & the cosmos are barren, stable as a mountain-peak, standing firm like a pillar. And even though

beings transmigrate, wander on, die, & reappear, there still is that which is for eternity.'

"This is the fourth basis—with reference to which, coming from which—some contemplatives & brahmans are adherents of eternalism, who proclaim an eternal self & cosmos.

"These, monks, are the contemplatives & brahmans who are adherents of eternalism, who proclaim an eternal self & cosmos on four grounds. And whatever contemplatives & brahmans who are adherents of eternalism, who proclaim an eternal self & cosmos, they all do so on one or another of these four grounds. There is nothing outside of this.[5]

"With regard to this, the Tathāgata discerns that 'These standpoints, thus seized, thus grasped at, lead to such & such a destination, to such & such a state in the world beyond.' That the Tathāgata discerns. And he discerns what is higher than that. And yet, discerning that, he does not grasp at it. And as he is not grasping at it, unbinding *[nibbuti]* is experienced right within. Knowing, as they have come to be, the origination, ending, allure, & drawbacks of feelings, along with the escape from feelings, the Tathāgata, monks—through lack of clinging/sustenance—is released.[6]

"These, monks, are the dhammas—deep, hard to see, hard to realize, tranquil, refined, beyond the scope of conjecture, subtle, to-be-experienced by the wise—that the Tathāgata proclaims, having directly known & realized them for himself, and that those who, rightly speaking in praise of the Tathāgata in line with what is factual, would speak.

[ II ]

***Partial Eternalism***

"There are some contemplatives & brahmans who are partially eternalists and partially non-eternalists, who proclaim a partially eternal and partially non-eternal self & cosmos on four grounds.[7] And with reference to what, coming from what, are these honorable contemplatives & brahmans partially eternalists and partially non-eternalists who proclaim a partially eternal and partially non-eternal self & cosmos on four grounds?

5. "There ultimately comes a time when, with the passing of a long stretch of time, this cosmos devolves. When the cosmos is devolving, beings for the most part head toward the Radiant (brahmās). There they stay: mind-made, feeding on rapture, self-luminous, coursing through the air, established in beauty for a long stretch of time. Then there ultimately comes a time when, with the passing of a long stretch of time, this cosmos evolves. When the cosmos is evolving, an empty Brahmā palace appears. Then a certain being—from the exhaustion of his life span or the exhaustion of his merit[8]—falls from the company of the Radiant and re-arises in the empty Brahmā palace. And there he still stays mind-made, feeding on rapture, self-luminous, coursing through the air, established in beauty for a long stretch of time.

"After dwelling there alone for a long time, he experiences displeasure & agitation: 'O, if only other beings would come to this world!'

"Then other beings, through the ending of their life span or the ending of their merit, fall from the company of the Radiant and reappear in the Brahmā palace, in the company of that being. And there they still stay mind-made, feeding on rapture, self-luminous, coursing through the air, established in beauty for a long stretch of time.

"Then the thought occurs to the being who reappeared first: 'I am Brahmā, the Great Brahmā, the Conqueror, the Unconquered, the All-Seeing, All-Powerful, the Sovereign Lord, the Maker, Creator, Chief, Appointer & Ruler, Father of All That Have Been & Shall Be.[9] These beings were created by me. Why is that? First the thought occurred to me, "O, if only other beings would come to this world!" And thus my direction of will brought these beings to this world.' As for the beings who reappeared later, this thought occurs to them: 'This is Brahmā… Father of All That Have Been & Shall Be. We were created by this Brahmā. Why is that? We saw that he appeared here before, while we appeared after.' The being who reappeared first is of longer life span, more beautiful, & more influential, while the beings who reappeared later are of shorter life span, less beautiful, & less influential.

"Now, there is the possibility, monks, that a certain being, having fallen from that company, comes to this world. Having come to this world, he goes forth from the home life into homelessness. Having gone forth from

the home life into homelessness, he—through ardency, through exertion, through commitment, through heedfulness, through right attention—touches an awareness-concentration such that in his concentrated mind he recollects that former life, but nothing prior to that. He says, 'We were created by Brahmā, the Great Brahmā, the Conqueror, the Unconquered, the All-Seeing, All-Powerful, the Sovereign Lord, the Maker, Creator, Chief, Appointer and Ruler, Father of All That Have Been and Shall Be. He is constant, permanent, eternal, not subject to change, and will remain just like that for eternity. But we who have been created by him—inconstant, impermanent, short-lived, subject to falling—have come to this world.'

"This is the first basis—with reference to which, coming from which—some contemplatives & brahmans are partially eternalists and partially non-eternalists who proclaim a partially eternal and partially non-eternal self & cosmos.

6. "As for the second: With reference to what, coming from what, are contemplatives & brahmans partially eternalists and partially non-eternalists who proclaim a partially eternal and partially non-eternal self & cosmos?

"There are, monks, devas called Corrupted by Play.[10] They spend an excessive amount of time indulging in the delights of laughter & play. Because they spend an excessive amount of time indulging in the delights of laughter & play, their mindfulness becomes muddled. Because of muddled mindfulness, they fall from that company of devas.

"Now, there is the possibility, monks, that a certain being, having fallen from that company, comes to this world. Having come to this world, he goes forth from the home life into homelessness. Having gone forth from the home life into homelessness, he—through ardency, through exertion, through commitment, through heedfulness, through right attention—touches an awareness-concentration such that in his concentrated mind he recollects that former life, but nothing prior to that. He says, 'Those honorable devas who are not corrupted by play don't spend an excessive amount of time indulging in the delights of laughter & play. Because they don't spend an excessive amount of time indulging in the delights of laughter & play, their mindfulness doesn't become muddled. Because of

unmuddled mindfulness, they don't fall from that company. They are constant, permanent, eternal, not subject to change, and will remain just like that for eternity. But those of us who were corrupted by play spent an excessive amount of time indulging in the delights of laughter & play. Because we spent an excessive amount of time indulging in the delights of laughter & play, our mindfulness became muddled. Because of muddled mindfulness, we fell from that company and—inconstant, impermanent, short-lived, subject to falling—have come to this world.'

"This is the second basis—with reference to which, coming from which—some contemplatives & brahmans are partially eternalists and partially non-eternalists who proclaim a partially eternal and partially non-eternal self & cosmos.

7. "As for the third: With reference to what, coming from what, are contemplatives & brahmans partially eternalists and partially non-eternalists who proclaim a partially eternal and partially non-eternal self & cosmos?

"There are, monks, devas called Corrupted by Mind. They spend an excessive amount of time staring at one another.[11] Because they spend an excessive amount of time staring at one another, their minds become corrupted toward one another. Because they are corrupted in mind toward one another, they grow exhausted in body & exhausted in mind. They fall from that company of devas.

"Now, there is the possibility, monks, that a certain being, having fallen from that company, comes to this world. Having come to this world, he goes forth from the home life into homelessness. Having gone forth from the home life into homelessness, he—through ardency, through exertion, through commitment, through heedfulness, through right attention—touches an awareness-concentration such that in his concentrated mind he recollects that former life, but nothing prior to that. He says, 'Those honorable devas who are not corrupted in mind don't spend an excessive amount of time staring at one another. Because they don't spend an excessive amount of time staring at one another, their minds don't become corrupted toward one another. Because they are uncorrupted in mind toward one another, they don't grow exhausted in body or exhausted in mind. They don't fall from that company. They are constant,

permanent, eternal, not subject to change, and will remain just like that for eternity. But those of us who were corrupted in mind spent an excessive amount of time staring at one another. Because we spent an excessive amount of time staring at one another, our minds became corrupted toward one another. Because we were corrupted in mind toward one another, we grew exhausted in body & exhausted in mind. We fell from that company and—inconstant, impermanent, short-lived, subject to falling—have come to this world.'

"This is the third basis—with reference to which, coming from which—some contemplatives & brahmans are partially eternalists and partially non-eternalists who proclaim a partially eternal and partially non-eternal self & cosmos.

8. "As for the fourth: With reference to what, coming from what, are contemplatives & brahmans partially eternalists and partially non-eternalists who proclaim a partially eternal and partially non-eternal self & cosmos?

"There is the case where a certain contemplative or brahman is a logician, an inquirer. He states his own improvisation, hammered out by logic, deduced from his inquiries: 'That which is called "eye" & "ear" & "nose" & "tongue" & "body": That self is inconstant, impermanent, non-eternal, subject to change. But that which is called "mind" or "intellect" or "consciousness": That self is constant, permanent, eternal, not subject to change, and will remain just like that for eternity.'[12]

"This is the fourth basis—with reference to which, coming from which—some contemplatives & brahmans are partially eternalists and partially non-eternalists who proclaim a partially eternal and partially non-eternal self & cosmos.

"These, monks, are the contemplatives & brahmans who are partially eternalists and partially non-eternalists, who proclaim a partially eternal and partially non-eternal self & cosmos on four grounds. And whatever contemplatives & brahmans who partially eternalists and partially non-eternalists, who proclaim a partially eternal and partially non-eternal self & cosmos, they all do so on one or another of these four grounds. There is nothing outside of this.

"With regard to this, the Tathāgata discerns that 'These standpoints, thus seized, thus grasped at, lead to such & such a destination, to such & such a state in the world beyond.' That the Tathāgata discerns. And he discerns what is higher than that. And yet, discerning that, he does not grasp at it. And as he is not grasping at it, unbinding *[nibbuti]* is experienced right within. Knowing, as they have come to be, the origination, ending, allure, & drawbacks of feelings, along with the escape from feelings, the Tathāgata, monks—through lack of clinging/sustenance—is released.

"These, monks, are the dhammas—deep, hard to see, hard to realize, tranquil, refined, beyond the scope of conjecture, subtle, to-be-experienced by the wise—that the Tathāgata proclaims, having directly known & realized them for himself, and that those who, rightly speaking in praise of the Tathāgata in line with what is factual, would speak.

***Finite or Infinite Cosmos***

"There are some contemplatives & brahmans who are finite-ists or infinite-ists, who proclaim a finite or infinite cosmos on four grounds.[13] And with reference to what, coming from what, are these honorable contemplatives & brahmans finite-ists or infinite-ists who proclaim a finite or infinite cosmos on four grounds?

9. "There is the case where a certain contemplative or brahman—through ardency, through exertion, through commitment, through heedfulness, through right attention—touches an awareness-concentration such that he remains with the perception of 'finite' with regard to the cosmos. He says, 'This cosmos is finite, encircled. Why is that? Because I… have attained an awareness-concentration such that I remain with the perception of "finite" with regard to the cosmos. By means of that, I know that the cosmos is finite, encircled.'

"This is the first basis—with reference to which, coming from which—some contemplatives & brahmans are finite-ists or infinite-ists who proclaim a finite or infinite cosmos.

10. "As for the second: With reference to what, coming from what, are honorable contemplatives & brahmans finite-ists or infinite-ists who proclaim a finite or infinite cosmos?

"There is the case where a certain contemplative or brahman… touches an awareness-concentration such that he remains with the perception of 'infinite' with regard to the cosmos. He says, 'This cosmos is infinite, unencircled. Those contemplatives & brahmans who say that this cosmos is finite, encircled: That is a falsehood on their part. This cosmos is infinite, unencircled. Why is that? Because I… have touched an awareness-concentration such that I remain with the perception of "infinite" with regard to the cosmos. By means of that, I know that the cosmos is infinite, unencircled.'

"This is the second basis—with reference to which, coming from which—some contemplatives & brahmans are finite-ists or infinite-ists who proclaim a finite or infinite cosmos.

11. "As for the third: With reference to what, coming from what, are honorable contemplatives & brahmans finite-ists or infinite-ists who proclaim a finite or infinite cosmos?

"There is the case where a certain contemplative or brahman… touches an awareness-concentration such that he remains with the perception of 'finite' with regard to the cosmos above & below, but with the perception of 'infinite' all around. He says, 'This cosmos is finite & infinite. Those contemplatives & brahmans who say that this cosmos is finite, encircled: That is a falsehood on their part. Those contemplatives & brahmans who say that this cosmos is infinite, unencircled: That is a falsehood on their part, too. This cosmos is finite & infinite. Why is that? Because I… have attained an awareness-concentration such that I remain with the perception of "finite" with regard to the cosmos above & below, but with the perception of "infinite" all around. By means of that, I know that the cosmos is finite & infinite.'

"This is the third basis—with reference to which, coming from which—some contemplatives & brahmans are finite-ists or infinite-ists who proclaim a finite or infinite cosmos.

12. "As for the fourth: With reference to what, coming from what, are honorable contemplatives & brahmans finite-ists or infinite-ists who proclaim a finite or infinite cosmos?

"There is the case where a certain contemplative or brahman is a logician, an inquirer. He states his own improvisation, hammered out by

logic, deduced from his inquiries: 'The cosmos is neither finite nor infinite. Those contemplatives & brahmans who say that this cosmos is finite, encircled: That is a falsehood on their part. Those contemplatives & brahmans who say that this cosmos is infinite, unencircled: That is a falsehood on their part, too. Those contemplatives & brahmans who say that this cosmos is finite & infinite: That is a falsehood on their part, too. The cosmos is neither finite nor infinite.'

"This is the fourth basis—with reference to which, coming from which—some contemplatives & brahmans are finite-ists or infinite-ists who proclaim a finite or infinite cosmos.

"These, monks, are the contemplatives & brahmans who are finite-ists or infinite-ists who proclaim a finite or infinite cosmos on four grounds. And whatever contemplatives & brahmans who are finite-ists or infinite-ists, who proclaim a finite or infinite cosmos, they all do so on one or another of these four grounds. There is nothing outside of this.

"With regard to this, the Tathāgata discerns that 'These standpoints, thus seized, thus grasped at, lead to such & such a destination, to such & such a state in the world beyond.' That the Tathāgata discerns. And he discerns what is higher than that. And yet, discerning that, he does not grasp at it. And as he is not grasping at it, unbinding *[nibbuti]* is experienced right within. Knowing, as they have come to be, the origination, ending, allure, & drawbacks of feelings, along with the escape from feelings, the Tathāgata, monks—through lack of clinging/sustenance—is released.

"These, monks, are the dhammas—deep, hard to see, hard to realize, tranquil, refined, beyond the scope of conjecture, subtle, to-be-experienced by the wise—that the Tathāgata proclaims, having directly known & realized them for himself, and that those who, rightly speaking in praise of the Tathāgata in line with what is factual, would speak.

***Eel-wriggling***

"There are, monks, some contemplatives & brahmans who, being asked questions regarding this or that, resort to verbal contortions, to eel-wriggling, on four grounds. And with reference to what, coming from what, do these honorable contemplatives & brahmans, when being asked

questions regarding this or that, resort to verbal contortions, to eel-wriggling, on four grounds?

13."There is the case where a certain contemplative or brahman doesn't discern as it has come to be that 'This is skillful,' or that 'This is unskillful.' The thought occurs to him: 'I don't discern as it has come to be that "This is skillful," or that "This is unskillful." If I—not discerning as it has come to be that "This is skillful," not discerning as it has come to be that "This is unskillful"—were to declare that "This is skillful," or that "This is unskillful": That would be a falsehood on my part. Whatever would be a falsehood on my part would be a distress for me. Whatever would be a distress for me would be an obstacle for me.' So, out of fear of falsehood, a loathing for falsehood, he does not declare that 'This is skillful,' or that 'This is unskillful.'[14] Being asked questions regarding this or that, he resorts to verbal contortions, to eel-wriggling: 'I don't think so. I don't think in that way. I don't think otherwise. I don't think not. I don't think not not.'

"This is the first basis—with reference to which, coming from which—some contemplatives & brahmans, when being asked questions regarding this or that, resort to verbal contortions, to eel-wriggling.

"As for the second: With reference to what, coming from what, do honorable contemplatives & brahmans, when being asked questions regarding this or that, resort to verbal contortions, to eel-wriggling?

14. "There is the case where a certain contemplative or brahman doesn't discern as it has come to be that 'This is skillful,' or that 'This is unskillful.' The thought occurs to him: 'I don't discern as it has come to be that "This is skillful," or that "This is unskillful." If I—not discerning as it has come to be that "This is skillful," not discerning as it has come to be that "This is unskillful"—were to declare that "This is skillful," or that "This is unskillful": That would be a desire on my part, a passion, an aversion, or an irritation on my part. Whatever would be a desire or passion or aversion or irritation on my part would be a clinging on my part. Whatever would be a clinging on my part would be a distress for me. Whatever would be a distress for me would be an obstacle for me.' So, out of fear of clinging, a loathing for clinging, he does not declare that 'This is skillful,' or that 'This is unskillful.' Being asked questions regarding this or

that, he resorts to verbal contortions, to eel-wriggling: 'I don't think so. I don't think in that way. I don't think otherwise. I don't think not. I don't think not not.'

"This is the second basis—with reference to which, coming from which—some contemplatives & brahmans, when being asked questions regarding this or that, resort to verbal contortions, to eel-wriggling.

15. "As for the third: With reference to what, coming from what, do honorable contemplatives & brahmans, when being asked questions regarding this or that, resort to verbal contortions, to eel-wriggling?

"There is the case where a certain contemplative or brahman doesn't discern as it has come to be that 'This is skillful,' or that 'This is unskillful.' The thought occurs to him: 'I don't discern as it has come to be that "This is skillful," or that "This is unskillful." If I—not discerning as it has come to be that "This is skillful," not discerning as it has come to be that "This is unskillful"—were to declare that "This is skillful," or that "This is unskillful": There are contemplatives & brahmans who are pundits, subtle, masters of debate. Like hair-splitting marksmen, they prowl about, shooting [philosophical] standpoints to pieces, as it were, with their dialectic. They might cross-question me there, press me for reasons, rebuke me. When they would cross-question me there, press me for reasons, rebuke me, I might not be able to stand my ground against them. The fact that I would not stand my ground would be a distress for me. Whatever would be a distress for me would be an obstacle for me.' So, out of a fear for interrogation, a loathing for interrogation, he does not declare that 'This is skillful' or that 'This is unskillful.' Being asked questions regarding this or that, he resorts to verbal contortions, to eel-wriggling: 'I don't think so. I don't think in that way. I don't think otherwise. I don't think not. I don't think not not.'

"This is the third basis—with reference to which, coming from which—some contemplatives & brahmans, when being asked questions regarding this or that, resort to verbal contortions, to eel-wriggling.

16. "As for the fourth: With reference to what, coming from what, do honorable contemplatives & brahmans, when being asked questions regarding this or that, resort to verbal contortions, to eel-wriggling?

"There is the case where a certain contemplative or brahman is dull & exceedingly stupid. Out of dullness & exceeding stupidity, he—being asked questions regarding this or that—resorts to verbal contortions, to eel-wriggling: 'If you ask me if there exists another world [after death],[15] if I thought that there exists another world, would I declare that to you? I don't think so. I don't think in that way. I don't think otherwise. I don't think not. I don't think not not. If you asked me if there isn't another world… both is & isn't… neither is nor isn't… if there are beings who wander on[16]… if there aren't… both are & aren't… neither are nor aren't… if the Tathāgata exists after death… doesn't exist after death… both exists & doesn't exist after death… neither exists nor doesn't exist after death,[17] would I declare that to you? I don't think so. I don't think in that way. I don't think otherwise. I don't think not. I don't think not not.'

"This is the fourth basis—with reference to which, coming from which—some contemplatives & brahmans, when being asked questions regarding this or that, resort to verbal contortions, to eel-wriggling.

"These, monks, are the contemplatives & brahmans who, being asked questions regarding this or that, resort to verbal contortions, to eel-wriggling. And whatever contemplatives & brahmans who, being asked questions regarding this or that, resort to verbal contortions, to eel-wriggling, they all do so on one or another of these four grounds. There is nothing outside of this.

"With regard to this, the Tathāgata discerns that 'These standpoints, thus seized, thus grasped at, lead to such & such a destination, to such & such a state in the world beyond.' That the Tathāgata discerns. And he discerns what is higher than that. And yet, discerning that, he does not grasp at it. And as he is not grasping at it, unbinding *[nibbuti]* is experienced right within. Knowing, as they have come to be, the origination, ending, allure, & drawbacks of feelings, along with the escape from feelings, the Tathāgata, monks—through lack of clinging/sustenance—is released.

"These, monks, are the dhammas—deep, hard to see, hard to realize, tranquil, refined, beyond the scope of conjecture, subtle, to-be-experienced by the wise—that the Tathāgata proclaims, having directly

known & realized them for himself, and that those who, rightly speaking in praise of the Tathāgata in line with what is factual, would speak.

***Fortuitous-arising***

"There are, monks, some contemplatives & brahmans who are fortuitous-arising-ists, who proclaim a fortuitously-arisen self & cosmos on two grounds.[18] And with reference to what, coming from what, are these honorable contemplatives & brahmans fortuitous-arising-ists who proclaim a fortuitously-arisen self & cosmos on two grounds?

17. "There are, monks, devas called Non-percipient Beings.[19] But, with the arising of perception, they fall from that company of devas. Now, there is the possibility, monks, that a certain being, having fallen from that company, comes to this world. Having come to this world, he goes forth from the home life into homelessness. Having gone forth from the home life into homelessness, he—through ardency, through exertion, through commitment, through heedfulness, through right attention—touches an awareness-concentration such that he recollects the arising of perception, but nothing prior to that. He says, 'The self & the cosmos are fortuitously arisen. Why is that? Because before I wasn't; now I am. Not having been, I sprang into being.'

"This is the first basis—with reference to which, coming from which—some contemplatives & brahmans are fortuitous-arising-ists who proclaim a fortuitously-arisen self & cosmos.

18. "As for the second: With reference to what, coming from what, are honorable contemplatives & brahmans fortuitous-arising-ists who proclaim a fortuitously-arisen self & cosmos?

"There is the case where a certain contemplative or brahman is a logician, an inquirer. He states his own improvisation, hammered out by logic, deduced from his inquiries: 'The self & the cosmos are fortuitously arisen.'

"This is the second basis—with reference to which, coming from which—some contemplatives & brahmans are fortuitous-arising-ists, who proclaim a fortuitously-arisen self & cosmos.

"These, monks, are the contemplatives & brahmans who are fortuitous-arising-ists, who proclaim a fortuitously-arisen self & cosmos on two

grounds. And whatever contemplatives & brahmans who are fortuitous-arising-ists, who proclaim a fortuitously-arisen self & cosmos, they all do so on one or another of these two grounds. There is nothing outside of this.

"With regard to this, the Tathāgata discerns that 'These standpoints, thus seized, thus grasped at, lead to such & such a destination, to such & such a state in the world beyond.' That the Tathāgata discerns. And he discerns what is higher than that. And yet, discerning that, he does not grasp at it. And as he is not grasping at it, unbinding *[nibbuti]* is experienced right within. Knowing, as they have come to be, the origination, ending, allure, & drawbacks of feelings, along with the escape from feelings, the Tathāgata, monks—through lack of clinging/sustenance—is released.

"These, monks, are the dhammas—deep, hard to see, hard to realize, tranquil, refined, beyond the scope of conjecture, subtle, to-be-experienced by the wise—that the Tathāgata proclaims, having directly known & realized them for himself, and that those who, rightly speaking in praise of the Tathāgata in line with what is factual, would speak.

"These, monks, are the contemplatives & brahmans who are theorists about the past, who hold views about the past, who approve of various beliefs with reference to the past on 18 grounds. And whatever contemplatives & brahmans who are theorists about the past, who hold views about the past, who approve of various beliefs with reference to the past, they all do so on one or another of these 18 grounds. There is nothing outside of this.

"With regard to this, the Tathāgata discerns that 'These standpoints, thus seized, thus grasped at, lead to such & such a destination, to such & such a state in the world beyond.' That the Tathāgata discerns. And he discerns what is higher than that. And yet, discerning that, he does not grasp at it. And as he is not grasping at it, unbinding *[nibbuti]* is experienced right within. Knowing, as they have come to be, the origination, ending, allure, & drawbacks of feelings, along with the escape from feelings, the Tathāgata, monks—through lack of clinging/sustenance—is released.

"These, monks, are the dhammas—deep, hard to see, hard to realize, tranquil, refined, beyond the scope of conjecture, subtle, to-be-experienced by the wise—that the Tathāgata proclaims, having directly known & realized them for himself, and that those who, rightly speaking in praise of the Tathāgata in line with what is factual, would speak.

### *Theorists about the Future*

"There are some contemplatives & brahmans who are theorists about the future, who hold views about the future, who approve of various beliefs with reference to the future on 44 grounds. And with reference to what, coming from what, are these honorable contemplatives & brahmans theorists about the past who hold views about the future, who approve of various beliefs with reference to the future on 44 grounds?

#### *Percipient After-death*

"There are, monks, some contemplatives & brahmans who are adherents of a percipient after-death, who proclaim a percipient self[20] after death on 16 grounds. And with reference to what, coming from what, are these honorable contemplatives & brahmans adherents of a percipient after-death, who proclaim a percipient self after death on 16 grounds?

"They proclaim that the self after death is undiseased,[21] percipient, &:

19. possessed of form,
20. formless,
21. possessed of form & formless,
22. neither possessed of form nor formless,
23. finite,
24. infinite,
25. both finite & infinite,
26. neither finite nor infinite,
27. percipient of singleness,
28. percipient of multiplicity,
29. percipient of what is limited,
30. percipient of what is limitless,
31. exclusively pleasant,[22]

32. exclusively pained,
33. both pleasant & pained,
34. neither pleasant nor pained.

"These, monks, are the contemplatives & brahmans who are adherents of a percipient after-death, who proclaim a percipient self after death on 16 grounds. And whatever contemplatives & brahmans who are adherents of a percipient after-death, who proclaim a percipient self after death, they all do so on one or another of these 16 grounds. There is nothing outside of this.

"With regard to this, the Tathāgata discerns that 'These standpoints, thus seized, thus grasped at, lead to such & such a destination, to such & such a state in the world beyond.' That the Tathāgata discerns. And he discerns what is higher than that. And yet, discerning that, he does not grasp at it. And as he is not grasping at it, unbinding *[nibbuti]* is experienced right within. Knowing, as they have come to be, the origination, ending, allure, & drawbacks of feelings, along with the escape from feelings, the Tathāgata, monks—through lack of clinging/sustenance—is released.

"These, monks, are the dhammas—deep, hard to see, hard to realize, tranquil, refined, beyond the scope of conjecture, subtle, to-be-experienced by the wise—that the Tathāgata proclaims, having directly known & realized them for himself, and that those who, rightly speaking in praise of the Tathāgata in line with what is factual, would speak.

***Non-percipient After-death***

"There are, monks, some contemplatives & brahmans who are adherents of a non-percipient after-death, who proclaim a non-percipient self after death on eight grounds. And with reference to what, coming from what, are these honorable contemplatives & brahmans adherents of a non-percipient after-death who proclaim a non-percipient self after death on eight grounds?

"They proclaim that the self after death is undiseased, non-percipient, &:

35. possessed of form,

36. formless,
37. possessed of form & formless,
38. neither possessed of form nor formless,
39. finite,
40. infinite,
41. both finite & infinite,
42. neither finite nor infinite.

"These, monks, are the contemplatives & brahmans who are adherents of a non-percipient after-death, who proclaim a non-percipient self after death on eight grounds. And whatever contemplatives & brahmans who are adherents of a non-percipient after-death, who proclaim a non-percipient self after death, they all do so on one or another of these eight grounds. There is nothing outside of this.

"With regard to this, the Tathāgata discerns that 'These standpoints, thus seized, thus grasped at, lead to such & such a destination, to such & such a state in the world beyond.' That the Tathāgata discerns. And he discerns what is higher than that. And yet, discerning that, he does not grasp at it. And as he is not grasping at it, unbinding *[nibbuti]* is experienced right within. Knowing, as they have come to be, the origination, ending, allure, & drawbacks of feelings, along with the escape from feelings, the Tathāgata, monks—through lack of clinging/sustenance—is released.

"These, monks, are the dhammas—deep, hard to see, hard to realize, tranquil, refined, beyond the scope of conjecture, subtle, to-be-experienced by the wise—that the Tathāgata proclaims, having directly known & realized them for himself, and that those who, rightly speaking in praise of the Tathāgata in line with what is factual, would speak.

***Neither Percipient nor Non-percipient After-death***

"There are, monks, some contemplatives & brahmans who are adherents of a neither percipient nor non-percipient after-death, who proclaim a neither percipient nor non-percipient self after death on eight grounds. And with reference to what, coming from what, are these honorable contemplatives & brahmans adherents of a neither percipient

nor non-percipient after-death who proclaim a neither percipient nor non-percipient self after death on eight grounds?

"They proclaim that the self after death is undiseased, neither percipient nor non-percipient, &:

43. possessed of form,
44. formless,
45. possessed of form & formless,
46. neither possessed of form nor formless,
47. finite,
48. infinite,
49. both finite & infinite,
50. neither finite nor infinite.

"These, monks, are the contemplatives & brahmans who are adherents of a neither percipient nor non-percipient after-death, who proclaim a neither percipient nor non-percipient self after death on eight grounds. And whatever contemplatives & brahmans who are adherents of a neither percipient nor non-percipient after-death, who proclaim a neither percipient nor non-percipient self after death, they all do so on one or another of these eight grounds. There is nothing outside of this.

"With regard to this, the Tathāgata discerns that 'These standpoints, thus seized, thus grasped at, lead to such & such a destination, to such & such a state in the world beyond.' That the Tathāgata discerns. And he discerns what is higher than that. And yet, discerning that, he does not grasp at it. And as he is not grasping at it, unbinding *[nibbuti]* is experienced right within. Knowing, as they have come to be, the origination, ending, allure, & drawbacks of feelings, along with the escape from feelings, the Tathāgata, monks—through lack of clinging/sustenance—is released.

"These, monks, are the dhammas—deep, hard to see, hard to realize, tranquil, refined, beyond the scope of conjecture, subtle, to-be-experienced by the wise—that the Tathāgata proclaims, having directly known & realized them for himself, and that those who, rightly speaking in praise of the Tathāgata in line with what is factual, would speak.

***Annihilationism***

"There are, monks, some contemplatives & brahmans who are annihilationists,[23] who proclaim the annihilation, destruction, & non-becoming of an existing being *[sant satta]*[24] on seven grounds. And with reference to what, coming from what, are these honorable contemplatives & brahmans annihilationists who proclaim the annihilation, destruction, & non-becoming of an existing being on seven grounds?

51. "There is the case where a certain contemplative or brahman is of this opinion, this view: 'When the self that is possessed of form, made of the four great elements,[25] engendered by mother & father, is—with the breakup of the body—annihilated, destroyed, & does not exist after death, it's to this extent that the self is completely exterminated.' This is how some proclaim the annihilation, destruction, & non-becoming of an existing being.

52. "Another says to him, 'There is, my good man, that self of which you speak. I don't say that there's not. But it's not to that extent that the self is completely exterminated. There is another self—divine, possessed of form, on the sensual level, feeding on material food. You don't know or see that, but *I* know it, *I* see it. When this self—with the breakup of the body—is annihilated, destroyed, & does not exist after death, it's to this extent that the self is completely exterminated.' This is how some proclaim the annihilation, destruction, & non-becoming of an existing being.

53. "Another says to him, 'There is, my good man, that self of which you speak. I don't say that there's not. But it's not to that extent that the self is completely exterminated. There is another self—divine, possessed of form,[26] mind-made, complete in all its limbs, not destitute of any faculties. You don't know or see that, but *I* know it, *I* see it. When this self—with the breakup of the body—is annihilated, destroyed, & does not exist after death, it's to this extent that the self is completely exterminated.' This is how some proclaim the annihilation, destruction, & non-becoming of an existing being.

54. "Another says to him, 'There is, my good man, that self of which you speak. I don't say that there's not. But it's not to that extent that the self is completely exterminated. There is another self where—with the complete transcending of perceptions of form, with the disappearance of perceptions of resistance, and not heeding perceptions of diversity,

(perceiving,) 'Infinite space'—one enters & remains in the dimension of the infinitude of space.[27] You don't know or see that, but *I* know it, *I* see it. When this self—with the breakup of the body—is annihilated, destroyed, & does not exist after death, it's to this extent that the self is completely exterminated.'

55. "Another says to him, 'There is, my good man, that self of which you speak. I don't say that there's not. But it's not to that extent that the self is completely exterminated. There is another self where—with the complete transcending of the dimension of the infinitude of space, (perceiving,) 'Infinite consciousness'—one enters & remains in the dimension of the infinitude of consciousness. You don't know or see that, but *I* know it, *I* see it. When this self—with the breakup of the body—is annihilated, destroyed, & does not exist after death, it's to this extent that the self is completely exterminated.' This is how some proclaim the annihilation, destruction, & non-becoming of an existing being.

56. "Another says to him, 'There is, my good man, that self of which you speak. I don't say that there's not. But it's not to that extent that the self is completely exterminated. There is another self where—with the complete transcending of the dimension of the infinitude of consciousness, (perceiving,) 'There is nothing'—one enters & remains in the dimension of nothingness.[28] You don't know or see that, but *I* know it, *I* see it. When this self—with the breakup of the body—is annihilated, destroyed, & does not exist after death, it's to this extent that the self is completely exterminated.' This is how some proclaim the annihilation, destruction, & non-becoming of an existing being.

57. "Another says to him, 'There is, my good man, that self of which you speak. I don't say that there's not. But it's not to that extent that the self is completely exterminated. There is another self where—with the complete transcending of the dimension of nothingness—one enters & remains in the dimension of neither perception nor non-perception. You don't know or see that, but *I* know it, *I* see it. When this self—with the breakup of the body—is annihilated, destroyed, & does not exist after death, it's to this extent that the self is completely exterminated.' This is how some proclaim the annihilation, destruction, & non-becoming of an existing being.

"These, monks, are the contemplatives & brahmans who are annihilationists, who proclaim the annihilation, destruction, & non-becoming of an existing being on seven grounds. And whatever contemplatives & brahmans who are annihilationists who proclaim the annihilation, destruction, & non-becoming of an existing being, they all do so on one or another of these seven grounds. There is nothing outside of this.

"With regard to this, the Tathāgata discerns that 'These standpoints, thus seized, thus grasped at, lead to such & such a destination, to such & such a state in the world beyond.' That the Tathāgata discerns. And he discerns what is higher than that. And yet, discerning that, he does not grasp at it. And as he is not grasping at it, unbinding *[nibbuti]* is experienced right within. Knowing, as they have come to be, the origination, ending, allure, & drawbacks of feelings, along with the escape from feelings, the Tathāgata, monks—through lack of clinging/sustenance—is released.

"These, monks, are the dhammas—deep, hard to see, hard to realize, tranquil, refined, beyond the scope of conjecture, subtle, to-be-experienced by the wise—that the Tathāgata proclaims, having directly known & realized them for himself, and that those who, rightly speaking in praise of the Tathāgata in line with what is factual, would speak.

***The Self's Unbinding in the Here-&-Now***

"There are, monks, some contemplatives & brahmans who are proponents of unbinding *[nibbāna]* in the here-&-now, who proclaim the highest here-&-now unbinding of an existing being *[sant satta]*[29] on five grounds. And with reference to what, coming from what, are these honorable contemplatives & brahmans proponents of unbinding in the here-&-now who proclaim the highest here-&-now unbinding of an existing being on five grounds?

58. "There is the case where a certain contemplative or brahman is of this opinion, this view: 'When the self goes about endowed & provided with the five strings of sensuality, it's to this extent that the self attains the highest here-&-now unbinding.'[30] This is how some proclaim the highest here-&-now unbinding of an existing being.

59. "Another says to him, 'There is, my good man, that self of which you speak. I don't say that there's not. But it's not to that extent that one attains the highest here-&-now unbinding. Why is that? Because sensuality is inconstant, stressful, subject to change. From its condition of being subject to change & becoming otherwise arises sorrow, lamentation, pain, distress, & despair. But when this self—quite secluded from sensuality, secluded from unskillful qualities—enters & remains in the first jhāna: rapture & pleasure born of seclusion, accompanied by directed thought & evaluation,[31] it's to that extent that this self attains the highest here-&-now unbinding.' This is how some proclaim the highest here-&-now unbinding of an existing being.

60. "Another says to him, 'There is, my good man, that self of which you speak. I don't say that there's not. But it's not to that extent that one attains the highest here-&-now unbinding. Why is that? Because precisely what's thought or evaluated there: That's declared to be gross. But when this self—with the stilling of directed thoughts & evaluations—enters & remains in the second jhāna: rapture & pleasure born of concentration, unification of awareness free from directed thought & evaluation, internal assurance, it's to that extent that this self attains the highest here-&-now unbinding.' This is how some proclaim the highest here-&-now unbinding of an existing being.

61. "Another says to him, 'There is, my good man, that self of which you speak. I don't say that there's not. But it's not to that extent that one attains the highest here-&-now unbinding. Why is that? Because precisely the state of mental exhilaration immersed in rapture there: That's declared to be gross. But when this self, with the fading of rapture, remains equanimous, mindful, & alert, and, sensing pleasure with the body, enters & remains in the third jhāna, of which the noble ones declare, 'Equanimous & mindful, he has a pleasant abiding,' it's to that extent that this self attains the highest here-&-now unbinding.' This is how some proclaim the highest here-&-now unbinding of an existing being.

62. "Another says to him, 'There is, my good man, that self of which you speak. I don't say that there's not. But it's not to that extent that one attains the highest here-&-now unbinding. Why is that? Because precisely the mental concern with "pleasure" there: That's declared to be gross. But

when this self, with the abandoning of pleasure & pain—as with the earlier disappearance of elation & distress—enters & remains in the fourth jhāna: purity of equanimity & mindfulness, neither pleasure nor pain, it's to that extent that this self attains the highest here-&-now unbinding.' This is how some proclaim the highest here-&-now unbinding of an existing being.

"These, monks, are the contemplatives & brahmans who are proponents of unbinding in the here-&-now, who proclaim the highest here-&-now unbinding of an existing being on five grounds. And whatever contemplatives & brahmans who are proponents of unbinding in the here-&-now, who proclaim the highest here-&-now unbinding of an existing being, they all do so on one or another of these five grounds. There is nothing outside of this.

"With regard to this, the Tathāgata discerns that 'These standpoints, thus seized, thus grasped at, lead to such & such a destination, to such & such a state in the world beyond.' That the Tathāgata discerns. And he discerns what is higher than that. And yet, discerning that, he does not grasp at it. And as he is not grasping at it, unbinding *[nibbuti]* is experienced right within. Knowing, as they have come to be, the origination, ending, allure, & drawbacks of feelings, along with the escape from feelings, the Tathāgata, monks—through lack of clinging/sustenance—is released.

"These, monks, are the dhammas—deep, hard to see, hard to realize, tranquil, refined, beyond the scope of conjecture, subtle, to-be-experienced by the wise—that the Tathāgata proclaims, having directly known & realized them for himself, and that those who, rightly speaking in praise of the Tathāgata in line with what is factual, would speak.

"These, monks, are the contemplatives & brahmans who are theorists about the future, who hold views about the future, who approve of various beliefs with reference to the future on 44 grounds. And whatever contemplatives & brahmans who are theorists about the future, who hold views about the future, who approve of various beliefs with reference to the future, they all do so on one or another of these 44 grounds. There is nothing outside of this.

"With regard to this, the Tathāgata discerns that 'These standpoints, thus seized, thus grasped at, lead to such & such a destination, to such & such a state in the world beyond.' That the Tathāgata discerns. And he discerns what is higher than that. And yet, discerning that, he does not grasp at it. And as he is not grasping at it, unbinding *[nibbuti]* is experienced right within. Knowing, as they have come to be, the origination, ending, allure, & drawbacks of feelings, along with the escape from feelings, the Tathāgata, monks—through lack of clinging/sustenance—is released.

"These, monks, are the dhammas—deep, hard to see, hard to realize, tranquil, refined, beyond the scope of conjecture, subtle, to-be-experienced by the wise—that the Tathāgata proclaims, having directly known & realized them for himself, and that those who, rightly speaking in praise of the Tathāgata in line with what is factual, would speak.

"These, monks, are the contemplatives & brahmans who are theorists about the past, theorists about the future, & theorists about the past & the future, who hold views about the past & the future, who approve of various beliefs with reference to the past & the future on 62 grounds. And whatever contemplatives & brahmans who are theorists about the past, theorists about the future, & theorists about the past & the future, who hold views about the past & the future, who approve of various beliefs with reference to the past & the future, they all do so on one or another of these 62 grounds. There is nothing outside of this.

"With regard to this, the Tathāgata discerns that 'These standpoints, thus seized, thus grasped at, lead to such & such a destination, to such & such a state in the world beyond.' That the Tathāgata discerns. And he discerns what is higher than that. And yet, discerning that, he does not grasp at it. And as he is not grasping at it, unbinding *[nibbuti]* is experienced right within. Knowing, as they have come to be, the origination, ending, allure, & drawbacks of feelings, along with the escape from feelings, the Tathāgata, monks—through lack of clinging/sustenance—is released.

"These, monks, are the dhammas—deep, hard to see, hard to realize, tranquil, refined, beyond the scope of conjecture, subtle, to-be-experienced by the wise—that the Tathāgata proclaims, having directly

known & realized them for himself, and that those who, rightly speaking in praise of the Tathāgata in line with what is factual, would speak.

### *Agitation & Vacillation*

"There,[32] where any of those contemplatives & brahmans who are adherents of eternalism proclaim an eternal self & cosmos on four grounds, that is just an agitation & vacillation to be felt by those contemplatives & brahmans who, not knowing, not seeing, are immersed in craving.

"There, where any of those contemplatives & brahmans who are partially eternalists and partially non-eternalists proclaim a partially eternal and partially non-eternal self & cosmos on four grounds, that is just an agitation & vacillation to be felt by those contemplatives & brahmans who, not knowing, not seeing, are immersed in craving.

"There, where any of those contemplatives & brahmans who are finite-ists or infinite-ists proclaim a finite or infinite cosmos on four grounds, that is just an agitation & vacillation to be felt by those contemplatives & brahmans who, not knowing, not seeing, are immersed in craving.

"There, where any of those contemplatives & brahmans who, being asked questions regarding this or that, resort to verbal contortions, to eel-wriggling on four grounds, that is just an agitation & vacillation to be felt by those contemplatives & brahmans who, not knowing, not seeing, are immersed in craving.

"There, where any of those contemplatives & brahmans who are fortuitous-arising-ists proclaim a fortuitously-arisen self & cosmos on two grounds, that is just an agitation & vacillation to be felt by those contemplatives & brahmans who, not knowing, not seeing, are immersed in craving.

"There, where any of those contemplatives & brahmans who are theorists about the past hold views about the past, approve of various beliefs with reference to the past on 18 grounds, that is just an agitation & vacillation to be felt by those contemplatives & brahmans who, not knowing, not seeing, are immersed in craving.

"There, where any of those contemplatives & brahmans who are adherents of a percipient after-death proclaim a percipient self after death on 16 grounds, that is just an agitation & vacillation to be felt by those contemplatives & brahmans who, not knowing, not seeing, are immersed in craving.

"There, where any of those contemplatives & brahmans who are adherents of a non-percipient after-death proclaim a non-percipient self after death on eight grounds, that is just an agitation & vacillation to be felt by those contemplatives & brahmans who, not knowing, not seeing, are immersed in craving.

"There, where any of those contemplatives & brahmans who are adherents of a neither percipient nor non-percipient after-death, proclaim a neither percipient nor non-percipient self after death on eight grounds, that is just an agitation & vacillation to be felt by those contemplatives & brahmans who, not knowing, not seeing, are immersed in craving.

"There, where any of those contemplatives & brahmans who are annihilationists proclaim the annihilation, destruction, & non-becoming of an existing being on seven grounds, that is just an agitation & vacillation to be felt by those contemplatives & brahmans who, not knowing, not seeing, are immersed in craving.

"There, where any of those contemplatives & brahmans who are proponents of unbinding in the here-&-now proclaim the highest here-&-now unbinding of an existing being on five grounds, that is just an agitation & vacillation to be felt by those contemplatives & brahmans who, not knowing, not seeing, are immersed in craving.

"There, where any of those contemplatives & brahmans who are theorists about the future hold views about the future, approve of various beliefs with reference to the future on 44 grounds, that is just an agitation & vacillation to be felt by those contemplatives & brahmans who, not knowing, not seeing, are immersed in craving.

"There, where any of those contemplatives & brahmans who are theorists about the past, theorists about the future, & theorists about the past & the future hold views about the past & the future, approve of various beliefs with reference to the past & the future on 62 grounds, that

is just an agitation & vacillation to be felt by those contemplatives & brahmans who, not knowing, not seeing, are immersed in craving.

*Conditioned by Contact*

"There, where any of those contemplatives & brahmans who are adherents of eternalism proclaim an eternal self & cosmos on four grounds, that comes from contact as a requisite condition.

"There, where any of those contemplatives & brahmans who are partially eternalists and partially non-eternalists proclaim a partially eternal and partially non-eternal self & cosmos on four grounds, that comes from contact as a requisite condition.

"There, where any of those contemplatives & brahmans who are finite-ists or infinite-ists proclaim a finite or infinite cosmos on four grounds, that comes from contact as a requisite condition.

"There, where any of those contemplatives & brahmans who, being asked questions regarding this or that, resort to verbal contortions, to eel-wriggling on four grounds, that comes from contact as a requisite condition.

"There, where any of those contemplatives & brahmans who are fortuitous-arising-ists proclaim a fortuitously-arisen self & cosmos on two grounds, that comes from contact as a requisite condition.

"There, where any of those contemplatives & brahmans who are theorists about the past hold views about the past, approve of various beliefs with reference to the past on 18 grounds, that comes from contact as a requisite condition.

"There, where any of those contemplatives & brahmans who are adherents of a percipient after-death proclaim a percipient self after death on 16 grounds, that comes from contact as a requisite condition.

"There, where any of those contemplatives & brahmans who are adherents of a non-percipient after-death proclaim a non-percipient self after death on eight grounds, that comes from contact as a requisite condition.

"There, where any of those contemplatives & brahmans who are adherents of a neither percipient nor non-percipient after-death, proclaim

a neither percipient nor non-percipient self after death on eight grounds, that comes from contact as a requisite condition.

"There, where any of those contemplatives & brahmans who are annihilationists proclaim the annihilation, destruction, & non-becoming of an existing being on seven grounds, that comes from contact as a requisite condition.

"There, where any of those contemplatives & brahmans who are proponents of unbinding in the here-&-now proclaim the highest here-&-now unbinding of an existing being on five grounds, that comes from contact as a requisite condition.

"There, where any of those contemplatives & brahmans who are theorists about the future hold views about the future, approve of various beliefs with reference to the future on 44 grounds, that comes from contact as a requisite condition.

"There, where any of those contemplatives & brahmans who are theorists about the past, theorists about the future, & theorists about the past & the future hold views about the past & the future, approve of various beliefs with reference to the past & the future on 62 grounds, that comes from contact as a requisite condition.

### *No Other Possibility*

"There, where any of those contemplatives & brahmans who are adherents of eternalism proclaim an eternal self & cosmos on four grounds: That they would experience that other than through contact isn't possible.

"There, where any of those contemplatives & brahmans who are partially eternalists and partially non-eternalists proclaim a partially eternal and partially non-eternal self & cosmos on four grounds: That they would experience that other than through contact isn't possible.

"There, where any of those contemplatives & brahmans who are finite-ists or infinite-ists proclaim a finite or infinite cosmos on four grounds: That they would experience that other than through contact isn't possible.

"There, where any of those contemplatives & brahmans who, being asked questions regarding this or that, resort to verbal contortions, to eel-wriggling on four grounds: That they would experience that other than through contact isn't possible.

"There, where any of those contemplatives & brahmans who are fortuitous-arising-ists proclaim a fortuitously-arisen self & cosmos on two grounds: That they would experience that other than through contact isn't possible.

"There, where any of those contemplatives & brahmans who are theorists about the past hold views about the past, approve of various beliefs with reference to the past on 18 grounds: That they would experience that other than through contact isn't possible.

"There, where any of those contemplatives & brahmans who are adherents of a percipient after-death proclaim a percipient self after death on 16 grounds: That they would experience that other than through contact isn't possible.

"There, where any of those contemplatives & brahmans who are adherents of a non-percipient after-death proclaim a non-percipient self after death on eight grounds: That they would experience that other than through contact isn't possible.

"There, where any of those contemplatives & brahmans who are adherents of a neither percipient nor non-percipient after-death, proclaim a neither percipient nor non-percipient self after death on eight grounds: That they would experience that other than through contact isn't possible.

"There, where any of those contemplatives & brahmans who are annihilationists proclaim the annihilation, destruction, & non-becoming of an existing being on seven grounds: That they would experience that other than through contact isn't possible.

"There, where any of those contemplatives & brahmans who are proponents of unbinding in the here-&-now proclaim the highest here-&-now unbinding of an existing being on five grounds: That they would experience that other than through contact isn't possible.

"There, where any of those contemplatives & brahmans who are theorists about the future hold views about the future, approve of various beliefs with reference to the future on 44 grounds: That they would experience that other than through contact isn't possible.

"There, where any of those contemplatives & brahmans who are theorists about the past, theorists about the future, & theorists about the past & the future hold views about the past & the future, approve of various beliefs with reference to the past & the future on 62 grounds: That they would experience that other than through contact isn't possible.

*Dependent Co-arising*

"There, where any of those contemplatives & brahmans who are adherents of eternalism proclaim an eternal self & cosmos on four grounds,

where any of those contemplatives & brahmans who are partially eternalists and partially non-eternalists proclaim a partially eternal and partially non-eternal self & cosmos on four grounds,

where any of those contemplatives & brahmans who are finite-ists or infinite-ists proclaim a finite or infinite cosmos on four grounds,

where any of those contemplatives & brahmans who, being asked questions regarding this or that, resort to verbal contortions, to eel-wriggling on four grounds,

where any of those contemplatives & brahmans who are fortuitous-arising-ists proclaim a fortuitously-arisen self & cosmos on two grounds,

where any of those contemplatives & brahmans who are theorists about the past hold views about the past, approve of various beliefs with reference to the past on 18 grounds,

where any of those contemplatives & brahmans who are adherents of a percipient after-death proclaim a percipient self after death on 16 grounds,

where any of those contemplatives & brahmans who are adherents of a non-percipient after-death proclaim a non-percipient self after death on eight grounds,

where any of those contemplatives & brahmans who are adherents of a neither percipient nor non-percipient after-death, proclaim a neither percipient nor non-percipient self after death on eight grounds,

where any of those contemplatives & brahmans who are annihilationists proclaim the annihilation, destruction, & non-becoming of an existing being on seven grounds,

where any of those contemplatives & brahmans who are proponents of unbinding in the here-&-now proclaim the highest here-&-now unbinding of an existing being on five grounds,

where any of those contemplatives & brahmans who are theorists about the future hold views about the future, approve of various beliefs with reference to the future on 44 grounds,

where any of those contemplatives & brahmans who are theorists about the past, theorists about the future, & theorists about the past & the future, who hold views about the past & the future, who approve of various beliefs with reference to the past & the future on 62 grounds:

"They all experience that through repeated contact at the six sense media. For them, from feeling as a requisite condition comes craving. From craving as a requisite condition comes clinging/sustenance. From clinging/sustenance as a requisite condition comes becoming. From becoming as a requisite condition comes birth. From birth as a requisite condition, then aging-&-death, sorrow, lamentation, pain, distress, & despair come into play. Such is the origination of this entire mass of stress & suffering.[33]

"But when a monk discerns the origination, ending, allure, drawbacks of, & escape from the six sense media, he discerns what is higher than all of this.

*The Net*

"Any contemplatives & brahmans who are theorists about the past, theorists about the future, & theorists about the past & the future, who hold views about the past & the future, who approve of various beliefs with reference to the past & the future, all come under this net with its 62 interstices. When emerging, they emerge trapped here. When emerging, they emerge encompassed here under this net. Just as if a deft fisherman or fisherman's apprentice were to cover a small body of water with a fine-meshed net: The thought would occur to him, 'Any sizeable creatures in this body of water all come under this net. When emerging, they emerge trapped here. When emerging, they emerge encompassed here under this net.' In this same way, monks, any contemplatives & brahmans who are theorists about the past, theorists about the future, & theorists about the past & the future, who hold views about the past & the future, who approve of various beliefs with reference to the past & the future, all come under this net with its 62 interstices. When emerging, they emerge trapped here. When emerging, they emerge encompassed here under this net.

"The body of the Tathāgata stands with the cord binding it to becoming cut through. As long as his body remains, human beings & devas will see him. But with the break-up of the body and the depletion of life, human beings & devas will see him no more. Just as with the cutting of the stalk of a bunch of mangoes, all the mangoes connected to the stalk follow with it; in the same way, the body of the Tathāgata stands with the cord binding it to becoming[34] cut through. As long as his body remains, human beings & devas will see him. But with the break-up of the body and the depletion of life, human beings & devas will see him no more."[35]

When this was said, Ven. Ānanda said to the Blessed One, "It's amazing, lord. It's astounding. What is the name of this Dhamma discourse?"

"Thus, Ānanda, remember this as 'The Net of Meaning' [or: 'The Net of What is Profitable *[attha]'*], 'The Net of Dhamma,' 'The Brahmā Net,' 'The Net of Views,' 'The Unexcelled Victory in Battle.'"[36]

That is what the Blessed One said. Gratified, the monks delighted in the Blessed One's words. And as this explanation was being spoken, the ten-thousand-fold cosmos shook.

## Notes

1. In many suttas—such as DN 9, MN 63, MN 72, and SN 44:7–8—the Buddha and his disciples refuse to take a stand on whether the cosmos is eternal or not. See *Skill in Questions*, Chapter 8, for a discussion of the reasons for their refusal. As a general principle, the Buddha warns against speculation about the cosmos, saying in AN 4:77 that it's one of four types of conjecture that can lead to madness. What he *does* say about how long there has been a cosmos (see, for instance, SN 15:3) is that transmigration comes from an inconceivable beginning. As for the length of time the cosmos will last, in SN 12:44 he teaches the path to the end of the cosmos—which he equates with the end of suffering—but it's an end for each person to find individually. In AN 10:95 he refuses to answer the question of whether all or a half or a third of the cosmos will follow that path to release.

As for the self, however, the Buddha regards the view that the self is eternal as a particularly evil form of wrong view. The form this view takes in DN 2 shows that it denies the power, and even the reality, of action.

2. The phrase, "purified, bright, unblemished, rid of defilement" is not in the Sinhalese edition of the Canon.

3. Compare the number of lifetimes remembered here and in the following cases with the number of lifetimes the Buddha remembered on the night of his awakening: "many eons of cosmic contraction, many eons of cosmic expansion, many eons of cosmic contraction & expansion" (MN 4).

4. Notice that the Buddha doesn't try to judge whether theorists of this sort make proper or improper use of their logic. In both AN 3:66 and MN 95 he states that just because a view is logical doesn't mean that it's skillful or true.

5. This sentence, repeated throughout this sutta, is hard to square with the fact that the Canon itself contains forms of these views that are not listed in this sutta. In the present case, for instance, SN 22:81 lists the following view, not found here, as a form of eternalism: "This self is the same as the cosmos. This I will be after death, constant, lasting, eternal, not subject to change." MN 102, for its part, lists views of the self after death not listed in the relevant part of this sutta. It seems more pertinent to the thrust of the sutta to say that, whatever form a view may take on the topics listed here, it has to come under observation given in the refrains that trace all views to feelings and sensory contact. That is the true "net" of the sutta.

6. It is instructive to compare this refrain, which follows each subset of the 62 views, with similar refrains in other suttas that treat views from the same perspective. For instance:

From MN 102: "'With regard to that—fabricated, gross—there is still the cessation of fabrications: There *is* this.' Knowing that, seeing the escape from it, the Tathāgata has gone beyond it."

From SN 22:81: "That assumption is a fabrication. Now what is the cause, what is the origination, what is the birth, what is the coming-into-existence of that fabrication? To an uninstructed, run-of-the-mill person, touched by that which is felt born of contact with ignorance, craving arises. That fabrication is born of that. And that fabrication is inconstant, fabricated, dependently co-arisen. That craving… That feeling… That contact… That ignorance is inconstant, fabricated, dependently co-arisen. It is by knowing & seeing in this way that one without delay puts an end to effluents."

From AN 10:93: [Anāthapiṇḍika is speaking:] "Venerable sirs, whatever has been brought into being, is fabricated, willed, dependently co-arisen: That is inconstant. Whatever is inconstant is stress. Whatever is stress is not me, is not what I am, is not my self. Having seen this well with right discernment as it has come to be, I also discern the higher escape from it as it has come to be."

On the Buddha's overall attitude toward the truth of views, see the article, "Truths with Consequences."

7. As the following discussion shows, various forms of theism would come under this category.

8. There is an implied criticism of Brahmanism in this sentence: The Great Brahmā, the highest god in their pantheon, has gained his position not because of his greatness but because the merit that would have allowed him to stay in a higher realm was exhausted. See MN 49.

9. See the story of the Great Brahmā in DN 11.

10. These devas are listed in DN 20.

11. These devas, too, are listed in DN 20. The Commentary to this passage states that they stare at one another out of envy and anger, but it could also be the case that they stare out of lust.

12. This is the view propounded by Sāti the Fisherman's Son in MN 38—a view that the Buddha characterizes as evil, probably because it denies the role of kamma in shaping experience. However, see notes 1 and 2 to that sutta.

13. The Buddha consistently refuses to take a stance on the question of whether the cosmos is finite or infinite (see, for example, MN 63). In AN 4:45

he limits himself to saying that it isn't possible by traveling to know or see or reach a far end of the cosmos where one doesn't take birth, age, die, pass away, or reappear, but that the cosmos, its origination, its cessation, and the path to its cessation can be found in this fathom-long body. For his definitions of the word, "cosmos," see SN 35:82 and AN 10:95.

14. In MN 36, the Buddha characterizes his search for awakening as a search for what is skillful. And in AN 3:62 he identifies one of the main responsibilities of a teaching is that it give grounds for deciding what is skillful and what's not.

15. One of the basic tenets of mundane right view is that there is a world after death. See MN 117 and the discussion of the levels of right view in *On the Path*, Chapter 3.

16. The existence of beings that wander on is one of the tenets of the second knowledge in the Buddha's awakening (see MN 19). SN 23:2 defines a being in terms of its attachments; SN 44:9 describes how a being takes rebirth through craving and clinging.

17. The question as to whether a Tathāgata exists, doesn't exist, both, or neither is one that the Buddha, too, refuses to take a stand on, but his refusal is based on knowledge, not on stupidity. See the discussion in *Skill in Questions*, Chapter 8 and Appendix 4.

18. The doctrine of fortuitous arising is a simple case of wrong view. Both the cosmos and the sense of self arise because of causes. In the case of the sense of self, these causes can come from previous lifetimes.

19. Mentioned in DN 15.

20. MN 102 contains a fuller description of the discussions among the Buddha's contemporaries as to whether the self is percipient, non-percipient, or neither percipient nor non-percipient after death. The Buddha himself discusses the afterlife, not in terms of what the self is, but of the various types of rebirth—percipient, non-percipient, or neither percipient nor non-percipient, pleasant or unpleasant—that can occur based on one's kamma. As for the arahant after death, Upasīva in Sn 5:6 asks whether the person who has reached the goal doesn't exist or remains for eternity. In response, the Buddha states that when a person does away with all dhammas, no means of speaking apply.

21. Upasīva's question in Sn 5:6 suggests that "undiseased" in this context means that the self would remain in that condition, unchanging, for eternity.

22. In DN 9, the Buddha heaps ridicule on the proponents of this position.

23. Annihilationism is, in many parts of the Canon, paired with eternalism as a particularly evil form of wrong view because it denies the long-term consequences of kamma after death. The positions taken by the theorists described in this section are based on how they define the self. From that definition, they conclude that the self cannot survive death. The Buddha, however—unlike other thinkers of his time—never defines *what* is reborn, and focuses instead on *how* rebirth happens. See *The Truth of Rebirth*.

Also, the positions taken here answer a pair of questions that the Buddha refuses to take a position on: whether the soul (or: life-force, *jīva)* is the same as the body or something different from the body. See MN 63.

24. *Sant satta:* a being as a discrete metaphysical entity, as opposed to a being described as a process. See the discussion in *Skill in Questions,* Appendix 4.

25. The elementary properties of earth (solidity), water (liquidity), wind (energy), and fire (warmth). In other words, this view is the materialist view that identifies the self with the physical body.

26. This apparently corresponds to the sense of the body as experienced from inside, as in any of the four jhānas.

27. This and the following attainments are the formless states that can be attained based on the attainment of the fourth jhāna (MN 140) or the "property of beauty" (SN 14:11, DN 15).

28. As MN 106 points out, this attainment can be reached through the contemplation of not-self in the six sense media.

29. The views in this section are wrong on two counts: (1) They describe unbinding as pertaining to an existing being (see note 23). This is wrong because a "being" is defined by its desires and attachments (see SN 23:2), whereas unbinding is free of desires and attachments. (2) They equate unbinding with experiences that are fabricated, and therefore stressful, whereas unbinding in the Buddhist sense is unfabricated and free of suffering and stress.

30. Māgaṇḍiya puts forth this view in MN 75. MN 13 and MN 45 list some of the dangers that can come from viewing sensual pleasure as a worthwhile goal.

31. The four jhānas described in this section are identical with the description of right concentration. However, because they are accompanied by wrong view, they are not noble right concentration (see MN 117). In other words, until the view is changed, these states of concentration cannot lead to awakening. Some people read this passage as a warning that a person experiencing jhāna may become so enamored of it that he/she will refuse to

practice further. However, although the Buddha does note that people attaining jhāna can get stuck there (see AN 4:178), he also notes in MN 14 that unless one has attained at least the pleasure of the first jhāna, one will not be able to overcome attachment to sensuality. And the dangers of attachment to sensuality that he lists in that sutta are far worse than the dangers of being attached to jhāna.

It's strange that none of the formless attainments are listed in this section, as these, too, are often confused with the experience of true unbinding. On this point, see the discussion of the non-duality of consciousness in AN 10:29.

32. I.e., in the act of holding to and proclaiming the view.

33. The sequence of conditions here is drawn from the teachings on dependent co-arising. For two different lists of all the conditions, see DN 15 and SN 12:2.

34. The cord binding it to becoming is craving.

35. SN 22:86 states that the unestablished consciousness of an arahant after death cannot be located. SN 12:64 illustrates this point with the image of a beam of light that is "unestablished"—i.e., that does not land on any object. See also DN 11 and MN 49 on the topic of consciousness without surface.

36. See SN 45:4.

*See also: DN 2; MN 1; MN 2; MN 22; MN 57; MN 109; SN 12:15; SN 22:94; SN 12:48; SN 42:2–3; SN 42:8–9; SN 44:10; AN 4:24; AN 4:77; Sn 4:5; Sn 4:8–9; Ud 1:10*

# *The Fruits of the Contemplative Life*
# *Sāmaññaphala Sutta (DN 2)*

## Introduction

*This discourse is one of the masterpieces of the Pali Canon. At heart, it is a comprehensive portrait of the Buddhist path of training, illustrating each stage of the training with vivid similes. This portrait is placed in juxtaposition to the Buddhist view of the teachings of rival philosophical teachers of the time, showing how the Buddha—in contradistinction to the inflexible, party-line approach of his contemporaries—presented his teaching in a way that was pertinent and sensitive to the needs of his listeners. This larger portrait of the intellectual landscape of early Buddhist India is then presented in a moving narrative frame: the sad story of King Ajātasattu.*

*Ajātasattu was the son of King Bimbisāra of Magadha, one of the Buddha's earliest followers. Urged on by Devadatta—the Buddha's cousin, who wished to use Ajātasattu's support in his bid to take over the Buddha's position as head of the Saṅgha—Ajātasattu arranged for his father's death so that he could secure his own position on the throne. As a result of this evil deed, he was destined not only to be killed by his own son—Udayabhadda (mentioned in the discourse)—but also to take immediate rebirth in one of the lowest regions of hell.*

*In this discourse, Ajātasattu visits the Buddha in hopes that the latter will bring some peace to his mind. The question he puts to the Buddha shows the limited level of his own understanding, so the Buddha patiently describes the steps of the training, beginning at a very basic level and gradually moving up, as a way of raising the king's spiritual horizons. At the end of the talk, Ajātasattu takes refuge in the Triple Gem. Although his earlier deeds were so heavy that this expression of faith could have only limited consequences in the immediate present, the Commentary assures us that the king's story would ultimately have a happy ending. After the Buddha's death, he sponsored the First Council, at which a congress of arahant disciples produced the first*

*standardized account of the Buddha's teachings. As a result of the merit coming from this deed, Ajātasattu is destined—after his release from hell—to attain awakening as a Private Buddha.*

* * *

I have heard that on one occasion the Blessed One was staying at Rājagaha, in Jīvaka Komārabhacca's mango grove, with a large Saṅgha of monks—1,250 monks in all. Now at that time—it being the uposatha day, the full-moon night of the water-lily season, the fourth month of the rains—King Ajātasattu of Magadha, the son of Queen Vedehi, was sitting on the roof terrace of his palace surrounded by his ministers. Then he felt inspired to exclaim: "How wonderful is this moonlit night! How beautiful… How lovely… How inspiring… How auspicious is this moonlit night! What contemplative or brahman should we visit tonight who, on being visited, would make our mind clear & serene?"

When this was said, one of the ministers said to the king: "Your majesty, there is Pūraṇa Kassapa, the leader of a community, the leader of a group, the teacher of a group, honored and famous, esteemed as holy by the mass of people. He is aged, long gone forth, advanced in years, in the last phase of life. Your majesty should visit him. Perhaps, if visited by you, he would make your mind clear & serene."

When this was said, the king remained silent.

Then another minister said to the king: "Your majesty, there is Makkhali Gosāla… " … "Your majesty, there is Ajita Kesakambalin… " … "Your majesty, there is Pakudha Kaccāyana… " … "Your majesty, there is Sañjaya Velaṭṭhaputta… " … "Your majesty, there is Nigaṇṭha Nāṭaputta, the leader of a community, the leader of a group, the teacher of a group, honored and famous, esteemed as holy by the mass of people. He is aged, long gone forth, advanced in years, in the last phase of life. Your majesty should visit him. Perhaps, if visited by you, he would make your mind clear & serene."

When this was said, the king remained silent.

All this time Jīvaka Komārabhacca was sitting silently not far from the king. So the king said to him, "Friend Jīvaka, why are you silent?"

"Your majesty, there is the Blessed One, worthy and rightly self-awakened, staying in my mango grove with a large Saṅgha of monks—1,250 monks in all. Concerning this Blessed One, this admirable report has been spread: 'Indeed, the Blessed One is worthy & rightly self-awakened, consummate in clear-knowing & conduct, well-gone, an expert with regard to the cosmos, unexcelled trainer of people fit to be tamed, teacher of devas & human beings, awakened, blessed.' Your majesty should visit him. Perhaps, if visited by you, he would make your mind clear & serene."

"Then in that case, friend Jīvaka, have the riding elephants prepared."

Responding, "As you say, your majesty," having had five hundred female elephants prepared as well as the king's personal tusker, Jīvaka announced to the king: "Your majesty, your riding elephants are prepared. Do what you think it is now time to do."

Then the king, having had five hundred of his women mounted on the five hundred female elephants—one on each—and having mounted his own personal tusker, set out from the capital in full royal state, with attendants carrying torches, headed for Jīvaka Komārabhacca's mango grove. But when the king was not far from the mango grove, he was gripped with fear, trepidation, his hair standing on end. Fearful, agitated, his hair standing on end, he said to Jīvaka Komārabhacca: "Friend Jīvaka, you aren't deceiving me, are you? You aren't betraying me, are you? You aren't turning me over to my enemies, are you? How can there be such a large Saṅgha of monks—1,250 in all—with no sound of sneezing, no sound of coughing, no voices at all?"

"Don't be afraid, great king. Don't be afraid. I'm not deceiving you or betraying you or turning you over to your enemies. Go forward, great king, go forward! Those are lamps burning in the pavilion hall."

Then the king, going as far on his tusker as the ground would permit, dismounted and approached the door of the pavilion hall on foot. On arrival, he asked Jīvaka: "Where, friend Jīvaka, is the Blessed One?"

"That is the Blessed One, great king, sitting against the middle pillar, facing east, surrounded by the Saṅgha of monks."

Then the king approached the Blessed One and, on reaching him, stood to one side. As he was standing there—surveying the Saṅgha of monks sitting in absolute silence, utterly clear & serene like a lake—he felt inspired to exclaim: "May my son, Prince Udayabhadda, enjoy the same stillness that this Saṅgha of monks now enjoys!"

(The Blessed One said:) "Have you come, great king, together with your affections?"

"Lord, my son, Prince Udayabhadda, is very dear to me. May he enjoy the same stillness that this Saṅgha of monks now enjoys!"

Then, bowing down to the Blessed One and saluting the Saṅgha of monks with his hands palm-to-palm over his heart, he sat to one side. As he was sitting there, he said to the Blessed One: "I would like to ask the Blessed One about a certain issue, if he would give me the opportunity to explain my question."

"Ask, great king, whatever you like."

## The King's Question

"Lord, there are these common craftsmen: elephant-trainers, horse-trainers, charioteers, archers, standard bearers, camp marshals, supply corps officers, high royal officers, commandos, military heroes, armor-clad warriors, leather-clad warriors, domestic slaves, confectioners, barbers, bath attendants, cooks, garland-makers, laundrymen, weavers, basket-makers, potters, calculators, accountants, and any other craftsmen of a similar sort. They live off the fruits of their crafts, visible in the here & now. They give happiness & pleasure to themselves, to their parents, wives, & children, to their friends & colleagues. They put in place an excellent presentation of offerings to contemplatives & brahmans, leading to heaven, resulting in happiness, conducive to a heavenly rebirth. Is it possible, lord, to point out a similar fruit of the contemplative life, visible in the here & now?"

"Do you remember, great king, ever having asked this question of other contemplatives & brahmans?"

"Yes, I do."

"If it isn't troublesome for you, how did they answer?"

"No, it's not troublesome for me wherever the Blessed One—or someone like the Blessed One—is sitting."

"Then speak, great king."

## Non-action

"Once, lord, I approached Pūraṇa Kassapa and, on arrival, exchanged courteous greetings with him. After an exchange of friendly greetings and courtesies, I sat to one side. As I was sitting there I asked him: 'Venerable Kassapa, there are these common craftsmen.… They live off the fruits of their crafts, visible in the here & now.… Is it possible, venerable sir, to point out a similar fruit of the contemplative life, visible in the here & now?'

"When this was said, Pūraṇa Kassapa said to me, 'Great king, in acting or getting others to act, in mutilating or getting others to mutilate, in torturing or getting others to torture, in inflicting sorrow or in getting others to inflict sorrow, in tormenting or getting others to torment, in intimidating or getting others to intimidate, in taking life, taking what is not given, breaking into houses, plundering wealth, committing burglary, ambushing highways, committing adultery, speaking falsehood—one does no evil. If with a razor-edged disk one were to turn all the living beings on this earth to a single heap of flesh, a single pile of flesh, there would be no evil from that cause, no coming of evil. Even if one were to go along the right bank of the Ganges, killing and getting others to kill, mutilating and getting others to mutilate, torturing and getting others to torture, there would be no evil from that cause, no coming of evil. Even if one were to go along the left bank of the Ganges, giving and getting others to give, making sacrifices and getting others to make sacrifices, there would be no merit from that cause, no coming of merit. Through generosity, self-control, restraint, and truthful speech there is no merit from that cause, no coming of merit.'

"Thus, when asked about a fruit of the contemplative life, visible here & now, Pūraṇa Kassapa answered with non-action. Just as if a person, when asked about a mango, were to answer with a breadfruit; or, when asked about a breadfruit, were to answer with a mango: In the same way, when asked about a fruit of the contemplative life, visible here & now,

Pūraṇa Kassapa answered with non-action. The thought occurred to me: 'How can anyone like me think of disparaging a contemplative or brahman living in his realm?' Yet I neither delighted in Pūraṇa Kassapa's words nor did I protest against them. Neither delighting nor protesting, I was dissatisfied. Without expressing dissatisfaction, without accepting his teaching, without adopting it, I got up from my seat and left.

### Purification through Wandering-on

"Another time I approached Makkhali Gosāla and, on arrival, exchanged courteous greetings with him. After an exchange of friendly greetings and courtesies, I sat to one side. As I was sitting there I asked him: 'Venerable Gosāla, there are these common craftsmen.… They live off the fruits of their crafts, visible in the here & now.… Is it possible, venerable sir, to point out a similar fruit of the contemplative life, visible in the here & now?'

"When this was said, Makkhali Gosāla said to me, 'Great king, there is no cause, no requisite condition, for the defilement of beings. Beings are defiled without cause, without requisite condition. There is no cause, no requisite condition, for the purification of beings. Beings are purified without cause, without requisite condition. There is nothing self-caused, nothing other-caused, nothing human-caused. There is no strength, no effort, no human energy, no human endeavor. All living beings, all life, all beings, all souls are powerless, devoid of strength, devoid of effort. Subject to the changes of fate, serendipity, and nature, they are sensitive to pleasure and pain in the six great classes of birth.

"'There are 1,406,600 principle modes of origin. There are 500 kinds of kamma, five kinds, and three kinds; full kamma and half kamma. There are 62 pathways, 62 sub-eons, six great classes of birth, eight classes of men, 4,900 modes of livelihood, 4,900 kinds of wanderers, 4,900 Nāga-abodes, 2,000 faculties, 3,000 hells, 36 dust-realms, seven spheres of percipient beings, seven spheres of non-percipient beings, seven kinds of jointed plants, seven kinds of deities, seven kinds of human beings, seven kinds of demons, seven great lakes, seven major knots, seven minor knots, 700 major precipices, 700 minor precipices, 700 major dreams, 700 minor

dreams, 84,000 great aeons. Having transmigrated and wandered on through these, the wise & the foolish alike will put an end to pain.

"'Though one might think, "Through this morality, this practice, this austerity, or this holy life I will ripen unripened kamma and eliminate ripened kamma whenever touched by it"—that is impossible. Pleasure and pain are measured out, the wandering-on is fixed in its limits. There is no shortening or lengthening, no accelerating or decelerating. Just as a ball of string, when thrown, comes to its end simply by unwinding, in the same way, having transmigrated and wandered on, the wise & the foolish alike will put an end to pain.'

"Thus, when asked about a fruit of the contemplative life, visible here & now, Makkhali Gosāla answered with purification through wandering-on. Just as if a person, when asked about a mango, were to answer with a breadfruit; or, when asked about a breadfruit, were to answer with a mango. In the same way, when asked about a fruit of the contemplative life, visible here & now, Makkhali Gosāla answered with purification through wandering-on. The thought occurred to me: 'How can anyone like me think of disparaging a contemplative or brahman living in his realm?' Yet I neither delighted in Makkhali Gosāla's words nor did I protest against them. Neither delighting nor protesting, I was dissatisfied. Without expressing dissatisfaction, without accepting his teaching, without adopting it, I got up from my seat and left.

### Annihilation

"Another time I approached Ajita Kesakambalin and, on arrival, exchanged courteous greetings with him. After an exchange of friendly greetings and courtesies, I sat to one side. As I was sitting there I asked him: 'Venerable Ajita, there are these common craftsmen.... They live off the fruits of their crafts, visible in the here & now.... Is it possible, venerable sir, to point out a similar fruit of the contemplative life, visible in the here & now?'

"When this was said, Ajita Kesakambalin said to me, 'Great king, there is nothing given, nothing offered, nothing sacrificed. There is no fruit or result of good or bad actions. There is no this world, no next world, no mother, no father, no spontaneously reborn beings; no contemplatives or

brahmans who, faring rightly and practicing rightly, proclaim this world and the next after having directly known and realized it for themselves. A person is a composite of four primary elements. At death, the earth (in the body) returns to and merges with the (external) earth-substance. The fire returns to and merges with the external fire-substance. The liquid returns to and merges with the external liquid-substance. The wind returns to and merges with the external wind-substance. The sense-faculties scatter into space. Four men, with the bier as the fifth, carry the corpse. Its eulogies are sounded only as far as the charnel ground. The bones turn pigeon-colored. The offerings end in ashes. Generosity is taught by idiots. The words of those who speak of existence after death are false, empty chatter. With the break-up of the body, the wise and the foolish alike are annihilated, destroyed. They do not exist after death.'

"Thus, when asked about a fruit of the contemplative life, visible here & now, Ajita Kesakambalin answered with annihilation. Just as if a person, when asked about a mango, were to answer with a breadfruit; or, when asked about a breadfruit, were to answer with a mango. In the same way, when asked about a fruit of the contemplative life, visible here & now, Ajita Kesakambalin answered with annihilation. The thought occurred to me: 'How can anyone like me think of disparaging a contemplative or brahman living in his realm?' Yet I neither delighted in Ajita Kesakambalin's words nor did I protest against them. Neither delighting nor protesting, I was dissatisfied. Without expressing dissatisfaction, without accepting his teaching, without adopting it, I got up from my seat and left.

### Non-relatedness

"Another time I approached Pakudha Kaccāyana and, on arrival, exchanged courteous greetings with him. After an exchange of friendly greetings and courtesies, I sat to one side. As I was sitting there I asked him: 'Venerable Kaccāna, there are these common craftsmen.… They live off the fruits of their crafts, visible in the here & now.… Is it possible, venerable sir, to point out a similar fruit of the contemplative life, visible in the here & now?'

"When this was said, Pakudha Kaccāyana said to me, 'Great king, there are these seven substances—unmade, irreducible, uncreated, without a creator, barren, stable as a mountain-peak, standing firm like a pillar—that do not alter, do not change, do not interfere with one another, are incapable of causing one another pleasure, pain, or both pleasure and pain. Which seven? The earth-substance, the liquid-substance, the fire-substance, the wind-substance, pleasure, pain, and the soul as the seventh. These are the seven substances—unmade, irreducible, uncreated, without a creator, barren, stable as a mountain-peak, standing firm like a pillar—that do not alter, do not change, do not interfere with one another, and are incapable of causing one another pleasure, pain, or both pleasure and pain.

"'And among them there is no killer nor one who causes killing, no hearer nor one who causes hearing, no cognizer nor one who causes cognition. When one cuts off (another person's) head, there is no one taking anyone's life. It is simply between the seven substances that the sword passes.'

"Thus, when asked about a fruit of the contemplative life, visible here & now, Pakudha Kaccāyana answered with non-relatedness. Just as if a person, when asked about a mango, were to answer with a breadfruit; or, when asked about a breadfruit, were to answer with a mango. In the same way, when asked about a fruit of the contemplative life, visible here & now, Pakudha Kaccāyana answered with non-relatedness. The thought occurred to me: 'How can anyone like me think of disparaging a contemplative or brahman living in his realm?' Yet I neither delighted in Pakudha Kaccāyana's words nor did I protest against them. Neither delighting nor protesting, I was dissatisfied. Without expressing dissatisfaction, without accepting his teaching, without adopting it, I got up from my seat and left.

## Fourfold Restraint

"Another time I approached Niganṭha Nāṭaputta and, on arrival, exchanged courteous greetings with him. After an exchange of friendly greetings and courtesies, I sat to one side. As I was sitting there I asked him: 'Venerable Aggivessana, there are these common craftsmen.… They live off the fruits of their crafts, visible in the here & now.… Is it possible, venerable sir, to point out a similar fruit of the contemplative life, visible in the here & now?'

"When this was said, Niganṭha Nāṭaputta said to me, 'Great king, there is the case where the Niganṭha—the knotless one—is restrained with the fourfold restraint. And how is the Niganṭha restrained with the fourfold restraint? There is the case where the Niganṭha is obstructed by all waters, conjoined with all waters, cleansed with all waters, suffused with all waters. This is how the Niganṭha is restrained with the fourfold restraint. When the Niganṭha—a knotless one—is restrained with such a fourfold restraint, he is said to be a Knotless One [Niganṭha], a son of Nāṭa [Nāṭaputta], with his self perfected, his self controlled, his self established.'

"Thus, when asked about a fruit of the contemplative life, visible here & now, Niganṭha Nāṭaputta answered with fourfold restraint. Just as if a person, when asked about a mango, were to answer with a breadfruit; or, when asked about a breadfruit, were to answer with a mango: In the same way, when asked about a fruit of the contemplative life, visible here & now, Niganṭha Nāṭaputta answered with fourfold restraint. The thought occurred to me: 'How can anyone like me think of disparaging a contemplative or brahman living in his realm?' Yet I neither delighted in Niganṭha Nāṭaputta's words nor did I protest against them. Neither delighting nor protesting, I was dissatisfied. Without expressing dissatisfaction, without accepting his teaching, without adopting it, I got up from my seat and left.

## Evasion

"Another time I approached Sañjaya Velaṭṭhaputta and, on arrival, exchanged courteous greetings with him. After an exchange of friendly greetings and courtesies, I sat to one side. As I was sitting there I asked him: 'Venerable Sañjaya, there are these common craftsmen.… They live off the fruits of their crafts, visible in the here & now.… Is it possible, venerable sir, to point out a similar fruit of the contemplative life, visible in the here & now?'

"When this was said, Sañjaya Velaṭṭhaputta said to me, 'If you ask me if there exists another world (after death), if I thought that there exists another world, would I declare that to you? I don't think so. I don't think in that way. I don't think otherwise. I don't think not. I don't think not not. If you asked me if there isn't another world… both is and isn't… neither is nor isn't… if there are beings who transmigrate… if there aren't… both are and aren't… neither are nor aren't… if the Tathāgata exists after death… doesn't… both… neither exists nor exists after death, would I declare that to you? I don't think so. I don't think in that way. I don't think otherwise. I don't think not. I don't think not not.'

"Thus, when asked about a fruit of the contemplative life, visible here & now, Sañjaya Velaṭṭhaputta answered with evasion. Just as if a person, when asked about a mango, were to answer with a breadfruit; or, when asked about a breadfruit, were to answer with a mango: In the same way, when asked about a fruit of the contemplative life, visible here & now, Sañjaya Velaṭṭhaputta answered with evasion. The thought occurred to me: 'This—among these contemplatives & brahmans—is the most foolish and confused of all. How can he, when asked about a fruit of the contemplative life, visible here & now, answer with evasion?' Still the thought occurred to me: 'How can anyone like me think of disparaging a contemplative or brahman living in his realm?' Yet I neither delighted in Sañjaya Velaṭṭhaputta's words nor did I protest against them. Neither delighting nor protesting, I was dissatisfied. Without expressing dissatisfaction, without accepting his teaching, without adopting it, I got up from my seat and left.

## The First Visible Fruit of the Contemplative Life

"So, lord, I ask the Blessed One as well: There are these common craftsmen: elephant-trainers, horse-trainers, charioteers, archers, standard bearers, camp marshals, supply corps officers, high royal officers, commandos, military heroes, armor-clad warriors, leather-clad warriors, domestic slaves, confectioners, barbers, bath attendants, cooks, garland-makers, laundrymen, weavers, basket-makers, potters, calculators, accountants, and any other craftsmen of a similar sort. They live off the fruits of their crafts, visible in the here & now. They give happiness and pleasure to themselves, to their parents, wives, and children, to their friends and colleagues. They put in place an excellent presentation of offerings to contemplatives & brahmans, leading to heaven, resulting in happiness, conducive to a heavenly rebirth. Is it possible, lord, to point out a similar fruit of the contemplative life, visible in the here & now?"

"Yes, it is, great king. But first, with regard to that, I will ask you a counter-question. Answer as you see fit. Suppose there were a man of yours: your slave, your workman, rising in the morning before you, going to bed in the evening only after you, doing whatever you order, always acting to please you, speaking politely to you, always watching for the look on your face. The thought would occur to him: 'Isn't it amazing? Isn't it astounding?—the destination, the results, of meritorious deeds. For this King Ajātasattu is a human being, and I, too, am a human being, yet King Ajātasattu enjoys himself supplied and replete with the five strings of sensuality—like a deva, as it were—while I am his slave, his workman… always watching for the look on his face. I, too, should do meritorious deeds. What if I were to shave off my hair and beard, put on the ochre robes, and go forth from the household life into homelessness?'

"So after some time he shaves off his hair & beard, puts on the ochre robes, and goes forth from the household life into homelessness. Having thus gone forth he lives restrained in body, speech, and mind, content with the simplest food and shelter, delighting in solitude. Then suppose one of your men were to inform you: 'You should know, your majesty, that that man of yours—your slave, your workman… always watching for the look on your face… has gone forth from the household life into homelessness… content with the simplest food and shelter, delighting in solitude.' Would you, thus informed, say, 'Bring that man back to me.

Make him again be my slave, my workman… always watching for the look on my face!'?"

"Not at all, lord. Rather, I am the one who should bow down to him, rise up out of respect for him, invite him to a seat, invite him to accept gifts of robes, almsfood, lodgings, and medicinal requisites for the sick. And I would provide him with righteous safety, defense, and protection."

"So what do you think, great king? With that being the case, is there a visible fruit of the contemplative life, or is there not?"

"Yes, lord. With that being the case, there certainly is a visible fruit of the contemplative life."

"This, great king, is the first fruit of the contemplative life, visible in the here & now, that I point out to you."

### The Second Visible Fruit of the Contemplative Life

"But is it possible, lord, to point out yet another fruit of the contemplative life, visible in the here & now?"

"Yes, it is, great king. But first, with regard to that, I will ask you a counter-question. Answer however you please. Suppose there were a man of yours: a farmer, a householder, a taxpayer swelling the royal treasury. The thought would occur to him: 'Isn't it amazing? Isn't it astounding?—the destination, the results, of meritorious deeds! For this King Ajātasattu is a human being, and I, too, am a human being, yet King Ajātasattu enjoys himself supplied and replete with the five strings of sensuality—like a deva, as it were—while I am a farmer, a householder, a taxpayer swelling the royal treasury. I, too, should do meritorious deeds. What if I were to shave off my hair and beard, put on the ochre robes, and go forth from the household life into homelessness?'

"So after some time he abandons his mass of wealth, large or small; leaves his circle of relatives, large or small; shaves off his hair and beard, puts on the ochre robes, and goes forth from the household life into homelessness. Having thus gone forth he lives restrained in body, speech, and mind, content with the simplest food and shelter, delighting in solitude. Then suppose one of your men were to inform you: 'You should know, your majesty, that that man of yours—the farmer, the householder,

the taxpayer swelling the royal treasury… has gone forth from the household life into homelessness… content with the simplest food & shelter, delighting in solitude.' Would you, thus informed, say, 'Bring that man back to me. Make him again be a farmer, a householder, a taxpayer swelling the royal treasury!'?"

"Not at all, lord. Rather, I am the one who should bow down to him, rise up out of respect for him, invite him to a seat, invite him to accept gifts of robes, almsfood, lodgings, & medicinal requisites for the sick. And I would provide him with righteous safety, defense, and protection."

"So what do you think, great king? With that being the case, is there a visible fruit of the contemplative life, or is there not?"

"Yes, lord. With that being the case, there certainly is a visible fruit of the contemplative life."

"This, great king, is the second fruit of the contemplative life, visible in the here & now, that I point out to you."

### Higher Fruits of the Contemplative Life

"But is it possible, lord, to point out yet another fruit of the contemplative life, visible in the here & now?"

"Yes, it is, great king. Listen and pay close attention. I will speak.

"There is the case, great king, where a Tathāgata appears in the world, worthy & rightly self-awakened. He teaches the Dhamma admirable in its beginning, admirable in its middle, admirable in its end. He proclaims the holy life both in its particulars and in its essence, entirely perfect, surpassingly pure.

"A householder or householder's son, hearing the Dhamma, gains conviction in the Tathāgata and reflects: 'Household life is confining, a dusty path. Life gone forth is the open air. It isn't easy, living at home, to practice the holy life totally perfect, totally pure, a polished shell. What if I, having shaved off my hair & beard and putting on the ochre robe, were to go forth from the household life into homelessness?'

"So after some time he abandons his mass of wealth, large or small; leaves his circle of relatives, large or small; shaves off his hair and beard,

puts on the ochre robes, and goes forth from the household life into homelessness.

"When he has thus gone forth, he lives restrained by the rules of the monastic code, seeing danger in the slightest faults. Consummate in his virtue, he guards the doors of his senses, is possessed of mindfulness and alertness, and is content.

### The Lesser Section on Virtue

"And how is a monk consummate in virtue? Abandoning the taking of life, he abstains from the taking of life. He dwells with his rod laid down, his knife laid down, scrupulous, merciful, compassionate for the welfare of all living beings. This is part of his virtue.

"Abandoning the taking of what is not given, he abstains from taking what is not given. He takes only what is given, accepts only what is given, lives not by stealth but by means of a self that has become pure. This, too, is part of his virtue.

"Abandoning uncelibacy, he lives a celibate life, aloof, refraining from the sexual act that is the villager's way. This, too, is part of his virtue.

"Abandoning false speech, he abstains from false speech. He speaks the truth, holds to the truth, is firm, reliable, no deceiver of the world. This, too, is part of his virtue.

"Abandoning divisive speech he abstains from divisive speech. What he has heard here he does not tell there to break those people apart from these people here. What he has heard there he does not tell here to break these people apart from those people there. Thus reconciling those who have broken apart or cementing those who are united, he loves concord, delights in concord, enjoys concord, speaks things that create concord. This, too, is part of his virtue.

"Abandoning abusive speech, he abstains from abusive speech. He speaks words that are soothing to the ear, that are affectionate, that go to the heart, that are polite, appealing and pleasing to people at large. This, too, is part of his virtue.

"Abandoning idle chatter, he abstains from idle chatter. He speaks in season, speaks what is factual, what is in accordance with the goal, the

Dhamma, & the Vinaya. He speaks words worth treasuring, seasonable, reasonable, circumscribed, connected with the goal. This, too, is part of his virtue.

"He abstains from damaging seed & plant life.

"He eats only once a day, refraining from the evening meal and from food at the wrong time of day.

"He abstains from dancing, singing, instrumental music, and from watching shows.

"He abstains from wearing garlands and from beautifying himself with scents & cosmetics.

"He abstains from high and luxurious beds & seats.

"He abstains from accepting gold & money.

"He abstains from accepting uncooked grain… raw meat… women & girls… male & female slaves… goats & sheep… fowl & pigs… elephants, cattle, steeds, & mares… fields & property.

"He abstains from running messages… from buying & selling… from dealing with false scales, false metals, & false measures… from bribery, deception, & fraud.

"He abstains from mutilating, executing, imprisoning, highway robbery, plunder, & violence.

"This, too, is part of his virtue.

### The Intermediate Section on Virtue

"Whereas some contemplatives & brahmans, living off food given in faith, remain addicted to damaging seed and plant life such as these—plants propagated from roots, stems, joints, buddings, and seeds—he abstains from damaging seed and plant life such as these. This, too, is part of his virtue.

"Whereas some contemplatives & brahmans, living off food given in faith, remain addicted to consuming stored-up goods such as these—stored-up food, stored-up drinks, stored-up clothing, stored-up vehicles, stored-up bedding, stored-up scents, and stored-up meat—he abstains

from consuming stored-up goods such as these. This, too, is part of his virtue.

"Whereas some contemplatives & brahmans, living off food given in faith, remain addicted to watching shows such as these—dancing, singing, instrumental music, plays, ballad recitations, hand-clapping, cymbals and drums, magic-lantern scenes, acrobatic and conjuring tricks, elephant fights, horse fights, buffalo fights, bull fights, goat fights, ram fights, cock fights, quail fights; fighting with staves, boxing, wrestling, war-games, roll calls, battle arrays, and regimental reviews—he abstains from watching shows such as these. This, too, is part of his virtue.

"Whereas some contemplatives & brahmans, living off food given in faith, remain addicted to heedless and idle games such as these—eight-row chess, ten-row chess, chess in the air, hopscotch, spillikins, dice, stick games, hand-pictures, ball-games, blowing through toy pipes, playing with toy plows, turning somersaults, playing with toy windmills, toy measures, toy chariots, toy bows, guessing letters drawn in the air, guessing thoughts, mimicking deformities—he abstains from heedless and idle games such as these. This, too, is part of his virtue.

"Whereas some contemplatives & brahmans, living off food given in faith, remain addicted to high and luxurious furnishings such as these—over-sized couches, couches adorned with carved animals, long-haired coverlets, multi-colored patchwork coverlets, white woolen coverlets, woolen coverlets embroidered with flowers or animal figures, stuffed quilts, coverlets with fringe, silk coverlets embroidered with gems; large woolen carpets; elephant, horse, and chariot rugs, antelope-hide rugs, deer-hide rugs; couches with canopies, couches with red cushions for the head and feet—he abstains from using high and luxurious furnishings such as these. This, too, is part of his virtue.

"Whereas some contemplatives & brahmans, living off food given in faith, remain addicted to scents, cosmetics, and means of beautification such as these—rubbing powders into the body, massaging with oils, bathing in perfumed water, kneading the limbs, using mirrors, ointments, garlands, scents, creams, face-powders, mascara, bracelets, head-bands, decorated walking sticks, ornamented water-bottles, swords, fancy sunshades, decorated sandals, turbans, gems, yak-tail whisks, long-fringed

white robes—he abstains from using scents, cosmetics, and means of beautification such as these. This, too, is part of his virtue.

"Whereas some contemplatives & brahmans, living off food given in faith, remain addicted to talking about lowly topics such as these—talking about kings, robbers, ministers of state; armies, alarms, and battles; food and drink; clothing, furniture, garlands, and scents; relatives; vehicles; villages, towns, cities, the countryside; women and heroes; the gossip of the street and the well; tales of the dead; tales of diversity [philosophical discussions of the past and future], the creation of the world and of the sea, and talk of whether things exist or not—he abstains from talking about lowly topics such as these. This, too, is part of his virtue.

"Whereas some contemplatives & brahmans, living off food given in faith, remain addicted to debates such as these—'*You* understand this doctrine and discipline? *I'm* the one who understands this doctrine and discipline. How could you understand this doctrine and discipline? You're practicing wrongly. I'm practicing rightly. I'm being consistent. You're not. What should be said first you said last. What should be said last you said first. What you took so long to think out has been refuted. Your doctrine has been overthrown. You're defeated. Go and try to salvage your doctrine; extricate yourself if you can!'—he abstains from debates such as these. This, too, is part of his virtue.

"Whereas some contemplatives & brahmans, living off food given in faith, remain addicted to running messages & errands for people such as these—kings, ministers of state, noble warriors, brahmans, householders, or youths (who say), 'Go here, go there, take this there, fetch that here'—he abstains from running messages & errands for people such as these. This, too, is part of his virtue.

"Whereas some contemplatives & brahmans, living off food given in faith, engage in scheming, persuading, hinting, belittling, & pursuing gain with gain, he abstains from forms of scheming & persuading [improper ways of trying to gain material support from donors] such as these. This, too, is part of his virtue.

## The Great Section on Virtue

"Whereas some contemplatives & brahmans, living off food given in faith, maintain themselves by wrong livelihood, by such "animal" arts as:

reading marks on the limbs [e.g., palmistry];
reading omens & signs;
interpreting celestial events [falling stars, comets];
interpreting dreams;
reading features of the body [e.g., phrenology];
reading marks on cloth gnawed by mice;
offering fire oblations, oblations from a ladle, oblations of husks, rice powder, rice grains, ghee, & oil;
offering oblations from the mouth;
offering blood-sacrifices;
making predictions based on the fingertips;
geomancy;
making predictions for state officials;
laying demons in a cemetery;
placing spells on spirits;
earth-skills [divining water and gems?];
snake-skills, poison-skills, scorpion-skills, rat-skills, bird-skills, crow-skills;
predicting life spans;
giving protective charms;
casting horoscopes—
he abstains from wrong livelihood, from "animal" arts such as these.

"Whereas some contemplatives & brahmans, living off food given in faith, maintain themselves by wrong livelihood, by such "animal" arts as: determining lucky & unlucky gems, staffs, garments, swords, arrows, bows, & other weapons; women, men, boys, girls, male slaves, female slaves; elephants, horses, buffaloes, bulls, cows, goats, rams, fowl, quails, lizards, rabbits, tortoises, & other animals—he abstains from wrong livelihood, from "animal" arts such as these.

"Whereas some contemplatives & brahmans, living off food given in faith, maintain themselves by wrong livelihood, by such "animal" arts as (forecasting):

the rulers will march forth;

the rulers will not march forth;
our rulers will attack, and their rulers will retreat;
their rulers will attack, and our rulers will retreat;
there will be triumph for our rulers and defeat for their rulers;
there will be triumph for their rulers and defeat for our rulers;
thus there will be triumph for this one, defeat for that one—
he abstains from wrong livelihood, from "animal" arts such as these.

"Whereas some contemplatives & brahmans, living off food given in faith, maintain themselves by wrong livelihood, by such "animal" arts as (forecasting):

there will be a lunar eclipse;
there will be a solar eclipse;
there will be an occultation of [a conjunction of the moon or a planet with] an asterism;
the sun & moon will be favorable;
the sun & moon will be unfavorable;
the asterisms will be favorable;
the asterisms will be unfavorable;
there will be a meteor shower;
there will be a flickering light on the horizon [an aurora?];
there will be an earthquake;
there will be thunder coming from dry clouds;
there will be a rising, a setting, a darkening, a brightening of the sun, moon, & asterisms;
such will be the result of the lunar eclipse… the rising, setting, darkening, brightening of the sun, moon, & asterisms—
he abstains from wrong livelihood, from "animal" arts such as these.

"Whereas some contemplatives & brahmans, living off food given in faith, maintain themselves by wrong livelihood, by such "animal" arts as (forecasting):

there will be abundant rain; there will be a drought;
there will be plenty; there will be famine;
there will be rest and security; there will be danger;
there will be disease; there will be freedom from disease;

or they earn their living by accounting, counting, calculation, composing poetry, or teaching hedonistic arts & doctrines *[lokāyata]*—

he abstains from wrong livelihood, from "animal" arts such as these.

"Whereas some contemplatives & brahmans, living off food given in faith, maintain themselves by wrong livelihood, by such "animal" arts as:

calculating auspicious dates for marriages—both those in which the bride is brought home and those in which she is sent out; calculating auspicious dates for betrothals and divorces; for collecting debts or making investments and loans; reciting charms to make people attractive or unattractive; curing women who have undergone miscarriages or abortions;

reciting spells to bind a man's tongue, to paralyze his jaws, to make him lose control over his hands, or to bring on deafness;

getting oracular answers to questions addressed to a spirit in a mirror, in a young girl, or to a spirit medium;

worshipping the sun, worshipping the Great Brahmā, bringing forth flames from the mouth, invoking the goddess of luck—

he abstains from wrong livelihood, from "animal" arts such as these.

"Whereas some contemplatives & brahmans, living off food given in faith, maintain themselves by wrong livelihood, by such "animal" arts as:

promising gifts to deities in return for favors; fulfilling such promises;

demonology;

reciting spells in earth houses [see earth skills, above];

inducing virility and impotence;

preparing sites for construction;

consecrating sites for construction;

giving ceremonial mouthwashes and ceremonial baths;

offering sacrificial fires;

administering emetics, purges, purges from above, purges from below, head-purges; ear-oil, eye-drops, treatments through the nose, ointments, and counter-ointments; practicing eye-surgery [or: extractive surgery], general surgery, pediatrics; administering root-medicines and binding medicinal herbs—

he abstains from wrong livelihood, from "animal" arts such as these. This, too, is part of his virtue.

### Sense Restraint

"And how does a monk guard the doors of his senses? On seeing a form with the eye, he does not grasp at any theme or details by which—if he were to dwell without restraint over the faculty of the eye—evil, unskillful qualities such as greed or distress might assail him. On hearing a sound with the ear.… On smelling an aroma with the nose.… On tasting a flavor with the tongue.… On touching a tactile sensation with the body.… On cognizing an idea with the intellect, he does not grasp at any theme or details by which—if he were to dwell without restraint over the faculty of the intellect—evil, unskillful qualities such as greed or distress might assail him. Endowed with this noble restraint over the sense faculties, he is inwardly sensitive to the pleasure of being blameless. This is how a monk guards the doors of his senses.

### Mindfulness & Alertness

"And how is a monk possessed of mindfulness & alertness? When going forward & returning, he makes himself alert. When looking toward & looking away.… when bending & extending his limbs.… when carrying his outer cloak, his upper robe, & his bowl.… when eating, drinking, chewing, & tasting.… when urinating & defecating.… when walking, standing, sitting, falling asleep, waking up, talking, & remaining silent, he makes himself alert. This is how a monk is possessed of mindfulness & alertness.

### Contentedness

"And how is a monk content? Just as a bird, wherever it goes, flies with its wings as its only burden; so too is he content with a set of robes to provide for his body and alms food to provide for his hunger. Wherever he goes, he takes only his barest necessities along. This is how a monk is content.

### Abandoning the Hindrances

"Endowed with this noble aggregate of virtue, this noble restraint over the sense faculties, this noble mindfulness and alertness, and this noble contentment, he seeks out a secluded dwelling: a wilderness, the shade of a tree, a mountain, a glen, a hillside cave, a charnel ground, a forest grove, the open air, a heap of straw. After his meal, returning from his alms round, he sits down, crosses his legs, holds his body erect, and brings mindfulness to the fore.

"Abandoning covetousness with regard to the world, he dwells with an awareness devoid of covetousness. He cleanses his mind of covetousness. Abandoning ill will & anger, he dwells with an awareness devoid of ill will, sympathetic with the welfare of all living beings. He cleanses his mind of ill will & anger. Abandoning sloth & drowsiness, he dwells with an awareness devoid of sloth & drowsiness, mindful, alert, percipient of light. He cleanses his mind of sloth & drowsiness. Abandoning restlessness & anxiety, he dwells undisturbed, his mind inwardly stilled. He cleanses his mind of restlessness & anxiety. Abandoning uncertainty, he dwells having crossed over uncertainty, with no perplexity with regard to skillful qualities. He cleanses his mind of uncertainty.

"Suppose that a man, taking a loan, invests it in his business affairs. His business affairs succeed. He repays his old debts and there is extra left over for maintaining his wife. The thought would occur to him, 'Before, taking a loan, I invested it in my business affairs. Now my business affairs have succeeded. I have repaid my old debts and there is extra left over for maintaining my wife.' Because of that he would experience joy and happiness.

"Now suppose that a man falls sick—in pain and seriously ill. He does not enjoy his meals, and there is no strength in his body. As time passes, he eventually recovers from that sickness. He enjoys his meals and there is strength in his body. The thought would occur to him, 'Before, I was sick.… Now I am recovered from that sickness. I enjoy my meals and there is strength in my body.' Because of that he would experience joy and happiness.

"Now suppose that a man is bound in prison. As time passes, he eventually is released from that bondage, safe and sound, with no loss of property. The thought would occur to him, 'Before, I was bound in prison.

Now I am released from that bondage, safe and sound, with no loss of my property.' Because of that he would experience joy and happiness.

"Now suppose that a man is a slave, subject to others, not subject to himself, unable to go where he likes. As time passes, he eventually is released from that slavery, subject to himself, not subject to others, freed, able to go where he likes. The thought would occur to him, 'Before, I was a slave.… Now I am released from that slavery, subject to myself, not subject to others, freed, able to go where I like.' Because of that he would experience joy and happiness.

"Now suppose that a man, carrying money and goods, is traveling by a road through desolate country. As time passes, he eventually emerges from that desolate country, safe and sound, with no loss of property. The thought would occur to him, 'Before, carrying money and goods, I was traveling by a road through desolate country. Now I have emerged from that desolate country, safe and sound, with no loss of my property.' Because of that he would experience joy and happiness.

"In the same way, when these five hindrances are not abandoned in himself, the monk regards it as a debt, a sickness, a prison, slavery, a road through desolate country. But when these five hindrances are abandoned in himself, he regards it as unindebtedness, good health, release from prison, freedom, a place of security. When he sees that they have been abandoned within him, gladness is born. In one who is gladdened, rapture is born. Enraptured at heart, his body grows calm. His body calm, he is sensitive to pleasure. Feeling pleasure, his mind becomes concentrated.

## The Four Jhānas

"Quite secluded from sensuality, secluded from unskillful qualities, he enters and remains in the first jhāna: rapture & pleasure born of seclusion, accompanied by directed thought and evaluation. He permeates and pervades, suffuses and fills this very body with the rapture & pleasure born of seclusion. Just as if a dexterous bathman or bathman's apprentice would pour bath powder into a brass basin and knead it together, sprinkling it again and again with water, so that his ball of bath powder—saturated, moisture-laden, permeated within and without—would nevertheless not drip; even so, the monk permeates…this very body with the rapture & pleasure born of seclusion. There is nothing of his entire body unpervaded by rapture & pleasure born of seclusion. This is a fruit of the contemplative life, visible here & now, more excellent than the previous ones and more sublime.

"Then, with the stilling of directed thoughts & evaluations, he enters and remains in the second jhāna: rapture & pleasure born of concentration, unification of awareness free from directed thought & evaluation—internal assurance. He permeates and pervades, suffuses and fills this very body with the rapture & pleasure born of concentration. Just like a lake with spring-water welling up from within, having no inflow from the east, west, north, or south, and with the skies supplying abundant showers time and again,[1] so that the cool fount of water welling up from within the lake would permeate and pervade, suffuse and fill it with cool waters, there being no part of the lake unpervaded by the cool waters; even so, the monk permeates… this very body with the rapture & pleasure born of concentration. There is nothing of his entire body unpervaded by rapture & pleasure born of concentration. This, too, is a fruit of the contemplative life, visible here & now, more excellent than the previous ones and more sublime.

"And then, with the fading of rapture, he remains equanimous, mindful, & alert, and senses pleasure with the body. He enters and remains in the third jhāna, of which the noble ones declare, 'Equanimous & mindful, he has a pleasant abiding.' He permeates and pervades, suffuses and fills this very body with the pleasure divested of rapture. Just as in a lotus pond, some of the lotuses, born and growing in the water, stay immersed in the water and flourish without standing up out of the water, so that they are permeated and pervaded, suffused and filled with

cool water from their roots to their tips, and nothing of those lotuses would be unpervaded with cool water; even so, the monk permeates… this very body with the pleasure divested of rapture. There is nothing of his entire body unpervaded with pleasure divested of rapture. This, too, is a fruit of the contemplative life, visible here & now, more excellent than the previous ones and more sublime.

"And then, with the abandoning of pleasure & pain—as with the earlier disappearance of elation & distress—he enters and remains in the fourth jhāna: purity of equanimity & mindfulness, neither pleasure nor pain. He sits, permeating the body with a pure, bright awareness. Just as if a man were sitting covered from head to foot with a white cloth so that there would be no part of his body to which the white cloth did not extend; even so, the monk sits, permeating the body with a pure, bright awareness. There is nothing of his entire body unpervaded by pure, bright awareness. This, too, great king, is a fruit of the contemplative life, visible here & now, more excellent than the previous ones and more sublime.

### Insight Knowledge

"With his mind thus concentrated, purified, and bright, unblemished, free from defects, pliant, malleable, steady, and attained to imperturbability, he directs and inclines it to knowledge and vision. He discerns: 'This body of mine is endowed with form, composed of the four primary elements, born from mother and father, nourished with rice and porridge, subject to inconstancy, rubbing, pressing, dissolution, and dispersion. And this consciousness of mine is supported here and bound up here.' Just as if there were a beautiful beryl gem of the purest water—eight faceted, well polished, clear, limpid, consummate in all its aspects, and going through the middle of it was a blue, yellow, red, white, or brown thread—and a man with good eyesight, taking it in his hand, were to reflect on it thus: 'This is a beautiful beryl gem of the purest water, eight faceted, well polished, clear, limpid, consummate in all its aspects. And this, going through the middle of it, is a blue, yellow, red, white, or brown thread.' In the same way—with his mind thus concentrated, purified, and bright, unblemished, free from defects, pliant, malleable, steady, and attained to imperturbability—the monk directs and inclines it to knowledge and vision. He discerns: 'This body of mine is endowed with form, composed of the four primary elements, born from mother and father, nourished with rice and porridge, subject to inconstancy, rubbing, pressing, dissolution, and dispersion. And this consciousness of mine is supported here and bound up here.' This, too, great king, is a fruit of the contemplative life, visible here & now, more excellent than the previous ones and more sublime.

### The Mind-made Body

"With his mind thus concentrated, purified, and bright, unblemished, free from defects, pliant, malleable, steady, and attained to imperturbability, he directs and inclines it to creating a mind-made body. From this body he creates another body, endowed with form, made of the mind, complete in all its parts, not inferior in its faculties. Just as if a man were to draw a reed from its sheath. The thought would occur to him: 'This is the sheath, this is the reed. The sheath is one thing, the reed another, but the reed has been drawn out from the sheath.' Or as if a man were to draw a sword from its scabbard. The thought would occur to him: 'This is the sword, this is the scabbard. The sword is one thing, the scabbard another, but the sword has been drawn out from the scabbard.' Or as if a man were to pull a snake out from its slough. The thought would occur to him: 'This is the snake, this is the slough. The snake is one thing, the slough another, but the snake has been pulled out from the slough.' In the same way—with his mind thus concentrated, purified, and bright, unblemished, free from defects, pliant, malleable, steady, and attained to imperturbability, the monk directs and inclines it to creating a mind-made body. From this body he creates another body, endowed with form, made of the mind, complete in all its parts, not inferior in its faculties. This, too, great king, is a fruit of the contemplative life, visible here & now, more excellent than the previous ones and more sublime.

### Supranormal Powers

"With his mind thus concentrated, purified, and bright, unblemished, free from defects, pliant, malleable, steady, and attained to imperturbability, he directs and inclines it to the modes of supranormal powers. He wields manifold supranormal powers. Having been one he becomes many; having been many he becomes one. He appears. He vanishes. He goes unimpeded through walls, ramparts, and mountains as if through space. He dives in and out of the earth as if it were water. He walks on water without sinking as if it were dry land. Sitting cross-legged he flies through the air like a winged bird. With his hand he touches and strokes even the sun and moon, so mighty and powerful. He exercises influence with his body even as far as the Brahmā worlds. Just as a dexterous potter or his assistant could craft from well-prepared clay whatever kind of pottery vessel he likes, or as a dexterous ivory-carver or his assistant could craft from well-prepared ivory any kind of ivory-work he likes, or as a dexterous goldsmith or his assistant could craft from well-prepared gold any kind of gold article he likes; in the same way—with his mind thus concentrated, purified, and bright, unblemished, free from defects, pliant, malleable, steady, and attained to imperturbability—the monk directs and inclines it to the modes of supranormal powers.… He exercises influence with his body even as far as the Brahmā worlds. This, too, great king, is a fruit of the contemplative life, visible here & now, more excellent than the previous ones and more sublime.

### Clairaudience

"With his mind thus concentrated, purified, and bright, unblemished, free from defects, pliant, malleable, steady, and attained to imperturbability, he directs and inclines it to the divine ear-element. He hears—by means of the divine ear-element, purified and surpassing the human—both kinds of sounds: divine and human, whether near or far. Just as if a man traveling along a highway were to hear the sounds of kettledrums, small drums, conchs, cymbals, and tom-toms. He would know, 'That is the sound of kettledrums, that is the sound of small drums, that is the sound of conchs, that is the sound of cymbals, and that is the sound of tom-toms.' In the same way—with his mind thus concentrated, purified, and bright, unblemished, free from defects, pliant, malleable, steady, and attained to imperturbability—the monk directs and inclines it to the divine ear-element. He hears—by means of the divine ear-element, purified and surpassing the human—both kinds of sounds: divine and human, whether near or far. This, too, great king, is a fruit of the contemplative life, visible here & now, more excellent than the previous ones and more sublime.

## Mind Reading

"With his mind thus concentrated, purified, and bright, unblemished, free from defects, pliant, malleable, steady, and attained to imperturbability, he directs and inclines it to knowledge of the awareness of other beings. He discerns the awareness of other beings, other individuals, having encompassed it with his own awareness. He discerns a mind with passion as 'a mind with passion,' and a mind without passion as 'a mind without passion.' He discerns a mind with aversion as 'a mind with aversion,' and a mind without aversion as 'a mind without aversion.' He discerns a mind with delusion as 'a mind with delusion,' and a mind without delusion as 'a mind without delusion.' He discerns a restricted mind as 'a restricted mind,' and a scattered mind as 'a scattered mind.' He discerns an enlarged mind[2] as 'an enlarged mind,' and an unenlarged mind as 'an unenlarged mind.' He discerns a surpassed mind [one that is not at the most excellent level] as 'a surpassed mind,' and an unsurpassed mind as 'an unsurpassed mind.' He discerns a concentrated mind as 'a concentrated mind,' and an unconcentrated mind as 'an unconcentrated mind.' He discerns a released mind[3] as 'a released mind,' and an unreleased mind as 'an unreleased mind.' Just as if a young woman—or man—fond of ornaments, examining the reflection of her own face in a bright mirror or a bowl of clear water would know 'blemished' if it were blemished, or 'unblemished' if it were not. In the same way—with his mind thus concentrated, purified, and bright, unblemished, free from defects, pliant, malleable, steady, and attained to imperturbability—the monk directs and inclines it to knowledge of the awareness of other beings. He discerns the awareness of other beings, other individuals, having encompassed it with his own awareness. He discerns a mind with passion as 'a mind with passion,' and a mind without passion as 'a mind without passion' … a released mind as 'a released mind,' and an unreleased mind as 'an unreleased mind.' This, too, great king, is a fruit of the contemplative life, visible here & now, more excellent than the previous ones and more sublime.

## Recollection of Past Lives

"With his mind thus concentrated, purified, and bright, unblemished, free from defects, pliant, malleable, steady, and attained to imperturbability, he directs and inclines it to knowledge of the recollection of past lives [lit: previous homes]. He recollects his manifold past lives, i.e., one birth, two births, three births, four, five, ten, twenty, thirty, forty, fifty, one hundred, one thousand, one hundred thousand, many eons of cosmic contraction, many eons of cosmic expansion, many eons of cosmic contraction & expansion, (recollecting,) 'There I had such a name, belonged to such a clan, had such an appearance. Such was my food, such my experience of pleasure & pain, such the end of my life. Passing away from that state, I re-arose there. There too I had such a name, belonged to such a clan, had such an appearance. Such was my food, such my experience of pleasure & pain, such the end of my life. Passing away from that state, I re-arose here.' Thus he recollects his manifold past lives in their modes & details. Just as if a man were to go from his home village to another village, and then from that village to yet another village, and then from that village back to his home village. The thought would occur to him, 'I went from my home village to that village over there. There I stood in such a way, sat in such a way, talked in such a way, and remained silent in such a way. From that village I went to that village over there, and there I stood in such a way, sat in such a way, talked in such a way, and remained silent in such a way. From that village I came back home.' In the same way—with his mind thus concentrated, purified, and bright, unblemished, free from defects, pliant, malleable, steady, and attained to imperturbability—the monk directs and inclines it to knowledge of the recollection of past lives. He recollects his manifold past lives… in their modes & details. This, too, great king, is a fruit of the contemplative life, visible here & now, more excellent than the previous ones and more sublime.

### The Passing Away & Re-appearance of Beings

"With his mind thus concentrated, purified, and bright, unblemished, free from defects, pliant, malleable, steady, and attained to imperturbability, he directs and inclines it to knowledge of the passing away and re-appearance of beings. He sees—by means of the divine eye, purified and surpassing the human—beings passing away and re-appearing, and he discerns how they are inferior and superior, beautiful and ugly, fortunate and unfortunate in accordance with their kamma: 'These beings—who were endowed with bad conduct of body, speech, and mind, who reviled the noble ones, held wrong views and undertook actions under the influence of wrong views—with the break-up of the body, after death, have re-appeared in a plane of deprivation, a bad destination, a lower realm, hell. But these beings—who were endowed with good conduct of body, speech, and mind, who did not revile the noble ones, who held right views and undertook actions under the influence of right views—with the break-up of the body, after death, have re-appeared in a good destination, a heavenly world.' Thus—by means of the divine eye, purified and surpassing the human—he sees beings passing away and re-appearing, and he discerns how they are inferior and superior, beautiful and ugly, fortunate and unfortunate in accordance with their kamma. Just as if there were a tall building in the central square (of a town), and a man with good eyesight standing on top of it were to see people entering a house, leaving it, walking along the street, and sitting in the central square. The thought would occur to him, 'These people are entering a house, leaving it, walking along the streets, and sitting in the central square.' In the same way—with his mind thus concentrated, purified, and bright, unblemished, free from defects, pliant, malleable, steady, and attained to imperturbability—the monk directs and inclines it to knowledge of the passing away and re-appearance of beings. He sees—by means of the divine eye, purified and surpassing the human—beings passing away and re-appearing, and he discerns how they are inferior and superior, beautiful and ugly, fortunate and unfortunate in accordance with their kamma.… This, too, great king, is a fruit of the contemplative life, visible here & now, more excellent than the previous ones and more sublime.

## The Ending of Effluents

"With his mind thus concentrated, purified, and bright, unblemished, free from defects, pliant, malleable, steady, and attained to imperturbability, the monk directs and inclines it to the knowledge of the ending of effluents.[4] He discerns, as it has come to be, that 'This is stress… This is the origination of stress… This is the cessation of stress… This is the way leading to the cessation of stress… These are effluents… This is the origination of effluents… This is the cessation of effluents… This is the way leading to the cessation of effluents.' His heart, thus knowing, thus seeing, is released from the effluent of sensuality, the effluent of becoming, the effluent of ignorance. With release, there is the knowledge, 'Released.' He discerns that 'Birth is ended, the holy life fulfilled, the task done. There is nothing further for this world.' Just as if there were a pool of water in a mountain glen—clear, limpid, & unsullied—where a man with good eyesight standing on the bank could see shells, gravel, and pebbles, and also shoals of fish swimming about and resting, and it would occur to him, 'This pool of water is clear, limpid, and unsullied. Here are these shells, gravel, and pebbles, and also these shoals of fish swimming about and resting.' In the same way—with his mind thus concentrated, purified, and bright, unblemished, free from defects, pliant, malleable, steady, and attained to imperturbability—the monk directs and inclines it to the knowledge of the ending of effluents. He discerns, as it has come to be, that 'This is stress… This is the origination of stress… This is the cessation of stress… This is the way leading to the cessation of stress… These are effluents… This is the origination of effluents… This is the cessation of effluents… This is the way leading to the cessation of effluents.' His heart, thus knowing, thus seeing, is released from the effluent of sensuality, the effluent of becoming, the effluent of ignorance. With release, there is the knowledge, 'Released.' He discerns that 'Birth is ended, the holy life fulfilled, the task done. There is nothing further for this world.' This, too, great king, is a fruit of the contemplative life, visible here & now, more excellent than the previous ones and more sublime. And as for another visible fruit of the contemplative life, higher and more sublime than this, there is none."

When this was said, King Ajātasattu said to the Blessed One: "Magnificent, lord! Magnificent! Just as if he were to place upright what was overturned, to reveal what was hidden, to show the way to one who

was lost, or to carry a lamp into the dark so that those with eyes could see forms, in the same way has the Blessed One—through many lines of reasoning—made the Dhamma clear. I go to the Blessed One for refuge, to the Dhamma, and to the Saṅgha of monks. May the Blessed One remember me as a lay follower who has gone to him for refuge, from this day forward, for life.

"A transgression has overcome me, lord, in that I was so foolish, so muddle-headed, and so unskilled as to kill my father—a righteous man, a righteous king—for the sake of sovereign rulership. May the Blessed One please accept this confession of my transgression as such, so that I may restrain myself in the future."

"Yes, great king, a transgression overcame you in that you were so foolish, so muddle-headed, and so unskilled as to kill your father—a righteous man, a righteous king—for the sake of sovereign rulership. But because you see your transgression as such and make amends in accordance with the Dhamma, we accept your confession. For it is a cause of growth in the discipline of the noble ones when, seeing a transgression as such, one makes amends in accordance with the Dhamma and exercises restraint in the future."

When this was said, King Ajātasattu said to the Blessed One: "Well, then, lord, I am now taking leave. Many are my duties, many my responsibilities."

"Then do, great king, what you think it is now time to do."

So King Ajātasattu, delighting and rejoicing in the Blessed One's words, rose from his seat, bowed down to him, and—after circumambulating him—left. Not long after King Ajātasattu had left, the Blessed One addressed the monks: "The king is wounded, monks. The king is incapacitated. Had he not killed his father—that righteous man, that righteous king—the dustless, stainless Dhamma eye would have arisen to him as he sat in this very seat."

That is what the Blessed One said. Gratified, the monks delighted in the Blessed One's words.

## Notes

1. Reading, *Devo ca kālena kālaṁ sammādhāraṁ anuppaveccheyya,* with the Thai edition.

2. *Mahaggataṁ.* This term is used, together with "immeasurable / unlimited," in the standard description of the awareness generated in the practice of the *brahmavihāras* (SN 42:8). According to Ven. Anuruddha in MN 127, however, an enlarged mind is not immeasurable. Its range of awareness is larger than the body but still measurable, ranging in distance from the shade of a tree to the earth bounded by the ocean.

3. On the various levels of release, see DN 15, MN 43, and AN 9:43–45.

4. *Āsavas:* three qualities—sensuality, becoming, and ignorance—that "flow out" of the mind and defile it. Sometimes a fourth quality—views—is added to the list, to connect these qualities with the four floods *(ogha),* which are identical to the four yokes. See AN 4:10.

*See also: DN 16; SN 46:51; SN 56:11; AN 6:86–87*

# *About Poṭṭhapāda*
# *Poṭṭhapāda Sutta (DN 9)*

## Introduction

*This sutta portrays two modes by which the Buddha responded to the controversial issues of his day. The first mode—illustrated by his contribution to the discussion on the ultimate cessation of perception—was to adopt the terms of the discussion but to invest them with his own meanings, and then to try to direct the discussion to the practice leading to the cessation of suffering & stress. The second mode—illustrated by his treatment of whether the cosmos is eternal, etc.—was to declare the issues as unconducive to awakening, and to refuse to take a position on them.*

*Several other suttas—such as MN 63, MN 72, and AN 10:93—portray the Buddha and his disciples adopting the second mode. This sutta is unusual in its extended portrait of the Buddha's adopting the first. Many of the technical terms he uses here—such as the perception of a refined truth, the peak of perception, the alert step-by step attainment of the ultimate cessation of perception, the appropriation of a self—are found nowhere else in the Canon. At the end of the sutta, he describes them as "the world's designations, the world's expressions, the world's ways of speaking, the world's descriptions, with which the Tathāgata expresses himself but without grasping at them." In other words, he picks them up for the purpose at hand and then lets them go. Thus they are not to be regarded as central to his teaching. Instead, they should be read as examples of his ability to adapt the language of his interlocutors to his own purposes. For this reason, this sutta is best read only after you have read other suttas and are familiar with the more central concepts of the Buddha's teachings.*

*Of particular interest here is the Buddha's treatment of the three "appropriations of a self." The first—the gross self—refers to the ordinary, everyday sense of identifying with one's body. The latter two—the mind-made appropriation and the formless appropriation—refer to the sense of self that can*

*be developed in meditation. The mind-made appropriation can result from an experience of the mind-made body—the "astral body"—that constitutes one of the powers that can be developed through concentration practice. The formless appropriation can result from any of the formless states of concentration—such as an experience of infinite space, infinite consciousness, or nothingness. Although meditators, on experiencing these states, might assume that they have encountered their "true self," the Buddha is careful to note that these are appropriations, and that they are no more one's true self than the body is. They are one's appropriation of a self only for the time that one identifies with them. The Buddha goes on to say that he teaches the Dhamma for the sake of abandoning every appropriation of a self "such that, when you practice it, defiling mental qualities will be abandoned, bright mental qualities will grow, and you will enter & remain in the culmination & abundance of discernment, having known & realized it for yourself in the here & now."*

* * *

I have heard that on one occasion the Blessed One was staying near Sāvatthī in Jeta's Grove, Anāthapiṇḍika's monastery. Now on that occasion Poṭṭhapāda the wanderer, together with a large following of about 300 wanderers, had taken up residence in the debating hall near the Tiṇḍuka tree in the single-pavilion park of Queen Mallikā. Then the Blessed One, early in the morning—having adjusted his lower robe and taking his bowl & outer robe—entered Sāvatthī for alms. Then the thought occurred to him, "While it's still too early to go into Sāvatthī for alms, why don't I go to the debating hall near the Tiṇḍuka tree in the single-pavilion park of Queen Mallikā to see Poṭṭhapāda the wanderer?" So he went to the debating hall near the Tiṇḍuka tree in the single-pavilion park of Queen Mallikā.

Now on that occasion Poṭṭhapāda the wanderer was sitting with his large following of wanderers, all making a great noise & racket, discussing many kinds of bestial topics of conversation: conversation about kings, robbers, & ministers of state; armies, alarms, & battles; food & drink; clothing, furniture, garlands, & scents; relatives; vehicles; villages, towns, cities, the countryside; women & heroes; the gossip of the street & the well; tales of the dead; tales of diversity, the creation of the world & of the sea; talk of whether things exist or not. Then Poṭṭhapāda the wanderer

saw the Blessed One coming from afar, and on seeing him, hushed his following: "Be quiet, good sirs. Don't make any noise. Here comes the contemplative Gotama. He is fond of quietude and speaks in praise of quietude. Maybe, if he perceives our group as quiet, he will consider it worth his while to come our way." So the wanderers fell silent.

Then the Blessed One went to Poṭṭhapāda, and Poṭṭhapāda said to him, "Come, Blessed One. Welcome, Blessed One. It's been a long time since the Blessed One has gone out of his way to come here. Sit down, Blessed One. This seat has been prepared." So the Blessed One sat on the prepared seat. Poṭṭhapāda, taking a lower seat, sat to one side. As he was sitting there, the Blessed One said to him, "For what topic of conversation are you gathered together here? In the midst of what topic of conversation have you been interrupted?"

When this was said, Poṭṭhapāda replied, "Never mind, lord, about the topic of conversation for which we have gathered here. It won't be difficult for the Blessed One to hear about that later. For the past few days a discussion has arisen among the many sects of contemplatives & brahmans gathered and sitting together in the debating hall, concerning the ultimate cessation of perception: 'How is there the ultimate cessation of perception?' With regard to this, some said, 'A person's perception arises and ceases without cause, without reason. When it arises, one is percipient. When it ceases, one is not percipient.'[1] That's how one group described the ultimate cessation of perception.

"Then someone else said, 'No, that's not how it is. Perception is a person's self, which comes and goes. When it comes, one is percipient. When it goes, one is not percipient.' That's how one group described the ultimate cessation of perception.

"Then someone else said, 'No, that's not how it is, for there are contemplatives & brahmans of great power, great potency. They draw perception in and out of a person. When they draw it in, one is percipient. When they draw it out, one is not percipient.' That's how one group described the ultimate cessation of perception.

"Then someone else said, 'No, that's not how it is, for there are devas of great power, great potency. They draw perception in and out of a person. When they draw it in, one is percipient. When they draw it out, one is not

percipient.' That's how one group described the ultimate cessation of perception.

"Then the memory of the Blessed One arose within me: 'Ah, the Blessed One! Ah, the One Well-Gone—who surely is well-skilled in these matters.' The Blessed One is skilled and expert in the ultimate cessation of perception. So what, lord, is the ultimate cessation of perception?"

"In this regard, Poṭṭhapāda, those contemplatives & brahmans who say that a person's perception arises & ceases without cause, without reason, are wrong from the very start. Why is that? Because a person's perception arises & ceases with a cause, with a reason. With training, one perception arises and with training another perception ceases. And what is that training?

"There is the case where a Tathāgata appears in the world, worthy and rightly self-awakened. [as in DN 2] …

"This is how a monk is consummate in virtue.…

"Seeing that these five hindrances have been abandoned within him, he becomes glad. Glad, he becomes enraptured. Enraptured, his body grows tranquil. His body tranquil, he is sensitive to pleasure. Feeling pleasure, his mind becomes concentrated.

"Quite secluded from sensuality, secluded from unskillful qualities, the monk enters & remains in the first jhāna: rapture & pleasure born of seclusion, accompanied by directed thought & evaluation. His earlier perception of sensuality ceases, and on that occasion there is a perception of a refined truth of rapture & pleasure born of seclusion. On that occasion he is one who is percipient of a refined truth of rapture & pleasure born of seclusion. And thus it is that with training one perception arises and with training another perception ceases.

"Then, with the stilling of directed thoughts & evaluations, the monk enters & remains in the second jhāna: rapture & pleasure born of concentration, unification of awareness free from directed thought & evaluation—internal assurance. His earlier perception of a refined truth of rapture & pleasure born of seclusion ceases, and on that occasion there is a perception of a refined truth of rapture & pleasure born of concentration. On that occasion he is one who is percipient of a refined

truth of rapture & pleasure born of concentration. And thus it is that with training one perception arises and with training another perception ceases.

"And further, with the fading of rapture, the monk remains equanimous, mindful, & alert, and senses pleasure with the body. He enters & remains in the third jhāna, of which the noble ones declare, 'Equanimous & mindful, he has a pleasant abiding.' His earlier perception of a refined truth of rapture & pleasure born of concentration ceases, and on that occasion there is a perception of a refined truth of equanimity. On that occasion he is one who is percipient of a refined truth of equanimity. And thus it is that with training one perception arises and with training another perception ceases.

"And further, with the abandoning of pleasure & pain—as with the earlier disappearance of elation & distress—the monk enters & remains in the fourth jhāna: purity of equanimity & mindfulness, neither pleasure nor pain. His earlier perception of a refined truth of equanimity ceases, and on that occasion there is a perception of a refined truth of neither pleasure nor pain. On that occasion he is one who is percipient of a refined truth of neither pleasure nor pain. And thus it is that with training one perception arises and with training another perception ceases.

"And further, with the complete transcending of perceptions of (physical) form, with the disappearance of perceptions of resistance, and not heeding perceptions of multiplicity, (perceiving,) 'Infinite space,' the monk enters & remains in the dimension of the infinitude of space. His earlier perception of form ceases, and on that occasion there is a perception of a refined truth of the dimension of the infinitude of space. On that occasion he is one who is percipient of a refined truth of the dimension of the infinitude of space. And thus it is that with training one perception arises and with training another perception ceases.

"And further, with the complete transcending of the dimension of the infinitude of space, (perceiving,) 'Infinite consciousness,' the monk enters & remains in the dimension of the infinitude of consciousness. His earlier perception of a refined truth of the dimension of the infinitude of space ceases, and on that occasion there is a perception of a refined truth of the dimension of the infinitude of consciousness. On that occasion he is one

who is percipient of a refined truth of the dimension of the infinitude of consciousness. And thus it is that with training one perception arises and with training another perception ceases.

"And further, with the complete transcending of the dimension of the infinitude of consciousness, (perceiving,) 'There is nothing,' enters & remains in the dimension of nothingness. His earlier perception of a refined truth of the dimension of the infinitude of consciousness ceases, and on that occasion there is a perception of a refined truth of the dimension of nothingness. On that occasion he is one who is percipient of a refined truth of the dimension of nothingness. And thus it is that with training one perception arises and with training another perception ceases.[2]

"Now, when the monk is percipient of himself here, then from there to there, step by step, he touches the peak of perception. As he remains at the peak of perception, the thought occurs to him, 'Thinking is bad for me. Not thinking is better for me. If I were to think and will, this perception of mine would cease, and a grosser perception would appear. What if I were neither to think nor to will?'[3] So he neither thinks nor wills, and as he is neither thinking nor willing, that perception ceases[4] and another, grosser perception does not appear. He touches cessation. This, Poṭṭhapāda, is how there is the alert[5] step-by step attainment of the ultimate cessation of perception.

"Now what do you think, Poṭṭhapāda? Have you ever before heard of such an alert step-by step attainment of the ultimate cessation of perception?"

"No, lord. And here is how I understand the Dhamma taught by the Blessed One: 'When the monk is percipient of himself here, then from there to there, step by step, he touches the peak of perception. As he remains at the peak of perception, the thought occurs to him, "Thinking is bad for me. Not thinking is better for me. If I were to think and will, this perception of mine would cease, and a grosser perception would appear. What if I were neither to think nor to will?" So he neither thinks nor wills, and as he is neither thinking nor willing, that perception ceases and another, grosser perception does not appear. He touches cessation.

This, Poṭṭhapāda, is how there is the alert step-by step attainment of the ultimate cessation of perception.'"

"That's right, Poṭṭhapāda."

"But, lord, does the Blessed One describe one peak of perception or many peaks of perception?"

"Poṭṭhapāda, I describe one peak of perception and many peaks of perception."

"And how does the Blessed One describe one peak of perception and many peaks of perception?"

"In whatever way one touches cessation, Poṭṭhapāda, that's the way I describe the peak of perception.[6] That's how I describe one peak of perception and many peaks of perception."

"Now, lord, does perception arise first, and knowledge after; or does knowledge arise first, and perception after; or do perception & knowledge arise simultaneously?"

"Poṭṭhapāda, perception arises first, and knowledge after. And the arising of knowledge comes from the arising of perception. One discerns, 'It's in dependence on this[7] that my knowledge has arisen.' Through this line of reasoning one can realize how perception arises first, and knowledge after, and how the arising of knowledge comes from the arising of perception."

"Now, lord, is perception a person's self, or is perception one thing and self another?"

"What self do you posit, Poṭṭhapāda?"

"I posit a gross self, possessed of form, made up of the four great elements [earth, water, fire, and wind], feeding on physical food."

"Then, Poṭṭhapāda, your self would be gross, possessed of form, made up of the four great elements, feeding on physical food. That being the case, then for you perception would be one thing and self another. And it's through this line of reasoning that one can realize how perception will be one thing and self another: Even as there remains this gross self—possessed of form, made up of the four great elements, and feeding on food—then for that person, perception arises as other, perception passes

away as other. It's through this line of reasoning that one can realize how perception will be one thing and self another."

"Then, lord, I posit a mind-made self complete in all its parts, not inferior in its faculties."[8]

"Then, Poṭṭhapāda, your self would be mind-made, complete in all its parts, not inferior in its faculties. That being the case, then for you perception would be one thing and self another. And it's through this line of reasoning that one can realize how perception will be one thing and self another: Even as there remains this mind-made self—complete in all its parts, not inferior in its faculties—then for that person, perception arises as other, perception passes away as other. It's through this line of reasoning that one can realize how perception will be one thing and self another."

"Then, lord, I posit a formless self made of perception."

"Then, Poṭṭhapāda, your self would be formless and made of perception. That being the case, then for you perception would be one thing and self another. And it's through this line of reasoning that one can realize how perception will be one thing and self another: Even as there remains this formless self made of perception, then for that person, perception arises as other, perception passes away as other. It's through this line of reasoning that one can realize how perception will be one thing and self another."

"Is it possible for me to know, lord, whether perception is a person's self or if perception is one thing and self another?"

"Poṭṭhapāda—having other views, other practices, other satisfactions, other aims, other teachers—it's hard for you to know whether perception is a person's self or if perception is one thing and self another."

"Well then, lord, if—having other views, other practices, other satisfactions, other aims, other teachers—it's hard for me to know whether perception is a person's self or if perception is one thing and self another, then is it the case that the cosmos is eternal, that only this is true and anything otherwise is worthless?"

"Poṭṭhapāda, I haven't expounded that the cosmos is eternal, that only this is true and anything otherwise is worthless."

"Then is it the case that the cosmos is not eternal, that only this is true and anything otherwise is worthless?"

"Poṭṭhapāda, I haven't expounded that the cosmos is not eternal, that only this is true and anything otherwise is worthless."

"Then is it the case that the cosmos is finite… the cosmos is infinite… the soul & the body are the same… the soul is one thing and the body another… after death a Tathāgata exists… after death a Tathāgata does not exist… after death a Tathāgata both exists & does not exist… after death a Tathāgata neither exists nor does not exist, that only this is true and anything otherwise is worthless?"

"Poṭṭhapāda, I haven't expounded that after death a Tathāgata neither exists nor does not exist, that only this is true and anything otherwise is worthless."

"But why hasn't the Blessed One expounded these things?"

"Because they are not conducive to the goal, are not conducive to the Dhamma, are not basic to the holy life. They don't lead to disenchantment, to dispassion, to cessation, to stilling, to direct knowledge, to self-awakening, to unbinding. That's why I haven't expounded them."

"And what *has* the Blessed One expounded?"

"I have expounded that, 'This is stress' … 'This is the origination of stress' … 'This is the cessation of stress' … 'This is the path of practice leading to the cessation of stress.'

"And why has the Blessed One expounded these things?"

"Because they are conducive to the goal, conducive to the Dhamma, and basic to the holy life. They lead to disenchantment, to dispassion, to cessation, to stilling, to direct knowledge, to self-awakening, to unbinding. That's why I have expounded them."

"So it is, Blessed One. So it is, O One Well-Gone. Well now, it's time for the Blessed One to do as he sees fit."

Then the Blessed One got up from his seat and left.

Not long after he had left, the wanderers, with sneering words, jeered at Poṭṭhapāda the wanderer from all sides: "So, whatever the

contemplative Gotama says, Sir Poṭṭhapāda rejoices in his every word: 'So it is, Blessed One. So it is, O One Well-Gone.' But *we* don't understand the contemplative Gotama as having taught any categorical teaching as to whether the cosmos is eternal or the cosmos is not eternal or… whether after death a Tathāgata neither exists nor does not exist."

When this was said, Poṭṭhapāda the wanderer replied to the wanderers, "I, too, don't understand the contemplative Gotama as having taught any categorical teaching as to whether the cosmos is eternal or the cosmos is not eternal or… whether after death a Tathāgata neither exists nor does not exist. But the contemplative Gotama describes a genuine, authentic, and accurate practice, grounded in the Dhamma and consonant with the Dhamma. And when a genuine, authentic, and accurate practice, grounded in the Dhamma and consonant with the Dhamma is being explained, why shouldn't a knowledgeable person such as myself rejoice in the well-spokenness of the contemplative Gotama's well-spoken words?"

Then two or three days later, Citta the elephant trainer's son and Poṭṭhapāda the wanderer went to the Blessed One. On their arrival, Citta bowed down to the Blessed One and sat to one side, while Poṭṭhapāda the wanderer greeted the Blessed One courteously. After an exchange of friendly greetings & courtesies, he sat to one side. As he was sitting there, he said to the Blessed One: "The other day, not long after the Blessed One had left, the wanderers, with sneering words, jeered at me from all sides: 'So, whatever the contemplative Gotama says, Sir Poṭṭhapāda rejoices in his every word: "So it is, Blessed One. So it is, O One Well-Gone." But *we* don't understand the contemplative Gotama as having taught any categorical teaching as to whether the cosmos is eternal or the cosmos is not eternal or … whether after death a Tathāgata neither exists nor does not exist.'

"When this was said, I replied to the wanderers, 'I, too, don't understand the contemplative Gotama as having taught any categorical teaching as to whether the cosmos is eternal or the cosmos is not eternal or… whether after death a Tathāgata neither exists nor does not exist. But the contemplative Gotama describes a genuine, authentic, and accurate practice, grounded in the Dhamma and consonant with the Dhamma. And when a genuine, authentic, and accurate practice, grounded in the

Dhamma and consonant with the Dhamma is being explained, why shouldn't a knowledgeable person such as myself rejoice in the well-spokenness of the contemplative Gotama's well-spoken words?'"

[The Buddha:] "Poṭṭhapāda, all those wanderers are blind and have no eyes. You alone among them have eyes. I have taught and declared some teachings to be categorical, and some teachings to be not categorical. And what are the teachings that I have taught and declared to be not categorical? (The statement that) 'The cosmos is eternal' I have taught and declared to be a not categorical teaching. (The statement that) 'The cosmos is not eternal' … 'The cosmos is finite' … 'The cosmos is infinite' … 'The soul & the body are the same' … 'The soul is one thing and the body another' … 'After death a Tathāgata exists' … 'After death a Tathāgata does not exist' … 'After death a Tathāgata both exists & does not exist' … 'After death a Tathāgata neither exists nor does not exist' I have taught and declared to be a not categorical teaching. And why have I taught and declared these teachings to be not categorical? Because they are not conducive to the goal, are not conducive to the Dhamma, are not basic to the holy life. They don't lead to disenchantment, to dispassion, to cessation, to calm, to direct knowledge, to self-awakening, to unbinding. That's why I have taught and declared them to be not categorical.

"And what have I taught and declared to be categorical teachings? (The statement that) 'This is stress' I have taught and declared to be a categorical teaching. (The statement that) 'This is the origination of stress' … 'This is the cessation of stress' … 'This is the path of practice leading to the cessation of stress' I have taught and declared to be a categorical teaching. And why have I taught and declared these teachings to be categorical? Because they are conducive to the goal, conducive to the Dhamma, and basic to the holy life. They lead to disenchantment, to dispassion, to cessation, to calm, to direct knowledge, to self-awakening, to unbinding. That's why I have taught and declared them to be categorical.

"There are some contemplatives & brahmans with a doctrine & view like this: 'After death, the self is exclusively happy and free from disease.' I approached them and asked them, 'Is it true that you have a doctrine & view like this: "After death, the self is exclusively happy and free from disease"?' When asked this, they replied, 'Yes.' So I asked them, 'But do you dwell having known or seen an exclusively happy world?' When asked

this, they said, 'No.' So I asked them, 'But have you ever been aware of a self exclusively happy for a day or a night, or for half a day or half a night?' When asked this, they said, 'No.' So I asked them, 'But do you know that "This is the path, this is the practice for the realization of an exclusively happy world"?' When asked this, they said, 'No.' So I asked them, 'But have you heard the voices of devas reborn in an exclusively happy world, saying, "Practice well, my dears. Practice straightforwardly, my dears, for the realization of an exclusively happy world, because it was through such a practice that we ourselves have been reborn in an exclusively happy world"?' When asked this, they said, 'No.'

"So what do you think, Poṭṭhapāda? When this is the case, don't the words of those contemplatives & brahmans turn out to be unconvincing?"

"Yes, lord. When this is the case, the words of those contemplatives & brahmans turn out to be unconvincing."

"Poṭṭhapāda, it's as if a man were to say, 'I'm in love with the most beautiful woman in this country,' and other people were to say to him, 'Well, my good man, this most beautiful woman in this country with whom you are in love: do you know if she's of the warrior caste, the brahman caste, the merchant caste, or the laborer caste?' and, when asked this, he would say, 'No.' Then they would say to him, 'Well then, do you know her name or clan name? Whether she's tall, short, or of medium height? Whether she's dark, fair, or ruddy-skinned? Do you know what village or town or city she's from?' When asked this, he would say, 'No.' Then they would say to him, 'So you've never known or seen the woman you're in love with?' When asked this, he would say, 'Yes.'

"So what do you think, Poṭṭhapāda? When this is the case, don't the words of that man turn out to be unconvincing?"

"Yes, lord…."

"In the same way, there are some contemplatives & brahmans with a doctrine & view like this: 'After death, the self is exclusively happy and free from disease.' … Don't the words of those contemplatives & brahmans turn out to be unconvincing?"

"Yes, lord…."

"Poṭṭhapāda, it's as if a man at a crossroads were to build a staircase for ascending to a palace, and other people were to say to him, 'Well, my good man, this palace for which you are building a staircase: Do you know whether it's east, west, north, or south of here? Whether it's high, low, or in between?' and, when asked this, he would say, 'No.' Then they would say to him, 'So you don't know or see the palace for which you are building a staircase?' When asked this, he would say, 'Yes.'

"So what do you think, Poṭṭhapāda? When this is the case, don't the words of that man turn out to be unconvincing?"

"Yes, lord…."

"In the same way, there are some contemplatives & brahmans with a doctrine & view like this: 'After death, the self is exclusively happy and free from disease.' … Don't the words of those contemplatives & brahmans turn out to be unconvincing?"

"Yes, lord. When this is the case, the words of those contemplatives & brahmans turn out to be unconvincing."

"Poṭṭhapāda, there are these three appropriations of a self: the gross appropriation of a self, the mind-made appropriation of a self, and the formless appropriation of a self.[2] And what is the gross appropriation of a self? Possessed of form, made up of the four great elements, feeding on physical food: this is the gross appropriation of a self. And what is the mind-made appropriation of a self? Possessed of form, mind-made, complete in all its parts, not inferior in its faculties: this is the mind-made appropriation of a self. And what is the formless appropriation of a self? Formless and made of perception: this is the formless appropriation of a self.

"I teach the Dhamma for the abandoning of the gross appropriation of a self, such that, when you practice it, defiling mental qualities will be abandoned, bright mental qualities will grow, and you will enter & remain in the culmination & abundance of discernment, having known & realized it for yourself in the here & now. If the thought should occur to you that, when defiling mental qualities are abandoned and bright mental qualities have grown, and one enters & remains in the culmination & abundance of discernment, having known & realized it for oneself in the here & now, one's abiding is stressful/painful, you

should not see it in that way. When defiling mental qualities are abandoned and bright mental qualities have grown, and one enters & remains in the culmination & abundance of discernment, having known & realized it for oneself in the here & now, there is joy, rapture, calm, mindfulness, alertness, and a pleasant/happy abiding.

"I also teach the Dhamma for the abandoning of the mind-made appropriation of a self… for the abandoning of the formless appropriation of a self, such that, when you practice it, defiling mental qualities will be abandoned, bright mental qualities will grow, and you will enter & remain in the culmination & abundance of discernment, having known & realized it for yourself in the here & now.… When defiling mental qualities are abandoned and bright mental qualities have grown, and one enters & remains in the culmination & abundance of discernment, having known & realized it for oneself in the here & now, there is joy, rapture, calm, mindfulness, alertness, and a pleasant/happy abiding.

"In the past, I have been asked, 'What, friend, is the gross appropriation of a self for whose abandoning you teach the Dhamma such that, when you practice it, defiling mental qualities will be abandoned, bright mental qualities will grow, and you will enter & remain in the culmination & abundance of discernment, having known & realized it for yourself in the here & now?' When asked this, I would answer, '*This,* friend, is that gross appropriation of a self for whose abandoning I teach the Dhamma.…'

"In the past, I have been asked, 'What, friend, is the mind-made appropriation of a self… the formless appropriation of a self for whose abandoning you teach the Dhamma…?' When asked this, I would answer, '*This,* friend, is that gross appropriation of a self for whose abandoning I teach the Dhamma.…'

"What do you think, Poṭṭhapāda? When this is the case, don't those words turn out to be convincing?"

"Yes, lord. When this is the case, those words turn out to be convincing."

"Poṭṭhapāda, it's as if a man at a crossroads were to build a staircase for ascending to a palace, and other people were to say to him, 'Well, my good man, this palace for which you are building a staircase: Do you know

whether it's east, west, north, or south of here? Whether it's high, low, or in between?' He would say, *'This,* friends, is the palace to which I am building a staircase. The staircase is right under the palace.'

"So what do you think, Poṭṭhapāda? When this is the case, don't the words of that man turn out to be convincing?"

"Yes, lord…."

"In the same way, in the past I have been asked, 'What, friend, is the gross appropriation of a self… the mind-made appropriation of a self… the formless appropriation of a self for whose abandoning you teach the Dhamma…?' When asked this, I would answer, *'This,* friend, is that gross appropriation of a self for whose abandoning I teach the Dhamma….'

"What do you think, Poṭṭhapāda? When this is the case, don't those words turn out to be convincing?"

"Yes, lord. When this is the case, those words turn out to be convincing."

When this was said, Citta the elephant trainer's son said to the Blessed One: "When there is a gross appropriation of a self, is it the case then that one's mind-made appropriation of a self and formless appropriation of a self are null & void, and only one's gross appropriation of a self is true? And when there is a mind-made appropriation of a self, is it the case then that one's gross appropriation of a self and formless appropriation of a self are null & void, and only one's mind-made appropriation of a self is true? And when there is a formless appropriation of a self, is it the case then that one's gross appropriation of a self and mind-made appropriation of a self are null & void, and only one's formless appropriation of a self is true?"

"Citta, when there is a gross appropriation of a self, it's not classified either as a mind-made appropriation of a self or as a formless appropriation of a self. It's classified just as a gross appropriation of a self. When there is a mind-made appropriation of a self, it's not classified either as a gross appropriation of a self or as a formless appropriation of a self. It's classified just as a mind-made appropriation of a self. When there is a formless appropriation of a self, it's not classified either as a gross

appropriation of a self or as a mind-made appropriation of a self. It is classified just as a formless appropriation of a self.

"Suppose they were to ask you: 'Did you exist in the past? Did you not not exist? Will you exist in the future? Will you not not exist? Do you exist now? Do you not not exist?' Thus asked, how would you answer?"

"… Thus asked, lord, I would answer: 'I existed in the past. I did not not exist. I will exist in the future. I will not not exist. I exist now. I do not not exist.' …. That's how I would answer."

"Suppose, Citta, they were to ask you: 'Whatever your past appropriation of a self: Is that alone your true appropriation of self, while the future & present ones are null & void? Whatever your future appropriation of a self: Is that alone your true appropriation of a self, while the past & present ones are null & void? Whatever your present appropriation of a self: Is that alone your true appropriation of a self, while the past & future ones are null & void?' Thus asked, how would you answer?"

"…Thus asked, lord, I would answer: 'Whatever my past appropriation of a self: on that occasion, that alone was my true appropriation of a self, while future & present ones were null & void. Whatever my future appropriation of a self: on that occasion, that alone will be my true appropriation of a self, while the past & present ones will be null & void. Whatever my present appropriation of a self: on that occasion, that alone is my true appropriation of a self, while the past & future ones are null & void.

"In the same way, Citta, when there is a gross appropriation of a self … it's classified just as a gross appropriation of a self. When there is a mind-made appropriation of a self.… When there is a formless appropriation of a self, it's not classified either as a gross appropriation of a self or as a mind-made appropriation of a self. It's classified just as a formless appropriation of a self.

"Just as when milk comes from a cow, curds from milk, butter from curds, ghee from butter, and the skimmings of ghee from ghee. When there is milk, it's not classified as curds, butter, ghee, or skimmings of ghee. It's classified just as milk. When there are curds.… When there is butter.… When there is ghee.… When there are the skimmings of ghee,

they're not classified as milk, curds, butter, or ghee. They're classified just as the skimmings of ghee.

"In the same way, when there is a gross appropriation of a self… it's classified just as a gross appropriation of a self. When there is a mind-made appropriation of a self.… When there is a formless appropriation of a self, it's not classified either as a gross appropriation of a self or as a mind-made appropriation of a self. It's classified just as a formless appropriation of a self.

"Citta, these are the world's designations, the world's expressions, the world's ways of speaking, the world's descriptions, with which the Tathāgata expresses himself but without grasping to them."[10]

When this was said, Poṭṭhapāda the wanderer said to the Blessed One: "Magnificent, Master Gotama! Magnificent! Just as if he were to place upright what was overturned, to reveal what was hidden, to show the way to one who was lost, or to carry a lamp into the dark so that those with eyes could see forms, in the same way has Master Gotama—through many lines of reasoning—made the Dhamma clear. I go to Master Gotama for refuge, to the Dhamma, and to the Saṅgha of monks. May Master Gotama remember me as a lay follower who has gone to him for refuge, from this day forward, for life."

But Citta the elephant trainer's son said to the Blessed One: "Magnificent, Master Gotama! Magnificent! Just as if he were to place upright what was overturned… in the same way has Master Gotama—through many lines of reasoning—made the Dhamma clear. I go to Master Gotama for refuge, to the Dhamma, and to the Saṅgha of monks. Let me obtain the going forth in the Blessed One's presence! Let me obtain acceptance!"[11]

So Citta the elephant trainer's son obtained the going forth in the Blessed One's presence; he obtained acceptance. And not long after his Acceptance—dwelling alone, secluded, heedful, ardent, & resolute—he in no long time reached & remained in the supreme goal of the holy life, for which clansmen rightly go forth from home into homelessness, knowing & realizing it for himself in the here & now. He knew: "Birth is ended, the holy life fulfilled, the task done. There is nothing further for the sake of

this world." And thus Ven. Elephant-trainer's Son[12] became another one of the arahants.

## Notes

1. Non-percipient *(asaññī):* This term is sometimes translated as "unconscious," but because the Buddha is so strict throughout this sutta in referring to *saññā* as it functions in other suttas—as "perception," i.e., the labels one attaches to experience—translating *asaññī* as "unconscious" creates needless confusion, especially as some readers might assume that the term would mean the absence of *viññāṇa.* An asaññī person might better be conceived as one in a mentally blank state.

2. The discussion does not include the dimension of neither perception nor non-perception because the topic here is perception and, as AN 9:36 points out, the dimension of nothingness is the highest perception-attainment.

3. See MN 140.

4. LDB mistakenly has "arises" here.

5. LDB omits "alert" here. (There are many other mistakes in the LDB translation of this sutta, but as it would be tedious to note them all, I am noting only these two, to alert the reader to the fact that the sloppiness that unfortunately mars much of LDB is particularly evident in its translation of this sutta.)

6. As AN 9:36 points out, one can attain cessation based on any of the levels of jhāna or the formless attainments. Thus, although the specific level from which cessation is attained might differ from person to person, its role in functioning as the basis for cessation is the same in every person's awakening.

7. According to the Commentary, the word "this" here refers to the perception characterizing the level of jhāna from which one attained the knowledge of cessation.

8. See the section on the mind-made body in DN 2.

9. Appropriation of a self *(atta-paṭilābho):* According to the Commentary, this refers to the appropriation of an individual identity *(atta-bhāva-paṭilābho)* on any of the three levels of becoming: the sensual level, the level of form, and the formless level. The term *atta-bhāva-paṭilābho* is used in a number of suttas—among them AN 4:192—where it definitely refers to the type of identity one assumes on experiencing rebirth in a particular level of being. However, there are two reasons for not following the Commentary's equation of *atta-paṭilābho* with *atta-bhāva-paṭilābho*. (1) As AN 4:72 makes clear, there is a type of *atta-*

*bhāva-paṭilābho*—rebirth in the dimension of neither perception nor non-perception—that would not be covered by any of the three types of appropriation of a self mentioned in this sutta. Thus the Buddha seems to be limiting his discussion here to the alternative selves posited by Poṭṭhapāda. (2) In a later passage in this sutta, the Buddha refers to the appropriation of a self as something he can point to directly in his listeners' immediate range of experience. Thus the term would seem to refer to the sense of self one can attain as a result of different levels of experience in meditation here and now.

10. The Commentary takes this is as the Buddha's affirmation of the idea—which in later centuries was accepted in all schools of Buddhism—that he spoke truth on two levels: conventional and ultimate. In context, though, the Buddha seems to be referring merely to the fact that he has adopted the linguistic usages of his interlocutors simply for the sake of discussion, and that they should not be interpreted out of context.

11. Full ordination as a monk.

12. Mv.I.74 indicates that it was considered a sign of respect to refer to a monk by his clan name.

*See also:* DN 15; MN 109; SN 22:59; SN 44; AN 4:42; AN 10:95–96

# *To Kevaṭṭa*
# *Kevaṭṭa Sutta (DN 11)*

## Introduction

*This discourse (also known as the Kevaddha Sutta) discusses the role of miracles and conversations with heavenly beings as a possible basis for faith and belief. While not denying the reality of such experiences, the Buddha points out that—of all possible miracles—only the miracle of instruction in the proper training of the mind is reliable. As for heavenly beings, they are subject to greed, anger, and delusion, and so the information they give—especially with regard to the miracle of instruction—is not necessarily trustworthy. Thus the only valid basis for faith is the instruction that, when followed, brings about the end of one's own mental defilements.*

*The tale concluding the discourse is one of the finest examples of the early Buddhist sense of humor.*

* * *

I have heard that on one occasion the Blessed One was staying at Nālandā in Pāvārika's mango grove. Then Kevaṭṭa the householder approached the Blessed One and, on arrival, having bowed down, sat to one side. As he was sitting there he said to the Blessed One: "Lord, this Nālandā is powerful, both prosperous and populous, filled with people who have faith in the Blessed One. It would be good if the Blessed One were to direct a monk to display a miracle of psychic power from his superior human state so that Nālandā would to an even greater extent have faith in the Blessed One."

When this was said, the Blessed One said to Kevaṭṭa the householder, "Kevaṭṭa, I don't teach the monks in this way: 'Come, monks, display a miracle of psychic power to the lay people clad in white.'"

A second time.… A third time, Kevaṭṭa the householder said to the Blessed One: "I won't argue with the Blessed One, but I tell you: Lord, this Nālandā is powerful, both prosperous and populous, filled with people who have faith in the Blessed One. It would be good if the Blessed One were to direct a monk to display a miracle of psychic power from his superior human state so that Nālandā would to an even greater extent have faith in the Blessed One."

A third time, the Blessed One said to Kevaṭṭa the householder, "Kevaṭṭa, I don't teach the monks in this way: 'Come, monks, display a miracle of psychic power to the lay people clad in white.'

"Kevaṭṭa, there are these three miracles that I have declared, having directly known and realized them for myself. Which three? The miracle of psychic power, the miracle of telepathy, and the miracle of instruction.[1]

## The Miracle of Psychic Power

"And what is the miracle of psychic power? There is the case where a monk wields manifold psychic powers. Having been one he becomes many; having been many he becomes one. He appears. He vanishes. He goes unimpeded through walls, ramparts, and mountains as if through space. He dives in and out of the earth as if it were water. He walks on water without sinking as if it were dry land. Sitting cross-legged he flies through the air like a winged bird. With his hand he touches and strokes even the sun and moon, so mighty and powerful. He exercises influence with his body even as far as the Brahmā worlds.

"Then someone who has faith and conviction in him sees him wielding manifold psychic powers… exercising influence with his body even as far as the Brahmā worlds. He reports this to someone who has no faith and no conviction, telling him, 'Isn't it awesome. Isn't it astounding, how great the power, how great the prowess of this contemplative. Just now I saw him wielding manifold psychic powers… exercising influence with his body even as far as the Brahmā worlds.'

Then the person without faith, without conviction, would say to the person with faith and with conviction: 'Sir, there is a charm called the Gandhāri charm by which the monk wielded manifold psychic powers… exercising influence with his body even as far as the Brahmā worlds.' What

do you think, Kevaṭṭa? Isn't that what the man without faith, without conviction, would say to the man with faith and with conviction?"

"Yes, lord, that's just what he would say."

"Seeing this drawback to the miracle of psychic power, Kevaṭṭa, I feel ashamed, repelled, and disgusted with the miracle of psychic power.

### The Miracle of Telepathy

"And what is the miracle of telepathy? There is the case where a monk reads the minds, the mental events, the thoughts, the ponderings of other beings, other individuals, (saying,) 'Such is your thinking, here is where your thinking is, thus is your mind.'

"Then someone who has faith and conviction in him sees him reading the minds… of other beings.… He reports this to someone who has no faith and no conviction, telling him, 'Isn't it awesome. Isn't it astounding, how great the power, how great the prowess of this contemplative. Just now I saw him reading the minds… of other beings…'

Then the person without faith, without conviction, would say to the person with faith and with conviction: 'Sir, there is a charm called the Maṇikā charm by which the monk read the minds… of other beings…' What do you think, Kevaṭṭa? Isn't that what the man without faith, without conviction, would say to the man with faith and with conviction?"

"Yes, lord, that's just what he would say."

"Seeing this drawback to the miracle of telepathy, Kevaṭṭa, I feel horrified, humiliated, and disgusted with the miracle of telepathy.

### The Miracle of Instruction

"And what is the miracle of instruction? There is the case where a monk gives instruction in this way: 'Direct your thought in this way, don't direct it in that. Attend to things in this way, don't attend to them in that. Let go of this, enter and remain in that.' This, Kevaṭṭa, is called the miracle of instruction.

"Then there is the case where a Tathāgata appears in the world, worthy and rightly self-awakened. He teaches the Dhamma admirable in its beginning, admirable in its middle, admirable in its end. He proclaims the holy life both in its particulars and in its essence, entirely perfect, surpassingly pure.

"A householder or householder's son, hearing the Dhamma, gains conviction in the Tathāgata and reflects: 'Household life is confining, a dusty path. The life gone forth is like the open air. It is not easy living at home to practice the holy life totally perfect, totally pure, like a polished shell. What if I were to shave off my hair and beard, put on the ochre robes, and go forth from the household life into homelessness?'

"So after some time he abandons his mass of wealth, large or small; leaves his circle of relatives, large or small; shaves off his hair and beard, puts on the ochre robes, and goes forth from the household life into homelessness.

"When he has thus gone forth, he lives restrained by the rules of the monastic code, seeing danger in the slightest faults. Consummate in his virtue, he guards the doors of his senses, is possessed of mindfulness & alertness, and is content [for details, see DN 2 ]....

### Abandoning the Hindrances

"Endowed with this noble aggregate of virtue, this noble restraint over the sense faculties, this noble mindfulness and alertness, and this noble contentment, he seeks out a secluded dwelling: a forest, the shade of a tree, a mountain, a glen, a hillside cave, a charnel ground, a forest grove, the open air, a heap of straw. After his meal, returning from his alms round, he sits down, crosses his legs, holds his body erect, and brings mindfulness to the fore.

"Abandoning covetousness with regard to the world, he dwells with an awareness devoid of covetousness. He cleanses his mind of covetousness. Abandoning ill will & anger, he dwells with an awareness devoid of ill will, sympathetic with the welfare of all living beings. He cleanses his mind of ill will & anger. Abandoning sloth & torpor, he dwells with an awareness devoid of sloth and torpor, mindful, alert, percipient of light. He cleanses his mind of sloth & torpor. Abandoning restlessness &

anxiety, he dwells undisturbed, his mind inwardly stilled. He cleanses his mind of restlessness & anxiety. Abandoning uncertainty, he dwells having crossed over uncertainty, with no perplexity with regard to skillful mental qualities. He cleanses his mind of uncertainty.

"Suppose that a man, taking a loan, invests it in his business affairs. His business affairs succeed. He repays his old debts and there is extra left over for maintaining his wife. The thought would occur to him, 'Before, taking a loan, I invested it in my business affairs. Now my business affairs have succeeded. I have repaid my old debts and there is extra left over for maintaining my wife.' Because of that he would experience joy and happiness.

"Now suppose that a man falls sick—in pain and seriously ill. He does not enjoy his meals, and there is no strength in his body. As time passes, he eventually recovers from that sickness. He enjoys his meals and there is strength in his body. The thought would occur to him, 'Before, I was sick....Now I am recovered from that sickness. I enjoy my meals and there is strength in my body.' Because of that he would experience joy and happiness.

"Now suppose that a man is bound in prison. As time passes, he eventually is released from that bondage, safe and sound, with no loss of property. The thought would occur to him, 'Before, I was bound in prison. Now I am released from that bondage, safe and sound, with no loss of my property.' Because of that he would experience joy and happiness.

"Now suppose that a man is a slave, subject to others, not subject to himself, unable to go where he likes. As time passes, he eventually is released from that slavery, subject to himself, not subject to others, freed, able to go where he likes. The thought would occur to him, 'Before, I was a slave....Now I am released from that slavery, subject to myself, not subject to others, freed, able to go where I like.' Because of that he would experience joy and happiness.

"Now suppose that a man, carrying money and goods, is traveling by a road through desolate country. As time passes, he eventually emerges from that desolate country, safe and sound, with no loss of property. The thought would occur to him, 'Before, carrying money and goods, I was traveling by a road through desolate country. Now I have emerged from

that desolate country, safe and sound, with no loss of my property.' Because of that he would experience joy and happiness.

"In the same way, when these five hindrances are not abandoned in himself, the monk regards it as a debt, a sickness, a prison, slavery, a road through desolate country. But when these five hindrances are abandoned in himself, he regards it as unindebtedness, good health, release from prison, freedom, a place of security. When he sees that they have been abandoned within him, gladness is born. In one who is gladdened, rapture is born. Enraptured at heart, his body grows calm. His body calm, he is sensitive to pleasure. Feeling pleasure, his mind becomes concentrated.

### The Four Jhānas

"Quite secluded from sensuality, secluded from unskillful qualities, he enters and remains in the first jhāna: rapture & pleasure born of seclusion, accompanied by directed thought & evaluation. He permeates and pervades, suffuses and fills this very body with the rapture & pleasure born of seclusion. Just as if a dexterous bathman or bathman's apprentice would pour bath powder into a brass basin and knead it together, sprinkling it again and again with water, so that his ball of bath powder—saturated, moisture-laden, permeated within and without—would nevertheless not drip; even so, the monk permeates...this very body with the rapture & pleasure born of seclusion. There is nothing of his entire body unpervaded by rapture & pleasure born of seclusion.

"This, too, is called the miracle of instruction.

"Then, with the stilling of directed thoughts & evaluations, he enters and remains in the second jhāna: rapture & pleasure born of concentration, unification of awareness free from directed thought & evaluation—internal assurance. He permeates and pervades, suffuses and fills this very body with the rapture & pleasure born of concentration. Just like a lake with spring-water welling up from within, having no inflow from the east, west, north, or south, and with the skies supplying abundant showers time & again, so that the cool fount of water welling up from within the lake would permeate and pervade, suffuse and fill it with cool waters, there being no part of the lake unpervaded by the cool

waters; even so, the monk permeates... this very body with the rapture and pleasure born of concentration. There is nothing of his entire body unpervaded by rapture and pleasure born of concentration.

"This, too, is called the miracle of instruction.

"And then, with the fading of rapture, he remains equanimous, mindful, & alert, and senses pleasure with the body. He enters and remains in the third jhāna, and of him the noble ones declare, 'Equanimous & mindful, he has a pleasant abiding.' He permeates and pervades, suffuses and fills this very body with the pleasure divested of rapture. Just as in a lotus pond, some of the lotuses, born and growing in the water, stay immersed in the water and flourish without standing up out of the water, so that they are permeated and pervaded, suffused and filled with cool water from their roots to their tips, and nothing of those lotuses would be unpervaded with cool water; even so, the monk permeates...this very body with the pleasure divested of rapture. There is nothing of his entire body unpervaded with pleasure divested of rapture.

"This, too, is called the miracle of instruction.

"And then, with the abandoning of pleasure & pain—as with the earlier disappearance of elation & distress—he enters and remains in the fourth jhāna: purity of equanimity & mindfulness, neither pleasure nor pain. He sits, permeating the body with a pure, bright awareness. Just as if a man were sitting covered from head to foot with a white cloth so that there would be no part of his body to which the white cloth did not extend; even so, the monk sits, permeating the body with a pure, bright awareness. There is nothing of his entire body unpervaded by pure, bright awareness.

"This, too, is called the miracle of instruction.

### Insight Knowledge, etc.

"With his mind thus concentrated, purified, & bright, unblemished, free from defects, pliant, malleable, steady, & attained to imperturbability, he directs and inclines it to knowledge & vision… to creating a mind-made body… to the modes of supranormal powers… to the divine ear-element… to knowledge of the awareness of other beings… to knowledge of the recollection of past lives… to knowledge of the passing away & re-appearance of beings… to the knowledge of the ending of effluents. He discerns, as it has come to be, that 'This is stress… This is the origination of stress… This is the cessation of stress… This is the way leading to the cessation of stress… These are effluents… This is the origination of effluents… This is the cessation of effluents… This is the way leading to the cessation of effluents.' His heart, thus knowing, thus seeing, is released from the effluent of sensuality, the effluent of becoming, the effluent of ignorance. With release, there is the knowledge, 'Released.' He discerns that 'Birth is ended, the holy life fulfilled, the task done. There is nothing further for this world.' Just as if there were a pool of water in a mountain glen—clear, limpid, and unsullied—where a man with good eyesight standing on the bank could see shells, gravel, and pebbles, and also shoals of fish swimming about and resting, and it would occur to him, 'This pool of water is clear, limpid, and unsullied. Here are these shells, gravel, and pebbles, and also these shoals of fish swimming about and resting.' In the same way—with his mind thus concentrated, purified, and bright, unblemished, free from defects, pliant, malleable, steady, and attained to imperturbability—the monk directs and inclines it to the knowledge of the ending of effluents. He discerns, as it has come to be, that 'This is stress… This is the origination of stress… This is the cessation of stress… This is the way leading to the cessation of stress… These are effluents… This is the origination of effluents… This is the cessation of effluents… This is the way leading to the cessation of effluents.' His heart, thus knowing, thus seeing, is released from the effluent of sensuality, the effluent of becoming, the effluent of ignorance. With release, there is the knowledge, 'Released.' He discerns that 'Birth is ended, the holy life fulfilled, the task done. There is nothing further for this world.'

This, too, is called the miracle of instruction.

"These are the three miracles that I declare, Kevaṭṭa, having directly known and realized them for myself.

"Once, Kevaṭṭa, this train of thought arose in the awareness of a certain monk in this very Saṅgha of monks: 'Where do these four great elements —the earth property, the liquid property, the fire property, and the wind property—cease without trace?' Then he attained to such a state of concentration that the way leading to the devas appeared in his concentrated mind. So he approached the Devas of the Retinue of the Four Great Kings and, on arrival, asked them, 'Friends, where do these four great elements—the earth property, the liquid property, the fire property, and the wind property—cease without trace?'

"When this was said, the Devas of the Retinue of the Four Great Kings said to the monk, 'We also don't know where the four great elements… cease without trace. But there are the Four Great Kings who are higher and more sublime than we. They should know where the four great elements… cease without trace.'

"So the monk approached the Four Great Kings and, on arrival, asked them, 'Friends, where do these four great elements… cease without trace?'

"When this was said, the Four Great Kings said to the monk, 'We also don't know where the four great elements… cease without trace. But there are the Devas of the Thirty-three who are higher and more sublime than we. They should know…'

"So the monk approached the Devas of the Thirty-three and, on arrival, asked them, 'Friends, where do these four great elements… cease without trace?'

"When this was said, the Devas of the Thirty-three said to the monk, 'We also don't know where the four great elements… cease without trace. But there is Sakka, the ruler of the devas, who is higher and more sublime than we. He should know…'

"So the monk approached Sakka, the ruler of the devas, and, on arrival, asked him, 'Friend, where do these four great elements… cease without trace?'

"When this was said, Sakka, the ruler of the devas, said to the monk, 'I also don't know where the four great elements… cease without trace. But

there are the Yāma devas [Devas of the Hours] who are higher and more sublime than I. They should know…'…

"The Yāma devas said, 'We also don't know.… But there is the deva named Suyāma.… He should know.… ' .…

"Suyāma said, 'I also don't know.… But there are the Tusita devas.… They should know.… '.…

"The Tusita devas said, 'We also don't know.… But there is the deva named Santusita.… He should know.… '.…

"Santusita said, 'I also don't know.… But there are the Nimmānaratī devas.… They should know.… ' .…

"The Nimmānaratī devas [devas who delight in creation] said, 'We also don't know.… But there is the deva named Sunimmita.… He should know.… ' .…

"Sunimmita said, 'I also don't know.… But there are the Paranimmitavasavattī devas [Devas Wielding control over the creations of others].… They should know.… ' .…

"The Paranimmitavasavattī devas said, 'We also don't know.… But there is the deva named Vasavatti.… He should know.… ' .…

"So the monk approached the deva Vassavatti and, on arrival, asked him, 'Friend, where do these four great elements… cease without trace?'

"When this was said, the deva Vassavatti said to the monk, 'I also don't know where the four great elements… cease without trace. But there are the Devas of Brahmā's Retinue who are higher and more sublime than I. They should know where the four great elements… cease without trace'.…

"Then the monk attained to such a state of concentration that the way leading to the Devas of Brahmā's Retinue appeared in his concentrated mind. So he approached the Devas of Brahmā's Retinue and, on arrival, asked them, 'Friends, where do these four great elements—the earth property, the liquid property, the fire property, and the wind property—cease without trace?'

"When this was said, the Devas of Brahmā's Retinue said to the monk, 'We also don't know where the four great elements… cease without trace. But there is Brahmā, the Great Brahmā, the Conqueror, the Unconquered,

the All-Seeing, All-Powerful, the Sovereign Lord, the Maker, Creator, Chief, Appointer, and Ruler, Father of All That Have Been and Shall Be. He is higher and more sublime than we. He should know where the four great elements… cease without trace.'

"'But where, friends, is the Great Brahmā now?'

"'Monk, we also don't know where Brahmā is or in what way Brahmā is. But when signs appear, light shines forth, and a radiance appears, Brahmā will appear. For these are the portents of Brahmā's appearance: Light shines forth and a radiance appears.'

"Then it was not long before Brahmā appeared.

"So the monk approached the Great Brahmā and, on arrival, said, 'Friend, where do these four great elements—the earth property, the liquid property, the fire property, and the wind property—cease without trace?'

"When this was said, the Great Brahmā said to the monk, 'I, monk, am Brahmā, the Great Brahmā, the Conqueror, the Unconquered, the All-Seeing, All-Powerful, the Sovereign Lord, the Maker, Creator, Chief, Appointer, and Ruler, Father of All That Have Been and Shall Be.'

A second time, the monk said to the Great Brahmā, 'Friend, I didn't ask you if you were Brahmā, the Great Brahmā, the Conqueror, the Unconquered, the All-Seeing, All-Powerful, the Sovereign Lord, the Maker, Creator, Chief, Appointer, and Ruler, Father of All That Have Been and Shall Be. I asked you where these four great elements—the earth property, the liquid property, the fire property, and the wind property—cease without trace.'

"A second time, the Great Brahmā said to the monk, 'I, monk, am Brahmā, the Great Brahmā, the Conqueror, the Unconquered, the All-Seeing, All-Powerful, the Sovereign Lord, the Maker, Creator, Chief, Appointer, and Ruler, Father of All That Have Been and Shall Be.'

"A third time, the monk said to the Great Brahmā, 'Friend, I didn't ask you if you were Brahmā, the Great Brahmā, the Conqueror, the Unconquered, the All-Seeing, All-Powerful, the Sovereign Lord, the Maker, Creator, Chief, Appointer, and Ruler, Father of All That Have Been and Shall Be. I asked you where these four great elements—the earth property,

the liquid property, the fire property, and the wind property—cease without trace.'

"Then the Great Brahmā, taking the monk by the arm and leading him off to one side, said to him, 'These Devas of the Retinue of Brahmā believe, "There is nothing that the Great Brahmā does not know. There is nothing that the Great Brahmā does not see. There is nothing of which the Great Brahmā is unaware. There is nothing that the Great Brahmā has not realized." That is why I did not say in their presence that I, too, don't know where the four great elements… cease without trace. So it's your own wrongdoing, your own mistake, in that—bypassing the Blessed One—you searched outside for an answer to this question. Go right back to the Blessed One and, on arrival, ask him this question. However he answers you, that's how you should remember it.'

"Then—just as a strong man might extend his flexed arm or flex his extended arm—the monk disappeared from the Brahmā world and immediately appeared in front of me. Having bowed down to me, he sat to one side. As he was sitting there he said to me, 'Lord, where do these four great elements—the earth property, the liquid property, the fire property, and the wind property—cease without trace?'

"When this was said, I said to him, 'Once, monk, some sea-faring merchants, taking a shore-sighting bird, set out across the ocean in their ship. When they could not see the shore from their ship, they released the shore-sighting bird. It flew to the east; it flew to the south; it flew to the west; it flew to the north; it flew to straight up; it flew to the intermediate directions. If it saw the shore in any direction, it flew there and was gone. If it did not see the shore in any direction, it returned right back to the ship. In the same way, monk, having searched as far as the Brahmā world and not receiving an answer to this question, you have come right back to my presence.

"'This question should not be asked in this way: Where do these four great elements—the earth property, the liquid property, the fire property, and the wind property—cease without trace? Instead, the question should be asked like this:

"'Where do water, earth, fire, & wind
have no footing?

Where are long & short,
coarse & fine,
fair & foul,
name & form
brought to a stop without trace?

"'And the answer to that is:

"'Consciousness without surface,[2]
without end,
luminous all around:
Here water, earth, fire, & wind
have no footing.
Here long & short,
coarse & fine,
fair & foul,
here name & form
are all brought to a stop without trace.
With the cessation of (the aggregate of) consciousness
each is here brought to a stop.'"

That is what the Blessed One said. Gratified, Kevaṭṭa the householder delighted in the Blessed One's words.

## Notes

1. See AN 3:61.

2. *Viññāṇaṁ anidassanaṁ.* This term is nowhere explained in the Canon. *Anidassanaṁ* is listed in SN 43 as an epithet for unbinding. This is apparently related to the image in SN 12:64 of a beam of light that doesn't land (or: "become established") on any surface anywhere, corresponding to consciousness that takes no food anywhere. MN 49 mentions that *viññāṇaṁ anidassanaṁ* "is not experienced through the allness of the All"—the "All" meaning the six internal and six external sense media (see SN 35:23). In this it differs from the consciousness factor in dependent co-arising, which is defined in terms of the six sense media. Because name and form are brought to an end, this consciousness also lies beyond the consciousness of the jhānas and the formless attainments, inasmuch as the four jhānas are composed of both name and form, and the formless attainments are composed of various aspects of

name: feeling, perception, and fabrication. The formless jhānas are also experienced through the sixth sense medium, the intellect.

Lying outside of time and space, consciousness without surface would also not come under the consciousness-aggregate, which covers all consciousness near and far; past, present, and future. However, the fact that it is outside of time and space—in a dimension where there is no here, there, or in between (Ud 1:10), no coming, no going, or staying (Ud 8:1)—means that it cannot be described as eternal or omnipresent, terms that have meaning only within space and time.

The standard description of nibbāna after death is, "All that is sensed, not being relished, will grow cold right here." (See MN 140 and Iti 44.) Again, as "all" is defined as the sense media, this raises the question as to whether consciousness without feature is not covered by this "all." However, AN 4:173 warns that any speculation as to whether anything does or doesn't remain after the remainderless stopping of the six sense media is to "objectify the non-objectified," which gets in the way of attaining the non-objectified. Thus this is a question that is best put aside.

*See also:* *DN 16*; *MN 86*; *SN 41:4*; *AN 4:45*; *AN 9:38*

## *To Lohicca*

## *Lohicca Sutta (DN 12)*

I have heard that on one occasion the Blessed One was on a wandering tour among the Kosalans with a large Saṅgha of monks—approximately 500 monks in all—and arrived at Sālavatikā. Now at that time the brahman Lohicca was reigning with feudatory rights over Sālavatikā, a crown property abounding in wildlife—with grass, timber, water, & grain—through a royal grant bestowed by King Pasenadi Kosala. And at that time an evil viewpoint to this effect had arisen to him: "Suppose that a contemplative or brahman were to arrive at a skillful Dhamma. Having arrived at a skillful Dhamma, he should not declare it to anyone else, for what can one person do for another? It would be just the same as if, having cut through an old bond, one were to make another new bond. I say that such a thing is an evil, greedy deed, for what can one person do for another?"

Then Lohicca heard it said, "Gotama the contemplative—the son of the Sakyans, having gone forth from the Sakyan clan—on a wandering tour among the Kosalans with a large Saṅgha of monks, approximately 500 monks in all—has arrived at Sālavatikā. And of that Master Gotama this fine reputation has spread: 'He is indeed a Blessed One, worthy & rightly self-awakened, consummate in clear-knowing & conduct, well-gone, an expert with regard to the cosmos, unexcelled trainer of people fit to be tamed, teacher of devas & human beings, awakened, blessed. He makes known—having realized it through direct knowledge—this world with its devas, Māras, & Brahmās, this generation with its contemplatives & brahmans, its royalty & commonfolk; he explains the Dhamma admirable in the beginning, admirable in the middle, admirable in the end; he expounds the holy life both in its particulars & in its essence, entirely perfect, surpassingly pure. It is good to see such a worthy one.'"

So Lohicca said to Rosika the barber: "Come, dear Rosika. Go to Gotama the contemplative and, on arrival, ask whether he is free from illness & affliction, is carefree, strong, & living in comfort, saying: 'The brahman Lohicca, Master Gotama, asks whether you are free from illness & affliction, are carefree, strong, & living in comfort.' And then say: 'May Master Gotama, together with the Saṅgha of monks, acquiesce to tomorrow's meal with the brahman Lohicca.'"

Responding, "As you say, sir," to the brahman Lohicca, Rosika the barber went to the Blessed One and, on arrival, bowing down to him, sat to one side. As he was sitting there, he said to the Blessed One, "The brahman Lohicca, lord, asks whether the Blessed One is free from illness & affliction, is carefree, strong, & living in comfort. And he says, 'May the Blessed One, together with the Saṅgha of monks, acquiesce to tomorrow's meal with the brahman Lohicca.'" The Blessed One acquiesced through silence.

Then Rosika the barber, understanding the Blessed One's acquiescence, rose from his seat, bowed down to the Blessed One, circumambulated him—keeping him to his right—and returned to the brahman Lohicca. On arrival he said to him, "I have informed the Blessed One of your words, (saying,) 'The brahman Lohicca, lord, asks whether the Blessed One is free from illness & affliction, is carefree, strong, & living in comfort. And he says, "May the Blessed One, together with the Saṅgha of monks, acquiesce to tomorrow's meal with the brahman Lohicca."' And the Blessed One has acquiesced."

Then, as the night was ending, the brahman Lohicca had choice staple & non-staple foods prepared in his own home and then said to Rosika the barber, "Come, dear Rosika. Go to Gotama the contemplative and on arrival announce the time, (saying,) 'It is time, Master Gotama. The meal is ready.'"

Responding, "As you say, sir," to the brahman Lohicca, Rosika the barber went to the Blessed One and, on arrival, bowing down to him, stood to one side. As he was standing there, he announced the time, (saying,) "It is time, lord. The meal is ready."

Then the Blessed One early in the morning—having adjusted his lower robe and taking his bowl & outer robe—went together with a Saṅgha of

monks to Sālavatikā. Meanwhile, Rosika the barber was following right behind the Blessed One and said to him, "Lord, an evil viewpoint to this effect has arisen to the brahman Lohicca: 'Suppose that a contemplative or brahman were to arrive at a skillful Dhamma. Having arrived at a skillful Dhamma, he should not declare it to anyone else, for what can one person do for another? It would be just the same as if, having cut through an old bond, one were to make another new bond. I say that such a thing is an evil, greedy deed, for what can one person do for another?' It would be good if the Blessed One would extract the brahman Lohicca from this evil viewpoint."

"Perhaps that will be, Rosika. Perhaps that will be."

Then the Blessed One went to the brahman Lohicca's home. On arrival, he sat down on a seat made ready. The brahman Lohicca, with his own hand, served & satisfied the Blessed One & the Saṅgha of monks with choice staple & non-staple foods. Then, when the Blessed One had eaten and had rinsed his bowl & hands, the brahman Lohicca took a lower seat and sat to one side. As he was sitting there, the Blessed One said to him, "Is it true, Lohicca, that an evil viewpoint to this effect has arisen to you: 'Suppose that a contemplative or brahman were to arrive at a skillful Dhamma. Having arrived at a skillful Dhamma, he should not declare it to anyone else, for what can one person do for another? It would be just the same as if, having cut through an old bond, one were to make another new bond. I say that such a thing is an evil, greedy deed, for what can one person do for another?'?"

"Yes, Master Gotama."

"What do you think, Lohicca? Don't you reign over Sālavatikā?"

"Yes, Master Gotama."

"Now, suppose someone were to say, 'The brahman Lohicca reigns over Sālavatikā. He alone should consume the fruits & revenues of Sālavatikā, and not share them with others.' Would someone speaking in this way be a creator of obstacles for your subjects, or would he not?"

"He would be a creator of obstacles, Master Gotama."

"And, being a creator of obstacles, would he be sympathetic for their welfare or not?"

"He would not be sympathetic for their welfare, Master Gotama."

"And in one not sympathetic for their welfare, would his mind be established in good will for them, or in animosity?"

"In animosity, Master Gotama."

"When the mind is established in animosity, is there wrong view or right view?"

"Wrong view, Master Gotama."

"Now, for one of wrong view, Lohicca, I tell you, there is one of two destinations: either hell or the animal womb.

"What do you think, Lohicca? Doesn't King Pasenadi Kosala reign over Kāsi & Kosala?"

"Yes, Master Gotama."

"Now, suppose someone were to say, 'King Pasenadi Kosala reigns over Kāsi & Kosala. He alone should consume the fruits & revenues of Kāsi & Kosala, and not share them with others.' Would someone speaking in this way be a creator of obstacles for King Pasenadi's subjects—you & others—or would he not?"

"He would be a creator of obstacles, Master Gotama."

"And, being a creator of obstacles, would he be sympathetic for their welfare or not?"

"He would not be sympathetic for their welfare, Master Gotama."

"And in one not sympathetic for their welfare, would his mind be established in good will for them, or in animosity?"

"In animosity, Master Gotama."

"When the mind is established in animosity, is there wrong view or right view?"

"Wrong view, Master Gotama."

"Now, for one of wrong view, Lohicca, I tell you, there is one of two destinations: either hell or the animal womb.

"So then, Lohicca, if anyone were to say, 'The brahman Lohicca reigns over Sālavatikā. He alone should consume the fruits & revenues of

Sālavatikā, and not share them with others,' he, speaking in this way, would be a creator of obstacles for your subjects. Being a creator of obstacles, he would not be sympathetic for their welfare. In one not sympathetic for their welfare, the mind would be established in animosity for them. When the mind is established in animosity, there is wrong view. For one of wrong view, I tell you, there is one of two destinations: either hell or the animal womb.

"In the same way, if anyone were to say, 'Suppose that a contemplative or brahman were to arrive at a skillful Dhamma. Having arrived at a skillful Dhamma, he should not declare it to anyone else, for what can one person do for another? It would be just the same as if, having cut through an old bond, one were to make another new bond. I say that such a thing is an evil, greedy deed, for what can one person do for another?'—he, speaking in this way, would be a creator of obstacles for those children of good family who, coming to the Dhamma & Vinaya revealed by the Tathāgata, attain the sort of grand distinction where they attain the fruit of stream-entry, the fruit of once-returning, the fruit of non-returning, the fruit of arahantship; and for those who ripen deva wombs for the sake of bringing about the deva state. Being a creator of obstacles, he would not be sympathetic for their welfare. In one not sympathetic for their welfare, the mind would be established in animosity for them. When the mind is established in animosity, there is wrong view. For one of wrong view, I tell you, there is one of two destinations: either hell or the animal womb.

"And if anyone were to say, 'King Pasenadi Kosala reigns over Kāsi & Kosala. He alone should consume the fruits & revenues of Kāsi & Kosala, and not share them with others,' he, speaking in this way, would be a creator of obstacles for King Pasenadi's subjects—you & others. Being a creator of obstacles, he would not be sympathetic for their welfare. In one not sympathetic for their welfare, the mind would be established in animosity for them. When the mind is established in animosity, there is wrong view. For one of wrong view, I tell you, there is one of two destinations: either hell or the animal womb.

"In the same way, if anyone were to say, 'Suppose that a contemplative or brahman were to arrive at a skillful Dhamma. Having arrived at a skillful Dhamma, he should not declare it to anyone else, for what can one person do for another? It would be just the same as if, having cut

through an old bond, one were to make another new bond. I say that such a thing is an evil, greedy deed, for what can one person do for another?'—he, speaking in this way, would be a creator of obstacles for those children of good family who, coming to the Dhamma & Vinaya revealed by the Tathāgata, attain the sort of grand distinction where they attain the fruit of stream-entry, the fruit of once-returning, the fruit of non-returning, the fruit of arahantship; and also for those who ripen deva wombs for the sake of bringing about the deva state. Being a creator of obstacles, he would not be sympathetic for their welfare. In one not sympathetic for their welfare, the mind would be established in animosity for them. When the mind is established in animosity, there is wrong view. For one of wrong view, I tell you, there is one of two destinations: either hell or the animal womb.

"Lohicca, there are these three sorts of teacher who are worthy of criticism in the world, and when anyone criticizes these sorts of teachers, the criticism is true, factual, righteous, & unblameworthy. Which three?

"There is the case where a certain teacher has not attained the goal of the contemplative life for which one goes forth from the home life into homelessness. He, not having attained that goal of the contemplative life, teaches his disciples, 'This is for your welfare. This is for your happiness.' His disciples don't listen, don't lend ear, don't put forth an intent for gnosis. They practice in a way deviating from the teacher's instructions. He should be criticized, saying, 'You, venerable sir, have not attained the goal of the contemplative life for which one goes forth from the home life into homelessness. Not having attained that goal of the contemplative life, you teach your disciples, "This is for your welfare. This is for your happiness." Your disciples don't listen, don't lend ear, don't put forth an intent for gnosis, and practice in a way deviating from the teacher's instructions. It's just as if a man were to pursue (a woman) who pulls away, or to embrace one who turns her back. I say that such a thing is an evil, greedy deed, for what can one person do for another?' This is the first teacher who is worthy of criticism in the world, and when anyone criticizes this sort of teacher, the criticism is true, factual, righteous, & unblameworthy.

"And further, there is the case where a certain teacher has not attained the goal of the contemplative life for which one goes forth from the home

life into homelessness. He, not having attained that goal of the contemplative life, teaches his disciples, 'This is for your welfare. This is for your happiness.' His disciples listen, lend ear, put forth an intent for gnosis, and practice in a way not deviating from the teacher's instructions. He should be criticized, saying, 'You, venerable sir, have not attained the goal of the contemplative life for which one goes forth from the home life into homelessness. Not having attained that goal of the contemplative life, you teach your disciples, "This is for your welfare. This is for your happiness." Your disciples listen, lend ear, put forth an intent for gnosis, and practice in a way not deviating from the teacher's instructions. It's just as if a man, neglecting his own field, were to imagine that another's field should be weeded. I say that such a thing is an evil, greedy deed, for what can one person do for another?' This is the second teacher who is worthy of criticism in the world, and when anyone criticizes this sort of teacher, the criticism is true, factual, righteous, & unblameworthy.

"And further, there is the case where a certain teacher has attained the goal of the contemplative life for which one goes forth from the home life into homelessness. He, having attained that goal of the contemplative life, teaches his disciples, 'This is for your welfare. This is for your happiness.' His disciples don't listen, don't lend ear, don't put forth an intent for gnosis. They practice in a way deviating from the teacher's instructions. He should be criticized, saying, 'You, venerable sir, have attained the goal of the contemplative life for which one goes forth from the home life into homelessness. Having attained that goal of the contemplative life, you teach your disciples, "This is for your welfare. This is for your happiness," but your disciples don't listen, don't lend ear, don't put forth an intent for gnosis, and practice in a way deviating from the teacher's instructions. It's just as if, having cut through an old bond, one were to make another new bond. I say that such a thing is an evil, greedy deed, for what can one person do for another?' This is the third teacher who is worthy of criticism in the world, and when anyone criticizes this sort of teacher, the criticism is true, factual, righteous, & unblameworthy."

When this was said, the brahman Lohicca said to the Blessed One, "But is there, Master Gotama, any teacher who is not worthy of criticism in the world?"

"There is, Lohicca, a teacher who is not worthy of criticism in the world."

"But which teacher, Master Gotama, is not worthy of criticism in the world?"

"There is the case, Lohicca, where a Tathāgata appears in the world, worthy & rightly self-awakened. He teaches the Dhamma admirable in its beginning, admirable in its middle, admirable in its end. He proclaims the holy life both in its particulars & in its essence, entirely perfect, surpassingly pure.

"A householder or householder's son, hearing the Dhamma, gains conviction in the Tathāgata and reflects: 'Household life is confining, a dusty path. The life gone forth is like the open air. It is not easy living at home to practice the holy life totally perfect, totally pure, like a polished shell. What if I were to shave off my hair & beard, put on the ochre robes, and go forth from the household life into homelessness?'

"So after some time he abandons his mass of wealth, large or small; leaves his circle of relatives, large or small; shaves off his hair & beard, puts on the ochre robes, and goes forth from the household life into homelessness.

"When he has thus gone forth, he lives restrained by the rules of the monastic code, seeing danger in the slightest faults. Consummate in his virtue, he guards the doors of his senses, is possessed of mindfulness & alertness, and is content [for details, see DN 2] …

### Abandoning the Hindrances

"Endowed with this noble aggregate of virtue, this noble restraint over the sense faculties, this noble mindfulness & alertness, and this noble contentment, he seeks out a secluded dwelling: a wilderness, the shade of a tree, a mountain, a glen, a hillside cave, a charnel ground, a forest grove, the open air, a heap of straw. After his meal, returning from his alms round, he sits down, crosses his legs, holds his body erect, and brings mindfulness to the fore.

"Abandoning covetousness with regard to the world, he dwells with an awareness devoid of covetousness. He cleanses his mind of covetousness.

Abandoning ill will & anger, he dwells with an awareness devoid of ill will, sympathetic with the welfare of all living beings. He cleanses his mind of ill will & anger. Abandoning sloth & drowsiness, he dwells with an awareness devoid of sloth & drowsiness, mindful, alert, percipient of light. He cleanses his mind of sloth & drowsiness. Abandoning restlessness & anxiety, he dwells undisturbed, his mind inwardly stilled. He cleanses his mind of restlessness & anxiety. Abandoning uncertainty, he dwells having crossed over uncertainty, with no perplexity with regard to skillful mental qualities. He cleanses his mind of uncertainty.

"Suppose that a man, taking a loan, invests it in his business affairs. His business affairs succeed. He repays his old debts and there is extra left over for maintaining his wife. The thought would occur to him, 'Before, taking a loan, I invested it in my business affairs. Now my business affairs have succeeded. I have repaid my old debts and there is extra left over for maintaining my wife.' Because of that he would experience joy & happiness.

"Now suppose that a man falls sick—in pain & seriously ill. He does not enjoy his meals, and there is no strength in his body. As time passes, he eventually recovers from that sickness. He enjoys his meals and there is strength in his body. The thought would occur to him, 'Before, I was sick....Now I am recovered from that sickness. I enjoy my meals and there is strength in my body.' Because of that he would experience joy & happiness.

"Now suppose that a man is bound in prison. As time passes, he eventually is released from that bondage, safe & sound, with no loss of property. The thought would occur to him, 'Before, I was bound in prison. Now I am released from that bondage, safe & sound, with no loss of my property.' Because of that he would experience joy & happiness.

"Now suppose that a man is a slave, subject to others, not subject to himself, unable to go where he likes. As time passes, he eventually is released from that slavery, subject to himself, not subject to others, freed, able to go where he likes. The thought would occur to him, 'Before, I was a slave.... Now I am released from that slavery, subject to myself, not subject to others, freed, able to go where I like.' Because of that he would experience joy & happiness.

"Now suppose that a man, carrying money & goods, is traveling by a road through desolate country. As time passes, he eventually emerges from that desolate country, safe & sound, with no loss of property. The thought would occur to him, 'Before, carrying money & goods, I was traveling by a road through desolate country. Now I have emerged from that desolate country, safe & sound, with no loss of my property.' Because of that he would experience joy & happiness.

"In the same way, when these five hindrances are not abandoned in himself, the monk regards it as a debt, a sickness, a prison, slavery, a road through desolate country. But when these five hindrances are abandoned in himself, he regards it as unindebtedness, good health, release from prison, freedom, a place of security. When he sees that they have been abandoned within him, gladness is born. In one who is gladdened, rapture is born. Enraptured at heart, his body grows calm. His body calm, he is sensitive to pleasure. Feeling pleasure, his mind becomes concentrated.

### The Four Jhānas

"Quite secluded from sensuality, secluded from unskillful qualities, he enters and remains in the first jhāna: rapture & pleasure born of seclusion, accompanied by directed thought & evaluation. He permeates & pervades, suffuses & fills this very body with the rapture & pleasure born from withdrawal. Just as if a dexterous bathman or bathman's apprentice would pour bath powder into a brass basin and knead it together, sprinkling it again & again with water, so that his ball of bath powder—saturated, moisture-laden, permeated within & without—would nevertheless not drip; even so, the monk permeates… this very body with the rapture & pleasure born of seclusion. There is nothing of his entire body unpervaded by rapture & pleasure born of seclusion.

"When a disciple of a teacher attains this sort of grand distinction, Lohicca, that is a teacher not worthy of criticism in the world, and if anyone were to criticize this sort of teacher, the criticism would be false, unfactual, unrighteous, & blameworthy.

"And further, with the stilling of directed thought & evaluation, he enters & remains in the second jhāna… the third jhāna… the fourth

jhāna: purity of equanimity & mindfulness, neither pleasure nor pain. He sits, permeating the body with a pure, bright awareness. Just as if a man were sitting covered from head to foot with a white cloth so that there would be no part of his body to which the white cloth did not extend; even so, the monk sits, permeating the body with a pure, bright awareness. There is nothing of his entire body unpervaded by pure, bright awareness.

"When a disciple of a teacher attains this sort of grand distinction, Lohicca, that is a teacher not worthy of criticism in the world, and if anyone were to criticize this sort of teacher, the criticism would be false, unfactual, unrighteous, & blameworthy.

### Insight Knowledge, etc.

"With his mind thus concentrated, purified, & bright, unblemished, free from defects, pliant, malleable, steady, & attained to imperturbability, he directs and inclines it to knowledge & vision… to creating a mind-made body… to the modes of supranormal powers… to the divine ear-element… to knowledge of the awareness of other beings… to knowledge of the recollection of past lives… to knowledge of the passing away & re-appearance of beings… to the knowledge of the ending of effluents. He discerns, as it is has come to be, that 'This is stress… This is the origination of stress… This is the cessation of stress… This is the way leading to the cessation of stress… These are effluents… This is the origination of effluents… This is the cessation of effluents… This is the way leading to the cessation of effluents.' His heart, thus knowing, thus seeing, is released from the effluent of sensuality, the effluent of becoming, the effluent of ignorance. With release, there is the knowledge, 'Released.' He discerns that 'Birth is ended, the holy life fulfilled, the task done. There is nothing further for this world.'

"Just as if there were a pool of water in a mountain glen—clear, limpid, & unsullied—where a man with good eyesight standing on the bank could see shells, gravel, & pebbles, and also shoals of fish swimming about & resting, and it would occur to him, 'This pool of water is clear, limpid, & unsullied. Here are these shells, gravel, & pebbles, and also these shoals of fish swimming about & resting.' In the same way—with his mind thus concentrated, purified, & bright, unblemished, free from defects, pliant,

malleable, steady, & attained to imperturbability—the monk directs & inclines it to the knowledge of the ending of effluents. He discerns, as it has come to be, that 'This is stress… This is the origination of stress… This is the cessation of stress… This is the way leading to the cessation of stress… These are effluents… This is the origination of effluents… This is the cessation of effluents… This is the way leading to the cessation of effluents.' His heart, thus knowing, thus seeing, is released from the effluent of sensuality, the effluent of becoming, the effluent of ignorance. With release, there is the knowledge, 'Released.' He discerns that 'Birth is ended, the holy life fulfilled, the task done. There is nothing further for this world.'

"When a disciple of a teacher attains this sort of grand distinction, Lohicca, that is a teacher not worthy of criticism in the world, and if anyone were to criticize this sort of teacher, the criticism would be false, unfactual, unrighteous, & blameworthy."

When this was said, the brahman Lohicca said to the Blessed One: "Master Gotama, it's as if a man, having seized by the hair another man who was falling into the pit of hell, were to pull him up & set him on firm ground. In the same way, Master Gotama has pulled me up as I was falling into the pit of hell and has set me on firm ground. Magnificent, Master Gotama! Magnificent! Just as if he were to place upright what was overturned, to reveal what was hidden, to show the way to one who was lost, or to carry a lamp into the dark so that those with eyes could see forms, in the same way has Master Gotama—through many lines of reasoning—made the Dhamma clear. I go to Master Gotama for refuge, to the Dhamma, & to the Saṅgha of monks. May Master Gotama remember me as a lay follower who has gone to him for refuge, from this day forward, for life."

*See also:* *MN 95*; *MN 137*; *SN 6:1*; *AN 2:19*; *AN 3:22*; *AN 3:62*; *AN 4:111*; *AN 10:95*; *Sn 2:8*

# *The Great Causes Discourse*
# *Mahā Nidāna Sutta (DN 15)*

## Introduction

*This is one of the most profound discourses in the Pali Canon. It gives an extended treatment of the teachings of dependent co-arising* (paṭicca samuppāda) *and not-self* (anattā) *in an outlined context of how these teachings function in practice.*

*The first part of the discourse takes the factors of dependent co-arising in sequence from effect to cause, tracing them down to the mutual dependency of name-&-form (mental and physical activity) on the one hand, and consciousness on the other. In connection with this point, it is worth noting that the word "great" in the title of the discourse may have a double meaning: modifying the word "discourse"—it's a long discourse—and modifying "causes," referring to the fact that name-&-form and consciousness as causal factors can account for everything describable in the cosmos.*

*After tracing the basic sequence of factors in the causal pattern, the discourse then reviews their inter-relationships, showing how they can explain stress and suffering both on the individual and on the social level.*

*The second part of the discourse, taking up the teaching of not-self, shows how dependent co-arising gives focus to this teaching in practice. It begins with a section on Delineations of a Self, classifying the various ways in which a sense of "self" might be defined in terms of form. The scheme of analysis introduced in this section—classifying views of the self according to the variables of form and formless; finite and infinite; already existing, naturally developing in the future, and alterable through human effort—covers all the theories of the self proposed in the classical Upaniṣads, as well as all theories of self or soul proposed in more recent times. The inclusion of an infinite self in this list gives the lie to the belief that the Buddha's teachings on not-self were denying nothing more than a sense of "separate" or "limited" self. The discourse points out that even a limitless,*

*infinite, all-embracing sense of self is based on an underlying tendency in the mind that has to be abandoned.*

*The following section, on Non-delineations of a Self, shows that it is possible for the mind to function without reading a "self" into experience. The remaining sections focus on ways in which this can be done by treating the sense of self as it relates to different aspects of name-&-form. The first of these sections—Assumptions of a Self—focuses on the sense of self as it relates to feeling, one of the "name" factors in name-&-form. The next section—Seven Stations of Consciousness—focuses on form, formlessness, and perception, which is another one of the "name" factors that allows a place for consciousness to land and grow on the "macro" level in the cycle of death and rebirth. The last section—Eight Emancipations—focuses on form, formlessness, and perception on the "micro" level in the practice of meditative absorption (jhāna).*

*In each of these cases, once the sense of attachment and identification with name-&-form can be broken, the mutual dependency between consciousness and name-&-form is broken as well. This brings about total freedom from the limits of "the extent to which there are means of designation, expression, and delineation… the extent to which the dimension of discernment extends, the extent to which the cycle revolves for the manifesting (discernibility) of this world—i.e., name-&-form together with consciousness." This is the release at which the Buddha's teachings are aimed.*

* * *

I have heard that on one occasion the Blessed One was living among the Kurus. Now, the Kurus have a town named Kammāsadhamma. There Ven. Ānanda approached the Blessed One and, on arrival, having bowed down to him, sat to one side. As he was sitting there he said to the Blessed One: "It's amazing, lord, it's astounding, how deep this dependent co-arising is, and how deep its appearance, and yet to me it seems as clear as clear can be."

(The Buddha:) "Don't say that, Ānanda. Don't say that. Deep is this dependent co-arising, and deep its appearance. It's because of not understanding and not penetrating this Dhamma that this generation is like a tangled skein, a knotted ball of string, like matted rushes and reeds,

and does not go beyond transmigration, beyond the planes of deprivation, woe, & bad destinations.

"If one is asked, 'Is there a demonstrable requisite condition for aging & death?' one should answer, 'There is.'

"If one is asked, 'From what requisite condition do aging & death come?' one should say, 'Aging & death come from birth as their requisite condition.'

"If one is asked, 'Is there a demonstrable requisite condition for birth?' one should answer, 'There is.'

"If one is asked, 'From what requisite condition does birth come?' one should say, 'Birth comes from becoming as its requisite condition.'

"If one is asked, 'Is there a demonstrable requisite condition for becoming?' one should answer, 'There is.'

"If one is asked, 'From what requisite condition does becoming come?' one should say, 'Becoming comes from clinging as its requisite condition.'

"If one is asked, 'Is there a demonstrable requisite condition for clinging?' one should answer, 'There is.'

"If one is asked, 'From what requisite condition does clinging come?' one should say, 'Clinging comes from craving as its requisite condition.'

"If one is asked, 'Is there a demonstrable requisite condition for craving?' one should answer, 'There is.'

"If one is asked, 'From what requisite condition does craving come?' one should say, 'Craving comes from feeling as its requisite condition.'

"If one is asked, 'Is there a demonstrable requisite condition for feeling?' one should answer, 'There is.'

"If one is asked, 'From what requisite condition does feeling come?' one should say, 'Feeling comes from contact as its requisite condition.'

"If one is asked, 'Is there a demonstrable requisite condition for contact?' one should answer, 'There is.'

"If one is asked, 'From what requisite condition does contact come?' one should say, 'Contact comes from name-&-form as its requisite condition.'

"If one is asked, 'Is there a demonstrable requisite condition for name-&-form?' one should answer, 'There is.'

"If one is asked, 'From what requisite condition does name-&-form come?' one should say, 'Name-&-form comes from consciousness as its requisite condition.'

"If one is asked, 'Is there a demonstrable requisite condition for consciousness?' one should answer, 'There is.'

"If one is asked, 'From what requisite condition does consciousness come?' one should say, 'Consciousness comes from name-&-form as its requisite condition.'

"Thus, Ānanda, from name-&-form as a requisite condition comes consciousness. From consciousness as a requisite condition comes name-&-form. From name-&-form as a requisite condition comes contact. From contact as a requisite condition comes feeling. From feeling as a requisite condition comes craving. From craving as a requisite condition comes clinging. From clinging as a requisite condition comes becoming. From becoming as a requisite condition comes birth. From birth as a requisite condition, aging-&-death, sorrow, lamentation, pain, distress, & despair come into play. Such is the origination of this entire mass of stress.

### Aging-&-Death

"'From birth as a requisite condition comes aging-&-death.' Thus it has been said. And this is the way to understand how from birth as a requisite condition come aging & death. If there were no birth at all, in any way, of anything anywhere—i.e., of devas in the state of devas, of celestials in the state of celestials, of spirits in the state of spirits, of demons in the state of demons, of human beings in the human state, of quadrupeds in the state of quadrupeds, of birds in the state of birds, of snakes in the state of snakes, or of any being in its own state—in the utter absence of birth, from the cessation of birth, would aging-&-death be discerned?"

"No, lord."

"Thus this is a cause, this is a reason, this is an origination, this is a requisite condition for aging-&-death, i.e., birth.

### Birth

"'From becoming as a requisite condition comes birth.' Thus it has been said. And this is the way to understand how from becoming as a requisite condition comes birth. If there were no becoming at all, in any way, of anything anywhere—i.e., sensual becoming, form becoming, or formless becoming—in the utter absence of becoming, from the cessation of becoming, would birth be discerned?"

"No, lord."

"Thus this is a cause, this is a reason, this is an origination, this is a requisite condition for birth, i.e., becoming.

### Becoming

"'From clinging as a requisite condition comes becoming.' Thus it has been said. And this is the way to understand how from clinging as a requisite condition comes becoming. If there were no clinging at all, in any way, of anything anywhere—i.e., clinging to sensuality, clinging to precepts and practices, clinging to views, or clinging to doctrines of the self—in the utter absence of clinging, from the cessation of clinging, would becoming be discerned?"

"No, lord."

"Thus this is a cause, this is a reason, this is an origination, this is a requisite condition for becoming, i.e., clinging.

### Clinging

"'From craving as a requisite condition comes clinging.' Thus it has been said. And this is the way to understand how from craving as a requisite condition comes clinging. If there were no craving at all, in any way, of anything anywhere—i.e., craving for forms, craving for sounds, craving for aromas, craving for flavors, craving for tactile sensations, craving for ideas—in the utter absence of craving, from the cessation of craving, would clinging be discerned?"

"No, lord."

"Thus this is a cause, this is a reason, this is an origination, this is a requisite condition for clinging, i.e., craving.

### Craving

"'From feeling as a requisite condition comes craving.' Thus it has been said. And this is the way to understand how from feeling as a requisite condition comes craving. If there were no feeling at all, in any way, of anything anywhere—i.e., feeling born of contact at the eye, feeling born of contact at the ear, feeling born of contact at the nose, feeling born of contact at the tongue, feeling born of contact at the body, or feeling born of contact at the intellect—in the utter absence of feeling, from the cessation of feeling, would craving be discerned?"

"No, lord."

"Thus this is a cause, this is a reason, this is an origination, this is a requisite condition for craving, i.e., feeling.

### Dependent on Craving

"Now, craving is dependent on feeling,

seeking is dependent on craving,

acquisition is dependent on seeking,

ascertainment is dependent on acquisition,

desire and passion is dependent on ascertainment,

attachment is dependent on desire and passion,

possessiveness is dependent on attachment,

stinginess is dependent on possessiveness,

defensiveness is dependent on stinginess,

and because of defensiveness, dependent on defensiveness, various evil, unskillful phenomena come into play: the taking up of sticks and knives; conflicts, quarrels, and disputes; accusations, divisive speech, and lies.

"And this is the way to understand how it is that because of defensiveness various evil, unskillful phenomena come into play: the

taking up of sticks and knives; conflicts, quarrels, and disputes; accusations, divisive speech, and lies. If there were no defensiveness at all, in any way, of anything anywhere, in the utter absence of defensiveness, from the cessation of defensiveness, would various evil, unskillful phenomena—the taking up of sticks and knives; conflicts, quarrels, and disputes; accusations, divisive speech, and lies—come into play?"

"No, lord."

"Thus this is a cause, this is a reason, this is an origination, this is a requisite condition for the coming-into-play of various evil, unskillful phenomena—the taking up of sticks and knives; conflicts, quarrels, and disputes; accusations, divisive speech, and lies—i.e., defensiveness.

"'Defensiveness is dependent on stinginess.' Thus it has been said. And this is the way to understand how defensiveness is dependent on stinginess. If there were no stinginess at all, in any way, of anything anywhere, in the utter absence of stinginess, from the cessation of stinginess, would defensiveness be discerned?"

"No, lord."

"Thus this is a cause, this is a reason, this is an origination, this is a requisite condition for defensiveness, i.e., stinginess.

(Similarly back through the chain of conditions: stinginess, attachment, possessiveness, desire and passion, ascertainment, acquisition, and seeking.)

"'Seeking is dependent on craving.' Thus it has been said. And this is the way to understand how seeking is dependent on craving. If there were no craving at all, in any way, of anything anywhere—i.e., craving for sensuality, craving for becoming, craving for no becoming—in the utter absence of craving, from the cessation of craving, would seeking be discerned?"

"No, lord."

"Thus this is a cause, this is a reason, this is an origination, this is a requisite condition for seeking, i.e., craving. Thus, Ānanda, these two phenomena (the chain of conditions leading from craving to birth, aging, and death, and the chain of conditions leading from craving to quarrels, etc.), as a duality, flow back into one place at feeling.

## Feeling

"'From contact as a requisite condition comes feeling.' Thus it has been said. And this is the way to understand how from contact as a requisite condition comes feeling. If there were no contact at all, in any way, of anything anywhere—i.e., contact at the eye, contact at the ear, contact at the nose, contact at the tongue, contact at the body, or contact at the intellect—in the utter absence of contact, from the cessation of contact, would feeling be discerned?"

"No, lord."

"Thus this is a cause, this is a reason, this is an origination, this is a requisite condition for feeling, i.e., contact.

## Contact

"'From name-&-form as a requisite condition comes contact.' Thus it has been said. And this is the way to understand how, from name-&-form as a requisite condition comes contact. If the permutations, signs, themes, & indicators by which there is a description of name-group (mental activity) were all absent, would designation-contact with regard to the form-group (the physical body) be discerned?"

"No, lord."

"If the permutations, signs, themes, & indicators by which there is a description of form-group were all absent, would resistance-contact with regard to the name-group be discerned?"

"No, lord."

"If the permutations, signs, themes, & indicators by which there is a description of name-group and form-group were all absent, would designation-contact or resistance-contact be discerned?"

"No, lord."

"If the permutations, signs, themes, \& indicators by which there is a description of name-\&-form were all absent, would contact be discerned?"

"No, lord."

"Thus this is a cause, this is a reason, this is an origination, this is a requisite condition for contact, i.e., name-&-form.

### Name-&-Form

"'From consciousness as a requisite condition comes name-&-form.' Thus it has been said. And this is the way to understand how from consciousness as a requisite condition comes name-&-form. If consciousness were not to descend into the mother's womb, would name-&-form take shape in the womb?"

"No, lord."

"If, after descending into the womb, consciousness were to depart, would name-&-form be produced for this world?"

"No, lord."

"If the consciousness of the young boy or girl were to be cut off, would name-&-form ripen, grow, and reach maturity?"

"No, lord."

"Thus this is a cause, this is a reason, this is an origination, this is a requisite condition for name-&-form, i.e., consciousness.

### Consciousness

"From name-&-form as a requisite condition comes consciousness.' Thus it has been said. And this is the way to understand how from name-&-form as a requisite condition comes consciousness. If consciousness were not to gain a foothold in name-&-form, would a coming-into-play of the origination of birth, aging, death, and stress in the future be discerned?"

"No, lord."

"Thus this is a cause, this is a reason, this is an origination, this is a requisite condition for consciousness, i.e., name-&-form.

"This is the extent to which there is birth, aging, death, passing away, and re-arising. This is the extent to which there are means of designation, expression, and delineation. This is the extent to which the dimension of

discernment extends, the extent to which the cycle revolves for the manifesting [discernibility] of this world—i.e., name-&-form together with consciousness.

## Delineations of a Self

"To what extent, Ānanda, does one delineate when delineating a self? Either delineating a self possessed of form & finite, one delineates that 'My self is possessed of form & finite.' Or, delineating a self possessed of form & infinite, one delineates that 'My self is possessed of form & infinite.' Or, delineating a self formless & finite, one delineates that 'My self is formless & finite.' Or, delineating a self formless & infinite, one delineates that 'My self is formless & infinite.'

"Now, the one who, when delineating a self, delineates it as possessed of form & finite, either delineates it as possessed of form & finite in the present, or of such a nature that it will (naturally) become possessed of form & finite [in the future/after death/when falling asleep], or the thought occurs to him that 'Although it is not yet that way, I will convert it into being that way.' This being the case, it is proper to say that speculation about a self possessed of form & finite obsesses him.

"The one who, when delineating a self, delineates it as possessed of form & infinite, either delineates it as possessed of form & infinite in the present, or of such a nature that it will (naturally) become possessed of form & infinite, or the thought occurs to him that 'Although it is not yet that way, I will convert it into being that way.' This being the case, it is proper to say that speculation about a self possessed of form & infinite obsesses him.

"The one who, when delineating a self, delineates it as formless & finite, either delineates it as formless & finite in the present, or of such a nature that it will (naturally) become formless & finite, or the thought occurs to him that 'Although it is not yet that way, I will convert it into being that way.' This being the case, it is proper to say that speculation about a self formless & finite obsesses him.

"The one who, when delineating a self, delineates it as formless & infinite, either delineates it as formless & infinite in the present, or of such a nature that it will (naturally) become formless & infinite [in the

future/after death], or the thought occurs to him that 'Although it is not yet that way, I will convert it into being that way.' This being the case, it is proper to say that speculation about a self formless & infinite obsesses him.[1]

## Non-Delineations of a Self

"To what extent, Ānanda, does one not delineate when not delineating a self? Either not delineating a self possessed of form and finite, one does not delineate that 'My self is possessed of form and finite.' Or, not delineating a self possessed of form and infinite, one does not delineate that 'My self is possessed of form and infinite.' Or, not delineating a self formless and finite, one does not delineate that 'My self is formless and finite.' Or, not delineating a self formless and infinite, one does not delineate that 'My self is formless and infinite.'

"Now, the one who, when not delineating a self, does not delineate it as possessed of form and finite, does not delineate it as possessed of form and finite in the present, nor does he delineate it as of such a nature that it will (naturally) become possessed of form and finite [in the future/after death], nor does the thought occur to him that 'Although it is not yet that way, I will convert it into being that way.' This being the case, it is proper to say that speculation about a self possessed of form and finite does not obsess him.

"The one who, when not delineating a self, does not delineate it as possessed of form and infinite, does not delineate it as possessed of form and infinite in the present, nor does he delineate it as of such a nature that it will (naturally) become possessed of form and infinite [in the future/after death], nor does the thought occur to him that 'Although it is not yet that way, I will convert it into being that way.' This being the case, it is proper to say that speculation about a self possessed of form and infinite does not obsess him.

"The one who, when not delineating a self, does not delineate it as formless and finite, does not delineate it as formless and finite in the present, nor does he delineate it as of such a nature that it will (naturally) become formless and finite [in the future/after death], nor does the thought occur to him that 'Although it is not yet that way, I will convert it

into being that way.' This being the case, it is proper to say that speculation about a self formless and finite does not obsess him.

"The one who, when not delineating a self, does not delineate it as formless and infinite, does not delineate it as formless and infinite in the present, nor does he delineate it as of such a nature that it will (naturally) become formless and infinite [in the future/after death], nor does the thought occur to him that 'Although it is not yet that way, I will convert it into being that way.' This being the case, it is proper to say that speculation about a self formless and infinite does not obsess him.

## Assumptions of a Self

"To what extent, Ānanda, does one assume when assuming a self? Assuming feeling to be the self, one assumes that 'Feeling is my self' (or) 'Feeling is not my self: My self is oblivious (to feeling)' (or) 'Neither is feeling my self, nor is my self oblivious to feeling, but rather my self feels, in that my self is subject to feeling.'

"Now, one who says, 'Feeling is my self,' should be addressed as follows: 'There are these three feelings, my friend—feelings of pleasure, feelings of pain, and feelings of neither pleasure nor pain. Which of these three feelings do you assume to be the self? At a moment when a feeling of pleasure is sensed, no feeling of pain or of neither pleasure nor pain is sensed. Only a feeling of pleasure is sensed at that moment. At a moment when a feeling of pain is sensed, no feeling of pleasure or of neither pleasure nor pain is sensed. Only a feeling of pain is sensed at that moment. At a moment when a feeling of neither pleasure nor pain is sensed, no feeling of pleasure or of pain is sensed. Only a feeling of neither pleasure nor pain is sensed at that moment.

"Now, a feeling of pleasure is inconstant, fabricated, dependent on conditions, subject to passing away, dissolution, fading, and cessation. A feeling of pain is inconstant, fabricated, dependent on conditions, subject to passing away, dissolution, fading, and cessation. A feeling of neither pleasure nor pain is inconstant, fabricated, dependent on conditions, subject to passing away, dissolution, fading, and cessation. Having sensed a feeling of pleasure as 'my self,' then with the cessation of one's very own feeling of pleasure, 'my self' has perished. Having sensed a feeling of pain

as 'my self,' then with the cessation of one's very own feeling of pain, 'my self' has perished. Having sensed a feeling of neither pleasure nor pain as 'my self,' then with the cessation of one's very own feeling of neither pleasure nor pain, 'my self' has perished.

"Thus he assumes, assuming in the immediate present a self inconstant, entangled in pleasure and pain, subject to arising and passing away, he who says, 'Feeling is my self.' Thus in this manner, Ānanda, one does not see fit to assume feeling to be the self.

"As for the person who says, 'Feeling is not the self: My self is oblivious (to feeling),' he should be addressed as follows: 'My friend, where nothing whatsoever is sensed [experienced] at all, would there be the thought, "I am"?'"

"No, lord."

"Thus in this manner, Ānanda, one does not see fit to assume that 'Feeling is not my self: My self is oblivious (to feeling).'

"As for the person who says, 'Neither is feeling my self, nor is my self oblivious (to feeling), but rather my self feels, in that my self is subject to feeling,' he should be addressed as follows: 'My friend, should feelings altogether and every way stop without remainder, then with feeling completely not existing, owing to the cessation of feeling, would there be the thought, "I am"?'"

"No, lord."

"Thus in this manner, Ānanda, one does not see fit to assume that 'Neither is feeling my self, nor is my self oblivious (to feeling), but rather my self feels, in that my self is subject to feeling.'

"Now, Ānanda, in as far as a monk doesn't assume feeling to be the self, nor the self as oblivious, nor that 'My self feels, in that my self is subject to feeling,' then, not assuming in this way, he is not sustained by [does not cling to] anything in the world. Unsustained, he is not agitated. Unagitated, he is totally unbound right within. He discerns that 'Birth is ended, the holy life fulfilled, the task done. There is nothing further for this world.'

## The Monk Released

"If anyone were to say with regard to a monk whose mind is thus released that 'The Tathāgata exists after death,' is his view, that would be mistaken; that 'The Tathāgata does not exist after death' … that 'The Tathāgata both exists and does not exist after death' … that 'The Tathāgata neither exists nor does not exist after death' is his view, that would be mistaken. Why? Having directly known the extent of designation and the extent of the objects of designation, the extent of expression and the extent of the objects of expression, the extent of description and the extent of the objects of description, the extent of discernment and the extent of the objects of discernment, the extent to which the cycle revolves: Having directly known that, the monk is released.[2] The view that, 'Having directly known that, the monk released does not see, does not know': That would be mistaken.[3]

## Seven Stations of Consciousness

"Ānanda, there are these seven stations of consciousness and two dimensions. Which seven?

"There are beings with multiplicity of body and multiplicity of perception,[4] such as human beings, some devas, and some beings in the lower realms. This is the first station of consciousness.

"There are beings with multiplicity of body and singularity of perception, such as the Devas of Brahmā's Retinue generated by the first (jhāna) and (some) beings in the four realms of deprivation.[5] This is the second station of consciousness.

"There are beings with singularity of body and multiplicity of perception, such as the Radiant Devas. This is the third station of consciousness.

"There are beings with singularity of body and singularity of perception, such as the Beautiful Black Devas. This is the fourth station of consciousness.

"There are beings who, with the complete transcending of perceptions of (physical) form, with the disappearance of perceptions of resistance, and not heeding perceptions of multiplicity, (perceiving,) 'Infinite space,'

arrive at the dimension of the infinitude of space. This is the fifth station of consciousness.

"There are beings who, with the complete transcending of the dimension of the infinitude of space, (perceiving,) 'Infinite consciousness,' arrive at the dimension of the infinitude of consciousness. This is the sixth station of consciousness.

"There are beings who, with the complete transcending of the dimension of the infinitude of consciousness, (perceiving,) 'There is nothing,' arrive at the dimension of nothingness. This is the seventh station of consciousness.

"The dimension of non-percipient beings and, second, the dimension of neither perception nor non-perception. [These are the two dimensions.]

"Now, as for the first station of consciousness—beings with multiplicity of body and multiplicity of perception, such as human beings, some devas, and some beings in the lower realms: If one discerns that (station of consciousness), discerns its origination, discerns its passing away, discerns its allure, discerns its drawbacks, discerns the escape from it, would it be proper, by means of that [discernment] to take delight there?"

"No, lord."

[Similarly with each of the remaining stations of consciousness and two dimensions.]

"Ānanda, when knowing—as they have come to be—the origination, passing away, allure, drawbacks of—and escape from—these seven stations of consciousness and two dimensions, a monk is released through lack of clinging, he is said to be a monk released through discernment.

## Eight Emancipations

"Ānanda, there are these eight emancipations. Which eight?

"Possessed of form, one sees forms. This is the first emancipation.

"Not percipient of form internally, one sees forms externally. This is the second emancipation.

"One is intent only on the beautiful. This is the third emancipation.

"With the complete transcending of perceptions of (physical) form, with the disappearance of perceptions of resistance, and not heeding perceptions of multiplicity, (perceiving,) 'Infinite space,' one enters and remains in the dimension of the infinitude of space. This is the fourth emancipation.

"With the complete transcending of the dimension of the infinitude of space, (perceiving,) 'Infinite consciousness,' one enters and remains in the dimension of the infinitude of consciousness. This is the fifth emancipation.

"With the complete transcending of the dimension of the infinitude of consciousness, (perceiving,) 'There is nothing,' one enters and remains in the dimension of nothingness. This is the sixth emancipation.

"With the complete transcending of the dimension of nothingness, one enters and remains in the dimension of neither perception nor non-perception. This is the seventh emancipation.

"With the complete transcending of the dimension of neither perception nor non-perception, one enters and remains in the cessation of perception and feeling. This is the eighth emancipation.

"Now, when a monk attains these eight emancipations in forward order, in reverse order, in forward and reverse order, when he attains them and emerges from them wherever he wants, however he wants, and for as long as he wants, when through the ending of effluents he enters and remains in the effluent-free release of awareness and release of discernment, having directly known it and realized it for himself in the here and now, he is said to be a monk released in both ways. And as for another release in both ways, higher or more sublime than this, there is none."

That is what the Blessed One said. Gratified, Ven. Ānanda delighted in the Blessed One's words.

## Notes

1. Some scholars, in an attempt to place the Buddha's teachings in an historical context, have maintained that his not-self teaching was meant to apply specifically to the Upaniṣadic self-doctrine. In other words, the Buddha's intention was to deny the truth of the Upaniṣadic doctrine of the universal self;

he was not denying other, more common-sense doctrines of the self. This understanding of the non-self teaching has partial support in MN 22—which subjects the idea of a universal self to specific ridicule.

Other scholars take an opposite tack, saying that the Buddha was refuting the existence of a perduring individual self, but not the existence of a universal or inter-connected self.

Neither position does justice to the wide variety of self doctrines that the Buddha rejects in this passage—whether finite or infinite (or endless—*ananta);* whether possessed of form or formless—for the act of holding to any of these doctrines involves clinging, and thus suffering and stress.

The first position, in particular, also fails to take into account two aspects of the Buddha's actual historical context:

a) The Upaniṣadic tradition was not the only tradition at the Buddha's time espousing doctrines of the self. DN 2 cites—and refutes—the self-doctrines of other, non-Vedic schools of the time.

b) No single self-doctrine can claim to be "the" Upaniṣadic doctrine of the self. The Upaniṣads were a diverse body of texts, offering a wide variety of teachings on the topic. Some, such as the Bṛhad-āraṇyaka Upaniṣad and Kaṭha Upaniṣad, state explicitly that each person has two selves, finite and infinite; and the major Upaniṣads differ on the nature of these two selves and how the infinite self can be attained.

In fact, it is instructive to classify the various Upaniṣadic self-doctrines in light of the twelve categories listed in this passage. A survey of the major Upaniṣads reveals self-doctrines falling into eight—and perhaps nine—of these categories, as follows: (Passage numbers are taken from S. Radhakrishnan, *The Principal Upaniṣads.* London: George Allen & Unwin, 1969.)

1) Already possessed of form and finite:
   *Bṛhad-āraṇyaka II.5.1*
   *Maitrī VI.11*
2) Naturally becoming possessed of form and finite:
   *Bṛhad-āraṇyaka IV.3.19-21*
3) Can be made possessed of form and finite:
   —
4) Already possessed of form and infinite:
   *Bṛhad-āraṇyaka I.4.7-10*
   *Bṛhad-āraṇyaka I.5.20*

*Chāndogya III.14.2-3*
*Muṇḍaka III.1.7*

5) Naturally becoming possessed of form and infinite:
*Chāndogya VIII.3.4*
*Chāndogya VIII.12.2-3*

6) Can be made possessed of form and infinite:
*Praśna IV.6-11*
*Subāla III*
*Kaivalya VI*

7) Already formless and finite:
*Kaṭha I.3.1-4* (?—the description here suggests, but does not explicitly state, that the self is formless)

8) Naturally becoming formless and finite:
—

9) Can be made formless and finite:
—

10) Already formless and infinite:
*Bṛhad-āraṇyaka III.8.8-11*

11) Naturally becoming formless and infinite:
*Praśna IV.6-11*

12) Can be made formless and infinite:
*Kaṭha I.3.13-15*
*Subāla III*
*Subāla IX.15*
*Paiṅgala III.6*

There is no way of knowing if these Upaniṣads, as we have them, were composed before or after the Buddha's time. Thus, the classifications here may or may not have been formulated in response to them. Nevertheless, the sheer variety of their teachings shows that there was no single Upaniṣadic doctrine of the self, and that the Buddha did not formulate his not-self teaching in response to only one doctrine. As the framework here shows, the not-self teaching was formulated in such a way as to counteract the act of clinging to any self-doctrine, regardless of how the self might be defined.

2. The relationship between the limitations of language and the question of the existence of the Tathāgata after death is indicated by SN 23:2. There the Buddha notes that one defines oneself as a being through passion and delight

for any of the five aggregates. Once there is no passion or delight for the aggregates, one can no longer be defined as a being. Once one is no longer defined, there is no way of describing one as existing, not existing, neither, or both—regardless of whether one is alive or dead (see SN 22:85–86).

3. The various readings for this sentence all seem corrupt. The sense of the paragraph, read in light of AN 10:96, demands that the view expressed in the last sentence be *about* the monk released, unlike the four earlier views, which are wrongly *attributed to* the monk released. In other words, the monk released has no opinion on the question of whether the Tathāgata does, doesn't, etc., exist after death. This might lead to the supposition that his lack of opinion comes from a lack of knowledge or vision. The description of what he comes to know in the course of gaining release shows that this supposition is inappropriate. He does know, he does see, and what he knows and sees about the limitations of language and concepts shows him that the question of the existence of the Tathāgata after death should be set aside.

Thus I would reconstruct the Pali of the final sentence in this paragraph as: *Tadabhiññā vimutto bhikkhu na jānāti nā passati iti sā diṭṭhi tadakallaṁ.*

4. MN 137 indicates that perceptions of multiplicity deal with the six senses, whereas perceptions of singularity form the basis of the four formless attainments.

5. This last phrase—"and (some) beings in the four realms of deprivation" is in the Thai edition of the Canon, but not in the PTS or Burmese editions. It seems required by the context in order to cover the beings in the lower realms not included in the first station of consciousness.

*See also: MN 109; MN 148; SN 12:2; SN 12:15; SN 12:20; SN 12:65; SN 12:67; SN 12:70; SN 22:1; SN 22:85–86; AN 2:30; AN 4:199; AN 7:11–12; AN 9:43–45; AN 10:96; Sn 3:12; Sn 4:11*

# *The Great Total Unbinding Discourse*
# *Mahā Parinibbāna Sutta (DN 16)*

## Introduction

Nibbāna *originally was the Pali word for the extinguishing of a fire. The Buddha employed it as one of the names of the goal he taught, in light of the way in which the processes of fire were viewed at his time: A burning fire was seen as clinging to its fuel in a state of hot agitation. When going out, it let go of its fuel and reached a state of freedom, cooling, and peace. These were thus the primary associations of this term when applied to the Buddhist goal. Given this understanding of fire, the term* nibbāna *apparently was derived etymologically from the negative prefix,* nir, *plus the root* vāṇa, *or binding: unbinding. The associated adjective is* nibbuta: *unbound. The associated verb,* nibbuti: *to unbind.*

Parinibbāna—*total unbinding—carries two meanings in the Canon. On the one hand, it denotes the unbinding that happens at the moment of full awakening, either for a Buddha or for one of his arahant disciples. On the other, it denotes the unbinding that happens when such a person dies and is no longer reborn. In the title of this sutta, the term has this second meaning, centered on the Buddha's death. The word* mahā, *"great," in the sutta's title modifies both "parinibbāna" and "sutta." In other words, it states both that the sutta is long—it's the longest in the Pali Canon—and that the Buddha's death is the most important parinibbāna in the Buddhist tradition.*

*The sutta narrates the events of the year leading up to the Buddha's parinibbāna and the weeks immediately following it. In a few instances, most notably the events right before the Buddha's passing, the narrative gives a fairly realistic blow-by-blow account of random incidents, but the main body of the sutta shows signs of having been consciously selected and shaped. We know from other passages in the Canon that not all the major events of this period were included here. Ven. Sāriputta, for instance, appears in Part I of the sutta, but*

*SN 47:13 tells us that he died before the Buddha did, and that the Buddha was at Sāvatthī when he received the news, yet neither event is included in this narrative. At the same time, the style of the narrative follows many of the conventions of literary prose and poetry in ancient India, aimed at producing an astounding* rasa, *or emotional savor.*

*Two main concerns seem to have determined the shape of the narrative, concerns that are common to any memorial: the desire (1) to show that the person memorialized was worthy of love and respect, and (2) to indicate the importance of continuing to live by the good traditions that the person established.*

*Both concerns are encapsulated in the event chosen to open the sutta: King Ajātasattu's emotional outburst over his plans to invade the Vajjians, and his request that his chief minister, Vassakāra, ask for the Buddha's advice on the matter. There's a wry irony in depicting a king so spiritually blind as to seek the Buddha's advice on plans for war, but the incident makes several serious points at once. To begin with, it points to the fact that the Buddha was respected by even the most highly placed members of society. The Buddha's indirect response to the king's request ultimately averts a war, showing that he used his influence to admirable effect. However, a knowledge of later events—Vassakāra and Ajātasattu were eventually able to defeat the Vajjians bloodlessly by undermining their good traditions—underlines the fact that good traditions cannot maintain themselves, for there are forces in the world seeking to undo them. The Buddha himself draws the parallel between the good traditions in which he trained the Vajjians—which they failed to maintain—and the good traditions in which he trained the Saṅgha. The point is that even though the Buddha set the Saṅgha on a good footing, the continued life of the Saṅgha requires the continued vigilance of its surviving members.*

*Thus even though the opening incident reports as an established fact the sutta's first concern—the fact that the Buddha is eminently worthy of respect—it leaves the second concern—the survival of his teachings—as an open question, alerting and inspiring any serious listeners that this was a responsibility they had to take on as their own.*

*These two concerns shape all the remaining sections of the narrative.*

*To indicate the fact that the Buddha was worthy of respect, the compilers continue the twofold tactic set out in the opening incident: directly, by showing*

*the Buddha's admirable character through his words and actions; and indirectly, by showing how people worthy of respect paid him homage.*

*In depicting the Buddha directly, the narrative gives primary emphasis to his ability as a teacher—one with a comprehensive command of the Dhamma, a prodigious memory, and an untiring willingness to teach what he knows. It also highlights the Buddha's prowess as a meditator, both in his command of concentration (as reported in his discussion with Pukkusa Mallaputta and his final display of concentration attainments before his passing away) and in his command of the psychic powers based on concentration: He sees devas, visits their heavens without their knowing who he is, teleports over a river, forecasts future events, recalls past lifetimes, reads minds. He also shows a total command over his own death: overcoming his next-to-last illness, voluntarily deciding when and where to die, and, of course, dying in such a way as to never again be reborn.*

*In terms of more personal qualities, the narrative depicts the Buddha's great fortitude in the face of his last two illnesses—in particular, walking all day to his final resting place after a severe attack of dysentery. At the same time, on the day of his death he shows great kindness and gratitude in taking time to comfort both Ven. Ānanda, his attendant, and Cunda, the layperson who provided his last meal; in having the Mallans notified so that they can pay homage to him; in teaching one last student, Subhadda; and in offering to answer any remaining questions right before passing away.*

*As for the ways in which the Buddha is shown respect, first and foremost are the miraculous events sprinkled throughout the narrative, showing that even the forces of nature respected him: a muddy river grows clear so that he can drink the water; his pyre lights spontaneously after his great disciple, Ven. Mahā Kassapa, has arrived and paid him homage.*

*Kings, ministers, and princes also vie with one another to pay the Buddha homage, and even the devas are eager to show him respect.*

*In showing how these figures paid homage to the Buddha, the sutta has taught many generations of Buddhists the etiquette of respect. Five points in particular stand out:*

*(a) Most common is the act of circumambulation on leaving the Buddha's presence. This became the common way of showing respect to the Buddha's remains and to the stupas, or memorials, that enshrined them.*

*(b) When, in Part V, the devas want to gaze at the "Eye," they are carrying on an ancient Indian tradition, going back to Vedic times, of regarding a holy being as an all-around eye (one of the epithets of the Buddha in early Pali poetry) and the act of gazing into such an eye as an auspicious one. In later centuries, it became a common meditation practice to stare at a Buddha image or into the image's eyes.*

*(c) When the Mallans call out their names while paying final homage to the Buddha, they are also carrying on an ancient Indian tradition, proclaiming that they are not ashamed to be known for bowing down to the Buddha. This later led to the tradition of inscribing one's name on items donated to stupas, even if the items were to be placed where the inscription could not be seen. The act of putting one's name on a donation continues within the Buddhist world to this day.*

*(d) When, after the Buddha's death and again after his cremation, the Mallans venerate his body with dances, songs, music, garlands, & scents, in making cloth canopies and arranging floral wreaths, they are establishing the precedent for the stupa festivals that have been popular throughout Buddhist Asia ever since.*

*(e) And of course, when the Buddha himself is depicted as describing how his funeral should be held and how his stupas should be visited and contemplated, the sutta establishes a foundation for the cult of stupas and pagodas as a whole.*

*As the Buddha states here, the purpose of such contemplation is not simply to show respect but also to give rise to feelings of* saṁvega*—urgency and dismay—over the impermanence and inconstancy of life. In the Buddhist analysis of emotions, saṁvega is one of the primary motivations for practice—especially when coupled with* pasāda, *confidence that the practice leads to freedom from that inconstancy. By inducing feelings of both saṁvega and pasāda, the sutta attempts to inspire its listeners to adopt its second major concern—the need to maintain good Buddhist traditions—both for their own individual sakes and for the sake of the common good.*

*Toward this end, the sutta narrates many of the Buddha's own instructions for how to maintain the life of the Dhamma and Saṅgha for a long time. As the sutta opens, he provides several lists of instructions for how the Saṅgha is to stay harmonious. Instead of appointing an individual as his successor, he identifies the Dhamma and Vinaya he has taught and expounded as his successor, at the*

*same time establishing standards for how the Dhamma and Vinaya are to be known: citing the Wings to awakening as his most central teachings, and insisting that any teachings claimed to be his should be judged, not on the authority of the person making the report, but on the consistency of those teachings with teachings already known to be standard.*

*For individuals, the Buddha stresses the need to take the Dhamma as their refuge by internalizing the Dhamma in such a way—through the four establishings of mindfulness—that they can take refuge in themselves. He also supplies a "Dhamma-mirror" so that they can judge the extent to which they have succeeded in providing themselves with this refuge.*

*The pursuit of the common and the individual good overlap in that when individual monks practice rightly, the world will not be empty of arahants.*

*One of the instructive ironies of the sutta is the way in which its two main concerns come into conflict toward the end: Kings and brahmans become so intent on gaining possession of the Buddha's relics that they forget his teachings and almost come to war. We know from Buddhist history that devotional Buddhism has threatened the practice in other ways as well. Time and again, monks in charge of devotional centers have made life difficult for monks in the forest; forest monasteries have, with the passage of generations, devolved into devotional centers. To resolve this conflict, the sutta recommends a compromise position, shown most clearly in the Buddha's response to the worship given by the devas on his last night: On the one hand, he honors their desire to gaze on him by telling his attendant monk to get out of the way; on the other, he tells Ānanda that the most genuine form of worship is to practice the Dhamma in accordance with the Dhamma. In this way, he makes room for external expressions of devotion, at the same time subordinating them to the practice of the Dhamma for the purpose of full liberation.*

*Ven. Mahā Kassapa, who appears at the end of the sutta, provides the ideal monastic figure to embody its dual ideals. Known both for his fierce devotion to the Buddha and for his strict practice, he shows that these two ideals need not be in conflict. The concluding part of the narrative also hints at the role he later played in shouldering the Buddha's concern for the survival of the Dhamma and Vinaya that were to be the Saṅgha's teacher in the Buddha's place. Cv.XI tells us that the remarks made by the elderly monk after the Buddha's passing and recorded here—that the Saṅgha is well rid of the Buddha and his*

*harassment over what should and shouldn't be done—were Mahā Kassapa's inspiration for calling the First Council to standardize the Dhamma and Vinaya. As he realized from those remarks, the threats to the survival of the Buddha's good traditions came not only from outside the Saṅgha but also—and more seriously—from within. In this way he shows the lengths to which members of the Saṅgha should be prepared to go in furthering the sutta's two main ideals.*

*As for the ideal lay embodiment of both ideals, that is provided by Doṇa the brahman, who divides the Buddha's relics in a fair and peaceful manner among their many claimants. In this way, he shows Buddhist lay people that they, too, can play a role in carrying on the good traditions established by the Buddha. Just as the sutta begins with the Buddha averting a war, Doṇa the brahman succeeds in averting a war at the end.*

[ I ]

I have heard that on one occasion the Blessed One was staying near Rājagaha on Vulture Peak Mountain. And on that occasion, Ajātasattu Vedehiputta, the king of Magadha, wanted to attack the Vajjians. He said: "I will cut down these Vajjians—so mighty, so powerful! I will destroy these Vajjians! I will bring these Vajjians to ruin—these Vajjians!"

Then he addressed Vassakāra the brahman, the chief minister of Magadha: "Come, brahman. Go to the Blessed One and, on arrival, show reverence with your head to his feet in my name and ask whether he is free from illness & affliction, is carefree, strong, & living in comfort, (saying,) 'Ajātasattu Vedehiputta, the king of Magadha, lord, shows reverence with his head to the Blessed One's feet and asks whether you are free from illness & affliction, are carefree, strong, & living in comfort.' And then say: 'Lord, Ajātasattu Vedehiputta, the king of Magadha, wants to attack the Vajjians. He says: "I will cut down these Vajjians—so mighty, so powerful! I will destroy these Vajjians! I will bring these Vajjians to ruin—these Vajjians!"' However the Blessed One answers, having grasped it well, report to me. For Tathāgatas do not speak untruthfully."[1]

Responding, "As you say, sire," to Ajātasattu Vedehiputta, the King of Magadha, Vassakāra the brahman, the chief minister of Magadha, had auspicious vehicles yoked, got into an auspicious vehicle, left Rājagaha

with the auspicious vehicles and drove toward Vulture Peak Mountain. Going in his vehicle as far as there was ground for a vehicle, getting down from his vehicle, he approached the Blessed One on foot. On arrival, he exchanged courteous greetings with the Blessed One. After an exchange of friendly greetings & courtesies, he sat to one side. As he was sitting there, he told the Blessed One, "Ajātasattu Vedehiputta, the king of Magadha, Master Gotama,[2] shows reverence with his head to Master Gotama's feet and asks whether you are free from illness & affliction, are carefree, strong, & living in comfort. Master Gotama, Ajātasattu Vedehiputta, the king of Magadha, wants to attack the Vajjians. He says: 'I will cut down these Vajjians—so mighty, so powerful! I will destroy these Vajjians! I will bring these Vajjians to ruin—these Vajjians!'"

Now on that occasion Ven. Ānanda was standing behind the Blessed One, fanning him. So the Blessed One addressed Ven. Ānanda, "Have you heard, Ānanda, that the Vajjians meet often and meet a great deal?"

"I have heard, lord, that the Vajjians meet often and meet a great deal."

"As long as the Vajjians meet often and meet a great deal, Ānanda, their growth can be expected, not their decline.

"Have you heard, Ānanda, that the Vajjians meet in harmony, adjourn from their meetings in harmony, and conduct their Vajjian business in harmony?"

"I have heard that, lord.…

"As long as the Vajjians meet in harmony, adjourn from their meetings in harmony, and conduct their Vajjian business in harmony, Ānanda, their growth can be expected, not their decline.

"Have you heard, Ānanda, that the Vajjians neither decree what has been undecreed nor repeal what has been decreed, but conduct themselves, having undertaken the ancient Vajjian laws as they have been decreed?"

"I have heard that, lord.…

"As long as the Vajjians neither decree what has been undecreed nor repeal what has been decreed, but conduct themselves, having undertaken the ancient Vajjian laws as they have been decreed, Ānanda, their growth can be expected, not their decline.

"Have you heard, Ānanda, that the Vajjians honor, respect, venerate, and do homage to the Vajjian elders of the Vajjis, regarding them as worth listening to?"

"I have heard that, lord.…

"As long as the Vajjians honor, respect, venerate, and do homage to the Vajjian elders of the Vajjis, regarding them as worth listening to, Ānanda, their growth can be expected, not their decline.

"Have you heard, Ānanda, that the Vajjians do not roughly drag off women & girls of good families and take them captive?"

"I have heard that, lord.…

"As long as the Vajjians do not roughly drag off women & girls of good families and take them captive, Ānanda, their growth can be expected, not their decline.

"Have you heard, Ānanda, that the Vajjians honor, respect, venerate, and do homage to the Vajjian shrines, both inside (the city) and out, and that they do not let the righteous offerings done in the past and given in the past to those shrines fall into decline?"

"I have heard that, lord.…

"As long as the Vajjians honor, respect, venerate, and do homage to the Vajjian shrines, both inside (the city) and out, and do not let the righteous offerings done in the past and given in the past to those shrines fall into decline, Ānanda, their growth can be expected, not their decline.

"Have you heard, Ānanda, that righteous protection, watch, and guarding for arahants is well-provided by the Vajjians (with the thought,) 'If there are any arahants who have yet to come to our domain, may they come; and may the arahants who have come to our domain live in comfort'?

"I have heard that, lord.…

"As long as righteous protection, watch, and guarding for arahants is well-provided by the Vajjians (with the thought,) 'If there are any arahants who have yet to come to our domain, may they come; and may the arahants who have come to our domain live in comfort,' Ānanda, their growth can be expected, not their decline."

Then the Blessed One addressed Vassakāra the brahman, the chief minister of Magadha, "Once, brahman, I was staying near Vesālī at the Sārandada shrine. There I taught the Vajjians these seven conditions that lead to no decline. As long as these seven conditions endure among the Vajjians, and as long as the Vajjians remain steadfast in these seven conditions, the Vajjians' growth can be expected, not their decline."

When this was said, Vassakāra the brahman, the chief minister of Magadha, said to the Blessed One, "Master Gotama, even if the Vajjians are endowed with only one of these conditions that lead to no decline, the Vajjians' growth can be expected, not their decline—to say nothing of all seven. Nothing can be done to the Vajjians by King Ajātasattu Vedehiputta, the king of Magadha, through force of arms—except by befriending them and sowing dissension (among them).[3]

"Well, then, Master Gotama, we must go now. Many are our duties, many our responsibilities."

"Then do, brahman, what you think it is now time to do."

Then Vassakāra the brahman, the chief minister of Magadha, delighting in and approving of the Blessed One's words, got up from his seat and left.

Not long after his departure, the Blessed One addressed Ven. Ānanda: "Go, Ānanda. Have all the monks living in dependence on Rājagaha gather at the assembly hall."

Responding, "As you say, lord," to the Blessed One, Ven. Ānanda—having had all the monks living in dependence on Rājagaha gather at the assembly hall—approached the Blessed One. On arrival, having bowed down to him, he stood to one side. As he was standing there, he said to the Blessed One, "The Saṅgha of monks has gathered, lord. May the Blessed One do what he thinks it is now time to do."

Then the Blessed One, getting up from his seat, went to the assembly hall and, on arrival, sat down on the seat laid out. Having sat down, he addressed the monks:

"Monks, I will teach you the seven conditions that lead to no decline. Listen & pay close attention. I will speak."

"As you say, lord," the monks responded to the Blessed One.

The Blessed One said:

"Monks, as long as the monks meet often, meet a great deal, their growth can be expected, not their decline.

"As long as the monks meet in harmony, adjourn from their meetings in harmony, and conduct Saṅgha business in harmony, their growth can be expected, not their decline.

"As long as the monks neither decree what has been undecreed nor repeal what has been decreed, but conduct themselves, having undertaken the training rules as they have been decreed, their growth can be expected, not their decline.

"As long as the monks honor, respect, venerate, and do homage to the elder monks—those with seniority who have long been ordained, the fathers of the Saṅgha, leaders of the Saṅgha—regarding them as worth listening to, their growth can be expected, not their decline.

"As long as the monks do not come under the sway of any arisen craving that leads to further-becoming, their growth can be expected, not their decline.

"As long as the monks see their own benefit in wilderness dwellings, their growth can be expected, not their decline.

"And as long as the monks each keep firmly in mind: 'If there are any well-behaved companions in the holy life who have yet to come, may they come; and may the well-behaved companions in the holy life who have come live in comfort,' their growth can be expected, not their decline.

"As long as these seven conditions endure among the monks, and as long as the monks remain steadfast in these seven conditions, the monks' growth can be expected, not their decline."[4]

"Monks, I will teach you seven further conditions that lead to no decline. Listen & pay close attention. I will speak."

"As you say, lord," the monks responded to the Blessed One.

The Blessed One said:

"Monks, as long as the monks are not infatuated with (construction) work, do not delight in construction work, and are not committed to

infatuation with construction work, the monks' growth can be expected, not their decline.

"As long as the monks are not infatuated with gossip…

"As long as the monks are not infatuated with sleeping…

"As long as the monks are not infatuated with entanglement…

"As long as the monks are not infatuated with evil ambition and have not come under the sway of evil ambitions, the monks' growth can be expected, not their decline.

"As long as the monks do not have evil friends, evil companions, and evil comrades, the monks' growth can be expected, not their decline.

"And as long as the monks do not stop half-way with lower distinctions & achievements, the monks' growth can be expected, not their decline.[5]

"As long as these seven conditions endure among the monks, and as long as the monks remain steadfast in these seven conditions, the monks' growth can be expected, not their decline."

"Monks, I will teach you seven further conditions that lead to no decline. Listen & pay close attention. I will speak."

"As you say, lord," the monks responded to the Blessed One.

The Blessed One said: "Monks, as long as the monks have conviction… shame… compunction… learning… aroused persistence… established mindfulness… discernment, the monks' growth can be expected, not their decline.[6]

"As long as these seven conditions endure among the monks, and as long as the monks remain steadfast in these seven conditions, the monks' growth can be expected, not their decline."

"Monks, I will teach you seven further conditions that lead to no decline. Listen & pay close attention. I will speak."

"As you say, lord," the monks responded to the Blessed One.

The Blessed One said:

"Monks, as long as the monks develop mindfulness as a factor for awakening… analysis of qualities as a factor for awakening… persistence

as a factor for awakening… rapture as a factor for awakening… calm as a factor for awakening… concentration as a factor for awakening… equanimity as a factor for awakening, the monks' growth can be expected, not their decline.[7]

"As long as these seven conditions endure among the monks, and as long as the monks remain steadfast in these seven conditions, the monks' growth can be expected, not their decline."

"Monks, I will teach you seven further conditions that lead to no decline. Listen & pay close attention. I will speak."

"As you say, lord," the monks responded to the Blessed One.

The Blessed One said: "Monks, as long as the monks develop the perception of inconstancy… the perception of not-self… the perception of unattractiveness… the perception of drawbacks… the perception of abandoning… the perception of dispassion… the perception of cessation, the monks' growth can be expected, not their decline.[8]

"As long as these seven conditions endure among the monks, and as long as the monks remain steadfast in these seven conditions, the monks' growth can be expected, not their decline."

"Monks, I will teach you six further[9] conditions that lead to no decline. Listen & pay close attention. I will speak."

"As you say, lord," the monks responded to the Blessed One.

The Blessed One said:

"As long as the monks are set on bodily acts of good will with regard to their companions in the holy life, to their faces & behind their backs, the monks' growth can be expected, not their decline.

"As long as the monks are set on verbal acts of good will with regard to their companions in the holy life, to their faces & behind their backs…

"As long as the monks are set on mental acts of good will with regard to their companions in the holy life, to their faces & behind their backs…

"As long as the monks, whatever righteous gains they may obtain in a righteous way—even if only the alms in their bowls—do not consume

them alone, but consume them after sharing them in common with their virtuous companions in the holy life…

"As long as the monks—with reference to the virtues that are untorn, unbroken, unspotted, unsplattered, liberating, praised by the observant, ungrasped at, leading to concentration—dwell with their virtue in tune with that of their companions in the holy life, to their faces & behind their backs…

"And as long as the monks—with reference to the view that is noble, leading outward, that leads those who act in accordance with it to the right ending of suffering & stress—dwell with their view in tune with those of their companions in the holy life, to their faces & behind their backs, the monks' growth can be expected, not their decline.

"As long as these six conditions endure among the monks, and as long as the monks remain steadfast in these six conditions, the monks' growth can be expected, not their decline."[10]

While staying there near Rājagaha on Vulture Peak Mountain, the Blessed One often gave this Dhamma talk to the monks: "Such is virtue, such is concentration, such is discernment. Concentration nurtured with virtue is of great fruit, great reward. Discernment nurtured with concentration is of great fruit, great reward. The mind nurtured with discernment is rightly released from the effluents, i.e., the effluent of sensuality, the effluent of becoming, the effluent of ignorance."

Then the Blessed One, having stayed near Rājagaha as long as he pleased, said to Ven. Ānanda, "Come, Ānanda, we will head for Ambalaṭṭhikā."[11]

"As you say, lord," Ven. Ānanda responded to the Blessed One.

Then the Blessed One, together with a large Saṅgha of monks, went to Ambalaṭṭhikā. There he stayed near Ambalaṭṭhikā at the Royal Cottage. While staying there near Ambalaṭṭhikā at the Royal Cottage, the Blessed One often gave this Dhamma talk to the monks: "Such is virtue, such is concentration, such is discernment. Concentration nurtured with virtue is of great fruit, great reward. Discernment nurtured with concentration is of great fruit, great reward. The mind nurtured with discernment is

rightly released from the effluents, i.e., the effluent of sensuality, the effluent of becoming, the effluent of ignorance."

Then the Blessed One, having stayed near Ambalaṭṭhikā as long as he pleased, said to Ven. Ānanda, "Come, Ānanda, we will head for Nāḷandā."

"As you say, lord," Ven. Ānanda responded to the Blessed One.

Then the Blessed One, together with a large Saṅgha of monks, went to Nāḷandā. There he stayed near Nāḷandā at the Pāvādika mango grove.

Then Ven. Sāriputta went to the Blessed One and, on arrival, having bowed down to him, sat to one side. As he was sitting there, Ven. Sāriputta said to the Blessed One, "Lord, I have confidence in the Blessed One that there neither has been nor will be nor is currently found a contemplative or brahman whose direct knowledge of self-awakening is greater than that of the Blessed One!"

"Grand is this bull-statement you have spoken, Sāriputta; categorical this lion's roar you have roared: 'Lord, I have confidence in the Blessed One that there neither has been nor will be nor is currently found a contemplative or brahman whose direct knowledge of self-awakening is greater than that of the Blessed One!' So then, Sāriputta, have you encompassed with your awareness the awareness of all the worthy ones, the rightly self-awakened ones that have been in the past and known: 'Such was their virtue, such their Dhamma, such their discernment, such their (meditative) dwelling, such their release'?"

"No, lord."

"Then have you encompassed with your awareness the awareness of all the worthy ones, the rightly self-awakened ones that will be in the future and known: 'Such will be their virtue, such their Dhamma, such their discernment, such their (meditative) dwelling, such their release'?"

"No, lord."

"Then have you encompassed with your awareness *my* awareness—the awareness of the worthy one, the rightly self-awakened one in the present—and known: 'Such is his virtue, such his Dhamma, such his discernment, such his (meditative) dwelling, such his release'?"

"No, lord."

"Then, Sāriputta, if you don't have knowledge of the awareness of the worthy ones, the rightly self-awakened ones of the past, future, & present, how is it that just now you spoke this grand bull-statement and roared this categorical lion's roar: 'Lord, I have confidence in the Blessed One that there neither has been nor will be nor is currently found a contemplative or brahman whose direct knowledge of self-awakening is greater than that of the Blessed One'?"

"Lord, I don't have knowledge of the awareness of the worthy ones, the rightly self-awakened ones of the past, future, & present, but I have known the consistency of the Dhamma. It's as if there were a royal frontier city with strong ramparts, strong walls & arches, and a single gate. In it would be a wise, competent, & intelligent gatekeeper to keep out those he didn't know and to let in those he did. Walking along the path encircling the city, he wouldn't see a crack or an opening in the walls big enough for even a cat to slip through. The thought would occur to him: 'Whatever large creatures enter or leave the city all enter or leave it through this gate.'[12]

"In the same way, I have known the consistency of the Dhamma: 'All those who were worthy ones, the rightly self-awakened ones in the past awoke to the unexcelled right self-awakening after having abandoned the five hindrances—those defilements of awareness that weaken discernment—having well-established their minds in the four establishings of mindfulness and having developed, as they have come to be, the seven factors for awakening. All those who will be worthy ones, the rightly self-awakened ones in the future will awaken to the unexcelled right self-awakening after having abandoned the five hindrances—those defilements of awareness that weaken discernment—having well-established their minds in the four establishings of mindfulness and having developed, as they have come to be, the seven factors for awakening. The Blessed One who is now the worthy one, the rightly self-awakened one has awakened to the unexcelled right self-awakening after having abandoned the five hindrances—those defilements of awareness that weaken discernment—having well-established his mind in the four establishings of mindfulness and having developed, as they have come to be, the seven factors for awakening."

While staying there near Nāḷandā at the Pāvādika mango grove, the Blessed One often gave this Dhamma talk to the monks: "Such is virtue, such is concentration, such is discernment. Concentration nurtured with virtue is of great fruit, great reward. Discernment nurtured with concentration is of great fruit, great reward. The mind nurtured with discernment is rightly released from the effluents, i.e., the effluent of sensuality, the effluent of becoming, the effluent of ignorance."

Then the Blessed One, having stayed near Nāḷandā as long as he pleased, said to Ven. Ānanda, "Come, Ānanda, we will head for Pāṭali Village."

"As you say, lord," Ven. Ānanda responded to the Blessed One.

Then the Blessed One, together with a large Saṅgha of monks, went to Pāṭali Village.[13] The lay followers of Pāṭali Village heard, "The Blessed One, they say, has reached Pāṭali Village." So they went to the Blessed One and, on arrival, having bowed down to him, sat to one side. As they were sitting there, they said to him, "Lord, may the Blessed One acquiesce to (the use of) the rest-house hall."

The Blessed One acquiesced with silence. Sensing his acquiescence, the lay followers of Pāṭali Village got up from their seats and, bowing down to him and circumambulating him, went to the rest-house hall. On arrival, they spread it all over with felt rugs, arranged seats, set out a water vessel, and raised an oil lamp. Then they went to the Blessed One and, on arrival, having bowed down to him, stood to one side. As they were standing there, they said to him, "Lord, the rest-house hall has been covered all over with felt rugs, seats have been arranged, a water vessel has been set out, and an oil lamp raised. May the Blessed One do what he thinks it is now time to do."

So the Blessed One, in the evening,[14] after adjusting his lower robe and taking his bowl & outer robe, went together with the Saṅgha of monks to the rest-house hall. On arrival he washed his feet, entered the hall, and sat with his back to the central post, facing east. The Saṅgha of monks washed their feet, entered the hall, and sat with their backs to the western wall, facing east, ranged around the Blessed One.

The lay followers of Pāṭali Village washed their feet, entered the hall, and sat with their backs to the eastern wall, facing west, ranged around

the Blessed One.

Then the Blessed One addressed the lay followers of Pāṭali Village, "Householders, there are these five drawbacks coming from an unvirtuous person's defect in virtue. Which five?

"There is the case where an unvirtuous person, defective in virtue, by reason of heedlessness undergoes the loss/confiscation of great wealth. This is the first drawback coming from an unvirtuous person's defect in virtue.

"And further, the bad reputation of the unvirtuous person, defective in virtue, gets spread about. This is the second drawback coming from an unvirtuous person's defect in virtue.

"And further, whatever assembly the unvirtuous person, defective in virtue, approaches—whether of noble warriors, brahmans, householders, or contemplatives—he/she does so without confidence & abashed. This is the third drawback coming from an unvirtuous person's defect in virtue.

"And further, the unvirtuous person, defective in virtue, dies confused. This is the fourth drawback coming from an unvirtuous person's defect in virtue.

"And further, the unvirtuous person, defective in virtue—on the break-up of the body, after death—reappears in a plane of deprivation, a bad destination, a lower realm, hell. This is the fifth drawback coming from an unvirtuous person's defect in virtue.

"These, householders, are the five drawbacks coming from an unvirtuous person's defect in virtue.

"Householders, there are these five rewards coming from a virtuous person's consummation in virtue. Which five?

"There is the case where a virtuous person, consummate in virtue, by reason of heedfulness acquires a great mass of wealth. This is the first reward coming from a virtuous person's consummation in virtue.

"And further, the fine reputation of the virtuous person, consummate in virtue, gets spread about. This is the second reward coming from a virtuous person's consummation in virtue.

"And further, whatever assembly the virtuous person, consummate in virtue, approaches—whether of noble warriors, brahmans, householders, or contemplatives—he/she does so with confidence & unabashed. This is the third reward coming from a virtuous person's consummation in virtue.

"And further, the virtuous person, consummate in virtue, dies unconfused. This is the fourth reward coming from a virtuous person's consummation in virtue.

"And further, the virtuous person, consummate in virtue—on the break-up of the body, after death—reappears in a good destination, a heavenly world. This is the fifth reward coming from a virtuous person's consummation in virtue.

"These, householders, are the five rewards coming from a virtuous person's consummation in virtue."

Then the Blessed One—having instructed, urged, roused, & encouraged the lay followers of Pāṭali Village for a large part of the night with Dhamma talk—dismissed them, saying, "The night is far gone, householders. Do what you think it is now time to do."

Responding, "As you say, lord," to the Blessed One, the lay followers of Pāṭali Village got up from their seats and, bowing down to him and circumambulating him, left. Then the Blessed One, not long after they had left, entered an empty building.

Now on that occasion, Sunidha & Vassakāra, the chief ministers of Magadha, were building a city at Pāṭali Village to preempt the Vajjians. And on that occasion many devas by the thousands were occupying sites in Pāṭali Village. In the area where devas of great influence occupied sites, there the minds of the king's royal ministers of great influence were inclined to build their homes. In the area where devas of middling influence occupied sites, there the minds of the king's royal ministers of middling influence were inclined to build their homes. In the area where devas of low influence occupied sites, there the minds of the king's royal ministers of low influence were inclined to build their homes.

The Blessed One, with the divine eye—purified and surpassing the human—saw those devas by the thousands occupying sites in Pāṭali

Village.

Then, getting up in the last watch of the night, the Blessed One addressed Ven. Ānanda, "Ānanda, who is building a city at Pāṭali Village?"

"Sunidha & Vassakāra, the chief ministers of Magadha, lord, are building a city at Pāṭali Village to preempt the Vajjians."

"Ānanda, it's as if they had consulted the Devas of the Thirty-three: That's how Sunidha & Vassakāra, the chief ministers of Magadha, are building a city at Pāṭali Village to preempt the Vajjians.

"Just now, Ānanda—with the divine eye—purified and surpassing the human—I saw many devas by the thousands occupying sites in Pāṭali Village. In the area where devas of great influence occupy sites, there the minds of the king's royal ministers of great influence are inclined to build their homes. In the area where devas of middling influence occupy sites, there the minds of the king's royal ministers of middling influence are inclined to build their homes. In the area where devas of low influence occupy sites, there the minds of the king's royal ministers of low influence are inclined to build their homes.

"Ānanda, as far as the sphere of the Ariyans extends, as far as merchants' roads extend, this will be the supreme city: Pāṭaliputta,[15] where the seedpods of the Pāṭali plant break open. There will be three dangers for Pāṭaliputta: from fire, from water, or from the breaking of alliances."

Then Sunidha & Vassakāra, the chief ministers of Magadha, went to the Blessed One and, on arrival, exchanged courteous greetings with him. After an exchange of friendly greetings & courtesies, they stood to one side. As they were standing there, they said to him, "May Master Gotama acquiesce to our meal today, together with the Saṅgha of monks." The Blessed One acquiesced with silence.

Then Sunidha & Vassakāra, the chief ministers of Magadha, understanding the Blessed One's acquiescence, went to their rest-house. On arrival, after having exquisite staple & non-staple food prepared in their rest-house, they announced the time to the Blessed One: "It's time, Master Gotama. The meal is ready."

Then the Blessed One, early in the morning, adjusted his lower robe and—taking his bowl & outer robe—went together with the Saṅgha of

monks to the rest-house of Sunidha & Vassakāra, the chief ministers of Magadha. On arrival, he sat down on the seat laid out. Sunidha & Vassakāra, with their own hands, served & satisfied the Saṅgha of monks, with the Buddha at its head, with exquisite staple & non-staple food. Then, when the Blessed One had finished his meal and had rinsed his bowl & hands, Sunidha & Vassakāra, taking a low seat, sat to one side. As they were sitting there, the Blessed One gave his approval with these verses:

In whatever place
a wise person makes his dwelling,
—there providing food
for the virtuous,
the restrained,
leaders of the holy life—
he should dedicate that offering
to the devas there.

They, receiving honor, will honor him;
being respected, will show him respect.
As a result, they will feel sympathy for him,
like that of a mother for her child, her son.
A person with whom the devas sympathize
always meets with auspicious things.

Then the Blessed One, having given his approval to Sunidha & Vassakāra with these verses, got up from his seat and left. And on that occasion, Sunidha & Vassakāra followed right after the Blessed One, (thinking,) "By whichever gate Gotama the contemplative departs today, that will be called the Gotama Gate. And by whichever ford he crosses over the Ganges River, that will be called the Gotama Ford."

So the gate by which the Blessed One departed was called the Gotama Gate. Then he went to the Ganges River. Now on that occasion the Ganges River was full up to the banks, so that a crow could drink from it. Some people were searching for boats; some were searching for floats; some were binding rafts in hopes of going from this shore to the other. So the Blessed One—just as a strong man might extend his flexed arm or flex his extended arm—disappeared from the near bank of the Ganges River

and reappeared on the far bank together with the Saṅgha of monks. He saw that some people were searching for boats; some were searching for floats; some were binding rafts in hopes of going from this shore to the other.

Then, on realizing the significance of that, the Blessed One on that occasion exclaimed:

> Those
> who cross the foaming flood,
> having made a bridge, avoiding the swamps
> —while people are binding rafts—
> intelligent people
> have already crossed.

[ II ]

Then the Blessed One said to Ven. Ānanda, "Come, Ānanda, we will head for Koṭi Village."

"As you say, lord," Ven. Ānanda responded to the Blessed One.

Then the Blessed One, together with a large Saṅgha of monks, went to Koṭi Village. There he stayed near Koṭi Village.

And there he addressed the monks: "It's through not awakening to or penetrating four noble truths, monks, that we have transmigrated and wandered on for such a long time, you & I. Which four?

"It's through not awakening to or penetrating the noble truth of stress that we have transmigrated and wandered on for such a long time, you & I. It's through not awakening to or penetrating the noble truth of the origination of stress… It's through not awakening to or penetrating the noble truth of the cessation of stress… It's through not awakening to or penetrating the noble truth of the path of practice leading to cessation of stress that we have transmigrated and wandered on for such a long time, you & I.

"(But now,) this noble truth of stress has been awakened to & penetrated, the noble truth of the origination of stress has been awakened to & penetrated, the noble truth of the cessation of stress has been

awakened to & penetrated, the noble truth of the path of practice leading to cessation of stress has been awakened to & penetrated. Craving for becoming has been crushed; the guide to becoming [i.e., clinging] is ended. There now is no further-becoming."

That is what the Blessed One said. Having said it, the Teacher, the One Well-Gone, said further:

> From lack of vision
> of the four noble truths,
> we have wandered a long time
> simply in these births & those.
> These are now seen,
> the guide to becoming is removed,
> crushed is the root of suffering & stress.
> There is now no further-becoming.

While staying there near Koṭi Village, the Blessed One often gave this Dhamma talk to the monks: "Such is virtue, such is concentration, such is discernment. Concentration nurtured with virtue is of great fruit, great reward. Discernment nurtured with concentration is of great fruit, great reward. The mind nurtured with discernment is rightly released from the effluents, i.e., the effluent of sensuality, the effluent of becoming, the effluent of ignorance."

Then the Blessed One, having stayed near Koṭi Village as long as he pleased, said to Ven. Ānanda, "Come, Ānanda, we will head for Nādikā."

"As you say, lord," Ven. Ānanda responded to the Blessed One.

Then the Blessed One, together with a large Saṅgha of monks, went to Nādikā. There he stayed near Nādikā at the Brick Hall.

Then Ven. Ānanda went to the Blessed One and, on arrival, having bowed down to him, sat to one side. As he was sitting there, Ven. Ānanda said to the Blessed One, "Lord, the monk named Sāḷha has died in Nādikā. What is his destination, what his future state? The nun named Nandā has died in Nādikā. What is her destination, what her future state? The male lay-follower named Sudatta has died in Nādikā. What is his destination, what his future state? The female lay-follower named Sujātā has died in Nādikā. What is her destination, what her future state? The male lay-

follower named Kakudha… Kāraḷimbha… Nikaṭa… Kaṭissaha… Tuṭṭha… Santuṭṭha… Bhaṭa… Subhaṭa has died in Nādikā. What is his destination, what his future state?"

"Ānanda, the monk Sāḷha, with the ending of effluents, dwelt in the effluent-free awareness-release and discernment-release, having directly known and realized them for himself right in the here-and-now. The nun Nandā, with the ending of the five lower fetters,[16] has spontaneously arisen (in the Pure Abodes,) there to be totally unbound, destined never again to return from that world. Sudatta the male lay-follower, with the ending of [the first] three fetters, and with the attenuation of passion, aversion, & delusion, is a once-returner, who—on returning only once more to this world—will put an end to stress. Sujātā the female lay-follower, with the ending of [the first] three fetters, is a stream-winner, never again destined for states of destitution, certain, headed for self-awakening. Kakudha the male lay-follower… Kāraḷimbha… Nikaṭa… Kaṭissaha… Tuṭṭha… Santuṭṭha… Bhaṭa… Subhaṭa the male lay-follower, with the ending of the five lower fetters, have spontaneously arisen (in the Pure Abodes,) there to be totally unbound, destined never again to return from that world.

"Ānanda, more than 50 lay-followers who have died in Nādikā, with the ending of the five lower fetters, have spontaneously arisen (in the Pure Abodes,) there to be totally unbound, destined never again to return from that world. 96 lay-followers who have died in Nādikā, with the ending of [the first] three fetters, and with the attenuation of passion, aversion, & delusion, are once-returners, who—on returning only once more to this world—will put an end to stress. 510 lay-followers who have died in Nādikā, with the ending of [the first] three fetters, are stream-winners, never again destined for states of destitution, certain, headed for self-awakening.

"It's not amazing, Ānanda, that anyone who has become a human being would die. But if with every death you approach the Tathāgata and ask about this matter, that would be wearisome for him.

"Therefore, Ānanda, I will teach you the Dhamma-discourse called the Dhamma-mirror, endowed with which a disciple of the noble ones, if he/she so desires, may predict for him or herself: 'Hell is ended for me;

animal wombs are ended; the state of the hungry ghosts is ended; planes of deprivation, the bad destinations, the lower realms are ended! I am a stream-winner, never again destined for the lower realms, certain, headed for self-awakening!'

"And what is the Dhamma-mirror Dhamma-discourse, endowed with which a disciple of the noble ones, if he/she so desires, may predict for him or herself: 'Hell is ended for me; animal wombs are ended; the state of the hungry ghosts is ended; planes of deprivation, the bad destinations, the lower realms are ended! I am a stream-winner, never again destined for the lower realms, certain, headed for self-awakening'?

"There is the case where the disciple of the noble ones is endowed with verified confidence in the Awakened One: 'Indeed, the Blessed One is worthy & rightly self-awakened, consummate in clear-knowing & conduct, well-gone, an expert with regard to the cosmos, unexcelled trainer of people fit to be tamed, teacher of devas & human beings, awakened, blessed.'

"He/she is endowed with verified confidence in the Dhamma: 'The Dhamma is well taught by the Blessed One, to be seen here & now, timeless, inviting verification, pertinent, to be experienced by the observant for themselves.'

"He/she is endowed with verified confidence in the Saṅgha: 'The Saṅgha of the Blessed One's disciples who have practiced well… who have practiced straight-forwardly… who have practiced methodically… who have practiced masterfully—in other words, the four types of noble disciples when taken as pairs, the eight when taken as individual types[17]—they are the Saṅgha of the Blessed One's disciples: deserving of gifts, deserving of hospitality, deserving of offerings, deserving of respect, the incomparable field of merit for the world.'"

"He/she is endowed with virtues that are appealing to the noble ones: untorn, unbroken, unspotted, unsplattered, liberating, praised by the observant, ungrasped at, leading to concentration.

"This, Ānanda, is the Dhamma-mirror Dhamma-discourse, endowed with which a disciple of the noble ones, if he/she so desires, may predict for him or herself: 'Hell is ended for me; animal wombs are ended; the state of the hungry ghosts is ended; planes of deprivation, the bad

destinations, the lower realms are ended! I am a stream-winner, never again destined for the lower realms, certain, headed for self-awakening!'"[18]

While staying there near Nādikā in the Brick House, the Blessed One often gave this Dhamma talk to the monks: "Such is virtue, such is concentration, such is discernment. Concentration nurtured with virtue is of great fruit, great reward. Discernment nurtured with concentration is of great fruit, great reward. The mind nurtured with discernment is rightly released from effluents, i.e., the effluent of sensuality, the effluent of becoming, the effluent of ignorance."

Then the Blessed One, having stayed near Nādikā as long as he pleased, said to Ven. Ānanda, "Come, Ānanda, we will head for Vesālī."

"As you say, lord," Ven. Ānanda responded to the Blessed One.

Then the Blessed One, together with a large Saṅgha of monks, went to Vesālī. There he stayed near Vesālī in Ambapālī's grove.

And there he addressed the monks: "Stay mindful, monks, and alert. This is our instruction to you all. And how is a monk mindful? There is the case where a monk remains focused on the body in & of itself—ardent, alert, & mindful—subduing greed & distress with reference to the world. He remains focused on feelings… mind… mental qualities in & of themselves—ardent, alert, & mindful—subduing greed & distress with reference to the world. This is how a monk is mindful.

"And how is a monk alert? When going forward & returning, he makes himself alert; when looking toward & looking away… when bending & extending his limbs… when carrying his outer cloak, his upper robe, & his bowl… when eating, drinking, chewing, & savoring… when urinating & defecating… when walking, standing, sitting, falling asleep, waking up, talking, & remaining silent, he makes himself alert. This is how a monk is alert.

"Stay mindful, monks, and alert. This is our instruction to you all."

Then Ambapālī the courtesan[19] heard, "The Blessed One, they say, has arrived at Vesālī and is staying near Vesālī in my mango *[amba]* grove!" Then, having auspicious vehicles yoked, she got into an auspicious vehicle, left Vesālī with the auspicious vehicles and drove toward her own garden [the grove]. Going in her vehicle as far as there was ground for a vehicle,

getting down from her vehicle, she approached the Blessed One on foot. On arrival, having bowed down to him, she sat to one side. As she was sitting there, the Blessed One instructed, urged, roused, & encouraged her with a talk on Dhamma. Then Ambapālī the courtesan—instructed, urged, roused, & encouraged with the Blessed One's talk on Dhamma—said to him, "Lord, may the Blessed One acquiesce to my meal tomorrow, together with the Saṅgha of monks." The Blessed One acquiesced with silence.

Then Ambapālī the courtesan, understanding the Blessed One's acquiescence, got up from her seat and, bowing down to him and circumambulating him, left.

Then the Licchavis of Vesālī heard, "The Blessed One, they say, has arrived at Vesālī and is staying near Vesālī in Ambapālī's grove!" Then, having auspicious vehicles yoked, the Licchavis got into the auspicious vehicles, and left Vesālī with the auspicious vehicles. Now, some of those Licchavis were dark blue, with dark blue complexions, dark blue clothing, & dark blue ornaments. Some of those Licchavis were yellow, with yellow complexions, yellow clothing, & yellow ornaments. Some of those Licchavis were red, with red complexions, red clothing, & red ornaments. Some of those Licchavis were white, with white complexions, white clothing, & white ornaments.

Then Ambapālī the courtesan, driving axle to axle, wheel to wheel, yoke to yoke, brought those young Licchavis to a halt. So those Licchavis said to her, "Hey, Ambapālī, what are you doing—driving axle to axle, wheel to wheel, yoke to yoke—bringing the young Licchavis to a halt?"

"Because, young masters, I have invited the Blessed One, together with the Saṅgha of monks, for tomorrow's meal!"

"Give us that meal, Ambapālī, for 100,000!"

"Even if the masters gave me Vesālī with all its revenue, I still wouldn't give up such a great meal!"

Then the Licchavis snapped their fingers: "How we've been defeated by Little Ambapālī! How we've been cheated by Little Ambapālī!"[20]

Then the Licchavis set out for Ambapālī's grove. The Blessed One saw them coming from afar and, on seeing them, he said to the monks, "Those

monks who have never before seen the Devas of the Thirty-three, look at the assembly of Licchavis! Gaze at the assembly of Licchavis! Regard the assembly of Licchavis as like the assembly of the Thirty-three!"

Then the Licchavis, going in their vehicles as far as there was ground for vehicles, got down from their vehicles and approached the Blessed One on foot. On arrival, having bowed down to him, they sat to one side. As they were sitting there, the Blessed One instructed, urged, roused, & encouraged them with a talk on Dhamma. Then the Licchavis—instructed, urged, roused, and encouraged with the Blessed One's talk on Dhamma—said to him, "Lord, may the Blessed One acquiesce to our meal tomorrow, together with the Saṅgha of monks."

"Licchavis, I have already acquiesced to Ambapālī the courtesan's meal tomorrow."

Then the Licchavis snapped their fingers: "How we've been defeated by Little Ambapālī! How we've been cheated by Little Ambapālī!"

Then the Licchavis, delighting in and approving of the Blessed One's words, got up from their seats and, bowing down to him and circumambulating him, left.

Then Ambapālī the courtesan, at the end of the night—after having exquisite staple & non-staple food prepared in her own garden—announced the time to the Blessed One: "It's time, lord. The meal is ready."

Then the Blessed One, early in the morning, adjusted his lower robe and—taking his bowl & outer robe—went together with the Saṅgha of monks to Ambapālī the courtesan's meal offering. On arrival, he sat down on the seat laid out. Ambapālī the courtesan, with her own hands, served & satisfied the Saṅgha of monks, with the Buddha at its head, with exquisite staple & non-staple food. Then, when the Blessed One had finished his meal and had rinsed his bowl & hands, Ambapālī the courtesan, taking a low seat, sat to one side. As she was sitting there, she said to the Blessed One, "Lord, I give this garden to the Saṅgha of monks with the Buddha at its head."

The the Blessed One accepted the garden. Then—having instructed, urged, roused, & encouraged Ambapālī the courtesan with a talk on

Dhamma—got up from his seat and left.

While staying there near Vesālī in Ambapālī's grove, the Blessed One often gave this Dhamma talk to the monks: "Such is virtue, such is concentration, such is discernment. Concentration nurtured with virtue is of great fruit, great reward. Discernment nurtured with concentration is of great fruit, great reward. The mind nurtured with discernment is rightly released from the effluents, i.e., the effluent of sensuality, the effluent of becoming, the effluent of ignorance."

Then the Blessed One, having stayed in Ambapālī's grove as long as he pleased, said to Ven. Ānanda, "Come, Ānanda, we will head for Veḷuva Village."

"As you say, lord," Ven. Ānanda responded to the Blessed One.

Then the Blessed One, together with a large Saṅgha of monks, went to Veḷuva Village. There he stayed near Veḷuva Village.

And there he addressed the monks: "Come, monks, enter the Rains retreat around Vesālī with your friends, acquaintances, & eating companions. As for me, I will enter the Rains retreat right here near Veḷuva Village.

Responding, "As you say, lord," to the Blessed One, the monks entered the Rains retreat around Vesālī with their friends, acquaintances, & eating companions. The Blessed One entered the Rains retreat right there near Veḷuva Village.

Then in the Blessed One, when he had entered the Rains retreat, there arose a severe disease with intense pains & deadly. But the Blessed One endured it—mindful, alert, & not struck down by it. The thought occurred to him, "It would not be proper for me to totally unbind without having addressed my attendants or taken leave of the Saṅgha of monks. Why don't I, bending back this disease with persistence, keep determining the fabrications of life?" So the Blessed One, bending back the disease with persistence, kept determining the fabrications of life. And his disease calmed down.

Then the Blessed One—having recovered from being ill, not long recovered from the illness—went out of the dwelling and sat down on a seat laid out behind the dwelling. Then Ven. Ānanda went to the Blessed

One and, on arrival, having bowed down to him, sat to one side. As he was sitting there, he said to the Blessed One, "What a happy sight to see the Blessed One's comfort! What a happy sight to see the Blessed One's being at ease! Because of the Blessed One's illness my own body felt as if it were drugged. I lost my bearings. Things were unclear to me. Yet I still took a measure of reassurance in the thought that the Blessed One would not totally unbind as long as he hadn't given at least some pronouncement concerning the Saṅgha of monks."

"What more does the Saṅgha of monks want from me, Ānanda? I have taught the Dhamma without making an inside or outside (version).[21] The Tathāgata has no closed fist with regard to teachings.[22] To whomever the thought occurs, 'I will govern the Saṅgha of monks,' or 'The Saṅgha of monks looks to me,' he should give some pronouncement concerning the Saṅgha of monks. But the thought doesn't occur to the Tathāgata that 'I will govern the Saṅgha of monks,' or 'The Saṅgha of monks looks to me.' So why should he give some pronouncement concerning the Saṅgha of monks?

"I am now aged, Ānanda: old, elderly, advanced in years, having come to the last stage of life, 80 years old. Just as an old cart is kept going with the help of bamboo strips, the Tathāgata's body is kept going with the help of bamboo strips, as it were. When the Tathāgata—not attending to any theme at all, and with the cessation of certain feelings—enters & remains in the theme-less concentration of awareness, that is when his body is more at ease.

"So, Ānanda, you should all live with yourselves as your island, yourselves as your refuge, with no other as your refuge; with the Dhamma as your island, the Dhamma as your refuge, with no other as your refuge. And how does a monk live with himself as his island, himself as his refuge, with no other as his refuge; with the Dhamma as his island, the Dhamma as his refuge, with no other as his refuge? There is the case where a monk remains focused on the body in & of itself—ardent, alert, & mindful—subduing greed & distress with reference to the world. He remains focused on feelings in & of themselves… mind in & of itself… mental qualities in & of themselves—ardent, alert, & mindful—subduing greed & distress with reference to the world. This is how a monk lives with himself as his island, himself as his refuge, with no other as his

refuge; with the Dhamma as his island, the Dhamma as his refuge, with no other as his refuge. For those who, now or when I am gone, live with themselves as their island, themselves as their refuge, with no other as their refuge; with the Dhamma as their island, the Dhamma as their refuge, not with another as their refuge, will be my foremost monks: those who are desirous of training."

[ III ]

Then the Blessed One, early in the morning, adjusted his lower robe and—taking his bowl & outer robe—went into Vesālī for alms. Then, having gone for alms in Vesālī, after the meal, returning from his alms round, he addressed Ven. Ānanda, "Get a sitting cloth, Ānanda. We will go to the Pāvāla shrine for the day's abiding."

Responding, "As you say, lord," to the Blessed One, Ven. Ānanda followed along behind the Blessed One, carrying the sitting cloth. Then the Blessed One went to the Pāvāla shrine and, on arrival, sat down on the seat laid out.

Seated, the Blessed One addressed Ven. Ānanda, "Vesālī is refreshing, Ānanda. Refreshing, too, are the Udena shrine, the Gotamaka shrine, the Sattamba shrine, the ManySon shrine, the Sāranda shrine, the Pāvāla shrine.[23]

"Anyone, Ānanda, in whom the four bases of power[24] are developed, pursued, given a means of transport, given a grounding, steadied, consolidated, and well-undertaken, could—if he wanted—remain for an eon or the remainder of an eon.[25] In the Tathāgata, Ānanda, the four bases of power are developed, pursued, given a means of transport, given a grounding, steadied, consolidated, and well-undertaken. He could—if he wanted—remain for an eon or the remainder of an eon."

But Ven. Ānanda—even when the Blessed One had given such a blatant sign, such a blatant hint—wasn't able to understand his meaning. He didn't beg of him, "Lord, may the Blessed One remain for an eon. May the One Well-Gone remain for an eon—for the benefit of the many, for the happiness of the many, out of sympathy for the world, for the welfare,

benefit, & happiness of human beings & devas." It was as if his mind were possessed by Māra.

A second time… A third time, the Blessed One addressed Ven. Ānanda, "Vesālī is refreshing, Ānanda. Refreshing, too, are the Udena shrine, the Gotamaka shrine, the Sattamba shrine, the ManySon shrine, the Sāranda shrine, the Pāvāla shrine.

"Anyone, Ānanda, in whom the four bases of power are developed, pursued, given a means of transport, given a grounding, steadied, consolidated, and well-undertaken, could—if he wanted—remain for an eon or the remainder of an eon. In the Tathāgata, Ānanda, the four bases of power are developed, pursued, given a means of transport, given a grounding, steadied, consolidated, and well-undertaken. He could—if he wanted—remain for an eon or the remainder of an eon."

But Ven. Ānanda—even when the Blessed One had given such a blatant sign, such a blatant hint—wasn't able to understand his meaning. He didn't request of him, "Lord, may the Blessed One remain for an eon. May the One Well-Gone remain for an eon—for the benefit of the many, for the happiness of the many, out of sympathy for the world, for the welfare, benefit, & happiness of human beings & devas." It was as if his mind were possessed by Māra.

Then the Blessed One addressed Ven. Ānanda, "Go, Ānanda. Do what you think it is now time to do."

Responding, "As you say, lord," to the Blessed One, Ven. Ānanda got up from his seat and, bowing down to him and circumambulating him, went to sit under a tree not far from the Blessed One.

Then, not long after Ven. Ānanda had left, Māra the Evil One went to the Blessed One and, on arrival, stood to one side. As he was standing there, he said to the Blessed One, "May the Blessed One totally unbind now, lord. May the One Well-Gone totally unbind now, lord. Now is the time for the Blessed One's total unbinding, lord. After all, these words were said by the Blessed One: 'Evil One, I will not totally unbind as long as my monk disciples are not yet experienced, trained, attained to confidence, learned, maintaining the Dhamma, practicing the Dhamma in line with the Dhamma, practicing masterfully, living in line with the Dhamma; declaring the Dhamma—after having learned it from their

own teachers—teaching it, describing it, setting it forth, revealing it, explaining it, making it plain; well-refuting, in line with the Dhamma, any opposing teachings that have arisen; teaching the Dhamma with its marvels.'[26]

"But now, lord, the Blessed One's monk disciples are experienced, trained, attained to confidence, learned, maintaining the Dhamma, practicing the Dhamma in line with the Dhamma, practicing masterfully, living in line with the Dhamma; declaring the Dhamma—after having learned it from their own teachers—teaching it, describing it, setting it forth, revealing it, explaining it, making it plain; well-refuting, in line with the Dhamma, any opposing teachings that have arisen; teaching the Dhamma with its marvels.

"May the Blessed One totally unbind now, lord. May the One Well-Gone totally unbind now, lord. Now is the time for the Blessed One's total unbinding, lord. After all, these words were said by the Blessed One: 'Evil One, I will not totally unbind as long as my nun disciples… my male lay-follower disciples… my female lay-follower disciples are not yet experienced, trained, attained to maturity, learned, maintaining the Dhamma, practicing the Dhamma in line with the Dhamma, practicing masterfully, living in line with the Dhamma; declaring the Dhamma—after having learned it from their own teachers—teaching it, describing it, setting it forth, revealing it, explaining it, making it plain; well-refuting, in line with the Dhamma, any opposing teachings that have arisen; teaching the Dhamma with its marvels.'

"But now, lord, the Blessed One's female lay-follower disciples are experienced, trained, attained to maturity, learned, maintaining the Dhamma, practicing the Dhamma in line with the Dhamma, practicing masterfully, living in line with the Dhamma; declaring the Dhamma—after having learned it from their own teachers—teaching it, describing it, setting it forth, revealing it, explaining it, making it plain; well-refuting, in line with the Dhamma, any opposing teachings that have arisen; teaching the Dhamma with its marvels.

"May the Blessed One totally unbind now, lord. May the One Well-Gone totally unbind now, lord. Now is the time for the Blessed One's total unbinding, lord. After all, these words were said by the Blessed One:

‘Evil One, I will not totally unbind as long as this holy life of mine is not powerful, prosperous, widely-spread, disseminated among many people, well-expounded as far as there are human beings & devas.’ But now, lord, the Blessed One’s holy life is powerful, prosperous, widely-spread, disseminated among many people, well-expounded as far as there are human beings & devas.

“May the Blessed One totally unbind now, lord. May the One Well-Gone totally unbind now, lord. Now is the time for the Blessed One’s total unbinding, lord.”

When this was said, the Blessed One said to Māra, the Evil One: “Relax, Evil One. It won’t be long until the Tathāgata’s total unbinding. In three months’ time from now, the Tathāgata will totally unbind.”

Thus at the Pāvāla shrine—mindful & alert—the Blessed One relinquished the fabrications of life.[27] And as the Blessed One relinquished the fabrications of life, there was a great earthquake, awesome & hair-raising, and rolls of the deva-drums split (the air).

Then, on realizing the significance of that, the Blessed One on that occasion exclaimed:

> Comparing the incomparable[28]
> with coming-into-being,
> the sage relinquished
> the fabrication of becoming.
> Inwardly joyful,
> centered,
> he split his own
> coming-into-being
> like a coat of mail.[29]

Then the thought occurred to Ven. Ānanda: “How amazing! How astounding! What a great earthquake! What a very great earthquake, awesome & hair-raising, and rolls of the deva-drums split (the air)! What is the reason, what is the cause, for the appearance of the great earthquake?”

So Ven. Ānanda went to the Blessed One and, on arrival, having bowed down to him, sat to one side. As he was sitting there, he said to the Blessed One, "How amazing, lord! How astounding! What a great earthquake! What a very great earthquake, awesome & hair-raising, and rolls of thunder split (the air)! What, lord, is the reason, what is the cause, for the appearance of the great earthquake?"

"Ānanda, there are these eight reasons, eight causes, for the appearance of a great earthquake. Which eight?

"This great earth, Ānanda, is established on water. The water is established on wind. The wind is standing on space. There comes a time when a great wind blows. The great wind blowing shakes the water. The water, shaken, shakes the earth. This is the first reason, the first cause, for the appearance of a great earthquake.

"Then, Ānanda, there comes a time when a brahman of power, with mastery of the mind, or a deva of great power, great might, has developed a limited earth-perception and an immeasurable liquid-perception. He makes this earth shake & shiver, quiver & quake. This is the second reason…

"Then, Ānanda, when the bodhisatta, falling from the Tusita group, mindful & alert, descends into his mother's womb, the earth shakes & shivers, quivers & quakes. This is the third reason…

"Then, Ānanda, when the bodhisatta, mindful & alert, emerges from his mother's womb, the earth shakes & shivers, quivers & quakes. This is the fourth reason…

"Then, Ānanda, when the Tathāgata awakens to the unexcelled right self-awakening, the earth shakes & shivers, quivers & quakes. This is the fifth reason…

"Then, Ānanda, when the Tathāgata sets rolling the unexcelled Dhamma-wheel, the earth shakes & shivers, quivers & quakes. This is the sixth reason…

"Then, Ānanda, when the Tathāgata, mindful & alert, relinquishes the fabrications of life, the earth shakes & shivers, quivers & quakes. This is the seventh reason…

"Then, Ānanda, when the Tathāgata, by means of the unbinding property with no fuel remaining, totally unbinds,[30] the earth shakes & shivers, quivers & quakes. This is the eighth reason, the eighth cause, for the appearance of a great earthquake.

"These are the eight reasons, the eight causes, for the appearance of a great earthquake.

"Ānanda, there are these eight assemblies. Which eight? A noble warrior assembly, a brahman assembly, a householder assembly, a contemplative assembly, a Four Great Kings assembly, a (Devas of the) Thirty-three assembly, a Māra assembly, a Brahmā assembly.

"I can remember approaching many hundreds of noble warrior assemblies. There—before seating myself, before talking, before engaging in conversation—whatever sort of appearance they had, that was the sort of appearance I had; whatever sort of accent they had, that was the sort of accent I had. And I instructed, urged, roused, & encouraged them with Dhamma talk. While I was speaking, they didn't know me: 'Who is this who speaks—a deva or a human being?' Having instructed, urged, roused, & encouraged them with Dhamma talk, I disappeared. When I had disappeared, they didn't know me: 'Who is this who disappeared—a deva or a human being?'

"I can remember approaching many hundreds of brahman assemblies… many hundreds of householder assemblies… many hundreds of contemplative assemblies… many hundreds of Four Great King assemblies… many hundreds of (Devas of the) Thirty-three assemblies… many hundreds of Māra assemblies…

"I can remember approaching many hundreds of Brahmā assemblies. There—before seating myself, before talking, before engaging in conversation—whatever sort of appearance they had, that was the sort of appearance I had; whatever sort of accent they had, that was the sort of accent I had. And I instructed, urged, roused, & encouraged them with Dhamma talk. While I was speaking, they didn't know me: 'Who is this person who speaks—a deva or a human being?' Having instructed, urged, roused, & encouraged them with Dhamma talk, I disappeared. When I had disappeared, they didn't know me: 'Who is this who disappeared—a deva or a human being?'

"Ānanda, there are these eight dimensions of (mental) mastery. Which eight?

"Having a single perception of form internally, one sees forms externally as limited, beautiful & ugly. Mastering them, one has the perception, 'I know; I see.' This is the first dimension of (mental) mastery.

"Having a single perception of form internally, one sees forms externally as immeasurable, beautiful & ugly. Mastering them, one has the perception, 'I know; I see.' This is the second dimension of (mental) mastery.

"Having a single formless perception internally, one sees forms externally as limited, beautiful & ugly. Mastering them, one has the perception, 'I know; I see.' This is the third dimension of (mental) mastery.

"Having a single formless perception internally, one sees forms externally as immeasurable, beautiful & ugly. Mastering them, one has the perception, 'I know; I see.' This is the fourth dimension of (mental) mastery.

"Having a single formless perception internally, one sees forms externally as blue, blue in their color, blue in their features, blue in their glow. Just as a flax-flower is blue, blue in its color, blue in its features, blue in its glow, or just as Bārāṇasī muslin, smooth on both sides, is blue, blue in its color, blue in its features, blue in its glow; in the same way, having a single formless perception internally, one sees forms externally as blue, blue in their color, blue in their features, blue in their glow. Mastering them, one has the perception, 'I know; I see.' This is the fifth dimension of (mental) mastery.

"Having a single formless perception internally, one sees forms externally as yellow, yellow in their color, yellow in their features, yellow in their glow. Just as a kaṇṇikāra flower is yellow, yellow in its color, yellow in its features, yellow in its glow, or just as Bārāṇasī muslin, smooth on both sides, is yellow, yellow in its color, yellow in its features, yellow in its glow; in the same way, having a single formless perception internally, one sees forms externally as yellow, yellow in their color, yellow in their features, yellow in their glow. Mastering them, one has the perception, 'I know; I see.' This is the sixth dimension of (mental) mastery.

“Having a single formless perception internally, one sees forms externally as red, red in their color, red in their features, red in their glow. Just as a bandhu-jīvaka flower is red, red in its color, red in its features, red in its glow, or just as Bārāṇasī muslin, smooth on both sides, is red, red in its color, red in its features, red in its glow; in the same way, having a single formless perception internally, one sees forms externally as red, red in their color, red in their features, red in their glow. Mastering them, one has the perception, ‘I know; I see.’ This is the seventh dimension of (mental) mastery.

“Having a single formless perception internally, one sees forms externally as white, white in their color, white in their features, white in their glow. Just as the morning star is white, white in its color, white in its features, white in its glow, or just as Bārāṇasī muslin, smooth on both sides, is white, white in its color, white in its features, white in its glow; in the same way, having a single formless perception internally, one sees forms externally as white, white in their color, white in their features, white in their glow. Mastering them, one has the perception, ‘I know; I see.’ This is the eighth dimension of (mental) mastery.

“These, Ānanda, are the eight dimensions of (mental) mastery.[31]

“Ānanda, there are these eight emancipations. Which eight?

“Possessed of form, one sees forms. This is the first emancipation.

“Not percipient of form internally, one sees forms externally. This is the second emancipation.

“One is intent only on the beautiful. This is the third emancipation.

“With the complete transcending of perceptions of (physical) form, with the disappearance of perceptions of resistance, and not heeding perceptions of multiplicity, (perceiving,) ‘Infinite space,’ one enters and remains in the dimension of the infinitude of space. This is the fourth emancipation.

“With the complete transcending of the dimension of the infinitude of space, (perceiving,) ‘Infinite consciousness,’ one enters and remains in the dimension of the infinitude of consciousness. This is the fifth emancipation.

"With the complete transcending of the dimension of the infinitude of consciousness, (perceiving,) 'There is nothing,' one enters and remains in the dimension of nothingness. This is the sixth emancipation.

"With the complete transcending of the dimension of nothingness, one enters and remains in the dimension of neither perception nor non-perception. This is the seventh emancipation.

"With the complete transcending of the dimension of neither perception nor non-perception, one enters and remains in the cessation of perception and feeling. This is the eighth emancipation.

"These, Ānanda, are the eight emancipations.[32]

"One time, Ānanda, I was staying in Uruvelā on the bank of the Nerañjarā River at the Goat-herd Banyan, newly awakened. Then Māra, the Evil One, approached me and, on arrival, stood to one side. As he was standing there, he said to me, 'May the Blessed One totally unbind now, lord. May the One Well-Gone totally unbind now, lord. Now is the time for the Blessed One's total unbinding, lord.'

"When this was said, I said to Māra, the Evil One, 'Evil One, I will not totally unbind as long as my monk disciples are not yet experienced, trained, attained to confidence, learned, maintaining the Dhamma, practicing the Dhamma in line with the Dhamma, practicing masterfully, living in line with the Dhamma; declaring the Dhamma—after having learned it from their own teachers—teaching it, describing it, setting it forth, revealing it, explaining it, making it plain; well-refuting, in line with the Dhamma, any opposing teachings that have arisen; teaching the Dhamma with its marvels.'

"'Evil One, I will not totally unbind as long as my nun disciples… my male lay-follower disciples… my female lay-follower disciples are not yet experienced, trained, attained to maturity, learned, maintaining the Dhamma, practicing the Dhamma in line with the Dhamma, practicing masterfully, living in line with the Dhamma; declaring the Dhamma—after having learned it from their own teachers—teaching it, describing it, setting it forth, revealing it, explaining it, making it plain; well-refuting, in line with the Dhamma, any opposing teachings that have arisen; teaching the Dhamma with its marvels.

"'Evil One, I will not totally unbind as long as this holy life of mine is not powerful, prosperous, widely-spread, disseminated among many people, well-expounded as far as there are human beings & devas.'

"And just now, Ānanda, (here) at the Pāvāla Shrine, Māra the Evil One approached me and, on arrival, stood to one side. As he was standing here, he said to me, 'May the Blessed One totally unbind now, lord. May the One Well-Gone totally unbind now, lord. Now is the time for the Blessed One's total unbinding, lord. After all, these words were said by the Blessed One: "Evil One, I will not totally unbind as long as my monk disciples are not yet experienced, as long as my nun disciples… my male lay-follower disciples… my female lay-follower disciples are not yet experienced… as long as this holy life of mine is not powerful, prosperous, widely-spread, disseminated among many people, well-expounded as far as there are human beings & devas." But now, lord, the Blessed One's holy life is powerful, prosperous, widely-spread, disseminated among many people, well-expounded as far as there are human beings & devas.

"'May the Blessed One totally unbind now, lord. May the One Well-Gone totally unbind now, lord. Now is the time for the Blessed One's total unbinding, lord.'

"When this was said, I said to Māra, the Evil One: 'Relax, Evil One. It won't be long until the Tathāgata's total unbinding. In three months' time from now, the Tathāgata will totally unbind.'

"Just now, Ānanda, here at the Pāvāla shrine—mindful & alert—I relinquished the fabrications of life."

When this was said, Ven. Ānanda said to the Blessed One, "Lord, may the Blessed One remain for an eon. May the One Well-Gone remain for an eon—for the benefit of the many, for the happiness of the many, out of sympathy for the world, for the welfare, benefit, & happiness of human beings & devas."

"Enough, now, Ānanda. Don't beg the Tathāgata. Now is not the time for begging the Tathāgata."

A second time… A third time, Ven. Ānanda said to the Blessed One, "Lord, may the Blessed One remain for an eon. May the One Well-Gone remain for an eon—for the benefit of the many, for the happiness of the

many, out of sympathy for the world, for the welfare, benefit, & happiness of human beings & devas."

"Ānanda, do you have conviction in the Tathāgata's awakening?"

"Yes, lord."

"Then why, Ānanda, do you harass the Tathāgata up to three times?"

"Face-to-face with the Blessed One have I heard this, face-to-face have I received this: 'Anyone, Ānanda, in whom the four bases of power are developed, pursued, given a means of transport, given a grounding, steadied, consolidated, and well-undertaken, could—if he wanted—remain for an eon or the remainder of an eon. In the Tathāgata, Ānanda, the four bases of power are developed, pursued, given a means of transport, given a grounding, steadied, consolidated, and well-undertaken. He could—if he wanted—remain for an eon or the remainder of an eon.'"

"Ānanda, do you have conviction in the Tathāgata's awakening?"

"Yes, lord."

"Then the wrong-doing is yours, Ānanda. Yours the mistake, in that—even when the Tathāgata had given such a blatant sign, such a blatant hint—you weren't able to understand his meaning. You didn't beg of the Tathāgata, 'Lord, may the Blessed One remain for an eon. May the One Well-Gone remain for an eon—for the benefit of the many, for the happiness of the many, out of sympathy for the world, for the welfare, benefit, & happiness of human beings & devas.' If you had begged the Tathāgata two times, the Tathāgata would have refused, but after the third time he would have acquiesced. The wrong-doing is yours, Ānanda. Yours the mistake.

"On one occasion, Ānanda, I was staying near Rājagaha, on Vulture Peak Mountain. There I addressed you, 'Vulture Peak mountain is refreshing, Ānanda. Anyone, Ānanda, in whom the four bases of power are developed, pursued, given a means of transport, given a grounding, steadied, consolidated, and well-undertaken, could—if he wanted—remain for an eon or the remainder of an eon. In the Tathāgata, Ānanda, the four bases of power are developed, pursued, given a means of transport, given a grounding, steadied, consolidated, and well-undertaken. He could—if he wanted—remain for an eon or the remainder of an eon.'

But you, Ānanda—even when the Tathāgata had given such a blatant sign, such a blatant hint—weren't able to understand his meaning. You didn't beg of the Tathāgata, 'Lord, may the Blessed One remain for an eon. May the One Well-Gone remain for an eon—for the benefit of the many, for the happiness of the many, out of sympathy for the world, for the welfare, benefit, & happiness of human beings & devas.' If you had begged the Tathāgata two times, the Tathāgata would have refused, but after the third time he would have acquiesced. The wrong-doing is yours, Ānanda. Yours the mistake.

"On one occasion, Ānanda, I was staying right there near Rājagaha at the Gotama Banyan tree… right there near Rājagaha at Robbers Cliff… right there near Rājagaha in Sattapaṇṇa Cave… right there near Rājagaha at the Black Rock on Isigili Mountain… right there near Rājagaha under the rock overhang at Serpents Water Hole in the Cool Forest… right there near Rājagaha at Tapodā Park… right there near Rājagaha at the Bamboo Forest, the Squirrels' Feeding Ground… right there near Rājagaha at Jīvaka's Mango Grove… right there near Rājagaha at the Maddakucchi Deer Park. There, too, I addressed you, 'Rājagaha is refreshing, Ānanda. Refreshing, too, are Vulture Peak Mountain, the Gotama Banyan tree, Robbers Cliff, Sattapaṇṇa Cave, the Black Rock on Isigili Mountain, the rock overhang at Serpents Water Hole in the Cool Forest, Tapodā Park, the Bamboo Forest, the Squirrels' Feeding Ground, Jīvaka's Mango Grove, the Maddakucchi Deer Park. Anyone, Ānanda, in whom the four bases of power are developed, pursued, given a means of transport, given a grounding, steadied, consolidated, and well-undertaken, could—if he wanted—remain for an eon or the remainder of an eon. In the Tathāgata, Ānanda, the four bases of power are developed, pursued, given a means of transport, given a grounding, steadied, consolidated, and well-undertaken. He could—if he wanted—remain for an eon or the remainder of an eon.' But you, Ānanda—even when the Tathāgata had given such a blatant sign, such a blatant hint—weren't able to understand his meaning. You didn't beg of the Tathāgata, 'Lord, may the Blessed One remain for an eon. May the One Well-Gone remain for an eon—for the benefit of the many, for the happiness of the many, out of sympathy for the world, for the welfare, benefit, & happiness of human beings & devas.' If you had begged the Tathāgata two times, the Tathāgata would have refused, but after the third

time he would have acquiesced. The wrong-doing is yours, Ānanda. Yours the mistake.

"On one occasion, Ānanda, I was staying right here in Vesālī at the Udena shrine… the Gotamaka shrine… the Sattamba shrine… the ManySon shrine… the Sāranda shrine…

"And just now, Ānanda, (here) at Pāvāla Shrine, I addressed you today: 'Vesālī is refreshing, Ānanda. Refreshing, too, are the Udena shrine, the Gotamaka shrine, the Sattamba shrine, the ManySon shrine, the Sāranda shrine, the Pāvāla shrine. Anyone, Ānanda, in whom the four bases of power are developed, pursued, given a means of transport, given a grounding, steadied, consolidated, and well-undertaken, could—if he wanted—remain for an eon or the remainder of an eon. In the Tathāgata, Ānanda, the four bases of power are developed, pursued, given a means of transport, given a grounding, steadied, consolidated, and well-undertaken. He could—if he wanted—remain for an eon or the remainder of an eon.' But you, Ānanda—even when the Tathāgata had given such a blatant sign, such a blatant hint—weren't able to understand his meaning. You didn't beg of the Tathāgata, 'Lord, may the Blessed One remain for an eon. May the One Well-Gone remain for an eon—for the benefit of the many, for the happiness of the many, out of sympathy for the world, for the welfare, benefit, & happiness of human beings & devas.' If you had begged the Tathāgata two times, the Tathāgata would have refused, but after the third time he would have acquiesced. The wrong-doing is yours, Ānanda. Yours the mistake.

"But then, Ānanda, haven't I—cautioning—pointed out different-becoming, separate-becoming, otherwise-becoming of all that is dear & appealing? What else is there to expect? That of anything born, become, fabricated, subject to disintegration, you might say, 'O, may it not disintegrate'? The possibility doesn't exist. And that is what the Tathāgata has gotten rid of, vomited up, released, abandoned, forfeited. It was with the fabrications of life relinquished that this categorical statement was spoken: 'It won't be long until the Tathāgata's total unbinding. In three months' time from now, the Tathāgata will totally unbind.' For the Tathāgata, for the sake of life, to rescind that: The possibility doesn't exist.

"Come, now, Ānanda. We will head for the Gabled Hall in the Great Forest."

"As you say, lord," Ven. Ānanda responded to the Blessed One.

Then the Blessed One together with Ven. Ānanda went to the Great Forest and to the Gabled Hall. On arrival, the Blessed One said to Ven. Ānanda, "Go, Ānanda. Have all the monks living in dependence on Vesālī gather at the assembly hall."

Responding, "As you say, lord," to the Blessed One, Ven. Ānanda—having had all the monks living in dependence on Vesālī gather at the assembly hall—approached the Blessed One. On arrival, having bowed down to him, he stood to one side. As he was standing there, he said to the Blessed One, "The Saṅgha of monks has gathered, lord. May the Blessed One do what he thinks it is now time to do."

Then the Blessed One went to the assembly hall and, on arrival, sat down on the seat laid out. Having sat down, he addressed the monks: "Monks, the qualities I have taught, having known them directly: You should grasp them thoroughly, cultivate them, develop them, & pursue them so that this holy life may long endure & remain steadfast for the benefit, welfare, & happiness of the multitude, out of sympathy for the world, for the benefit, welfare, & happiness of human beings & devas. And which are the qualities I have taught… for the benefit, welfare, & happiness of human beings & devas? The four establishings of mindfulness, the four right exertions, the four bases of power, the five faculties, the five strengths, the seven factors for awakening, the noble eightfold path.[33] These are the qualities I have taught, having known them directly, that you should grasp thoroughly, cultivate, develop, & pursue so that this holy life may long endure & remain steadfast for the benefit, welfare, & happiness of the multitude, out of sympathy for the world, for the benefit, welfare, & happiness of human beings & devas."

Then the Blessed One addressed the monks, 'I exhort you, monks: All fabrications are subject to decay. Reach consummation through heedfulness.[34] It won't be long until the Tathāgata's total unbinding. In three months' time from now, the Tathāgata will totally unbind."

That is what the Blessed One said. Having said that, the One Well-Gone said further:

Young & old
wise & foolish
rich & poor:
        all end up dying.
As a potter's clay vessels
        large & small
        fired & unfired
all end up broken,
        so too life
        heads to death.

Then the Teacher said further:

Ripe my age, little the life
        remaining to me.
Leaving you, I will go,
having made my refuge
        for myself.
Be heedful, monks,
        mindful, virtuous.
With your resolves well-concentrated,
        look after your minds.
        He who, in this
        Dhamma & Vinaya,
        remains heedful,
        leaving the wandering-on
                through birth,
        will make an end
                of stress.

[ IV ]

Then the Blessed One, early in the morning, adjusted his lower robe and—taking his bowl & outer robe—went into Vesālī for alms. Having gone for alms in Vesālī, after the meal, returning from his alms round, gazing on Vesālī with an elephant's look, he addressed Ven. Ānanda: "Ānanda, this is the Tathāgata's last look at Vesālī. Come, Ānanda, we will head for Bhaṇḍa Village.

"As you say, lord," Ven. Ānanda responded to the Blessed One.

Then the Blessed One, together with a large Saṅgha of monks, went to Bhaṇḍa Village. There the Blessed One stayed near Bhaṇḍa Village.

And there he addressed the monks, "It's through not awakening to or penetrating four qualities, monks, that we have transmigrated and wandered on for such a long time, you & I. Which four?

"It's through not awakening to or penetrating noble virtue that we have transmigrated and wandered on for such a long time, you & I. It's through not awakening to or penetrating noble concentration… It's through not awakening to or penetrating noble discernment… It's through not awakening to or penetrating noble release that we have transmigrated and wandered on for such a long time, you & I.

"(But now,) this noble virtue has been awakened to & penetrated, noble concentration has been awakened to & penetrated, noble discernment has been awakened to & penetrated, noble release has been awakened to & penetrated. Craving for becoming has been crushed, the guide to becoming [i.e., craving] is ended. There now is no further-becoming."

That is what the Blessed One said. Having said it, the Teacher, the One Well-Gone, said further:

> Virtue, concentration, discernment,
> and unexcelled release:
> These qualities have been awakened to
> by Gotama, the prestigious.
> Directly knowing this, he shows it to the monks—
> the awakened one,
> the teacher who has made an ending of stress,
> the one with eyes,
> totally unbound.

While staying there at Bhaṇḍa Village, the Blessed One often gave this Dhamma talk to the monks: "Such is virtue, such is concentration, such is discernment. Concentration nurtured with virtue is of great fruit, great reward. Discernment nurtured with concentration is of great fruit, great reward. The mind nurtured with discernment is rightly released from the

effluents, i.e., the effluent of sensuality, the effluent of becoming, the effluent of ignorance."

Then the Blessed One, having stayed near Bhaṇḍa Village as long as he pleased, said to Ven. Ānanda, "Come, Ānanda, we will head for Hatthi Village, Amba Village, Jambu Village, to Bhoganagara."

"As you say, lord," Ven. Ānanda responded to the Blessed One.

Then the Blessed One, together with a large Saṅgha of monks, went to Bhoganagara. There the Blessed One stayed near Bhoganagara at the Ānanda shrine.

There the Blessed One addressed the monks, "Monks, I will teach you four great standards. Listen and pay careful attention."

"As you say, lord," the monks responded to him.

The Blessed One said, "There is the case where a monk says this: 'Face-to-face with the Blessed One have I heard this, face-to-face have I received this: This is the Dhamma, this is the Vinaya, this is the Teacher's instruction.' His statement is neither to be approved nor scorned. Without approval or scorn, take careful note of his words and make them stand against the suttas and tally them against the Vinaya. If, on making them stand against the suttas and tallying them against the Vinaya, you find that they don't stand with the suttas or tally with the Vinaya, you may conclude: 'This is not the word of the Blessed One; this monk has misunderstood it'—and you should reject it. But if, on making them stand against the suttas and tallying them against the Vinaya, you find that they stand with the suttas and tally with the Vinaya, you may conclude: 'This is the word of the Blessed One; this monk has understood it rightly.'

"Then there is the case where a monk says this: 'In a monastery over there dwells a Saṅgha with well-known leading elders. Face-to-face with that Saṅgha I have heard this, face-to-face have I received this: This is the Dhamma, this is the Vinaya, this is the Teacher's instruction.' …

"Then there is the case where a monk says this: 'In a monastery over there dwell many learned elder monks, well-versed in the tradition, who have memorized the Dhamma, the Vinaya, and the Mātikā.[35] Face-to-face with those elders I have heard this, face-to-face have I received this: This is the Dhamma, this is the Vinaya, this is the Teacher's instruction.' …

"Then there is the case where a monk says this: 'In a monastery over there dwells a learned elder monk, well-versed in the tradition, who has memorized the Dhamma, the Vinaya, and the Mātikā. Face-to-face with that elder I have heard this, face-to-face have I received this: This is the Dhamma, this is the Vinaya, this is the Teacher's instruction.' His statement is neither to be approved nor scorned. Without approval or scorn, take careful note of his words and make them stand against the suttas and tally them against the Vinaya. If, on making them stand against the suttas and tallying them against the Vinaya, you find that they don't stand with the suttas or tally with the Vinaya, you may conclude: 'This is not the word of the Blessed One; this monk has misunderstood it'—and you should reject it. But if, on making them stand against the suttas and tallying them against the Vinaya, you find that they stand with the suttas and tally with the Vinaya, you may conclude: 'This is the word of the Blessed One; this monk has understood it rightly.'

"Monks, remember these four great standards."

While staying there near Bhoganagara at the Ānanda shrine, the Blessed One often gave this Dhamma talk to the monks: "Such is virtue, such is concentration, such is discernment. Concentration nurtured with virtue is of great fruit, great reward. Discernment nurtured with concentration is of great fruit, great reward. The mind nurtured with discernment is rightly released from the effluents, i.e., the effluent of sensuality, the effluent of becoming, the effluent of ignorance."

Then the Blessed One, having stayed near Bhoganagara at the Ānanda shrine as long as he pleased, said to Ven. Ānanda, "Come, Ānanda, we will head for Pāvā."

"As you say, lord," Ven. Ānanda responded to the Blessed One.

Then the Blessed One, together with a large Saṅgha of monks, went to Pāvā. There the Blessed One stayed near Pāvā in the mango grove of Cunda the silversmith.

Cunda the silversmith heard, "The Blessed One, they say, on reaching Pāvā, is staying near Pāvā in my mango grove."

So Cunda went to the Blessed One and, on arrival, having bowed down to him, sat to one side. As he was sitting there, the Blessed One instructed,

urged, roused, & encouraged him with Dhamma talk. Then Cunda—instructed, urged, roused, & encouraged by the Blessed One's Dhamma talk—said to him, "Lord, may the Blessed One acquiesce to my meal tomorrow, together with the Saṅgha of monks."

The Blessed One acquiesced with silence.

Then Cunda, understanding the Blessed One's acquiescence, got up from his seat and, bowing down to him and circumambulating him, left. Then, at the end of the night, after having exquisite staple & non-staple food—including a large amount of pig-delicacy[36]—prepared in his own home, he announced the time to the Blessed One: "It's time, lord. The meal is ready."

Then the Blessed One, early in the morning, adjusted his lower robe and—taking his bowl & outer robe—went together with the Saṅgha of monks to Cunda's home. On arrival, he sat down on the seat laid out. Seated, he said to Cunda, "Cunda, serve me with the pig-delicacy you have had prepared, and the Saṅgha of monks with the other staple & non-staple food you have had prepared."

Responding, "As you say, lord," to the Blessed One, Cunda served the Blessed One with the pig-delicacy he had had prepared, and the Saṅgha of monks with the other staple & non-staple food he had had prepared. Then the Blessed One said to him, "Cunda, bury the remaining pig-delicacy in a pit. I don't see anyone in the world together with its devas, Māras, &Brahmās, in this generation with its contemplatives &brahmans, its rulers &commonfolk, in whom, when it was ingested, it would go to a healthy change, aside from the Tathāgata."

Responding, "As you say, lord," to the Blessed One, Cunda buried the remaining pig-delicacy in a pit, went to the Blessed One and, on arrival, having bowed down to him, sat to one side. As he was sitting there, the Blessed One—after instructing, urging, rousing, & encouraging him with Dhamma talk—got up from his seat and left.

Then in the Blessed One, after he had eaten Cunda's meal, there arose a severe disease accompanied with (the passing of) blood, with intense pains & deadly. But the Blessed One endured it—mindful, alert, & not struck down by it.

Then he addressed Ven. Ānanda, "Ānanda, we will go to Kusinārā."

"As you say, lord," Ven. Ānanda responded to the Blessed One.

I have heard that,
on eating Cunda the silversmith's meal,
the enlightened one was touched by illness—
    fierce, deadly.
After he had eaten the pig-delicacy,
a fierce sickness arose in the Teacher.
After being purged of it,
the Blessed One said,
"To the city of Kusinārā
I will go."[37]

Then the Blessed One, going down from the road, went to a certain tree and, on arrival, said to Ven. Ānanda, "Ānanda, please arrange my outer robe folded in four. I am tired. I will sit down."

Responding, "As you say, lord," to the Blessed One, Ven. Ānanda arranged the outer robe folded in four. The Blessed One sat down on the seat laid out.

Seated, he said to Ven. Ānanda, "Ānanda, please fetch me some water. I am thirsty. I will drink."

When this was said, Ven. Ānanda said to the Blessed One, "Lord, just now 500 carts have passed through. The meager river—cut by the wheels—flows turbid & disturbed. But the Kakudha river is not far away, with pristine water, pleasing water, cool water, pellucid water,[38] with restful banks, refreshing. There the Blessed One will drink potable water and cool his limbs."

A second time, the Blessed One said to Ven. Ānanda, "Ānanda, please fetch me some water. I am thirsty. I will drink."

A second time, Ven. Ānanda said to the Blessed One, "Lord, just now 500 carts have passed through. The meager water—cut by the wheels—flows turbid & disturbed. But the Kakudha River is not far away, with pristine water, pleasing water, cool water, pellucid water, with restful

banks, refreshing. There the Blessed One will drink potable water and cool his limbs."

A third time, the Blessed One said to Ven. Ānanda, "Ānanda, please fetch me some water. I am thirsty. I will drink."

Responding, "As you say, lord," to the Blessed One, Ven. Ānanda—taking a bowl—went to the river. And the meager river that, cut by the wheels, had been flowing turbid & disturbed, on his approach flowed pristine, clear, & undisturbed. The thought occurred to him, "How amazing! How astounding!—the great power & great might of the Tathāgata!—in that this meager river that, cut by the wheels, was flowing turbid & disturbed, on my approach flowed pristine, clear, & undisturbed!" Fetching water with the bowl, he went to the Blessed One and on arrival said, "How amazing! How astounding!—the great power & great might of the Tathāgata!—in that this meager river that, cut by the wheels, was flowing turbid & disturbed, on my approach flowed pristine, clear, & undisturbed! Drink the water, O Blessed One! Drink the water, O One Well-Gone!"

Then the Blessed One drank the water.[39]

Now on that occasion Pukkusa Mallaputta, a disciple of Āḷāra Kālāma was traveling on the road from Kusinārā to Pāvā. He saw the Blessed One sitting at the root of a tree and, on seeing him, approached him. On arrival, having bowed down to him, he sat to one side. As he was sitting there, he said to the Blessed One, "It's amazing, lord. It's astounding: the peaceful abiding by which those gone forth abide. Once, Āḷāra Kālāma, while traveling, went down from the road and sat not far away at the root of a tree for the day's abiding. Then 500 carts passed by right near him. Then a certain man, coming along right behind those hundreds of carts, approached Āḷāra Kālāma and, on arrival, said to him, 'Venerable sir, did you see 500 carts going past?' 'No, friend, I didn't.' 'But did you hear the sound?' 'No, friend, I didn't.' 'But were you asleep?' 'No, friend, I wasn't asleep.' 'But were you conscious?' 'Yes, friend.' 'Then, venerable sir, being conscious & awake when 500 carts passed by right near you, you neither saw them nor heard a sound. And yet your outer robe is covered with (their) dust!' 'Yes, friend.' Then the thought occurred to that man, 'How amazing! How astounding: the peaceful abiding by which those gone

forth abide—in that, being conscious & awake when 500 carts passed by right near, he would neither see them nor hear a sound!'[40] Having proclaimed immense conviction in Āḷāra Kālāma, he then left."

"What do you think, Pukkusa? Which is more difficult to do, more difficult to master: one who, being conscious & awake when 500 carts passed by right near, would neither see them nor hear a sound; or one who, being conscious & awake when the rain-deva was raining, the rain-deva was pouring, lightning-streaks were shooting out, and a thunderbolt split (the air), would neither see them nor hear a sound?"

"Lord, what would 500 carts amount to—or 600 carts, or 700 carts, or 800 carts, or 900 carts, or 1,000 carts… or 100,000 carts? That would be more difficult to do, more difficult to master: one who, being conscious & awake when the rain-deva was raining, the rain-deva was pouring, lightning-streaks were shooting out, and a thunderbolt split (the air), would neither see them nor hear a sound."

"One time, Pukkusa, I was staying near Ātumā in a threshing barn. And on that occasion, when the rain-deva was raining, the rain-deva was pouring, lightning-streaks were shooting out, and a thunderbolt split (the air) not far from the threshing barn, two farmers—brothers—were killed, along with four oxen.

"Then a large crowd of people came out of Ātumā to where the two farmers—brothers—were killed, along with the four oxen. And on that occasion I, having come out of the threshing barn, was doing walking meditation in front of the door to the threshing barn. A certain man from the great crowd of people approached me and, on arrival, having bowed down to me, stood to one side. As he was standing there, I said to him, 'Why, friend, has this great crowd of people gathered?'

"'Just now, lord—when the rain-deva was raining, the rain-deva was pouring, lightning-streaks were shooting out, and a thunderbolt split (the air)—two farmers—brothers—were killed, along with four oxen. That's why this great crowd of people has gathered. But you, lord: Where were you?'

"'I was right here, friend.'

"'But did you see anything?'

"'No, friend, I didn't.'

"'But did you hear the sound?'

"'No, friend, I didn't.'

"'But were you asleep?'

"'No, friend, I wasn't asleep.'

"'But were you conscious?'

"'Yes, friend.'

"'Then, lord, being conscious & awake when the rain-deva was raining, the rain-deva was pouring, lightning-streaks were shooting out, and a thunderbolt split (the air), you neither saw anything nor heard a sound.'

"'Yes, friend.'

"Then the thought occurred to that man, 'How amazing! How astounding: the peaceful abiding by which those gone forth abide—in that, when the rain-deva was raining, the rain-deva was pouring, lightning-streaks were shooting out, and a thunderbolt split (the air), he would neither see them nor hear a sound!' Having proclaimed immense conviction in me, he circumambulated me and then left."

When this was said, Pukkusa Mallaputta said to the Blessed One, "The conviction I had in Āḷāra Kālāma I winnow before a high wind or wash away in the swift current of a river. Magnificent, lord! Magnificent! Just as if he were to place upright what was overturned, to reveal what was hidden, to show the way to one who was lost, or to carry a lamp into the dark so that those with eyes could see forms, in the same way has the Blessed One—through many lines of reasoning—made the Dhamma clear. I go to the Blessed One for refuge, to the Dhamma, and to the Saṅgha of monks. May the Blessed One remember me as a lay follower who has gone to him for refuge, from this day forward, for life."

Then Pukkusa Mallaputta addressed a certain man, "Come now, I say. Fetch me a pair of gold-colored robes, ready to wear."

Responding, "As you say, lord," to Pukkusa Mallaputta, the man fetched the pair of gold-colored robes, ready to wear. Then Pukkusa Mallaputta presented the pair of gold-colored robes, ready to wear, to the Blessed

One, (saying,) "May the Blessed One accept from me this pair of gold-colored robes, ready to wear, out of kindness."

"Very well, then, Pukkusa. Clothe me with one, and Ānanda with the other."

Responding, "As you say, lord," to the Blessed One, Pukkusa Mallaputta clothed the Blessed One with one, and Ven. Ānanda with the other.

Then the Blessed One instructed, urged, roused, and encouraged Pukkusa Mallaputta with Dhamma talk. Then Pukkusa Mallaputta—instructed, urged, roused, and encouraged with the Blessed One's Dhamma talk—got up from his seat and, bowing down to the Blessed One and circumambulating him, left.

Then not long after Pukkusa Mallaputta had left, Ven. Ānanda placed the pair of gold-colored robes, ready to wear, against the Blessed One's body. Placed against the Blessed One's body, their iridescence seemed as if destroyed.

Then Ven. Ānanda said, "It's amazing, lord. It's astounding—how clear & bright the color of the Tathāgata's skin! When this pair of gold-colored robes, ready to wear, is placed against the Blessed One's body, their iridescence seems as if destroyed!"

"So it is, Ānanda. There are two times when the color of the Tathāgata's skin is especially clear & bright. Which two? The night on which the Tathāgata awakens to the unexcelled self-awakening, and the night on which the Tathāgata totally unbinds by means of the unbinding property with no fuel remaining. These are the two times when the color of the Tathāgata's skin is especially clear & bright. Today, in the last watch of the night, between the twin Sal trees in Upavattana, the Mallans' Sal Forest near Kusinārā, the Tathāgata's total unbinding will occur.

"Come, Ānanda, we will head for Kakudha River."

"As you say, lord," Ven. Ānanda responded to the Blessed One.

> Pukkusa offered a pair of gold-colored robes
> clothed in which,
> the Teacher of golden complexion
> shone brightly.

Then the Blessed One, together with the large Saṅgha of monks, went to the Kakudha River and, after arriving at the Kakudha River, going down, bathing, drinking, & coming back out, went to a mango grove. On arrival, the Blessed One said to Ven. Cundaka, "Cundaka, please arrange my outer robe folded in four. I am tired. I will lie down."

Responding, "As you say, lord," to the Blessed One, Ven. Cundaka arranged the outer robe folded in four. The Blessed One, lying on his right side, took up the lion's posture, placing one foot on top of the other—mindful, alert, and attending to the perception of getting up. Ven. Cundaka sat in front of him.

The awakened one,
—having gone to the little Kakudha river
with its pristine, pleasing water, clear—
the Teacher, seeming very tired,
the Tathāgata, unequalled in the world
went down, bathed, drank, & came out.
Honored, surrounded,
in the midst of the group of monks,
the Blessed One, Teacher,
proceeding here in the Dhamma,
the great seer,
went to the mango grove.
He addressed the monk named Cundaka,
"Spread it out, folded in four
for me to lie down."
Ordered by the One of developed mind,
Cundaka quickly set it out, folded in four.
The Teacher lay down, seeming very tired,
and Cundaka sat down there before him.

Then the Blessed One addressed Ven. Ānanda, "Ānanda, if anyone tries to incite remorse in Cunda the silversmith, saying, 'It's no gain for you, friend Cunda, it's ill-done by you, that the Tathāgata, having eaten your last alms, totally unbound,' then Cunda's remorse should be allayed (in this way): 'It's a gain for you, friend Cunda, it's well-done by you, that the Tathāgata, having eaten your last alms, totally unbound. Face to face with

the Blessed One have I heard it, face to face have I learned it, "These two alms are equal to each other in fruit, equal to each other in result, of much greater fruit & reward than any other alms. Which two? The alms that, after having eaten it, the Tathāgata awakens to the unexcelled right self-awakening. And the alms that, after having eaten it, the Tathāgata unbinds by means of the unbinding property with no fuel remaining. These are the two alms that are equal to each other in fruit, equal to each other in result, of much greater fruit & reward than any other alms. Venerable[41] Cunda the silversmith has accumulated kamma that leads to long life. Venerable Cunda the silversmith has accumulated kamma that leads to beauty. Venerable Cunda the silversmith has accumulated kamma that leads to happiness. Venerable Cunda the silversmith has accumulated kamma that leads to heaven. Venerable Cunda the silversmith has accumulated kamma that leads to rank. Venerable Cunda the silversmith has accumulated kamma that leads to sovereignty.'' In this way, Ānanda, Cunda the silversmith's remorse should be allayed."

Then, on realizing the significance of that, the Blessed One on that occasion exclaimed:

For a person giving,
merit increases.
For one self-restraining,
no animosity is amassed.
One who is skillful
leaves evil behind
and
—from the ending of
passion,
aversion,
delusion—
totally unbinds.

[ V ]

Then the Blessed One said to Ven. Ānanda: "Come, Ānanda, we will head for the far shore of the Hiraññavati River, for Upavattana, the Mallans' Sal Forest near Kusinārā."

"As you say, lord," Ven. Ānanda responded to the Blessed One.

Then the Blessed One with a large Saṅgha of monks went to the far shore of the Hiraññavati River, to Upavattana, the Mallans' Sal Forest near Kusinārā. On arrival, he said to Ven. Ānanda, "Ānanda, please prepare a bed for me between the twin Sal trees, with its head to the north. I am tired and will lie down."

Responding, "As you say, lord," to the Blessed One, Ven. Ānanda prepared a bed between the twin Sal trees, with its head to the north. Then the Blessed One lay down on his right side in the lion's sleeping posture, with one foot on top of the other, mindful & alert.[42]

Now on that occasion the twin Sal trees were in full bloom, even though it was not the time for flowering. They showered, strewed, & sprinkled on the Tathāgata's body in homage to him. Heavenly coral-tree blossoms fell from the sky, showering, strewing, & sprinkling the Tathāgata's body in homage to him. Heavenly sandalwood powder fell from the sky, showering, strewing, & sprinkling the Tathāgata's body in homage to him. Heavenly music was playing in the sky, in homage to the Tathāgata. Heavenly songs were sung in the sky, in homage to the Tathāgata.

Then the Blessed One said to Ven. Ānanda, "Ānanda, the twin Sal trees are in full bloom, even though it's not the flowering season. They shower, strew, & sprinkle on the Tathāgata's body in homage to him. Heavenly coral-tree blossoms are falling from the sky.… Heavenly sandalwood powder is falling from the sky.… Heavenly music is playing in the sky.… Heavenly songs are sung in the sky, in homage to the Tathāgata. But it is not to this extent that a Tathāgata is worshipped, honored, respected, venerated, or paid homage to. Rather, the monk, nun, male lay follower, or female lay follower who keeps practicing the Dhamma in accordance with the Dhamma, who keeps practicing masterfully, who lives in accordance with the Dhamma: That is the person who worships, honors, respects, venerates, & pays homage to the Tathāgata with the highest homage. So you should train yourselves: 'We will keep practicing the Dhamma in accordance with the Dhamma, we will keep practicing masterfully, we will live in accordance with the Dhamma.'[43] That's how you should train yourselves."

Now on that occasion Ven. Upavāṇa was standing in front of the Blessed One, fanning him. Then the Blessed One dismissed him, saying, "Go away, monk. Don't stand in front of me." Then the thought occurred to Ven. Ānanda, "For a long time, now, this Ven. Upavāṇa has been an attendant to the Blessed One, staying near him and traveling with him. But now, in his final hour, he dismisses him, saying, 'Go away, monk. Don't stand in front of me.' Now what is the reason, what is the cause, why the Blessed One dismisses him, saying, 'Go away, monk. Don't stand in front of me'?"

Then Ven. Ānanda said to the Blessed One, "For a long time, now, this Ven. Upavāṇa has been an attendant to the Blessed One, staying near him and traveling with him. But now, in his final hour, he dismisses him, saying, 'Go away, monk. Don't stand in front of me.' Now what is the reason, what is the cause, why the Blessed One dismisses him, saying, 'Go away, monk. Don't stand in front of me'?"

"Ānanda, most of the devatās from ten world-systems have gathered in order to see the Tathāgata. For twelve leagues all around Upavattana, the Mallans' Sal Forest near Kusinārā, there is not the space even of the tip of a horse-tail hair that is not occupied by eminent devatās. The devatās, Ānanda, are complaining, 'We have come a long distance to see the Tathāgata.[44] Only once in a long, long time does a Tathāgata—worthy & rightly self-awakened—arise in the world. Tonight, in the last watch of the night, the total unbinding of the Tathāgata will occur. And this eminent monk is standing in front of the Blessed One, blocking the way. We aren't getting to see the Blessed One in his final hour.'"

"But, lord, what is the state of the devatās the Blessed One is paying attention to?"

"Ānanda, there are devatās who perceive space to be earth. Tearing at their hair, they are weeping. Uplifting their arms, they are weeping. As if their feet were cut out from under them,[45] they fall down and roll back & forth, crying, 'All too soon, the Blessed One will totally unbind! All too soon, the One Well-Gone will totally unbind! All too soon, the One with Eyes [alternate reading: the Eye] will disappear from the world!' Then there are devatās who perceive earth to be earth. Tearing at their hair, they are weeping. Uplifting their arms, they are weeping. As if their feet were

cut out from under them, they fall down and roll back & forth, crying, 'All too soon, the Blessed One will totally unbind! All too soon, the One Well-Gone will totally unbind! All too soon, the One with Eyes will disappear from the world!' But those devatās who are free from passion acquiesce, mindful & alert: 'Inconstant are fabrications. What else is there to expect?'"

"In the past, lord, the monks in all directions, after ending the Rains retreat, came to see the Tathāgata. Thus we got to see & attend to the monks who inspire the heart. But now, after the Blessed One is gone, we won't get to see or attend to the monks who inspire the heart."

"Ānanda, there are these four places that merit being seen by a clansman with conviction, that merit his feelings of urgency & dismay *[saṁvega].* Which four? 'Here the Tathāgata was born' is a place that merits being seen by a clansman with conviction, that merits his feelings of urgency & dismay. 'Here the Tathāgata awakened to the unexcelled right self-awakening.'… 'Here the Tathāgata set rolling the unexcelled wheel of Dhamma.'… 'Here the Tathāgata totally unbound in the property of unbinding with no fuel remaining' is a place that merits being seen by a clansman with conviction, that merits his feelings of urgency & dismay. These are the four places that merit being seen by a clansman with conviction, that merit his feelings of urgency & dismay. They will come out of conviction, Ānanda—monks, nuns, male lay followers, & female lay followers—to the spots where 'Here the Tathāgata was born,' 'Here the Tathāgata awakened to the unexcelled right self-awakening,' 'Here the Tathāgata set rolling the unexcelled wheel of Dhamma,' 'Here the Tathāgata totally unbound in the property of unbinding with no fuel remaining.' And anyone who dies while making a pilgrimage to these shrines with a bright, confident mind will—on the break-up of the body, after death—reappear in a good destination, a heavenly world."

"Lord, what course should we follow with regard to womenfolk?"

"Not-seeing, Ānanda."

"But when there is seeing, lord, what course should be followed?"

"Not-addressing, Ānanda."

"But when we are addressed, what course should be followed?"

"Mindfulness should be established, Ānanda."

"And, lord, what course should we follow with regard to the Tathāgata's body?"

"You are not to be concerned about the Tathāgata's funeral. Please, Ānanda, strive for the true goal, be committed to the true goal, dwell heedful, ardent, & resolute for the sake of the true goal. There are wise nobles, wise brahmans, & wise householders who are highly confident in the Tathāgata. They will conduct the Tathāgata's funeral."

"But, lord, what course should be followed with regard to the Tathāgata's body?"

"The course they follow with regard to a wheel-turning monarch's body, Ānanda, is the course that should be followed with regard to the Tathāgata's body."

"And what, lord, is the course they follow with regard to a wheel-turning monarch's body?"

"Ānanda, they wrap the wheel-turning monarch's body in new linen cloth. Having wrapped it in new linen cloth, they wrap it in teased cotton-wool. Having wrapped it in teased cotton-wool, they wrap it in new linen cloth. Having done this five hundred times, they place the body in an iron oil-vat, cover it with an iron lid, make a pyre composed totally of perfumed substances, and cremate the body. Then they build a burial mound for the wheel-turning monarch at a great four-way intersection. That is the course that they follow with regard to a wheel-turning monarch's body. The course they follow with regard to a wheel-turning monarch's body, Ānanda, is the course that should be followed with regard to the Tathāgata's body. A burial mound for the Tathāgata is to be built at a great four-way intersection. And those who offer a garland, a scent, or a perfume powder there, or bow down there, or brighten their minds there: That will be for their long-term welfare & happiness.

"There are these four who are worthy of a burial mound. Which four? A Tathāgata, worthy & rightly self-awakened, is worthy of a burial mound. A Private Buddha… a disciple of a Tathāgata… a wheel-turning monarch is worthy of a burial mound.

"And for what reason is a Tathāgata, worthy & rightly self-awakened, worthy of a burial mound? (At the thought,) 'This is the burial mound of a Tathāgata, worthy & rightly self-awakened,' many people will brighten their minds. Having brightened their minds there, then—on the break-up of the body, after death—they will reappear in a good destination, a heavenly world. It is for this reason that a Tathāgata, worthy & rightly self-awakened, is worthy of a burial mound.

"And for what reason is a Private Buddha worthy of a burial mound? (At the thought,) 'This is the burial mound of a Private Buddha,' many people will brighten their minds. Having brightened their minds there, then—on the break-up of the body, after death—they will reappear in a good destination, a heavenly world.…

"And for what reason is a disciple of a Tathāgata worthy of a burial mound? (At the thought,) 'This is the burial mound of a disciple of a Tathāgata,' many people will brighten their minds. Having brightened their minds there, then—on the break-up of the body, after death—they will reappear in a good destination, a heavenly world.…

"And for what reason is a wheel-turning monarch worthy of a burial mound? (At the thought,) 'This is the burial mound of a wheel-turning monarch,' many people will brighten their minds. Having brightened their minds there, then—on the break-up of the body, after death—they will reappear in a good destination, a heavenly world. It is for this reason that a wheel-turning monarch is worthy of a burial mound.

"These are the four who are worthy of a burial mound."

Then Ven. Ānanda, going into a (nearby) building, stood leaning against the door jamb, weeping: "Here I am, still in training, with work left to do, and the total unbinding of my teacher is about to occur—the teacher who has had such sympathy for me!"

Then the Blessed One said to the monks, "Monks, where is Ānanda?"

"Lord, Ven. Ānanda, having gone into that building, stands leaning against the door jamb, weeping: 'Here I am, still in training, with work left to do, and the total unbinding of my teacher is about to occur—the teacher who has had such sympathy for me!'"

Then the Blessed One told a certain monk, "Come, monk. In my name, call Ānanda, saying, 'The Teacher calls you, my friend.'"

Responding, "As you say, lord," to the Blessed One, the monk went to Ven. Ānanda and on arrival said, "The Teacher calls you, my friend."

Responding, "As you say, my friend," to the monk, Ven. Ānanda went to the Blessed One and, on arrival, having bowed down to him, sat to one side. As he was sitting there, the Blessed One said to him, "Enough, Ānanda. Don't grieve. Don't lament. Haven't I already taught you the state of growing different with regard to all things dear & appealing, the state of becoming separate, the state of becoming otherwise? What else is there to expect? It's impossible that one could forbid anything born, existent, fabricated, & subject to disintegration from disintegrating.

"For a long time, Ānanda, you have waited on the Tathāgata with bodily acts of good will—helpful, happy, whole-hearted, without limit; with verbal acts of good will… with mental acts of good will—helpful, happy, whole-hearted, without limit. You are one who has made merit. Commit yourself to exertion, and soon you will be without effluents."

Then the Blessed One addressed the monks, "Monks, those Blessed Ones who, in the past, were worthy ones, rightly self-awakened, had foremost attendants, just as I have had Ānanda. Those Blessed Ones who, in the future, will be worthy ones, rightly self-awakened, will have foremost attendants, just as I have had Ānanda. Ānanda is wise. He knows, 'This is the time to approach to see the Tathāgata. This is the time for monks, this the time for nuns, this the time for male lay-followers, this the time for female lay-followers, this the time for kings & their ministers, this the time for sectarians, this the time for the followers of sectarians.

"There are these four amazing & astounding qualities in Ānanda. If a group of monks approaches to see Ānanda, they are gratified at the sight of him. If he speaks Dhamma to them, they are gratified with what he says. Before they are sated, he falls silent. If a group of nuns approaches to see Ānanda… If a group of male lay followers approaches to see Ānanda… If a group of female lay followers approaches to see Ānanda, they are gratified at the sight of him. If he speaks Dhamma to them, they are gratified with what he says. Before they are sated, he falls silent. These are the four amazing & astounding qualities in Ānanda. There are these four

amazing & astounding qualities in a wheel-turning monarch. If a group of noble warriors approaches to see him… If a group of brahmans approaches to see him… If a group of householders approaches to see him… If a group of contemplatives approaches to see him, they are gratified at the sight of him. If he speaks to them, they are gratified with what he says. Before they are sated, he falls silent. In the same way, monks, there are these four amazing & astounding qualities in Ānanda. If a group of monks… a group of nuns… a group of male lay followers… a group of female lay followers approaches to see Ānanda, they are gratified at the sight of him. If he speaks Dhamma to them, they are gratified with what he says. Before they are sated, he falls silent. These are the four amazing & astounding qualities in Ānanda."

When this was said, Ven. Ānanda said to the Blessed One, "Lord, may the Blessed One not totally unbind in this little town, this dusty town, this branch township. There are other great cities: Campā, Rājagaha, Sāvatthī, Sāketa, Kosambī, Bārāṇasī. May the Blessed One totally unbind there. In those cities there are many wealthy noble warriors, brahmans, & householders who have high confidence in the Tathāgata. They will conduct the Tathāgata's funeral."

"Don't say that, Ānanda. Don't say that: 'this little town, this dusty town, this branch township.' In the past, Ānanda, a king named Mahā Sudassana was a wheel-turning monarch, a righteous king ruling righteously, who was a conqueror of the four directions, a stabilizer of his country, endowed with the seven treasures. This Kusinārā was his capital city, named Kusāvatī: twelve leagues long from east to west, seven leagues wide from north to south. Kusāvatī was powerful, rich, & well-populated, crowded with people & prosperous. Just as the capital city of the devas named Ālakamandā is powerful, rich, & well-populated, crowded with yakkhas & prosperous; in the same way, Kusāvatī was powerful, rich, & well-populated, crowded with people & prosperous. By day or by night, it was never lacking in ten sounds: the sound of elephants, the sound of horses, the sound of carts, the sound of drums, the sound of tabors, the sound of lutes, the sound of songs, the sound of cymbals, the sound of gongs, with cries of 'Eat! Drink! Snack!' as the tenth.

"Now, Ānanda, go into Kusinārā and announce to the Kusinārā Mallans, 'Tonight, Vāsiṭṭhas, in the last watch of the night, the total

unbinding of the Tathāgata will occur. Come out, Vāsiṭṭhas! Come out, Vāsiṭṭhas! Don't later regret that "The Tathāgata's total unbinding occurred within the borders of our very own town, but we didn't get to see him in his final hour!"""

Responding, "As you say, lord," to the Blessed One, Ven. Ānanda adjusted his lower robe and—taking his bowl & outer robe—went unaccompanied into Kusinārā. Now at that time the Kusinārā Mallans had met for some business in their reception hall. Ven. Ānanda went to the reception hall and on arrival announced to them, "Tonight, Vāsiṭṭhas, in the last watch of the night, the total unbinding of the Tathāgata will occur. Come out, Vāsiṭṭhas! Come out, Vāsiṭṭhas! Don't later regret that 'The Tathāgata's total unbinding occurred within the borders of our very own town, but we didn't get to see him in his final hour!'" When they heard Ven. Ānanda, the Mallans together with their sons, daughters, & wives were shocked, saddened, their minds overflowing with sorrow. Some of them wept, tearing at their hair; they wept, uplifting their arms. As if their feet were cut out from under them, they fell down and rolled back & forth, crying, "All too soon, the Blessed One will totally unbind! All too soon, the One Well-Gone will totally unbind! All too soon, the One with Eyes will disappear from the world!"

Then the Mallans together with their sons, daughters, & wives—shocked, saddened, their minds overflowing with sorrow—went to Ven. Ānanda at Upavattana, the Mallans' Sal Forest near Kusinārā. The thought occurred to Ven. Ānanda, "If I let the Mallans pay reverence to the Blessed One one by one, the night will be over before they have finished paying reverence. What if I were to have them pay reverence to the Blessed One arranging them family by family, announcing, 'Lord, the Mallan named so-&-so, together with his children & wives, servants & retainers, bows down with his head at the Blessed One's feet.'"[46] So Ven. Ānanda, arranging the Mallans family by family, had them pay reverence to the Blessed One, (saying,) "Lord, the Mallan named so-&-so, together with his children & wives, servants & retainers, bows down with his head at the Blessed One's feet."

In this way Ven. Ānanda got the Mallans to pay reverence to the Blessed One within the first watch of the night.

Now on that occasion a wanderer named Subhadda was staying near Kusinārā. He heard, "Tonight, in the last watch of the night, the total unbinding of Gotama the contemplative will take place." Then the thought occurred to him: "I have heard the old elder wanderers, teachers of teachers, saying that only once in a long, long time do Tathāgatas—worthy ones, rightly self-awakened—appear in the world. Tonight, in the last watch of the night, the total unbinding of Gotama the contemplative will occur. Now there is a doubt that has arisen in me, but I have confidence in Gotama the contemplative that he can teach me the Dhamma in such a way that I might abandon that doubt."

So he went to Upavattana, the Mallans' Sal Forest and, on arrival, said to Ven. Ānanda, "I have heard the old elder wanderers, teachers of teachers, saying that only once in a long, long time do Tathāgatas—worthy ones, rightly self-awakened—appear in the world. Tonight, in the last watch of the night, the total unbinding of Gotama the contemplative will occur. Now there is a doubt that has arisen in me, but I have confidence in Gotama the contemplative that he can teach me the Dhamma in such a way that I might abandon that doubt. It would be good, Ven. Ānanda, if you would let me see him."

When this was said, Ven. Ānanda said to him, "Enough, friend Subhadda. Don't bother the Blessed One. The Blessed One is tired."

For a second time… For a third time, Subhadda the wanderer said to Ven. Ānanda, "…It would be good, Ven. Ānanda, if you would let me see him."

For a third time, Ven. Ānanda said to him, "Enough, friend Subhadda. Don't bother the Blessed One. The Blessed One is tired."

Now, the Blessed One heard the exchange between Ven. Ānanda & Subhadda the wanderer, and so he said to Ven. Ānanda, "Enough, Ānanda. Don't stand in his way. Let him see the Tathāgata. Whatever he asks me will all be for the sake of knowledge, and not to be bothersome. And whatever I answer when asked, he will quickly understand."

So Ven. Ānanda said to Subhadda the wanderer, "Go ahead, friend Subhadda. The Blessed One gives you his leave."

Then Subhadda went to the Blessed One and exchanged courteous greetings with him. After an exchange of friendly greetings & courtesies, he sat to one side. As he was sitting there, he said to the Blessed One, "Master Gotama, these contemplatives & brahmans, each with his group, each with his community, each the teacher of his group, an honored leader, well-regarded by people at large—i.e., Pūraṇa Kassapa, Makkhali Gosāla, Ajita Kesakambalin, Pakudha Kaccāyana, Sañjaya Velaṭṭhaputta, & the Nigaṇṭha Nāṭaputta: Do they all have direct knowledge as they themselves claim, or do they all not have direct knowledge, or do some of them have direct knowledge and some of them not?"

"Enough, Subhadda. Put this question aside: 'Do they all have direct knowledge as they themselves claim, or do they all not have direct knowledge, or do some of them have direct knowledge and some of them not?' I will teach you the Dhamma, Subhadda. Listen, and pay close attention. I will speak."

"As you say, lord," Subhadda responded to the Blessed One.

The Blessed One said, "In any doctrine & discipline where the noble eightfold path is not ascertained, no contemplative of the first… second… third… fourth order [stream-winner, once-returner, non-returner, or arahant] is ascertained. But in any doctrine & discipline where the noble eightfold path *is* ascertained, contemplatives of the first… second… third… fourth order *are* ascertained. The noble eightfold path is ascertained in this doctrine & discipline, and right here there are contemplatives of the first… second… third… fourth order. Other teachings are empty of knowledgeable contemplatives. And if the monks dwell rightly, this world will not be empty of arahants.

At age twenty-nine I went forth, Subhadda,
seeking what might be skillful,
and since my going forth, Subhadda,
more than fifty years have passed.

Outside of the realm
of methodical Dhamma,
there is no contemplative.

There is no contemplative of the second order; there is no contemplative of the third order; there is no contemplative of the fourth order. Other teachings are empty of knowledgeable contemplatives. And if the monks dwell rightly, this world will not be empty of arahants."

Then Subhadda the wanderer said, "Magnificent, lord! Magnificent! Just as if he were to place upright what was overturned, to reveal what was hidden, to show the way to one who was lost, or to set out a lamp in the darkness so that those with eyes could see forms, in the same way has the Blessed One—through many lines of reasoning—made the Dhamma clear. I go to the Blessed One for refuge, to the Dhamma, and to the Saṅgha of monks. Let me obtain the going forth in the Blessed One's presence, let me obtain the acceptance."

"Anyone, Subhadda, who has previously belonged to another sect and who desires the going forth & acceptance into this Dhamma & Vinaya, must first undergo probation for four months. If, at the end of four months, the monks feel so moved, they give him the going forth & accept him into the monk's state. But I know distinctions among individuals in this matter."

"Lord, if that is so, I am willing to undergo probation for four years. If, at the end of four years, the monks feel so moved, let them give me the going forth & accept me into the monk's state."

Then the Blessed One said to Ven. Ānanda, "Very well then, Ānanda, give Subhadda the going forth."

"As you say, lord," Ven. Ānanda responded to the Blessed One.

Then Subhadda said to Ven. Ānanda, "It's a gain for you, Ānanda, a great gain, that you have been anointed here, face-to-face with the Teacher, with the pupil's anointing."[47]

Then Subhadda the wanderer obtained the going forth in the Blessed One's presence, he obtained acceptance. And not long after his acceptance —dwelling alone, secluded, heedful, ardent, & resolute—he in no long time entered & remained in the supreme goal of the holy life, for which clansmen rightly go forth from home into homelessness, directly knowing & realizing it for himself in the here & now. He knew: "Birth is ended, the holy life fulfilled, the task done. There is nothing further for

the sake of this world." And thus Ven. Subhadda became another one of the arahants, the last of the Blessed One's direct-witness disciples.

[ VI ]

Then the Blessed One said to Ven. Ānanda, "Now, if the thought occurs to any of you—'The teaching has lost its arbitrator; we are without a Teacher'—do not view it in that way. Whatever Dhamma & Vinaya I have pointed out & formulated for you, that will be your Teacher after my passing.

"At present, the monks address one another as 'friend,' but after my passing they are not to address one another that way. The more senior monks are to address the newer monks by their name or clan or as 'friend.' The newer monks are to address the more senior monks as 'venerable' or 'sir.'

"After my passing, the Saṅgha—if it wants—may rescind the lesser & minor training rules.[48]

"After my passing, the monk Channa should be given the brahma-penalty."

"What, lord, is the brahma-penalty?"

"Channa may say what he wants, Ānanda, but he is not to be spoken to, instructed, or admonished by the monks."[49]

Then the Blessed One addressed the monks, "If even a single monk has any doubt or perplexity concerning the Buddha, Dhamma, or Saṅgha, the path or the practice, ask. Don't later regret that 'The Teacher was face-to-face with us, but we didn't bring ourselves to ask a counter-question in his presence.'"

When this was said, the monks were silent.

A second time, the Blessed One said, "If even one of the monks has any doubt or perplexity concerning the Buddha, Dhamma, or Saṅgha, the path or the practice, ask. Don't later regret that 'The Teacher was face-to-face with us, but we didn't bring ourselves to ask a counter-question in his presence.'"

A second time, the monks were silent.

A third time, the Blessed One said, "If even one of the monks has any doubt or perplexity concerning the Buddha, Dhamma, or Saṅgha, the path or the practice, ask. Don't later regret that 'The Teacher was face-to-face with us, but we didn't bring ourselves to ask a counter-question in his presence.'"

A third time, the monks were silent.

Then the Blessed One addressed the monks, "Now, if it's simply out of respect for the Teacher that you don't ask, let a companion inform a companion."

When this was said, the monks were silent.

Then Ven. Ānanda said to the Blessed One, "It's amazing, lord. It's astounding. I have confidence in this Saṅgha of monks that there is not even a single monk in this Saṅgha of monks who has any doubt or perplexity concerning the Buddha, Dhamma, or Saṅgha, the path or the practice."

"You, Ānanda, speak out of confidence, while there is knowledge in the Tathāgata that there is not even a single monk in this Saṅgha of monks who has any doubt or perplexity concerning the Buddha, Dhamma, or Saṅgha, the path or the practice. Of these 500 monks, the most backward is a stream-winner, never again destined for the lower realms, certain, headed for self-awakening."

Then the Blessed One addressed the monks, "Now, then, monks, I exhort you: All fabrications are subject to ending & decay. Reach consummation through heedfulness." That was the Tathāgata's last statement.

Then the Blessed One entered the first jhāna. Emerging from that he entered the second jhāna. Emerging from that, he entered the third… the fourth jhāna… the dimension of the infinitude of space… the dimension of the infinitude of consciousness… the dimension of nothingness… the dimension of neither perception nor non-perception. Emerging from that, he entered the cessation of perception & feeling.

Then Ven. Ānanda said to Ven. Anuruddha, "Ven. Anuruddha,[50] the Blessed One is totally unbound."

"No, friend Ānanda. The Blessed One isn't totally unbound. He has entered the cessation of perception & feeling."

Then the Blessed One, emerging from the cessation of perception & feeling, entered the dimension of neither perception nor non-perception. Emerging from that, he entered the dimension of nothingness… the dimension of the infinitude of consciousness… the dimension of the infinitude of space… the fourth jhāna… the third… the second… the first jhāna. Emerging from the first jhāna he entered the second… the third… the fourth jhāna. Emerging from the fourth jhāna, he immediately totally unbound.

When the Blessed One totally unbound, simultaneously with the total unbinding, there was a great earthquake, awesome & hair-raising, and rolls of the deva-drums split (the air).[51]

When the Blessed One totally unbound, simultaneously with the total unbinding, Sahampati Brahmā uttered this verse:

> All beings—all—in the world,
> will cast off the bodily heap
> in the world
> where a Teacher like this
> without peer in the world
> the Tathāgata, with strength attained,
> the Rightly Self-Awakened One,
> has totally unbound.

When the Blessed One totally unbound, simultaneously with the total unbinding, Sakka, the deva-king, uttered this verse:

> How inconstant are fabrications!
> Their nature: to arise & pass away.
> They disband as they are arising.
> Their total stilling is bliss.

When the Blessed One totally unbound, simultaneously with the total unbinding, Ven. Anuruddha uttered this verse:

> He had no in-&-out breathing,

the firm-minded one, the one who was Such,
imperturbable
& intent on peace:
the sage completing his span.

With heart unbowed
he endured the pain.
Like a flame's unbinding
was the liberation
of awareness.

When the Blessed One totally unbound, simultaneously with the total unbinding, Ven. Ānanda uttered this verse:

It was awe-inspiring.
It was hair-raising
when, displaying the foremost
accomplishment in all things,
the Rightly Self-Awakened One
totally unbound.

When the Blessed One totally unbound, simultaneously with the total unbinding, some of the monks present who were not without passion wept, uplifting their arms. As if their feet were cut out from under them, they fell down and rolled back & forth, crying, "All too soon has the Blessed One totally unbound! All too soon has the One Well-Gone totally unbound! All too soon has the One with Eyes disappeared from the world!" But those monks who were free from passion acquiesced, mindful & alert: "Inconstant are fabrications. What else is there to expect?"

Then Ven. Anuruddha addressed the monks, "Enough, friends. Don't grieve. Don't lament. Hasn't the Blessed One already taught the state of growing different with regard to all things dear & appealing, the state of becoming separate, the state of becoming otherwise? What else is there to expect?[52] It's impossible that one could forbid anything born, existent, fabricated, & subject to disintegration from disintegrating. The devatās, friends, are complaining."

[Ven. Ānanda:] "But, Ven. Anuruddha, what is the state of the devatās you are paying attention to?"

"Friend Ānanda, there are devatās who perceive space to be earth. Tearing at their hair, they are weeping. Uplifting their arms, they are weeping. As if their feet were cut out from under them, they fall down and roll back & forth, crying, 'All too soon has the Blessed One totally unbound! All too soon has the One Well-Gone totally unbound! All too soon, has the One with Eyes disappeared from the world!' Then there are devatās who perceive earth to be earth. Tearing at their hair, they are weeping. Uplifting their arms, they are weeping. As if their feet were cut out from under them, they fall down and roll back & forth, crying, 'All too soon has the Blessed One totally unbound! All too soon has the One Well-Gone totally unbound! All too soon has the One with Eyes disappeared from the world!' But those devatās who are free from passion[53] acquiesce, mindful & alert: 'Inconstant are fabrications. What else is there to expect?'"

Then Ven. Anuruddha & Ven. Ānanda spent the remainder of the night in Dhamma talk.

Then Ven. Anuruddha said to Ven. Ānanda, "Go, friend Ānanda. Entering Kusinārā, announce to the Kusinārā Mallans, 'The Blessed One, Vāsiṭṭhas, has totally unbound. Now is the time for you to do as you see fit.'"

Responding, "As you say, sir," to Ven. Anuruddha, Ven. Ānanda in the early morning adjusted his lower robe and—taking his bowl & outer robe—went unaccompanied into Kusinārā. Now at that time the Kusinārā Mallans had met for some business in their reception hall. Ven. Ānanda went to the reception hall and on arrival announced to them, "The Blessed One, Vāsiṭṭhas, has totally unbound. Now is the time for you to do as you see fit."

When they heard Ven. Ānanda, the Mallans together with their sons, daughters, & wives were shocked, saddened, their minds overflowing with sorrow. Some of them wept, tearing at their hair; they wept, uplifting their arms. As if their feet were cut out from under them, they fell down and rolled back & forth, crying, "All too soon has the Blessed One totally unbound! All too soon has the One Well-Gone totally unbound! All too soon has the One with Eyes disappeared from the world!"

Then the Kusinārā Mallans ordered their men, "In that case, I say, gather scents, garlands, & all the musical instruments in Kusinārā!" Then, taking scents, garlands, & all the musical instruments in Kusinārā, along with 500 pairs of cloth, the Kusinārā Mallans went to the Blessed One's body in Upavattana, the Mallans' Sal Forest near Kusinārā. On arrival, they spent the entire day in worshipping, honoring, respecting, & venerating the Blessed One's body with dances, songs, music, garlands, & scents, in making cloth canopies and arranging floral wreaths. Then the thought occurred to them, "It's too late today to cremate the Blessed One's body. We'll cremate the Blessed One's body tomorrow." And so they spent the second day, the third day, the fourth day, the fifth day, the sixth day in worshipping, honoring, respecting, & venerating the Blessed One's body with dances, songs, music, garlands, & scents, in making cloth canopies and arranging floral wreaths.

Then on the seventh day the thought occurred to them, "Worshipping, honoring, respecting, & venerating the Blessed One's body with dances, songs, music, garlands, & scents, let's carry it to the south, around the outside of the town, and cremate it to the south of the town."

Then eight leading Mallans, having bathed their heads and wearing new linen cloth, thinking, "We'll lift up the Blessed One's body," were unable to lift it. So the Kusinārā Mallans asked Ven. Anuruddha, "What is the reason, Ven. Anuruddha, what is the cause, why these eight leading Mallans, having bathed their heads and wearing new linen cloth, thinking, 'We'll lift up the Blessed One's body,' are unable to lift it?"

"Your intention, Vāsiṭṭhas, is one thing. The devas' intention is another."

"But what, Ven. Anuruddha, is the devas' intention?"

"Your intention, Vāsiṭṭhas, is, 'Worshipping, honoring, respecting, & venerating the Blessed One's body with dances, songs, music, garlands, & scents, let's carry it to the south, around the outside of the town, and cremate it to the south of the town.' The devas' intention is, 'Worshipping, honoring, respecting, & venerating the Blessed One's body with heavenly dances, songs, music, garlands, & scents, lets carry it to the north of the town, enter the town through the north gate, carry it through the middle

of the town and out the east gate to the Mallans' shrine called Makuṭa-bandhana, to cremate it there.'"

"Then let it be, venerable sir, in line with the devas' intention."

Now on that occasion Kusinārā—even to its rubbish heaps & cesspools—was strewn knee-deep in coral-tree flowers. So the devas & the Kusinārā Mallans, worshipping, honoring, respecting, & venerating the Blessed One's body with heavenly & human dances, songs, music, garlands, & scents, carried it to the north of the town, entered the town through the north gate, carried it through the middle of the town and out the east gate to the Mallans' shrine called Makuṭa-bandhana. There they set it down.

Then the Kusinārā Mallans said to Ven. Ānanda, "Venerable sir, what course should we follow with regard to the Tathāgata's body?"

"The course they follow with regard to a wheel-turning monarch's body, Vāsiṭṭhas, is the course that should be followed with regard to the Tathāgata's body."

"And what, venerable sir, is the course they follow with regard to a wheel-turning monarch's body?"

"Vāsiṭṭhas, they wrap the wheel-turning monarch's body in new linen cloth. Having wrapped it in new linen cloth, they wrap it in teased cotton-wool. Having wrapped it in teased cotton-wool, they wrap it in new linen cloth. Having done this five hundred times, they place the body in an iron oil-vat, cover it with an iron lid, make a pyre composed totally of perfumed substances, and cremate the body. Then they build a burial mound for the wheel-turning monarch at a great four-way intersection. That is the course that they follow with regard to the wheel-turning monarch's body. The course they follow with regard to a wheel-turning monarch's body, Vāsiṭṭhas, is the course that should be followed with regard to the Tathāgata's body. A burial mound for the Tathāgata is to be built at a great, four-way intersection. And those who offer a garland, a scent, or a perfume powder there, or bow down there, or brighten their minds there: that will be for their long-term welfare & happiness."

So the Kusinārā Mallans ordered their men, "In that case, I say, gather the Mallans' teased cotton-wool."

Then they wrapped the Blessed One's body in new linen cloth. Having wrapped it in new linen cloth, they wrapped it in teased cotton-wool. Having wrapped it in teased cotton-wool, they wrapped it in new linen cloth. Having done this five hundred times, they placed the body in an iron oil-vat, covered it with an iron lid, made a pyre composed totally of perfumed substances, and set the body on the pyre.

Now on that occasion Ven. Mahā Kassapa was traveling on the highway from Pāvā to Kusinārā with a large Saṅgha of monks, approximately 500 monks in all. Leaving the road, he sat down at the root of a tree. Meanwhile, a certain Ājīvakan ascetic, carrying a coral-tree flower from Kusinārā, was traveling on the highway to Pāvā. Ven. Mahā Kassapa saw the Ājīvakan ascetic coming from afar, and on seeing him said to him, "Do you know our teacher, friend?"

"Yes, friend, I know him. Seven days ago Gotama the contemplative totally unbound. That's how I got this coral-tree flower."

With that, some of the monks present who were not without passion wept, uplifting their arms. As if their feet were cut out from under them, they fell down and rolled back & forth, crying, "All too soon has the Blessed One totally unbound! All too soon has the One Well-Gone totally unbound! All too soon has the One with Eyes disappeared from the world!" But those monks who were free from passion acquiesced, mindful & alert: "Inconstant are fabrications. What else is there to expect?"

Now at that time a monk named Subhadda,[54] who had gone forth when old, was sitting among the group. He said to the monks, "Enough, friends. Don't grieve. Don't lament. We're well rid of the Great Contemplative. We've been harassed by (his saying,) 'This is allowable. This is not allowable.' But now we will do what we want to do, and not do what we don't want to do."[55]

Then Ven. Mahā Kassapa addressed the monks, "Enough, friends. Don't grieve. Don't lament. Hasn't the Blessed One already taught the state of growing different with regard to all things dear & appealing, the state of becoming separate, the state of becoming otherwise? What else is there to expect? It's impossible that one could forbid anything born, existent, fabricated, & subject to disintegration from disintegrating."

Then four leading Mallans, having bathed their heads and wearing new linen cloth, thinking, "We'll ignite the Blessed One's pyre," were unable to ignite it. So the Kusinārā Mallans asked Ven. Anuruddha, "What is the reason, Ven. Anuruddha, what is the cause, why these four leading Mallans, having bathed their heads and wearing new linen cloth, thinking, 'We'll ignite the Blessed One's pyre,' are unable to ignite it?"

"Your intention, Vāsiṭṭhas, is one thing. The devas' intention is another."

"But what, Ven. Anuruddha, is the devas' intention?"

"The devas' intention, Vāsiṭṭhas, is, 'This Ven. Mahā Kassapa is traveling on the highway from Pāvā to Kusinārā with a large Saṅgha of monks, approximately 500 monks in all. The Blessed One's pyre will not catch fire until Ven. Mahā Kassapa has worshipped the Blessed One's feet with his bathed head.'"

"Then let it be, venerable sir, in line with the devas' intention."

So Ven. Mahā Kassapa went to the Blessed One's pyre at Makuṭa-bandhana, the Mallans' memorial near Kusinārā. On arrival, arranging his robe over one shoulder, he placed his hands palm-to-palm over his heart, circumambulated the pyre three times, uncovered the Blessed One's feet,[56] and worshipped them with his head. And the 500 monks, arranging their robes over one shoulder, placed their hands palm-to-palm over their hearts, circumambulated the pyre three times, and worshipped the Blessed One's feet with their heads. As soon as it had been worshipped by Ven. Mahā Kassapa and the 500 monks, the Blessed One's pyre caught fire of its own accord. In the burning of the Blessed One's body, no cinder or ash of the outer skin, inner skin, flesh, tendons, or oil of the joints could be discerned. Only the bone-relics[57] remained. Just as in the burning of ghee or oil, no cinder or ash can be discerned; in the same way, in the burning of the Blessed One's body, no cinder or ash of the outer skin, inner skin, flesh, tendons, or oil of the joints could be discerned. Only the bone-relics remained. And of the five hundred twin-wrappings, only two were burnt: the innermost & the outermost.

When the Blessed One's body was consumed, a cascade of water falling from the sky extinguished *[nibbāpesi]* the Blessed One's pyre. Water shooting up from a Sal tree as well extinguished the Blessed One's pyre.

The Kusinārā Mallans, with all kinds of scented water, extinguished the Blessed One's pyre. Then for seven days the Kusinārā Mallans kept the bone-relics in their reception hall—setting them round with a lattice of spears surrounded by ramparts of bows—worshipping, honoring, respecting, & venerating them with dances, songs, music, garlands, & scents.

Then King Ajātasattu Vedehiputta of Magadha heard, "The Blessed One, they say, has totally unbound in Kusinārā." So he sent an envoy to the Kusinārā Mallans: "The Blessed One was a noble warrior. I, too, am a noble warrior. I deserve a share of the Blessed One's bone-relics. I, too, will build a burial mound and hold a ceremony for them."

The Licchavis of Vesālī heard, "The Blessed One, they say, has totally unbound in Kusinārā." So they sent an envoy to the Kusinārā Mallans: "The Blessed One was a noble warrior. We, too, are noble warriors. We deserve a share of the Blessed One's bone-relics. We, too, will build a burial mound and hold a ceremony for them."

The Sakyans of Kapilavatthu heard, "The Blessed One, they say, has totally unbound in Kusinārā." So they sent an envoy to the Kusinārā Mallans: "The Blessed One was the greatest of our relatives. We deserve a share of the Blessed One's bone-relics. We, too, will build a burial mound and hold a ceremony for them."

The Thulayans of Allakappa.... The Koḷiyans of Rāmagāma heard, "The Blessed One, they say, has totally unbound in Kusinārā." So they sent an envoy to the Kusinārā Mallans: "The Blessed One was a noble warrior. We, too, are noble warriors. We deserve a share of the Blessed One's bone-relics. We, too, will build a burial mound and hold a ceremony for them."

The brahman of Veṭṭha Island heard, "The Blessed One, they say, has totally unbound in Kusinārā." So he sent an envoy to the Kusinārā Mallans: "The Blessed One was a noble warrior. I am a brahman. I deserve a share of the Blessed One's bone-relics. I, too, will build a burial mound and hold a ceremony for them."

The Pāvā Mallans heard, "The Blessed One, they say, has totally unbound in Kusinārā." So they sent an envoy to the Kusinārā Mallans: "The Blessed One was a noble warrior. We, too, are noble warriors. We

deserve a share of the Blessed One's bone-relics. We, too, will build a burial mound and hold a ceremony for them."

When this was said, the Kusinārā Mallans said to the groups & factions, "The Blessed One totally unbound within the borders of our own town. We will not give up a share of the Blessed One's bone-relics."

When this was said, Doṇa the brahman addressed the groups & factions,

> "Listen, good sirs,
> to a word from me.
> Our Awakened One was a teacher
> of forbearance.
> It's not good that there should be combat
> over the sharing of the relics
> of the highest person.
> Let us, masters, unite in concord,
> on friendly terms,
> and make eight shares.
> Let there be
> burial mounds
> in the various directions,
> many people made confident
> in the One with Eyes."

"In that case, brahman, you yourself divide the Blessed One's bone-relics into eight equal shares."

Responding, "As you say, good sirs," to the groups & factions, Doṇa the brahman divided the Blessed One's bone-relics into eight equal shares and then said to the groups & factions, "Good sirs, give me this urn. I will build a burial mound and hold a ceremony for the urn." They gave him the urn.

Then the Moriyans of Pipphalivana heard, "The Blessed One, they say, has totally unbound in Kusinārā." So they sent an envoy to the Kusinārā Mallans: "The Blessed One was a noble warrior. We, too, are noble warriors. We deserve a share of the Blessed One's bone-relics. We, too, will build a burial mound and hold a ceremony for them."

"There is no (remaining) share of the Blessed One's bone-relics. They have been divided. Take the ashes from here." They took the ashes from there.

Then King Ajātasattu Vedehiputta of Magadha built a burial mound and held a ceremony for the Blessed One's relics in Rājagaha.

The Licchavis of Vesālī built a burial mound and held a ceremony for the Blessed One's relics in Vesālī.

The Sakyans of Kapilavatthu built a burial mound and held a ceremony for the Blessed One's relics in Kapilavatthu.

The Thulayans of Allakappa built a burial mound and held a ceremony for the Blessed One's relics in Allakappa.

The Koliyans of Rāmagāma built a burial mound and held a ceremony for the Blessed One's relics in Rāmagāma.

The brahman of Veṭṭha Island built a burial mound and held a ceremony for the Blessed One's relics on Veṭṭha Island.

The Pāvā Mallans built a burial mound and held a ceremony for the Blessed One's relics in Pāvā.

The Kusinārā Mallans built a burial mound and held a ceremony for the Blessed One's relics in Kusinārā.

Doṇa the brahman built a burial mound and held a ceremony for the urn.

The Moriyans of Pipphalivana built a burial mound and held a ceremony for the embers in Pipphalivana.

Thus there were eight burial mounds for the bone-relics, a ninth for the urn, and a tenth for the embers.

That is how it was in the past.

> Eight portions were the relics
> of the One with Eyes,
> the highest, the foremost of men:
> seven honored in Jambudīpa,
> and one in Rāmagāma
> honored by kings of the nāgas.

One tooth
the Devas of the Thirty-three worship;
one is honored in Gandhārapura;
one in the realm of the king of Kāliṅga;
another is honored by kings of the nāgas.

These, with their splendor,
their excellent gifts,
embellish this wealth-bearing earth.

Thus the relics of the One with Eyes
    are honored by those honored
    by those who are honored.
He is worshiped by deva kings,
nāga kings, human kings,
and likewise is worshiped
by the most excellent people.

So pay homage to him,
with hands palm-to-palm
over the heart,
for the Awakened are rarely encountered
    in the course of one hundred eons.[58]

## Notes

1. There is a play on words in this sentence, between *Tathāgata* ("one truly gone," or "one who has become true") and *vi-tathaṁ*, "untruthfully."

2. Notice that Vassakāra, by addressing the Buddha as "Master Gotama," shows a lesser degree of respect to the Buddha than King Ajātasattu had told him to. Vassakāra also appears in MN 108, AN 4:35, and AN 4:183, and in each instance displays a limited understanding of the Dhamma.

3. According to the Commentary, that is precisely what Vassakāra did, thus enabling King Ajātasattu to defeat the Vajjians without bloodshed. In addition to being ironic—showing how benighted Ajātasattu was, trying to get military advice from the Buddha—this passage has a poignant meaning for the Saṅgha. As the following passage shows, the conditions of no decline in the Saṅgha are not that different from those for no decline in the Vajjians. And although those conditions may prevail in the Saṅgha, the example of the Vajjians shows that

they can easily be abandoned. This passage thus serves as a warning not to be heedless. See also AN 5:77–80.

4. See AN 7:21.

5. See MN 29–30.

6. See MN 53 and AN 7:63.

7. See SN 46:51 and SN 46:53.

8. See AN 10:60.

9. The Burmese edition does not contain the word, "further," here.

10. See MN 48 and AN 6:12.

11. See MN 61.

12. See AN 10:95.

13. See Ud 8:6.

14. The translation here follows the Burmese and Sri Lankan editions of the text. The PTS version of the passage doesn't state the time of day, whereas the Thai version states that the Buddha went to the rest-house hall in the morning —which, given the events that follow, doesn't seem right, for he would have spent the entire day teaching the lay followers of Pāṭali Village.

15. Pāṭaliputta later became the capital of King Asoka's empire. The "breaking open of the seed-pods *(pūṭa-bhedana)*" is a wordplay on the last part of the city's name.

Archaeological evidence from what may have been part of Asoka's palace in Pāṭaliputta shows burnt wooden posts buried in mud—perhaps a sign that the palace burned and then was buried in a flood.

16. The five lower fetters are self-identification views, uncertainty, grasping at habits & practices, sensual desire, & ill will. The five higher fetters, abandoned by the arahant in addition to the lower five, are passion for form, passion for what is formless, conceit, restlessness, and ignorance. See AN 10:13.

17. The four pairs are (1) the person on the path to stream entry, the person experiencing the fruit of stream entry; (2) the person on the path to once-returning, the person experiencing the fruit of once-returning; (3) the person on the path to non-returning, the person experiencing the fruit of non-returning; (4) the person on the path to arahantship, the person experiencing the fruit of arahantship. The eight individuals are the eight types forming these four pairs.

18. For another way to gauge whether one has attained stream-entry, see MN 48. Notice that in this Dhamma-mirror, the Buddha gives criteria only for gauging one's own level of attainment, and not that of others. On this point, see AN 10:75.

19. Ambapālī apparently ordained as a nun later in life. Her verses are recorded in Thig 13:1.

20. Following the Thai edition. The Sinhalese and PTS editions have "we've been totally defeated *(parājitamhā)"* rather than "cheated" *(vañcitamhā);* the Burmese edition has Little Mango *(Ambakā)* instead of Little Ambapālī *(Ambapālikā).*

21. In other words, the Buddha had no esoteric version of the Dhamma that he taught only to an inner circle or a select class of privileged beings. The Dhamma that he taught to his close disciples was consistent with the Dhamma he taught at large.

22. In other words, he did not hold back any teachings from his students until he was about to die. As the narrative of this sutta makes clear, the teachings he taught up to the night of his unbinding were identical to the teachings he had taught for his entire career.

23. As the text will make clear, these are some of the locations where, in the past, the Buddha had commented to Ven. Ānanda on how refreshing the location was, implying that living on would not be a burden, and that he could, if he so desired, extend his life. The reference to these locations was apparently to remind Ānanda of what he had said there.

24. "And what is the base of power? Whatever path, whatever practice, leads to the attainment of power, the winning of power: That is called the base of power.

"And what is the development of the base of power? There is the case where a monk develops the base of power endowed with concentration founded on *desire* & the fabrications of exertion. He develops the base of power endowed with concentration founded on *persistence*… concentration founded on *intent*… concentration founded on *discrimination* & the fabrications of exertion. This is called the development of the base of power." — *SN 51:26*

25. An eon, in the Buddhist cosmology, is an immensely long stretch of time. According to the Commentary here, it can also mean the full lifespan of a human being in that particular period of the eon (Buddhist cosmology allows for a huge fluctuation in human lifespans over the course of an eon). The Commentary adopts this second meaning in this passage, and so takes the Buddha's statement here as meaning that a person who has developed the bases of power could live for a full lifespan or for a little bit more. In this case, the Pali for the last part of this compound, *kappāvasesaṁ,* would mean, "an eon plus a remainder."

26. DN 11 defines the miracle of instruction as instruction in training the mind to the point of where it gains release from all suffering and stress.

27. In other words, the Buddha relinquished the will to live longer. It was this relinquishment that led to his total unbinding three months later.

28. Reading *tulaṁ* as a present participle.

29. The image is of splitting a coat of mail with an arrow.

30. *Anupādisesa-nibbāna-dhātu.* Unbinding as experienced by an arahant at death. According to Iti 44, there are two unbinding properties: that with fuel remaining, and that with no fuel remaining. The first refers to unbinding as experienced before death. The second, to unbinding as experienced after death. Thag 15:2 hints at the image behind these terms. The first unbinding property corresponds to a fire that has gone out but whose embers are still glowing. The second, to a fire so totally out that no glowing embers remain. See the discussion in The Mind Like Fire Unbound, chapter 1.

31. This list is apparently a description both of the ways in which beings on different levels of the cosmos are percipient, and of experiences that a meditator —particularly one who is inclined to visions—might have. AN 10:29 adds this comment to the list:

"Now, of these eight dimensions of mastery, this is supreme: when one percipient of the formless internally sees forms externally as white, white in their color, white in their features, white in their glow. And there are beings who are percipient in this way. Yet even in the beings who are percipient in this way there is still aberration, there is change. Seeing this, the instructed disciple of the noble ones grows disenchanted with that. Being disenchanted with that, he becomes dispassionate toward what is supreme, and even more so toward what is inferior."

32. This, too, is a list of the stages of meditation as experienced by one who is inclined to visions.

These lists of eight factors are not randomly chosen. They all highlight the grandeur of the Buddha's attainment, and add to the marvelous savor of this entire passage.

33. These are the 37 *bodhi-pakkhiya-dhammas*. For a full account, see *The Wings to awakening.*

34. The Buddha will repeat these two statements as his last exhortation before his total unbinding. On the topic of heedfulness, see SN 35:97 and SN 55:40. On the topic of consummation, see MN 53.

35. The Mātikā is a list of dhamma-topics—such as the 37 Wings to awakening—that formed the basis for the Abhidhamma.

36. The Commentary notes a wide range of opinions on what "pig-delicacy" means. The opinion given in the Mahā Aṭṭhakathā—the primary source for the Commentary we now have—is that pig-delicacy is tender pork. Other opinions include soft bamboo shoots or mushrooms that pigs like to nibble on, or a special elixir. Given that India has long had a history of giving fanciful names to its foods and elixirs, it's hard to say for sure what the Buddha ate for his last meal.

37. This style of narrative—in which prose passages alternate with verses retelling parts of what was narrated in the prose—is called a *campū.* This is one of the few passages in the Canon where this style is used, two others being the Kuṇāla Jātaka (J 5:416-456) and Udāna 8:5, which also narrates these events, minus the Buddha's conversation with Pukkusa Mallaputta. The fact that this is the only section of this sutta using this style suggests that perhaps the version of the narrative given in Ud 8:5 was composed first as a separate piece and then later incorporated into this sutta.

38. Ven. Ānanda's description of the water is alliterative in the Pali: *sātodakā sītodakā setodakā.*

39. The narrative in Ud 8:5 skips from this poem to the place in the narrative where the Buddha goes to the Kakudha River, skipping over the story of Pukkusa Mallaputta.

40. Āḷāra Kālāma was the teacher from whom the Buddha, before his awakening, learned how to attain the dimension of nothingness, one of the formless attainments. See MN 26. The Vibhaṅga to Pārājika 4 indicates that the purity of one's mastery of any of these formless attainments can be measured by the extent to which one does not hear sounds while in that attainment. The same passage also indicates that if one *does* hear sounds, that does not mean that one has not achieved that attainment, simply that one's mastery of the attainment is not entirely pure. It further indicates that "purity" here does not mean purity from defilements. After all, in the Vibhaṅga to Pārājika 4, Ven. Mahā Moggallāna's attainment of the formless states is said to be impure, and yet he is an arahant. "Purity" refers instead to the strength of one's concentration.

41. *Āyasmant:* This is a term of respect usually reserved for senior monks. The Buddha's using it here was probably meant to emphasize the point that Cunda's gift of the Buddha's last meal should be treated as a very honorable thing.

42. Up to this point in the sutta, the standard phrase describing the Buddha's act of lying down to rest ends with the phrase, "having made a mental note to get up." Here, however, the Buddha is lying down for the last time and will pass away in this posture, so he makes no mental note to get up.

43. SN 12:67 states: "If a monk practices for the sake of disenchantment, dispassion, & cessation with regard to aging-&-death… birth… becoming… clinging/sustenance… craving… feeling… contact… the six sense media… name-&-form… consciousness… fabrications… ignorance, he deserves to be called a monk who practices the Dhamma in accordance with the Dhamma." SN 22:39 states: "For a monk practicing the Dhamma in accordance with the Dhamma, what accords with the Dhamma is this: that he keep cultivating disenchantment with regard to form, that he keep cultivating disenchantment with regard to feeling, that he keep cultivating disenchantment with regard to perception, that he keep cultivating disenchantment with regard to fabrications, that he keep cultivating disenchantment with regard to consciousness." SN 22:40–41 add that this is to be done by remaining focused on stress, inconstancy, and not-self with regard to the five aggregates.

44. From Vedic times, it has been considered auspicious in India to gaze on a holy person or heavenly being, and to be gazed on by such a being as well. Here the fact that heavenly beings themselves want to gaze on the Buddha indicates the high regard they have for him (this is also the motive for their Great Meeting in DN 20); the phrase later in this paragraph, "the One with Eyes," indicates that they also regarded his gaze as highly auspicious for them. Later passages in this discourse indicate that human beings have similar feelings about the auspiciousness of the Buddha's gaze and the Buddha as an object of one's own gaze. A great deal of the later history of Buddhism in India—including devotional practice, Buddhology, meditation practice, and even the architecture of monasteries—grew out of the continuing desire to have a vision of the Buddha and to be gazed on by the Buddha, even after his Parinibbāna.

It is sometimes assumed, based on a passage in SN 22:87, that the Pali Canon is uniformly negative toward this aspect of Buddhist tradition. There, Ven. Vakkali, who is ill, states that "For a long time have I wanted to come & see the Blessed One, but I haven't had the bodily strength to do so," and the Buddha comforts him, "Enough, Vakkali. Why do you want to see this filthy body? Whoever sees the Dhamma sees me; whoever sees me sees the Dhamma." It should be noted, however, that the Buddha's treatment of this topic is sensitive to the context. In SN 22:87, he is talking to a monk who (1) is too sick to come

see the Buddha on his own strength; and (2) is on the verge of arahantship. Here in DN 16, however, the Buddha dismisses Ven. Upavāṇa so as to honor the desire of the devas who want to see him in his last hour; and he sends Ven. Ānanda into Kusinārā to inform the lay people there so that they too will be able to see him in his last hour. His motive here may be similar to that given for encouraging the building of a burial mound dedicated to him: seeing him will help human & heavenly beings brighten their minds, and that will be for their long-term welfare & happiness. Thus the attitudes expressed on this topic in the Pali Canon, when taken in their entirety, are more complex than is generally recognized.

45. Reading *chinna-pada* with the Thai edition.

46. The desire to have one's name announced to a holy person appears to have been a part of pre-Buddhist devotional practice in India. This passage, along with others in the Canon (see, for example, MN 89), indicates that it was quickly adopted into Buddhist devotional practice as well. It lived on in later Buddhist practice in the custom of having the donor's name inscribed in bas-reliefs and other offerings placed near or on a stupa, even in locations where the name would not be visible to human eyes.

47. The commentary notes that Subhadda makes this statement based on non-Buddhist practices he knew from his previous sectarian affiliation.

48. The Cullavagga (XI.9) tells of how the monks at the First Council could not agree on which rules should be classed as lesser & minor. Ven. Ānanda himself confessed that he neglected to ask the Buddha on this point. One of the monks made a motion that—because many of the rules affect the laity, and the laity would look down on the monks for rescinding them after the Buddha's death—none of the rules should be rescinded. This motion was adopted by the Council.

49. A monk named Channa is depicted at several spots in the Vinaya as despising all other monks on the grounds that "The Buddha is mine, the Dhamma is mine, it was by my young master that the Dhamma was realized." (Saṅghādisesa 12) This would fit in with the post-canonical tradition identifying Channa as the horseman who accompanied the young Prince Siddhartha on the night of the latter's Great Renunciation. Two rules in the Vinaya—Saṅghādisesa 12 & Pācittiya 12—depict him as devious & impossible to admonish. Cv.XI reports events after the Parinibbāna, telling of how news of the brahma-penalty shocked Channa to his senses. As a result, he changed his ways and eventually became an arahant. As Ven. Ānanda then explains in that passage, the brahma-

penalty was automatically lifted at the moment of Ven. Channa's final attainment. SN 22:90 tells a different version of how Ven. Channa changed his attitude and broke through to the Dhamma.

50. Ven. Ānanda, assuming that the Buddha has passed away, addresses Ven. Anuruddha—his senior—as "venerable sir," in line with the Buddha's instructions.

51. This is one of the earthquakes forecast in Part III.

52. See AN 5:49 and AN 5:57.

53. This apparently refers to the devas who are non-returners, living in the Pure Abodes.

54. A different Subhadda from the Buddha's last direct-witness disciple.

55. In Cullavagga XI.1, Ven. Mahā Kassapa cites this statement as good reason to hold a council for standardizing the Dhamma & Vinaya "before what is not-dhamma shines out and dhamma is obscured, before what is not-discipline shines out and discipline is obscured; before those who speak what is not-dhamma become strong and those who speak what is dhamma become weak; before those who speak what is not-discipline become strong and those who speak what is discipline become weak." Thus the First Council was held during the Rains retreat following the Buddha's Parinibbāna.

56. The commentary notes that Ven. Mahā Kassapa entered the fourth jhāna, which he used as the basis for a feat of psychic power so that the Buddha's feet would appear out of their extensive wrappings.

57. Up to this point in the narrative, the Buddha's body is called a *sarīra* (singular). Here the noun becomes plural—with the meaning of "relics"—and remains plural for the remainder of the narrative.

58. According to the Commentary, this closing poem was added to the sutta by elder monks in Sri Lanka. The Thai, Sri Lankan, and Burmese editions end the sutta with a further, fairly anticlimactic, verse that appears to be an even later composition:

> Altogether forty teeth,
> and all the head-hairs & body-hairs
> were taken by the devas
> one after another
> around the universe.

# *The Great Meeting*
# *Mahā Samaya Sutta (DN 20)*

## Introduction

*This discourse is an interesting example of the folklore of the Pali Canon. It shows that the tendency of Asian popular Buddhism to regard the Buddha as a protective figure, and not just as a teacher, has its roots in the earliest part of the tradition. Metrical analysis indicates that the long "tribute" section of this discourse is very old, while the verses in the introductory section—which is also found in the Saṁyutta Nikāya—are later. This fits with a more subjective judgment: that the tribute was an earlier composition, to which the introduction was added at a later date. This judgment is based on the fact that the two sections do not quite fit each other. The introduction to the tribute indicates that the reciter of the tribute is the Buddha himself, whereas the narration in the tribute indicates otherwise. The style of the tribute—with its repeated stanzas and tropes—also falls into the ancient genre of verses celebrating a king's victory over his enemies*

*At any rate, this discourse is the closest thing in the Pali Canon to a "who's who" of the deva worlds, and should provide useful material for anyone interested in the cosmology of early Buddhism.*

*The Commentary reports the belief that devas still enjoy hearing this discourse chanted in Pali. Until recently it was part of many monks' standard memorized repertoire, to be chanted at weddings and the dedication of new buildings. Even today, as many of the traditions of memorization in Asia seem to be falling by the wayside, there are a few monks and laypeople who chant this discourse regularly.*

* * *

I have heard that on one occasion the Blessed One was dwelling among the Sakyans at Kapilavatthu in the Great Forest, together with a

large Saṅgha of approximately five hundred monks, all of them arahants. And most of the devatās from ten world-systems had gathered in order to see the Blessed One & the Saṅgha of monks.

Then the thought occurred to four devatās of the ranks from the Pure Abodes: "The Blessed One is dwelling among the Sakyans at Kapilavatthu in the Great Forest, together with a large Saṅgha of about five hundred monks, all of them arahants. And most of the devatās from ten world-systems have gathered in order to see the Blessed One & the Saṅgha of monks. Let us also approach the Blessed One and, on arrival, let us each speak a verse in his presence."

Then, just as a strong man might extend his flexed arm or flex his extended arm, those devatās disappeared from among the Devas of the Pure Abodes and reappeared before the Blessed One. Having paid homage to him, they stood to one side. As they were standing there, one devatā recited this verse in the Blessed One's presence:

"A great meeting in the woods:
The deva hosts have assembled.
We have come to this Dhamma meeting
to see the unvanquished Saṅgha."

Then another devatā recited this verse in the Blessed One's presence:

"There the monks are concentrated,
have straightened their own minds.
Like a charioteer holding the reins,
the wise ones guard their faculties."

Then another devatā recited this verse in the Blessed One's presence:

"Having cut through barrenness, cut the cross-bar,
having uprooted Indra's pillar, unstirred,
they wander about pure, unstained,
young nāgas[1] well tamed by the One with Eyes."

Then another devatā recited this verse in the Blessed One's presence:

"Those who have gone to the Buddha for refuge

will not go to the plane of woe.
On discarding the human body,
they will fill the hosts of the devas."

Then the Blessed One addressed the monks: "Monks, most of the devatās

from ten world-systems have gathered in order to see the Tathāgata & the Saṅgha of monks. Those who, in the past, were Worthy Ones, Rightly Self-

awakened, at most had their devatā-gathering like mine at the present. Those

who, in the future, will be Worthy Ones, Rightly Self-awakened, will at most have their devatā-gathering like mine at the present.

"I will tell you the names of the deva hosts. I will describe to you the names of the deva hosts. I will teach you the names of the deva hosts. Listen & pay close attention. I will speak."

"As you say, lord," the monks responded to the Blessed One.

The Blessed One said:

I will recite a verse of tribute.
Those who live where spirits dwell,
who live in mountain caves, resolute, concentrated,
many, like hidden lions, who have overcome horripilation,
white-hearted, pure, serene, & undisturbed:

Knowing that more than 500 of them
had come to the forest of Kapilavatthu,
the Teacher then said to them,
disciples delighting in his instruction,
"The deva hosts have approached. Detect them, monks!"
Listening to the Awakened One's instruction,
they made an ardent effort.
Knowledge appeared to them, vision of non-human beings.
Some saw 100, some 1,000, some 70,000,
some had vision of 100,000 non-human beings.
Some gained vision of innumerable devas

filling every direction.

Realizing all this,
the One-with-Vision felt moved to speak.
The Teacher then said to them,
disciples delighting in his instruction,
"The deva hosts have approached. Detect them, monks,
as I describe their glories, one by one.

7,000 yakkhas inhabiting the land of Kāpilavatthu,
powerful, effulgent, glamorous, prestigious,
rejoicing, have approached the monks' forest meeting.

6,000 yakkhas from the Himālayas, of varied hue,
powerful, effulgent, glamorous, prestigious,
rejoicing, have approached the monks' forest meeting.

From Mount Sāta 3,000 yakkhas of varied hue,
powerful, effulgent, glamorous, prestigious,
rejoicing, have approached the monks' forest meeting.

These 16,000 yakkhas of varied hue
powerful, effulgent, glamorous, prestigious,
rejoicing, have approached the monks' forest meeting.

500 yakkhas from Vessāmitta, of varied hue,
powerful, effulgent, glamorous, prestigious,
rejoicing, have approached the monks' forest meeting.

Kumbhīra from Rājagaha,
who dwells on Mount Vepulla,
attended to by more than 100,000 yakkhas—
Kumbhīra from Rājagaha:
He, too, has come to the forest meeting.

And Dhataraṭṭha, who rules as king of the Eastern Direction,
as lord of the gandhabbas: A glorious, great king is he,
and many are his sons named Indra, of great strength.
Powerful, effulgent, glamorous, prestigious,
rejoicing, they have approached the monks' forest meeting.

And Virūḷha, who rules as king of the Southern Direction,
as lord of the kumbaṇḍas: A glorious, great king is he,

and many are his sons named Indra, of great strength.
Powerful, effulgent, glamorous, prestigious,
rejoicing, they have approached the monks' forest meeting.

And Virūpakkha, who rules as king of the Western Direction,
as lord of the nāgas: A glorious, great king is he,
and many are his sons named Indra, of great strength.
Powerful, effulgent, glamorous, prestigious,
rejoicing, they have approached the monks' forest meeting.

And Kuvera, who rules as king of the Northern Direction,
as lord of the yakkhas: A glorious, great king is he,
and many are his sons named Indra, of great strength.
Powerful, effulgent, glamorous, prestigious,
rejoicing, they have approached the monks' forest meeting.

Dhataraṭṭha from the Eastern Direction,
Virūḷhaka from the South,
Virūpakkha from the West,
Kuvera from the Northern Direction:
These four Great Kings encompassing the four directions,
resplendent, stand in the Kāpilavatthu forest.

Their deceitful vassals have also come
—deceptive, treacherous—
Māyā, Kuṭeṇḍu, Veṭeṇḍu, Viṭu with Viṭuṭa,
Candana, the Chief of Sensuality,
Kinnughaṇḍu, Nighaṇḍu,
Panāda, the Mimic, Mātali, the deva's charioteer,
Cittasena the gandhabba, King Naḷa, the Bull of the People,
Pañcasikha has come
with Timbaru [and his daughter,] Suriyavacchasā
[SunDazzle].[2]
These & other kings, gandhabbas with their kings,
rejoicing, have approached the monks' forest meeting.

Then there have also come nāgas
from Lake Nābhasa, Vesālī & Tacchaka.
Kambalas, Assataras, Pāyāgas, & their kin.
And from the River Yāmuna

comes the prestigious nāga, Dhataraṭṭha.
The great nāga Erāvaṇṇa:
He, too, has come to the forest meeting.

> They who swoop down swiftly on nāga kings,
> divine, twice-born, winged, their eyesight pure:
> (Garuḍas) came from the sky to the midst of the forest.
> Citra & Supaṇṇa are their names.
> But the Buddha made the nāga kings safe,
> made them secure from Supaṇṇa.
> Addressing one another with affectionate words,
> the nāgas & Supaṇṇas made the Buddha their refuge.

Defeated by Indra of the thunderbolt hand,
Asuras dwelling in the ocean,
Vāsava's brothers—powerful, prestigious—
Greatly terrifying Kālakañjas, the Dānaveghasa asuras,
Vepacitti & Sucitti, Pahārāda, with Namucī,
and Bali's hundred sons, all named Veroca,
arrayed with powerful armies
have approached their honored Rāhu
[and said]: "Now is the occasion, sir,
of the monk's forest meeting."

Devas of water, earth, fire, & wind have come here.
Varuṇas, Vāruṇas, Soma together with Yasa,
the prestigious devas of the hosts
of goodwill & compassion have come.
These ten ten-fold hosts, all of varied hue,
powerful, effulgent, glamorous, prestigious,
rejoicing, have approached the monks' forest meeting.

Veṇḍu [Viṣṇu] & Sahalī,
Asama & the Yama twins,
the devas dependent on the moon
surrounding the moon have come.
The devas dependent on the sun
surrounding the sun have come.
Devas surrounding the zodiac stars

and the sprites of the clouds have come.
Sakka, chief of the Vasus, the ancient donor, has come.
These ten ten-fold hosts, all of varied hue,
powerful, effulgent, glamorous, prestigious,
rejoicing, have approached the monks' forest meeting.

Then come the Sahabhu devas,
blazing like crests of fire-flame.
The Ariṭṭakas, Rojas, cornflower blue.
Varuṇas & Sahadhammas, Accutas & Anejakas,
Sūleyyas & Ruciras, and Vāsavanesis have come.
These ten ten-fold hosts, all of varied hue,
powerful, effulgent, glamorous, prestigious,
rejoicing, have approached the monks' forest meeting.

Samānas, Great Samānas, Mānusas, Super Mānusas,
the devas corrupted by play have come,
as well as devas corrupted by mind.[3]
Then come green-gold devas and those wearing red.
Pāragas, Great Pāragas, prestigious devas have come.
These ten ten-fold hosts, all of varied hue,
powerful, effulgent, glamorous, prestigious,
rejoicing, have approached the monks' forest meeting.

White devas, ruddy-green devas, dawn-devas
have come with the Veghanas
headed by devas totally in white.
The Vicakkhaṇas have come.
Sadāmatta, Hāragajas, & the prestigious multi-coloreds,
Pajunna, the thunderer, who brings rain to the lands:
These ten ten-fold hosts, all of varied hue,
powerful, effulgent, glamorous, prestigious,
rejoicing, have approached the monks' forest meeting.

The Khemiyas, Tusitas, & Yāmas, the prestigious Kaṭṭhakas,
Lambitakas & Lāma chiefs, the Jotināmas & Āsavas,
the Nimmānaratis have come, as have the Paranimmitas.
These ten ten-fold hosts, all of varied hue,
powerful, effulgent, glamorous, prestigious,

rejoicing, have approached the monks' forest meeting.

These 60 deva groups, all of varied hue,
have come arranged in order,
together with others in like manner (thinking:)
"We'll see the one who has transcended birth,
who has no bounds, who has crossed over the flood,
effluent-free,
the Mighty One, crossing over the flood,
like the moon emerging from the dark fortnight."

Subrahmā and Paramatta Brahmā,
together with sons of the Powerful One,
Sanaṅkumāra and Tissa:
They too have come to the forest meeting.
Great Brahmā, who stands over 1,000 Brahmā worlds,
who arose there spontaneously, effulgent:
Prestigious is he, with a terrifying body.[4]
And ten Brahmā sovereigns, each the lord of his own realm—
and in their midst has come Hārita Brahmā
surrounded by his retinue."

When all these devas with Indras & Brahmās had come,
    Māra's army came as well.
Now look at the Dark One's foolishness!
[He said:] "Come seize them! Bind them!
Tie them down with passion!
Surround them on every side!
Don't let anyone at all escape!"
Thus the great warlord urged on his dark army,
slapping the ground with his hand,
making a horrendous din, as when
a storm cloud bursts with thunder,
lightning, & torrents of rain.
But then he withdrew—enraged,
with none under his sway.

    Realizing all this,
the One-with-Vision felt moved to speak.

The Teacher then said to them,
disciples delighting in his instruction,
"Māra's army has approached. Detect them, monks!"
Listening to the Awakened One's instruction,
    they made an ardent effort.
The army retreated from those without passion,
without raising even a hair on their bodies.
Having all won the battle—prestigious, past fear—
    they rejoice with all beings:
disciples outstanding among the human race.

## Notes

1. Here *nāga* means "Great Being." It is frequently used in this sense as an epithet for arahants. The verse containing this line is set in one of the most complex meters found in the Pali Canon.

2. See DN 21.

3. DN 1 reports that devas corrupted by play and corrupted by mind, on falling to the human state and then remembering their previous lives, hold views of partial eternalism. Their accounts of why they hold these views incidentally show what "corrupted by play" and "corrupted by mind" mean:

> "Those honorable devas who are not corrupted by play don't spend an excessive amount of time indulging in the delights of laughter & play. Because they don't spend an excessive amount of time indulging in the delights of laughter & play, their mindfulness doesn't become muddled. Because of unmuddled mindfulness, they don't fall from that company. They are constant, permanent, eternal, not subject to change, and will stay just like that as long as eternity. But those of us who were corrupted by play spent an excessive amount of time indulging in the delights of laughter & play. Because we spent an excessive amount of time indulging in the delights of laughter & play, our mindfulness became muddled. Because of muddled mindfulness, we fell from that company and—inconstant, impermanent, short-lived, subject to falling—have come to this world.'" — *DN 1*

> "Those honorable devas who are not corrupted in mind don't spend an excessive amount of time staring at one another. Because they don't spend an excessive amount of time staring at one another, their minds

don't become corrupted toward one another. Because they are uncorrupted in mind toward one another, they don't grow exhausted in body or exhausted in mind. They don't fall from that company. They are constant, permanent, eternal, not subject to change, and will stay just like that as long as eternity. But those of us who were corrupted in mind spent an excessive amount of time staring at one another. Because we spent an excessive amount of time staring at one another, our minds became corrupted toward one another. Because we were corrupted in mind toward one another, we grew exhausted in body & exhausted in mind. We fell from that company and—inconstant, impermanent, short-lived, subject to falling—have come to this world.'" — *DN 1*

4. DN 1 tells how the Great Brahmā appears spontaneously at the beginning of an eon, and how he and his retinue become deluded about his creative powers:

"There ultimately comes a time when, with the passing of a long stretch of time, this world devolves. When the world is devolving, beings for the most part head toward the Radiant (Brahmās). There they stay: mind-made, feeding on rapture, self-luminous, coursing through the air, established in beauty for a long stretch of time. Then there ultimately comes a time when, with the passing of a long stretch of time, this world evolves. When the world is evolving, an empty Brahmā palace appears. Then a certain being—from the exhaustion of his life span or the exhaustion of his merit—falls from the company of the Radiant and re-arises in the empty Brahmā palace. And there he still stays mind-made, feeding on rapture, self-luminous, coursing through the air, established in beauty for a long stretch of time.

"After dwelling there alone for a long time, he experiences displeasure & agitation: 'O, if only other beings would come to this world!'

"Then other beings, through the ending of their life span or the ending of their merit, fall from the company of the Radiant and reappear in the Brahmā palace, in the company of that being. And there they still stay mind-made, feeding on rapture, self-luminous, coursing through the air, established in beauty for a long stretch of time.

"Then the thought occurred to the being who reappeared first: 'I am Brahmā, the Great Brahmā, the Conqueror, the Unconquered, the All-Seeing, All-Powerful, the Sovereign Lord, the Maker, Creator, Chief,

> Appointer and Ruler, Father of All That Have Been and Shall Be. These beings were created by me. Why is that? First the thought occurred to me, "O, if only other beings would come to this world!" And thus my direction of will brought these beings to this world.' As for the beings who reappear later, this thought occurred to them: 'This is Brahmā… Father of All That Have Been and Shall Be. We were created by this Brahmā. Why is that? We saw that he appeared here before, while we appeared after.' The being who reappeared first was of longer life span, more beautiful, & more influential, while the beings who reappeared later were of shorter life span, less beautiful, & less influential." — *DN 1*

*See also: DN 11; DN 21; SN 1:20; SN 4; SN 5; SN 6:1–2; SN 6:15; SN 9; SN 10:12; SN 11:3; SN 11:5; SN 55:25, SN 56:11*

# *Sakka's Questions (Excerpt)*
# *Sakka-pañha Sutta (DN 21)*

## Introduction

*In this sutta, Sakka, the deva king, asks questions of the Buddha concerning the sources of conflict. The apparent reason for his questions is alluded to at the end of the sutta: He had recently engaged in a war with the asuras—a race of beings that, like the Titans in Greek mythology—had challenged the devas for control of heaven. Thus the question of conflict and its avoidance would understandably be high on his mind.*

*The first section of the sutta, not translated here, contains one the prime examples of ironic humor in the Canon. In it, Sakka sends a gandhabba—a celestial musician, an inhabitant of the lowest level of the celestial heavens—to sing a song for the Buddha, to put him in the mood to converse with a deva. The gandhabba, however, knows only one song related to the Dhamma, a song he composed for a lady gandhabba shortly before the Buddha's awakening. He is so preoccupied with sensual lust that, even though he tries to please the Buddha by making references to the Buddha himself and to arahants in his song, he simply shows his complete misunderstanding of their Dhamma.*

*My lady SunDazzle,*
*I revere your father, Timbaru,*
*who sired such a lovely lady—*
*the mother of my joy.*

*As a breeze is pleasing to one who is sweating,*
*or a drink to one who thirsts,*
*you, radiant one, are dear to me,*
*as the Dhamma is to an arahant.*

*Like medicine for the afflicted,*
*like food for the hungry,*

*calm me, lady,*
*like water for a fire ablaze.*

*As an elephant, overcome by summer's heat,*
*plunges into a lotus pond—*
*cool, covered with stamens & pollen—*
*so I would plunge*
*into your bosom & breasts.*

*Like an elephant*
*beyond the power of the goad,*
*unfazed by lances & hooks,*
*I have no sense of what's proper to do,*
*intoxicated by the shape of your thighs.*

*My heart is filled with yearning,*
*my heart is utterly changed.*
*Like a fish having swallowed the hook*
*I cannot turn back.*

*O, lady of gorgeous thighs,*
*embrace me.*
*Embrace me,*
*O lady of languid eye.*
*Hold me tight, my lovely:*
*That is my highest wish.*

*Though small at first, my desire—*
*O you of wavy hair—*
*has grown to manifold power*
*like an offering to an arahant.*

*May the fruit of the merit*
*from deeds I've done for arahants*
*ripen in being with you,*
*lady lovely in every limb.*

*May the fruit of the merit*
*from deeds I've done in all the world,*
*ripen in being with you,*
*lady lovely in every limb.*

*Like the Buddha—through jhāna,*
*one-pointed, intent, & mindful,*
*a sage longing for the deathless—*
*so I long, SunDazzle, for you.*

*As a sage would rejoice*
*in gaining the supreme awakening,*
*so would I, my lovely,*
*in mingling with you.*

*If Sakka, lord of the Thirty-three,*
*were to grant me a wish,*
*I would choose you, my lady:*
*My passion is so strong.*

*As I would to a Sal tree*
*not long in bloom,*
*I honor & bow to your father,*
*O wise one,*
*who engendered someone like you.*

*After this comic interlude, Sakka approaches the Buddha, and the discussion eventually turns serious. That is the part of the sutta translated here.*

* * *

Having been given leave by the Blessed One, Sakka the deva-king asked him his first question: "Fettered with what, dear sir—though they think, 'May we live free from hostility, free from violence, free from rivalry, free from ill will, free from those who are hostile'—do devas, human beings, asuras, nāgas, gandhabbas, & whatever other many kinds of beings there are, nevertheless live in hostility, violence, rivalry, ill will, with those who are hostile?"

Thus Sakka asked his first question of the Blessed One, and the Blessed One, when asked, replied: "Devas, human beings, asuras, nāgas, gandhabbas, & whatever other many kinds of beings there are, are fettered with envy & stinginess, which is why—even though they think, 'May we live free from hostility, free from violence, free from rivalry, free from ill

will, free from those who are hostile'—they nevertheless live in hostility, violence, rivalry, ill will, with those who are hostile."

Thus the Blessed One answered, having been asked by Sakka the deva-king. Gratified, Sakka was delighted in & expressed his approval of the Blessed One's words: "So it is, O Blessed One. So it is, O One Well-Gone. Hearing the Blessed One's answer to my question, my doubt is now cut off, my perplexity is overcome."

Then Sakka, having delighted in & expressed his approval of the Blessed One's words, asked him a further question: "But what, dear sir, is the cause of envy & stinginess, what is their origination, what gives them birth, what is their source? When what exists do they come into being? When what doesn't exist do they not?"

"Envy & stinginess have dear-&-not-dear as their cause, have dear-&-not-dear as their origination, have dear-&-not-dear as what gives them birth, have dear-&-not-dear as their source. When dear-&-not-dear exist, they come into being. When dear-&-not-dear are not, they don't."

"But what, dear sir, is the cause of dear-&-not-dear, what is their origination, what gives them birth, what is their source? When what exists do they come into being? When what doesn't exist do they not?"

"Dear-&-not-dear have desire as their cause, have desire as their origination, have desire as what gives them birth, have desire as their source. When desire exists, they come into being. When desire is not, they don't."

"But what, dear sir, is the cause of desire, what is its origination, what gives it birth, what is its source? When what exists does it come into being? When what doesn't exist does it not?"

"Desire has thinking as its cause, has thinking as its origination, has thinking as what gives it birth, has thinking as its source. When thinking exists, desire comes into being. When thinking is not, it doesn't."

"But what, dear sir, is the cause of thinking, what is its origination, what gives it birth, what is its source? When what exists does it come into being? When what doesn't exist does it not?"

"Thinking has the perceptions & categories of objectification[1] as its cause, has the perceptions & categories of objectification as its origination,

has the perceptions & categories of objectification as what gives it birth, has the perceptions & categories of objectification as its source. When the perceptions & categories of objectification exist, thinking comes into being. When the perceptions & categories of objectification are not, it doesn't."

"And how has he practiced, dear sir: the monk who has practiced the practice leading to the right cessation of the perceptions & categories of objectification?"

"Joy is of two sorts, I tell you, deva-king: to be pursued & not to be pursued. Grief is of two sorts: to be pursued & not to be pursued. Equanimity is of two sorts: to be pursued & not to be pursued.[2]

"'Joy is of two sorts, I tell you, deva-king: to be pursued & not to be pursued.' Thus was it said. And in reference to what was it said? When one knows of a feeling of joy, 'As I pursue this joy, unskillful mental qualities increase, and skillful mental qualities decline,' that sort of joy is not to be pursued. When one knows of a feeling of joy, 'As I pursue this joy, unskillful mental qualities decline, and skillful mental qualities increase,' that sort of joy is to be pursued. And this sort of joy may be accompanied by directed thought & evaluation or free of directed thought & evaluation. Of the two, the latter is the more refined. 'Joy is of two sorts, I tell you, deva-king: to be pursued & not to be pursued.' Thus was it said. And in reference to this was it said.

"'Grief is of two sorts, I tell you: to be pursued & not to be pursued.' Thus was it said. And in reference to what was it said? When one knows of a feeling of grief, 'As I pursue this grief, unskillful mental qualities increase, and skillful mental qualities decline,' that sort of grief is not to be pursued. When one knows of a feeling of grief, 'As I pursue this grief, unskillful mental qualities decline, and skillful mental qualities increase,' that sort of grief is to be pursued. And this sort of grief may be accompanied by directed thought & evaluation or free of directed thought & evaluation. Of the two, the latter is the more refined. 'Grief is of two sorts, I tell you: to be pursued & not to be pursued.' Thus was it said. And in reference to this was it said.

"'Equanimity is of two sorts, I tell you: to be pursued & not to be pursued.' Thus was it said. And in reference to what was it said? When one

knows of a feeling of equanimity, 'As I pursue this equanimity, unskillful mental qualities increase, and skillful mental qualities decline,' that sort of equanimity is not to be pursued. When one knows of a feeling of equanimity, 'As I pursue this equanimity, unskillful mental qualities decline, and skillful mental qualities increase,' that sort of equanimity is to be pursued. And this sort of equanimity may be accompanied by directed thought & evaluation or free of directed thought & evaluation. Of the two, the latter is the more refined. 'Equanimity is of two sorts, I tell you: to be pursued & not to be pursued.' Thus was it said. And in reference to this was it said.

"This is how he has practiced, deva-king: the monk who has practiced the practice leading to the right cessation of the perceptions & categories of objectification."

Thus the Blessed One answered, having been asked by Sakka the deva-king. Gratified, Sakka was delighted in & expressed his approval of the Blessed One's words: "So it is, O Blessed One. So it is, O One Well-Gone. Hearing the Blessed One's answer to my question, my doubt is now cut off, my perplexity is overcome."

Then Sakka, having delighted in & expressed his approval of the Blessed One's words, asked him a further question: "But how has he practiced, dear sir: the monk who has practiced for restraint in the Pāṭimokkha?"

"Bodily conduct is of two sorts, I tell you, deva-king: to be pursued & not to be pursued. Verbal conduct is of two sorts: to be pursued & not to be pursued. Searching is of two sorts: to be pursued & not to be pursued.

"'Bodily conduct is of two sorts, I tell you, deva-king: to be pursued & not to be pursued.' Thus was it said. And in reference to what was it said? When one knows of bodily conduct, 'As I pursue this bodily conduct, unskillful mental qualities increase, and skillful mental qualities decline,' that sort of bodily conduct is not to be pursued. When one knows of bodily conduct, 'As I pursue this bodily conduct, unskillful mental qualities decline, and skillful mental qualities increase,' that sort of bodily conduct is to be pursued. 'Bodily conduct is of two sorts, I tell you, deva-king: to be pursued & not to be pursued.' Thus was it said. And in reference to this was it said.

"'Verbal conduct is of two sorts, I tell you, deva-king: to be pursued & not to be pursued.' Thus was it said. And in reference to what was it said? When one knows of verbal conduct, 'As I pursue this verbal conduct, unskillful mental qualities increase, and skillful mental qualities decline,' that sort of verbal conduct is not to be pursued. When one knows of verbal conduct, 'As I pursue this verbal conduct, unskillful mental qualities decline, and skillful mental qualities increase,' that sort of verbal conduct is to be pursued. 'Verbal conduct is of two sorts, I tell you, deva-king: to be pursued & not to be pursued.' Thus was it said. And in reference to this was it said.

"'Searching is of two sorts, I tell you, deva-king: to be pursued & not to be pursued.' Thus was it said. And in reference to what was it said? When one knows of a search, 'As I pursue this search, unskillful mental qualities increase, and skillful mental qualities decline,' that sort of search is not to be pursued. When one knows of a search, 'As I pursue this search, unskillful mental qualities decline, and skillful mental qualities increase,' that sort of search is to be pursued. 'Searching is of two sorts, I tell you, deva-king: to be pursued & not to be pursued.' Thus was it said. And in reference to this was it said.[3]

"This is how he has practiced, deva-king: the monk who has practiced the practice for restraint in the Pāṭimokkha."

Thus the Blessed One answered, having been asked by Sakka the deva-king. Gratified, Sakka was delighted in & expressed his approval of the Blessed One's words: "So it is, O Blessed One. So it is, O One Well-Gone. Hearing the Blessed One's answer to my question, my doubt is now cut off, my perplexity is overcome."

Then Sakka, having delighted in & expressed his approval of the Blessed One's words, asked him a further question: "But how has he practiced, dear sir: the monk who has practiced for restraint with regard to the sense faculties?"

"Forms cognizable by the eye are of two sorts, I tell you, deva-king: to be pursued & not to be pursued. Sounds cognizable by the ear…. Aromas cognizable by the nose…. Flavors cognizable by the tongue…. Tactile sensations cognizable by the body…. Ideas cognizable by the intellect are of two sorts: to be pursued & not to be pursued."

When this was said, Sakka the deva-king said to the Blessed One, "Dear sir, I understand the detailed meaning of the Blessed One's brief statement. If, as one pursues a certain type of form cognizable by the eye, unskillful mental qualities increase, and skillful mental qualities decline, that sort of form cognizable by the eye is not to be pursued. But if, as one pursues a certain type of form cognizable by the eye, unskillful mental qualities decline, and skillful mental qualities increase, that sort of form cognizable by the eye is to be pursued.

"If, as one pursues a certain type of sound cognizable by the ear….

"If, as one pursues a certain type of aroma cognizable by the nose….

"If, as one pursues a certain type of flavor cognizable by the tongue….

"If, as one pursues a certain type of tactile sensation cognizable by the body….

"If, as one pursues a certain type of idea cognizable by the intellect, unskillful mental qualities increase, and skillful mental qualities decline, that sort of idea cognizable by the intellect is not to be pursued. But if, as one pursues a certain type of idea cognizable by the intellect, unskillful mental qualities decline, and skillful mental qualities increase, that sort of idea cognizable by the intellect is to be pursued.

"This is how I understand the detailed meaning of the Blessed One's brief statement. Hearing the Blessed One's answer to my question, my doubt is now cut off, my perplexity is overcome."

Then Sakka, having delighted in & expressed his approval of the Blessed One's words, asked him a further question: "Dear sir, do all contemplatives & brahmans teach the same doctrine, adhere to the same precepts, desire the same thing, aim at the same goal?"

"No, deva-king, not all contemplatives & brahmans teach the same doctrine, adhere to the same precepts, desire the same thing, aim at the same goal."

"Why, dear sir, don't all contemplatives & brahmans teach the same doctrine, adhere to the same precepts, desire the same thing, aim at the same goal?"

"The world is made up of many properties, various properties. Because of the many & various properties in the world, then whichever property living beings get fixated on, they become entrenched & latch onto it, saying, 'Only this is true; anything else is worthless.' This is why not all contemplatives & brahmans teach the same doctrine, adhere to the same precepts, desire the same thing, aim at the same goal."

"But, dear sir, are all contemplatives & brahmans utterly complete, utterly free from bonds, followers of the utterly holy life, utterly consummate?"

"No, deva-king, not all contemplatives & brahmans are utterly complete, utterly free from bonds, followers of the utterly holy life, utterly consummate."

"But why, dear sir, are not all contemplatives & brahmans utterly complete, utterly free from bonds, followers of the utterly holy life, utterly consummate?"

"Those monks who are released through the total ending of craving are the ones who are utterly complete, utterly free from bonds, followers of the utterly holy life, utterly consummate. This is why not all contemplatives & brahmans are utterly complete, utterly free from bonds, followers of the utterly holy life, utterly consummate."

Thus the Blessed One answered, having been asked by Sakka the deva-king. Gratified, Sakka was delighted in & expressed his approval of the Blessed One's words: "So it is, O Blessed One. So it is, O One Well-Gone. Hearing the Blessed One's answer to my question, my doubt is now cut off, my perplexity is overcome."

Then Sakka, having delighted in & expressed his approval of the Blessed One's words, said to him: "Yearning is a disease, yearning is a boil, yearning is an arrow. It seduces one, drawing one into this or that state of being, which is why one is reborn in high states & low. Whereas other outside contemplatives & brahmans gave me no chance to ask them these questions, the Blessed One has answered at length, so that he has removed the arrow of my uncertainty & perplexity."

"Deva-king, do you recall having asked other contemplatives & brahmans these questions?"

"Yes, lord, I recall having asked other contemplatives & brahmans these questions."

"If it's no inconvenience, could you tell me how they answered?"

"It's no inconvenience when sitting with the Blessed One or one who is like him."

"Then tell me, deva-king."

"Having gone to those whom I considered to be contemplatives & brahmans living in isolated dwellings in the wilderness, I asked them these questions. But when asked by me, they were at a loss. Being at a loss, they asked *me* in return, 'What is your name?'

"Being asked, I responded, 'I, dear sir, am Sakka, the deva-king.'

"So they questioned me further, 'But what kamma did you do to attain to this state?'

"So I taught them the Dhamma as far as I had heard & mastered it. And they were gratified with just this much: 'We have seen Sakka, the deva-king, and he has answered our questions!' So, instead of my becoming their disciple, they simply became mine. But I, lord, am the Blessed One's disciple, a stream-winner, steadfast, never again destined for states of woe, headed for self-awakening."

"Deva-king, do you recall ever having previously experienced such happiness & joy?"

"Yes, lord, I do."

"And how do you recall ever having previously experienced such happiness & joy?"

"Once, lord, the devas & asuras were arrayed in battle. And in that battle the devas won, while the asuras lost. Having won the battle, as the victor in the battle, this thought occurred to me: 'Whatever has been the divine nourishment of the asuras, whatever has been the divine nourishment of the devas, the devas will now enjoy both of them.' But my attainment of happiness & joy was in the sphere of violence & weapons. It didn't lead to disenchantment, to dispassion, to cessation, to stilling, to direct knowledge to self-awakening, to Unbinding. But my attainment of happiness & joy on hearing the Blessed One's Dhamma is in the sphere of

no violence, the sphere of no weapons. It leads to disenchantment, to dispassion, to cessation, to stilling, to direct knowledge to self-awakening, to Unbinding."

…

Then Sakka, the deva-king, touched the earth with his hand and said three times, "Homage to the Worthy One, the Blessed One, the Rightly Self-awakened One! Homage to the Worthy One, the Blessed One, the Rightly Self-awakened One! Homage to the Worthy One, the Blessed One, the Rightly Self-awakened One!"

While this explanation was being given, there arose to Sakka the dustless, stainless Dhamma eye—"Whatever is subject to origination is all subject to cessation"—as it also did to [his following of] 80,000 other devas.

Such were the questions that the Blessed One answered at Sakka's bidding. And so this discourse is called "Sakka's Questions."

## Notes

1. Objectification = *papañca.* The tendency of the mind to proliferate issues from the sense of "I am the thinker." This term can also be translated as self-reflexive thinking, reification, falsification, distortion, elaboration, or exaggeration. In the discourses, it is frequently used in analyses of the psychology of conflict. The categories of objectification include the categories of inappropriate attention (see MN 2): being/not-being, me/not-me, mine/not-mine, doer/done-to. The perceptions of objectification include such thoughts as "This is me. This is mine. This is my self." These perceptions and categories turn back on the person who allows them to proliferate, giving rise to internal conflict & strife, which then expand outward. For more on these terms, see MN 18.

2. For more on this topic, see MN 101 and 137.

3. For more on this topic, see MN 26.

*See also:* *SN 11:3*; *SN 11:5*

# *The Great Establishing of Mindfulness Discourse*
# *Mahā Satipaṭṭhāna Sutta (DN 22)*

## Introduction

*Satipaṭṭhāna—the establishing* (upaṭṭhāna) *of mindfulness* (sati)*—is a meditative technique for training the mind to keep mindfulness firmly established in a particular frame of reference in all its activities. The term* sati *is related to the verb* sarati, *to remember or to keep in mind. It is sometimes translated as non-reactive awareness, free from agendas, simply present with whatever arises, but the formula for satipaṭṭhāna doesn't support that translation. Non-reactive awareness is actually an aspect of equanimity, one of the mental qualities fostered in the course of satipaṭṭhāna. The activity of satipaṭṭhāna, however, definitely has a motivating agenda: the desire for awakening, which is classed not as a cause of suffering, but as part of the path to its ending (see SN 51:15). The role of mindfulness is to keep the mind properly focused in frames of reference that will give it guidance in what present events to develop, and which ones to abandon, so as to keep it on the path. To make an analogy, awakening is like a mountain on the horizon, the destination to which you are driving a car. Mindfulness is what remembers to keep attention focused on the road to the mountain, rather than letting it stay focused on glimpses of the mountain or get distracted by other paths leading away from the road.*

*Satipaṭṭhāna plays a role in many formulations of the path to awakening. In the noble eightfold path, it is the seventh factor, following on right effort and leading to right concentration. In the five strengths and five faculties, it is the third factor, following on persistence and leading to concentration. In the seven factors for awakening, it is the first factor, providing a foundation for the remaining six factors: analysis of qualities, persistence, rapture, calm, concentration, and equanimity.*

*The following sutta contains the longest treatment of satipaṭṭhāna found in the Canon. However, despite its length, its treatment of the topic is far from*

*complete. This partly has to do with the nature of the topic itself. As the Buddha states in MN 12:*

> "Sāriputta, suppose that I had four disciples with a 100-year life span, living for 100 years, and endowed with excellent mindfulness, retention, recall, & keenness of discernment. Just as an archer with a good bow—trained, dexterous, & practiced—could easily shoot a light arrow across the shadow of a palmyra tree, they—endowed with that great an extent of mindfulness, that great an extent of retention, that great an extent of recall, & that keenness of discernment—would ask me one question after another on the four establishings of mindfulness. And I, asked again & again, would answer. Answered, they would remember what I had answered, and they wouldn't counter-question me about it a second time more. Aside from eating, drinking, chewing, & savoring, aside from urinating & defecating, aside from relieving sleepiness & weariness, there would be no ending of the Tathāgata's Dhamma teaching, there would be no ending of the Tathāgata's phrasing of Dhamma statements, there would be no ending of the Tathāgata's quick-wittedness (in answering) questions; but those four disciples of mine, with their 100-year life span, living for 100 years, would die with the passing of 100 years."

*Although the main thrust of this passage concerns the extent of the Buddha's knowledge, it also makes an important statement about how vast the topic of satipaṭṭhāna is: Even with one hundred years of questioning, you couldn't exhaust it.*

*The fact that DN 22's treatment of the satipaṭṭhāna is incomplete is also apparent from the organization of the sutta: The Buddha starts with a statement of the standard short formula for satipaṭṭhāna: "There is the case where a monk remains focused on the body in & of itself—ardent, alert, & mindful—subduing greed & distress with reference to the world. He remains focused on feelings… mind… mental qualities in & of themselves—ardent, alert, & mindful—subduing greed & distress with reference to the world." However, the questions posed and answered in the course of the sutta explain and expand on only part of the formula: what it means to "remained focused" on each of the frames of reference in & of itself. Among other things, there is no*

*discussion of how ardency functions in the practice, of what it means to subdue greed and distress with reference to the world, of how the various frames of reference interact in practice, nor of what the stages in the practice are. For this information, we have to look at other treatments of these topics found elsewhere in the Canon.*

*For instance, MN 118 makes the important point that focusing on the breath can bring all four frames of reference into play simultaneously. In other words, the body in & of itself is the main frame of reference, and the remaining three build on it. SN 47:40 mentions two stages in the practice—the establishing of mindfulness and the development of the establishing of mindfulness—adding that the second stage is accomplished by developing all eight factors of the noble eightfold path. Among other things, this means that not only does the establishing of mindfulness provide a foundation for right concentration—the four jhānas—but the mastery of the four jhānas also helps to develop the establishing of mindfulness even further.*

*When we compare SN 47:40 with one of the refrains in DN 22, we find three stages in satipaṭṭhāna practice.*

*The first stage, as applied to the body, is this:*

> The monk remains focused on the body in & of itself—ardent, alert, and mindful—subduing greed and distress with reference to the world.

*The three qualities at the center of this formula are also central to the practice of satipaṭṭhāna. SN 16:2 shows that ardency is directly related to the practice of right effort. Thus mindfulness keeps the proper frame of reference in mind, alertness watches events related to that frame of reference, and these two qualities together give guidance to ardency so that it can, in line with right effort, abandon things that need to be abandoned, and to develop those that need to be developed.*

*Although satipaṭṭhāna practice is often said to be separate from the practice of jhāna, a number of suttas—such as MN 125 and AN 8:70—equate the successful completion of this first stage with the attainment of the first level of jhāna. This point is confirmed by the many suttas—MN 118 among them—describing how the practice of satipaṭṭhāna brings to completion the factors for awakening, which coincide with the factors of jhāna.*

*The second stage of satipaṭṭhāna practice—the development of satipaṭṭhāna —is this:*

> One remains focused on the phenomenon of origination with regard to the body, on the phenomenon of passing away with regard to the body, or on the phenomenon of origination & passing away with regard to the body.

*The word "origination," here, does not mean that one is focused simply on the arising of phenomena. Instead, it means being focused on how phenomena arise in connection with causes. The "phenomenon of origination and passing away" covers events either directly or indirectly related to one's chosen frame of reference. "Directly" means changes in the frame of reference itself. For instance, when focused on the body, one may notice what causes breath sensations to arise and pass away within it. "Indirectly," here, means events in any of the other three frames of reference as they relate to the body. For example, one might notice what causes feelings of pleasure or mental states of irritation to arise and pass away in connection to events in the body. Or one might notice lapses of mindfulness in one's focus on the body.*

*Of course, to see causal relations requires that the meditator consciously try to effect changes in events, to see which events actually have a causal relationship to one another and which ones don't. Here again, ardency in the practice of right effort and right concentration is what allows for this sort of understanding to arise.*

*In every case, when skillful or unskillful mental qualities—such as the factors for awakening or the hindrances—arise and pass away, one is encouraged to foster the factors that strengthen jhāna and eliminate those that weaken it. This means actively getting engaged in maximizing skillful mental qualities and minimizing unskillful ones. One thus develops insight into the process of origination and passing away by taking an active and sensitive role in the process, just as you learn about eggs by trying to cook with them, gathering experience from your successes and failures in attempting increasingly difficult dishes.*

*As this process leads to stronger and more refined states of concentration, it makes one sensitive to the fact that the grosser one's participation in the process of origination and passing away in the mind, the grosser the level of stress that*

*results. This leads one to let go, first of grosser levels of participation, and then increasingly refined ones as one is able to detect them, leading to the third and final stage in satipaṭṭhāna practice:*

> Or his mindfulness that 'There is a body' is maintained (simply) to the extent of knowledge & recollection. And he remains independent, unsustained by [not clinging to] anything in the world.

*This stage corresponds to a mode of perception that the Buddha in MN 121 terms "entry into emptiness":*

> Thus he regards it [this mode of perception] as empty of whatever is not there. Whatever remains, he discerns as present: "There is this."

*This is the culminating equipoise where the path of the practice opens to a state of non-fashioning* (atammayatā—*see MN 137*) *and from there to the fruit of awakening and release.*

*These few examples show how important it is, in reading this sutta, to remember that its treatment of satipaṭṭhāna, though extensive, is incomplete and needs to be understood in terms of the larger context of teachings provided by the Canon on all the other factors of the path.*

*The notes to this sutta provide some beginning guidance in where to look for this further information, as do the recommended sutta readings listed at the end.*

* * *

I have heard that on one occasion the Blessed One was staying among the Kurus. Now there is a town of the Kurus called Kammāsadhamma. There the Blessed One addressed the monks, "Monks."

"Lord," the monks responded to him.

The Blessed One said: "This is the direct path[1] for the purification of beings, for the overcoming of sorrow & lamentation, for the disappearance of pain & distress, for the attainment of the right method, & for the realization of unbinding—in other words, the four establishings of mindfulness. Which four?

"There is the case where a monk remains focused on the body in & of itself—ardent, alert, & mindful—subduing greed & distress with reference to the world. He remains focused on feelings… mind… mental qualities in & of themselves—ardent,[2] alert,[3] & mindful[4]—subduing greed & distress with reference to the world.[5]

## A. Body

"And how does a monk remain focused on the body in & of itself?

[1] "There is the case where a monk—having gone to the wilderness, to the shade of a tree, or to an empty building—sits down folding his legs crosswise, holding his body erect and establishing mindfulness to the fore.[6] Always mindful, he breathes in; mindful he breathes out.

"Breathing in long, he discerns, 'I am breathing in long'; or breathing out long, he discerns, 'I am breathing out long.' Or breathing in short, he discerns, 'I am breathing in short'; or breathing out short, he discerns, 'I am breathing out short.' He trains himself, 'I will breathe in sensitive to the entire body';[7] he trains himself, 'I will breathe out sensitive to the entire body.' He trains himself, 'I will breathe in calming bodily fabrication';[8] he trains himself, 'I will breathe out calming bodily fabrication.' Just as a dexterous turner or his apprentice, when making a long turn, discerns, 'I am making a long turn,' or when making a short turn discerns, 'I am making a short turn'; in the same way the monk, when breathing in long, discerns, 'I am breathing in long'; or breathing out long, he discerns, 'I am breathing out long.' … He trains himself, 'I will breathe in calming bodily fabrication'; he trains himself, 'I will breathe out calming bodily fabrication.'

"In this way he remains focused internally on the body in & of itself, or externally on the body in & of itself, or both internally & externally on the body in & of itself. Or he remains focused on the phenomenon of origination with regard to the body, on the phenomenon of passing away with regard to the body, or on the phenomenon of origination & passing away with regard to the body. Or his mindfulness that 'There is a body' is maintained to the extent of knowledge & remembrance. And he remains

independent, unsustained by [not clinging to] anything in the world. This is how a monk remains focused on the body in & of itself.

[2] "And further, when walking, the monk discerns, 'I am walking.' When standing, he discerns, 'I am standing.' When sitting, he discerns, 'I am sitting.' When lying down, he discerns, 'I am lying down.' Or however his body is disposed, that is how he discerns it.

"In this way he remains focused internally on the body in & of itself, or externally on the body in & of itself, or both internally & externally on the body in & of itself. Or he remains focused on the phenomenon of origination with regard to the body, on the phenomenon of passing away with regard to the body, or on the phenomenon of origination & passing away with regard to the body. Or his mindfulness that 'There is a body' is maintained to the extent of knowledge & remembrance. And he remains independent, unsustained by [not clinging to] anything in the world. This is how a monk remains focused on the body in & of itself.

[3] "And further, when going forward & returning, he makes himself fully alert; when looking toward & looking away… when flexing & extending his limbs… when carrying his outer cloak, his upper robe, & his bowl… when eating, drinking, chewing, & savoring… when urinating & defecating… when walking, standing, sitting, falling asleep, waking up, talking, & remaining silent, he makes himself fully alert.

"In this way he remains focused internally on the body in & of itself, or externally on the body in & of itself, or both internally & externally on the body in & of itself. Or he remains focused on the phenomenon of origination with regard to the body, on the phenomenon of passing away with regard to the body, or on the phenomenon of origination & passing away with regard to the body. Or his mindfulness that 'There is a body' is maintained to the extent of knowledge & remembrance. And he remains independent, unsustained by [not clinging to] anything in the world. This is how a monk remains focused on the body in & of itself.

[4] "And further… just as if a sack with openings at both ends were full of various kinds of grain—wheat, rice, mung beans, kidney beans, sesame seeds, husked rice—and a man with good eyesight, pouring it out, were to reflect, 'This is wheat. This is rice. These are mung beans. These are kidney beans. These are sesame seeds. This is husked rice,' in the same way, the

monk reflects on this very body from the soles of the feet on up, from the crown of the head on down, surrounded by skin and full of various kinds of unclean things: 'In this body there are head hairs, body hairs, nails, teeth, skin, flesh, tendons, bones, bone marrow, kidneys, heart, liver, pleura, spleen, lungs, large intestines, small intestines, gorge, feces, bile, phlegm, pus, blood, sweat, fat, tears, skin-oil, saliva, mucus, fluid in the joints, urine.'

"In this way he remains focused internally on the body in & of itself, or externally on the body in & of itself, or both internally & externally on the body in & of itself. Or he remains focused on the phenomenon of origination with regard to the body, on the phenomenon of passing away with regard to the body, or on the phenomenon of origination & passing away with regard to the body. Or his mindfulness that 'There is a body' is maintained to the extent of knowledge & remembrance. And he remains independent, unsustained by [not clinging to] anything in the world. This is how a monk remains focused on the body in & of itself.

[5] "And further… just as a dexterous butcher or his apprentice, having killed a cow, would sit at a crossroads cutting it up into pieces, the monk reflects on this very body—however it stands, however it is disposed—in terms of properties: 'In this body there is the earth property, the liquid property, the fire property, & the wind property.'[9]

"In this way he remains focused internally on the body in & of itself, or externally on the body in & of itself, or both internally & externally on the body in & of itself. Or he remains focused on the phenomenon of origination with regard to the body, on the phenomenon of passing away with regard to the body, or on the phenomenon of origination & passing away with regard to the body. Or his mindfulness that 'There is a body' is maintained to the extent of knowledge & remembrance. And he remains independent, unsustained by [not clinging to] anything in the world. This is how a monk remains focused on the body in & of itself.

[6] "And further, as if he were to see a corpse cast away in a charnel ground—one day, two days, three days dead—bloated, livid, & festering, he applies it to this very body, 'This body, too: Such is its nature, such is its future, such its unavoidable fate.'

"In this way he remains focused internally on the body in & of itself, or externally on the body in & of itself, or both internally & externally on the body in & of itself. Or he remains focused on the phenomenon of origination with regard to the body, on the phenomenon of passing away with regard to the body, or on the phenomenon of origination & passing away with regard to the body. Or his mindfulness that 'There is a body' is maintained to the extent of knowledge & remembrance. And he remains independent, unsustained by [not clinging to] anything in the world. This is how a monk remains focused on the body in & of itself.

"Or again, as if he were to see a corpse cast away in a charnel ground, being chewed by crows, being chewed by vultures, being chewed by hawks, being chewed by dogs, being chewed by hyenas, being chewed by various other creatures… a skeleton smeared with flesh & blood, connected with tendons… a fleshless skeleton smeared with blood, connected with tendons… a skeleton without flesh or blood, connected with tendons… bones detached from their tendons, scattered in all directions—here a hand bone, there a foot bone, here a shin bone, there a thigh bone, here a hip bone, there a back bone, here a rib, there a chest bone, here a shoulder bone, there a neck bone, here a jaw bone, there a tooth, here a skull… the bones whitened, somewhat like the color of shells… the bones piled up, more than a year old… the bones decomposed into a powder: He applies it to this very body, 'This body, too: Such is its nature, such is its future, such its unavoidable fate.'

"In this way he remains focused internally on the body in & of itself, or externally on the body in & of itself, or both internally & externally on the body in & of itself. Or he remains focused on the phenomenon of origination with regard to the body, on the phenomenon of passing away with regard to the body, or on the phenomenon of origination & passing away with regard to the body. Or his mindfulness that 'There is a body' is maintained to the extent of knowledge & remembrance. And he remains independent, unsustained by [not clinging to] anything in the world. This is how a monk remains focused on the body in & of itself.

### B. Feelings

"And how does a monk remain focused on feelings in & of themselves? There is the case where a monk, when feeling a painful feeling, discerns, 'I am feeling a painful feeling.' When feeling a pleasant feeling, he discerns, 'I am feeling a pleasant feeling.' When feeling a neither-painful-nor-pleasant feeling, he discerns, 'I am feeling a neither-painful-nor-pleasant feeling.'

"When feeling a painful feeling of the flesh, he discerns, 'I am feeling a painful feeling of the flesh.' When feeling a painful feeling not of the flesh, he discerns, 'I am feeling a painful feeling not of the flesh.' When feeling a pleasant feeling of the flesh, he discerns, 'I am feeling a pleasant feeling of the flesh.' When feeling a pleasant feeling not of the flesh, he discerns, 'I am feeling a pleasant feeling not of the flesh.' When feeling a neither-painful-nor-pleasant feeling of the flesh, he discerns, 'I am feeling a neither-painful-nor-pleasant feeling of the flesh.' When feeling a neither-painful-nor-pleasant feeling not of the flesh, he discerns, 'I am feeling a neither-painful-nor-pleasant feeling not of the flesh.'[10]

"In this way he remains focused internally on feelings in & of themselves, or externally on feelings in & of themselves, or both internally & externally on feelings in & of themselves. Or he remains focused on the phenomenon of origination with regard to feelings, on the phenomenon of passing away with regard to feelings, or on the phenomenon of origination & passing away with regard to feelings. Or his mindfulness that 'There are feelings' is maintained to the extent of knowledge & remembrance. And he remains independent, unsustained by [not clinging to] anything in the world. This is how a monk remains focused on feelings in & of themselves.

### C. Mind

"And how does a monk remain focused on the mind in & of itself? There is the case where a monk, when the mind has passion, discerns, 'The mind has passion.' When the mind is without passion, he discerns, 'The mind is without passion.' When the mind has aversion, he discerns, 'The mind has aversion.' When the mind is without aversion, he discerns, 'The mind is without aversion.' When the mind has delusion, he discerns, 'The mind has delusion.' When the mind is without delusion, he discerns, 'The mind is without delusion.'[11]

"When the mind is constricted, he discerns, 'The mind is constricted.' When the mind is scattered, he discerns, 'The mind is scattered.'[12] When the mind is enlarged,[13] he discerns, 'The mind is enlarged.' When the mind is not enlarged, he discerns, 'The mind is not enlarged.' When the mind is surpassed, he discerns, 'The mind is surpassed.' When the mind is unsurpassed, he discerns, 'The mind is unsurpassed.' When the mind is concentrated, he discerns, 'The mind is concentrated.' When the mind is not concentrated, he discerns, 'The mind is not concentrated.' When the mind is released,[14] he discerns, 'The mind is released.' When the mind is not released, he discerns, 'The mind is not released.'

"In this way he remains focused internally on the mind in & of itself, or externally on the mind in & of itself, or both internally & externally on the mind in & of itself. Or he remains focused on the phenomenon of origination with regard to the mind, on the phenomenon of passing away with regard to the mind, or on the phenomenon of origination & passing away with regard to the mind. Or his mindfulness that 'There is a mind' is maintained to the extent of knowledge & remembrance. And he remains independent, unsustained by [not clinging to] anything in the world. This is how a monk remains focused on the mind in & of itself.

### D. Mental Qualities

"And how does a monk remain focused on mental qualities in & of themselves?

[1] "There is the case where a monk remains focused on mental qualities in & of themselves with reference to the **five hindrances.** And how does a monk remain focused on mental qualities in & of themselves with reference to the five hindrances? There is the case where, there being

sensual desire present within, a monk discerns, 'There is sensual desire present within me.' Or, there being no sensual desire present within, he discerns, 'There is no sensual desire present within me.' He discerns how there is the arising of unarisen sensual desire. And he discerns how there is the abandoning of sensual desire once it has arisen.[15] And he discerns how there is no further appearance in the future of sensual desire that has been abandoned. [The same formula is repeated for the remaining hindrances: ill will, sloth & drowsiness, restlessness & anxiety, and uncertainty.]

"In this way he remains focused internally on mental qualities in & of themselves, or externally on mental qualities in & of themselves, or both internally & externally on mental qualities in & of themselves. Or he remains focused on the phenomenon of origination with regard to mental qualities, on the phenomenon of passing away with regard to mental qualities, or on the phenomenon of origination & passing away with regard to mental qualities. Or his mindfulness that 'There are mental qualities' is maintained to the extent of knowledge & remembrance. And he remains independent, unsustained by [not clinging to] anything in the world. This is how a monk remains focused on mental qualities in & of themselves with reference to the five hindrances.

[2] "And further, the monk remains focused on mental qualities in & of themselves with reference to the **five clinging-aggregates.** And how does a monk remain focused on mental qualities in & of themselves with reference to the five clinging-aggregates? There is the case where a monk [discerns]: 'Such is form, such its origination, such its disappearance. Such is feeling… Such is perception… Such are fabrications… Such is consciousness, such its origination, such its disappearance.'[16]

"In this way he remains focused internally on mental qualities in & of themselves, or externally on mental qualities in & of themselves, or both internally & externally on mental qualities in & of themselves. Or he remains focused on the phenomenon of origination with regard to mental qualities, on the phenomenon of passing away with regard to mental qualities, or on the phenomenon of origination & passing away with regard to mental qualities. Or his mindfulness that 'There are mental qualities' is maintained to the extent of knowledge & remembrance. And he remains independent, unsustained by [not clinging to] anything in the

world. This is how a monk remains focused on mental qualities in & of themselves with reference to the five clinging-aggregates.

[3] "And further, the monk remains focused on mental qualities in & of themselves with reference to the **sixfold internal & external sense media.** And how does a monk remain focused on mental qualities in & of themselves with reference to the sixfold internal & external sense media? There is the case where he discerns the eye, he discerns forms, he discerns the fetter that arises dependent on both.[17] He discerns how there is the arising of an unarisen fetter. And he discerns how there is the abandoning of a fetter once it has arisen. And he discerns how there is no further appearance in the future of a fetter that has been abandoned. [The same formula is repeated for the remaining sense media: ear, nose, tongue, body, & intellect.]

"In this way he remains focused internally on mental qualities in & of themselves, or externally on mental qualities in & of themselves, or both internally & externally on mental qualities in & of themselves. Or he remains focused on the phenomenon of origination with regard to mental qualities, on the phenomenon of passing away with regard to mental qualities, or on the phenomenon of origination & passing away with regard to mental qualities. Or his mindfulness that 'There are mental qualities' is maintained to the extent of knowledge & remembrance. And he remains independent, unsustained by [not clinging to] anything in the world. This is how a monk remains focused on mental qualities in & of themselves with reference to the sixfold internal & external sense media.

[4] "And further, the monk remains focused on mental qualities in & of themselves with reference to the **seven factors for awakening.** And how does a monk remain focused on mental qualities in & of themselves with reference to the seven factors for awakening? There is the case where, there being mindfulness as a factor for awakening present within, he discerns, 'Mindfulness as a factor for awakening is present within me.' Or, there being no mindfulness as a factor for awakening present within, he discerns, 'Mindfulness as a factor for awakening is not present within me.' He discerns how there is the arising of unarisen mindfulness as a factor for awakening. And he discerns how there is the culmination of the development of mindfulness as a factor for awakening once it has arisen.[18] [The same formula is repeated for the remaining factors for

awakening: analysis of qualities, persistence, rapture, calm, concentration, & equanimity.]

"In this way he remains focused internally on mental qualities in & of themselves, or externally on mental qualities in & of themselves, or both internally & externally on mental qualities in & of themselves. Or he remains focused on the phenomenon of origination with regard to mental qualities, on the phenomenon of passing away with regard to mental qualities, or on the phenomenon of origination & passing away with regard to mental qualities. Or his mindfulness that 'There are mental qualities' is maintained to the extent of knowledge & remembrance. And he remains independent, unsustained by [not clinging to] anything in the world. This is how a monk remains focused on mental qualities in & of themselves with reference to the seven factors for awakening.

[5] "And further, the monk remains focused on mental qualities in & of themselves with reference to the **four noble truths.** And how does a monk remain focused on mental qualities in & of themselves with reference to the four noble truths? There is the case where he discerns, as it has come to be, that 'This is stress…This is the origination of stress… This is the cessation of stress…This is the way leading to the cessation of stress.'[19]

[a] "Now what is the noble truth of stress? Birth is stressful, aging is stressful, death is stressful; sorrow, lamentation, pain, distress, & despair are stressful; association with the unbeloved is stressful; separation from the loved is stressful; not getting what is wanted is stressful. In short, the five clinging-aggregates are stressful.

"And what is *birth?* Whatever birth, taking birth, descent, coming-to-be, coming-forth, appearance of aggregates, & acquisition of [sense] spheres of the various beings in this or that group of beings, that is called birth.

"And what is *aging*? Whatever aging, decrepitude, brokenness, graying, wrinkling, decline of life-force, weakening of the faculties of the various beings in this or that group of beings, that is called aging.

"And what is *death?* Whatever deceasing, passing away, breaking up, disappearance, dying, death, completion of time, break up of the aggregates, casting off of the body, interruption in the life faculty of the various beings in this or that group of beings, that is called death.

"And what is *sorrow?* Whatever sorrow, sorrowing, sadness, inward sorrow, inward sadness of anyone suffering from misfortune, touched by a painful thing, that is called sorrow.

"And what is *lamentation?* Whatever crying, grieving, lamenting, weeping, wailing, lamentation of anyone suffering from misfortune, touched by a painful thing, that is called lamentation.

"And what is *pain?* Whatever is experienced as bodily pain, bodily discomfort, pain or discomfort born of bodily contact, that is called pain.

"And what is *distress?* Whatever is experienced as mental pain, mental discomfort, pain or discomfort born of mental contact, that is called distress.

"And what is *despair?* Whatever despair, despondency, desperation of anyone suffering from misfortune, touched by a painful thing, that is called despair.

"And what is the stress of *association with the unbeloved?* There is the case where undesirable, unpleasing, unattractive sights, sounds, aromas, flavors, or tactile sensations occur to one; or one has connection, contact, relationship, interaction with those who wish one ill, who wish for one's harm, who wish for one's discomfort, who wish one no security from the yoke. This is called the stress of association with the unbeloved.

"And what is the stress of *separation from the loved?* There is the case where desirable, pleasing, attractive sights, sounds, aromas, flavors, or tactile sensations do not occur to one; or one has no connection, no contact, no relationship, no interaction with those who wish one well, who wish for one's benefit, who wish for one's comfort, who wish one security from the yoke, nor with one's mother, father, brother, sister, friends, companions, or relatives. This is called the stress of separation from the loved.

"And what is the stress of *not getting what is wanted?* In beings subject to birth, the wish arises, 'O, may we not be subject to birth, and may birth not come to us.' But this is not to be achieved by wishing. This is the stress of not getting what is wanted. In beings subject to aging… illness… death… sorrow, lamentation, pain, distress, & despair, the wish arises, 'O, may we not be subject to aging… illness… death… sorrow, lamentation,

pain, distress, & despair, and may aging… illness… death… sorrow, lamentation, pain, distress, & despair not come to us.' But this is not to be achieved by wishing. This is the stress of not getting what is wanted.

"And what are the *five clinging-aggregates* that, in short, are stressful? The form clinging-aggregate, the feeling clinging-aggregate, the perception clinging-aggregate, the fabrications clinging-aggregate, the consciousness clinging-aggregate: These are called the five clinging-aggregates that, in short, are stressful.

"This is called the noble truth of stress.

[b] "And what is the noble truth of the origination of stress? The craving that makes for further becoming—accompanied by passion & delight, relishing now here & now there—i.e., sensuality-craving, becoming-craving, and non-becoming-craving.

"And where does this craving, when arising, arise? And where, when dwelling, does it dwell? Whatever is endearing & alluring in terms of the world: that is where this craving, when arising, arises. That is where, when dwelling, it dwells.

"And what is endearing & alluring in terms of the world? The eye is endearing & alluring in terms of the world. That is where this craving, when arising, arises. That is where, when dwelling, it dwells.

"The ear…. The nose…. The tongue…. The body…. The intellect….

"Forms…. Sounds…. Aromas…. Flavors…. Tactile sensations…. Ideas….

"Eye-consciousness…. Ear-consciousness…. Nose-consciousness…. Tongue-consciousness…. Body-consciousness…. Intellect-consciousness….

"Eye-contact…. Ear-contact…. Nose-contact…. Tongue-contact…. Body-contact…. Intellect-contact….

"Feeling born of eye-contact…. Feeling born of ear-contact…. Feeling born of nose-contact…. Feeling born of tongue-contact…. Feeling born of body-contact…. Feeling born of intellect-contact….

"Perception of forms…. Perception of sounds…. Perception of aromas…. Perception of flavors…. Perception of tactile sensations….

Perception of ideas….

"Intention for forms…. Intention for sounds…. Intention for aromas…. Intention for flavors…. Intention for tactile sensations…. Intention for ideas….

"Craving for forms…. Craving for sounds…. Craving for aromas…. Craving for flavors…. Craving for tactile sensations…. Craving for ideas….

"Thought directed at forms…. Thought directed at sounds…. Thought directed at aromas…. Thought directed at flavors…. Thought directed at tactile sensations…. Thought directed at ideas….

"Evaluation of forms…. Evaluation of sounds…. Evaluation of aromas…. Evaluation of flavors…. Evaluation of tactile sensations…. Evaluation of ideas is endearing & alluring in terms of the world. That is where this craving, when arising, arises. That is where, when dwelling, it dwells.

"This is called the noble truth of the origination of stress.

[c] "And what is the noble truth of the cessation of stress? The remainderless fading & cessation, renunciation, relinquishment, release, & letting go of that very craving.

"And where, when being abandoned, is this craving abandoned? And where, when ceasing, does it cease? Whatever is endearing & alluring in terms of the world: that is where, when being abandoned, this craving is abandoned. That is where, when ceasing, it ceases.

"And what is endearing & alluring in terms of the world? The eye is endearing & alluring in terms of the world. That is where, when being abandoned, this craving is abandoned. That is where, when ceasing, it ceases.

"The ear…. The nose…. The tongue…. The body…. The intellect….

"Forms…. Sounds…. Aromas…. Flavors…. Tactile sensations…. Ideas….

"Eye-consciousness…. Ear-consciousness…. Nose-consciousness…. Tongue-consciousness…. Body-consciousness…. Intellect-consciousness….

"Eye-contact…. Ear-contact…. Nose-contact…. Tongue-contact…. Body-contact…. Intellect-contact….

"Feeling born of eye-contact…. Feeling born of ear-contact…. Feeling born of nose-contact…. Feeling born of tongue-contact…. Feeling born of body-contact…. Feeling born of intellect-contact….

"Perception of forms…. Perception of sounds…. Perception of aromas…. Perception of flavors…. Perception of tactile sensations…. Perception of ideas….

"Intention for forms…. Intention for sounds…. Intention for aromas…. Intention for flavors…. Intention for tactile sensations…. Intention for ideas….

"Craving for forms…. Craving for sounds…. Craving for aromas…. Craving for flavors…. Craving for tactile sensations…. Craving for ideas….

"Thought directed at forms…. Thought directed at sounds…. Thought directed at aromas…. Thought directed at flavors…. Thought directed at tactile sensations…. Thought directed at ideas….

"Evaluation of forms…. Evaluation of sounds…. Evaluation of aromas…. Evaluation of flavors…. Evaluation of tactile sensations…. Evaluation of ideas is endearing & alluring in terms of the world. That is where, when being abandoned, this craving is abandoned. That is where, when ceasing, it ceases.

"This is called the noble truth of the cessation of stress.

[d] "And what is the noble truth of the path of practice leading to the cessation of stress? Just this very noble eightfold path: right view, right resolve, right speech, right action, right livelihood, right effort, right mindfulness, right concentration.

"And what is right view? Knowledge with reference to stress, knowledge with reference to the origination of stress, knowledge with reference to the cessation of stress, knowledge with reference to the way of practice leading to the cessation of stress: This is called right view.

And what is right resolve? Resolve for renunciation, resolve for freedom from ill will, resolve for harmlessness: This is called right resolve.

"And what is right speech? Abstaining from lying, from divisive speech, from abusive speech, & from idle chatter: This is called right speech.

"And what is right action? Abstaining from taking life, from stealing, & from sexual misconduct: This is called right action.

"And what is right livelihood? There is the case where a disciple of the noble ones, having abandoned dishonest livelihood, keeps his life going with right livelihood. This is called right livelihood.

"And what is right effort? There is the case where a monk generates desire, endeavors, arouses persistence, upholds & exerts his intent for the sake of the non-arising of evil, unskillful qualities that have not yet arisen… for the sake of the abandoning of evil, unskillful qualities that have arisen… for the sake of the arising of skillful qualities that have not yet arisen… (and) for the maintenance, non-confusion, increase, plenitude, development, & culmination of skillful qualities that have arisen. This is called right effort.

"And what is right mindfulness? There is the case where a monk remains focused on the body in & of itself—ardent, alert, & mindful—subduing greed & distress with reference to the world. He remains focused on feelings in & of themselves… the mind in & of itself… mental qualities in & of themselves—ardent, alert, & mindful—subduing greed & distress with reference to the world. This is called right mindfulness.

"And what is right concentration? There is the case where a monk—quite secluded from sensuality, secluded from unskillful qualities—enters & remains in the first jhāna: rapture & pleasure born of seclusion, accompanied by directed thought & evaluation. With the stilling of directed thoughts & evaluations, he enters & remains in the second jhāna: rapture & pleasure born of concentration, unification of awareness free from directed thought & evaluation—internal assurance. With the fading of rapture he remains equanimous, mindful, & alert, and senses pleasure with the body. He enters & remains in the third jhāna, of which the noble ones declare, 'Equanimous & mindful, he has a pleasant abiding.' With the abandoning of pleasure & pain—as with the earlier disappearance of elation & distress—he enters & remains in the fourth jhāna: purity of equanimity & mindfulness, neither pleasure nor pain. This is called right concentration.

"This is called the noble truth of the path of practice leading to the cessation of stress.

"In this way he remains focused internally on mental qualities in & of themselves, or externally on mental qualities in & of themselves, or both internally & externally on mental qualities in & of themselves. Or he remains focused on the phenomenon of origination with regard to mental qualities, on the phenomenon of passing away with regard to mental qualities, or on the phenomenon of origination & passing away with regard to mental qualities. Or his mindfulness that 'There are mental qualities' is maintained to the extent of knowledge & remembrance. And he remains independent, unsustained by [not clinging to] anything in the world. This is how a monk remains focused on mental qualities in & of themselves with reference to the four noble truths.

### E. Conclusion

"Now, if anyone would develop these four establishings of mindfulness in this way for seven years, one of two fruits can be expected for him: either gnosis right here & now, or—if there be any remnant of clinging-sustenance—non-return.

"Let alone seven years. If anyone would develop these four establishings of mindfulness in this way for six years… five… four… three… two years… one year… seven months… six months… five… four… three… two months… one month… half a month, one of two fruits can be expected for him: either gnosis right here & now, or—if there be any remnant of clinging-sustenance—non-return.

"Let alone half a month. If anyone would develop these four establishings of mindfulness in this way for seven days, one of two fruits can be expected for him: either gnosis right here & now, or—if there be any remnant of clinging-sustenance—non-return.

"'This is the direct path for the purification of beings, for the overcoming of sorrow & lamentation, for the disappearance of pain & distress, for the attainment of the right method, & for the realization of unbinding—in other words, the four establishings of mindfulness.' Thus was it said, and in reference to this was it said."

That is what the Blessed One said. Gratified, the monks delighted in the Blessed One's words.

## Notes

*1. Ekāyana-magga.* For decades, this term was translated as "the only way," but more recently—beginning with Ven. Ñāṇamoli—translators have noted that the phrase *ekāyana magga* appears in a series of similes in MN 12 where it reveals its idiomatic sense. In each of the similes, the Buddha describes his knowledge of the destination of an individual on a particular path of practice. He sees that the way the individual conducts himself will lead inevitably to a particular destination. He then compares his knowledge to that of a person seeing an individual following an ekāyana magga to a particular destination and knowing that the individual will have to end up there for sure. For the similes to work, *ekāyana magga* requires the sense, not of an only way, but of a way that goes to only one destination. In other words, an ekāyana magga is a path that doesn't fork—one that, as long as you follow it, takes you to a single, inevitable goal.

Of the similes in MN 12, one deals with an ekāyana magga to unbinding—which, of course, would apply to the practice of right mindfulness:

> "Suppose that there were a lotus pond with pristine water, pleasing water, cool water, pellucid water; with restful banks, refreshing; and not far from it was a dense forest grove. A man—scorched with heat, overcome by heat, exhausted, trembling, & thirsty—would come along a path going one way only *[ekāyana magga]* directed to that lotus pond. A man with good eyes, on seeing him, would say, 'The way this individual has practiced, the way he conducts himself, and the path he has entered are such that he will come to that lotus pond.' Then at a later time he would see him—having plunged into the lotus pond, having bathed & drunk & relieved all his disturbance, exhaustion, & fever, and having come back out—sitting or lying down in the forest grove, experiencing feelings that are exclusively pleasant.
>
> "In the same way, Sāriputta, there is the case where—having thus encompassed awareness with awareness—I know of a certain individual: 'The way this individual has practiced, the way he conducts himself, and the path he has entered are such that he will, through the ending of the effluents, enter & remain in the effluent-free awareness-release & discernment-release, having directly known & realized them for himself

right in the here & now. Then at a later time, by means of the divine eye, purified & surpassing the human, I see him, through the ending of the effluents—entering & remaining in the effluent-free awareness-release & discernment-release, having directly known & realized them for himself right in the here & now—experiencing feelings that are exclusively pleasant." — *MN 12*

2. Ven. Mahā Kassapa: "And how is one ardent? There is the case where a monk, (thinking,) 'Unarisen evil, unskillful qualities arising in me would lead to what is unbeneficial,' arouses ardency. (Thinking,) 'Arisen evil, unskillful qualities not being abandoned in me…' … 'Unarisen skillful qualities not arising in me …' … 'Arisen skillful qualities ceasing in me would lead to what is unbeneficial,' he arouses ardency. This is how one is ardent." — *SN 16:2*

"And how is mindfulness the governing principle? The mindfulness that 'I will make complete any training with regard to good conduct that is not yet complete, or I will protect with discernment any training with regard to good conduct that is complete' is well established right within. The mindfulness that 'I will make complete any training with regard to the basics of the holy life that is not yet complete, or I will protect with discernment any training with regard to the basics of the holy life that is complete' is well established right within. The mindfulness that 'I will scrutinize with discernment any Dhamma that is not yet scrutinized, or I will protect with discernment any Dhamma that has been scrutinized' is well established right within. The mindfulness that 'I will touch through release any Dhamma that is not yet touched, or I will protect with discernment any Dhamma that has been touched' is well established right within. This is how mindfulness is the governing principle." — *AN 4:245*

3. "And how is a monk alert? There is the case where feelings are known to the monk as they arise, known as they become established, known as they subside. Thoughts are known to him as they arise, known as they become established, known as they subside. Perceptions are known to him as they arise, known as they become established, known as they subside. This is how a monk is alert." — *SN 47:35*

"And how is a monk alert? When going forward & returning, he makes himself alert; when looking toward & looking away… when bending & extending his limbs… when carrying his outer cloak, his upper robe, & his bowl… when eating, drinking, chewing, & savoring… when urinating & defecating… when walking, standing, sitting, falling asleep, waking up, talking,

& remaining silent, he makes himself alert. This is how a monk is alert." — *SN 36:7*

4. "And which is the faculty of mindfulness? There is the case where a disciple of the noble ones is mindful, is endowed with excellent proficiency in mindfulness, remembering & recollecting what was done and said a long time ago. He remains focused on the body in & of itself—ardent, alert, & mindful—subduing greed & distress with reference to the world. He remains focused on feelings in & of themselves… the mind in & of itself… mental qualities in & of themselves—ardent, alert, & mindful—subduing greed & distress with reference to the world. This is called the faculty of mindfulness." — *SN 48:10*

5. The discourses define "world" in two ways, both of which are relevant here:

> Then a certain monk went to the Blessed One and, on arrival, having bowed down to him, sat to one side. As he was sitting there, he said to the Blessed One: "'The world, the world *[loka],*' it is said. In what respect does the word 'world' apply?
>
> "Insofar as it disintegrates *[lujjati],* monk, it is called the 'world.' Now what disintegrates? The eye disintegrates. Forms disintegrate. Consciousness at the eye disintegrates. Contact at the eye disintegrates. And whatever there is that arises in dependence on contact at the eye—experienced as pleasure, pain or neither-pleasure-nor-pain—that too disintegrates.
>
> "The ear disintegrates. Sounds disintegrate…
>
> "The nose disintegrates. Aromas disintegrate…
>
> "The tongue disintegrates. Flavors disintegrate…
>
> "The body disintegrates. Tactile sensations disintegrate…
>
> "The intellect disintegrates. Ideas disintegrate. Consciousness at the intellect disintegrates. Contact at the intellect disintegrates. And whatever there is that arises in dependence on contact at the intellect—experienced as pleasure, pain or neither-pleasure-nor-pain—that too disintegrates.
>
> "Insofar as it disintegrates, it is called the 'world.'" — *SN 35:82*

> "These five strings of sensuality are, in the discipline of the noble ones, called the world. Which five? Forms cognizable via the eye—agreeable, pleasing, charming, endearing, enticing, linked to sensual desire; sounds cognizable via the ear… aromas cognizable via the nose… flavors cognizable via the tongue… tactile sensations cognizable via the body—agreeable, pleasing, charming, endearing, enticing, linked to sensual

desire. These are the five strings of sensuality that, in the discipline of the noble ones, are called the world." — *AN 9:38*

6. To the fore *(parimukhaṁ):* An Abhidhamma text, Vibhaṅga 12:1, defines this term as meaning "the tip of the nose or the sign of the mouth." However, the term appears as part of a stock phrase describing a person engaged in meditation, even for themes that have nothing to do with the body at all, such as sublime-attitude *(brahma-vihāra)* meditation (AN 3:64). Thus it seems more likely that the term is used in an idiomatic sense, indicating either that mindfulness is placed face-to-face with its object, or that it is made prominent, which is how I have translated it here.

7. The commentaries insist that "body" here means the full length of the breath, but this is unlikely in this context, for three reasons: (a) The first two steps already require being aware of the entire length of the breath. Otherwise, the meditator wouldn't know if a breath was short or long. (b) The fourth step —without further explanation—refers to the breath as "bodily fabrication." If the Buddha were using two different terms to refer to the breath—"body" and "bodily fabrication"—in such close proximity, he would have been careful to signal that he was redefining his terms (as he does below, when explaining that the first four steps in breath meditation correspond to the practice of focusing on the body in and of itself as a frame of reference). But he doesn't. (c) As AN 10:20 indicates, the fourth step refers to bringing the mind to the fourth jhāna, a state in which in-and-out breathing grows still (SN 36:11; AN 10:72) and the body is filled with pure, bright awareness (after awareness has been extended to be sensitive to the entire body beginning with the first jhāna (DN 2; MN 119)). Because the fourth step focuses on the stilling of the breath, there has to be a step in which the awareness is extended to fill the entire body. That would be this step.

8. "In-&-out breaths are bodily; these are things tied up with the body. That's why in-&-out breaths are bodily fabrications." — *MN 44*

"And how is a monk calmed in his bodily fabrication? There is the case where a monk, with the abandoning of pleasure & pain—as with the earlier disappearance of elation & distress—enters & remains in the fourth jhāna: purity of equanimity & mindfulness, neither pleasure nor pain." — *AN 10:20*

"When one has attained the fourth jhāna, in-and-out breaths have ceased." — SN 36:11 & AN 9:31

9. See MN 28 and MN 140.

10. SN 36:31 defines pleasure not of the flesh as the pleasure experienced in the first three jhānas. Similarly, the neither-painful-nor-pleasant feeling not of the flesh is equivalent to the feeling of equanimity not of the flesh experienced in the fourth jhāna (SN 48:38). Feelings of this sort don't simply come on their own. They're a product of fabrication. They have to be induced. And as the standard similes for the practice of jhāna show, the feelings of pleasure not of the flesh experienced in the first three jhānas aren't simply induced; they're spread and suffused until they permeate and fill the entire body.

"Painful feeling not of the flesh" is nowhere defined in the Canon, but we can derive from the discourses two possible ways of understanding it. On the one hand, it could be the sense of mental displeasure experienced while engaging in the contemplation of the unattractiveness of the body or the perception of death, which are painful ways to awakening (AN 4:163). On the other hand, a passage from MN 44 suggests that a painful feeling not of the flesh would be the distress that accompanies this thought: "O when will I enter & remain in the dimension that the noble ones now enter & remain in?" In other words, it's the feeling of distress you experience when contemplating how much you want to attain the goal and you haven't yet attained it. Another example of this sort of distress would be the reflection given in MN 28: "It is a loss for me, not a gain; ill-gotten for me, not well-gotten, that when I recollect the Buddha, Dhamma, & Saṅgha in this way, equanimity based on what is skillful is not established within me."

As MN 137 shows, painful feelings of this sort are not to be avoided. Instead, they are to be cultivated as an antidote to painful feelings of the flesh in order to provide an impetus to practice until one arrives at feelings of pleasure and equanimity not of the flesh.

11. "And what are the effluents to be abandoned by destroying? There is the case where a monk, reflecting appropriately, doesn't acquiesce to an arisen thought of sensuality. He abandons it, dispels it, wipes it out of existence.

"Reflecting appropriately, he doesn't acquiesce to an arisen thought of ill will. He abandons it, dispels it, & wipes it out of existence.

"Reflecting appropriately, he doesn't acquiesce to an arisen thought of harmfulness. He abandons it, dispels it, wipes it out of existence.

"Reflecting appropriately, he doesn't acquiesce to any arisen evil, unskillful qualities. He abandons them, dispels them, wipes them out of existence. The effluents, vexation, or fever that would arise if he were not to dispel these things

do not arise for him when he dispels them. These are called the effluents to be abandoned by dispelling." — *MN 2*

"And how is a monk skilled in reading his own mind? Imagine a young woman—or man—youthful, fond of adornment, examining the image of her own face in a bright, clean mirror or bowl of clear water: If she saw any dirt or blemish there, she would try to remove it. If she saw no dirt or blemish there, she would be pleased, her resolves fulfilled: 'How fortunate I am! How clean I am!' In the same way, a monk's self-examination is very productive in terms of skillful qualities [if he conducts it in this way]: 'Do I usually remain covetous or not? With thoughts of ill will or not? Overcome by sloth & drowsiness or not? Restless or not? Uncertain or gone beyond uncertainty? Angry or not? With soiled thoughts or unsoiled thoughts? With my body aroused or unaroused? Lazy or with persistence aroused? Unconcentrated or concentrated?'

"If, on examination, a monk knows, 'I usually remain covetous, with thoughts of ill will, overcome by sloth & drowsiness, restless, uncertain, angry, with soiled thoughts, with my body aroused, lazy, or unconcentrated,' then he should put forth intense desire, effort, diligence, endeavor, relentlessness, mindfulness, & alertness for the abandoning of those very same evil, unskillful qualities. Just as when a person whose turban or head was on fire would put forth intense desire, effort, diligence, endeavor, relentlessness, mindfulness, & alertness to put out the fire on his turban or head; in the same way, the monk should put forth intense desire, effort, diligence, endeavor, relentlessness, mindfulness, & alertness for the abandoning of those very same evil, unskillful qualities.

"But if, on examination, a monk knows, 'I usually remain uncovetous, without thoughts of ill will, free of sloth & drowsiness, not restless, gone beyond uncertainty, not angry, with unsoiled thoughts, with my body unaroused, with persistence aroused, & concentrated,' then his duty is to make an effort in establishing ['tuning'] those very same skillful qualities to a higher degree for the ending of the effluents." — *AN 10:51*

12. "There is the case where a monk develops the base of power endowed with concentration founded on desire & the fabrications of exertion, thinking, 'This desire of mine will be neither overly sluggish nor overly active, neither inwardly constricted nor outwardly scattered.' …

"And how is desire overly sluggish? Whatever desire is accompanied by laziness, conjoined with laziness: This is called overly sluggish desire.

"And how is desire overly active? Whatever desire is accompanied by restlessness, conjoined with restlessness: This is called overly active desire.

"And how is desire inwardly constricted? Whatever desire is accompanied by sloth & drowsiness, conjoined with sloth & drowsiness: This is called inwardly constricted desire.

"And how is desire outwardly scattered? Whatever desire is stirred up by the five strands of sensuality, outwardly dispersed & dissipated, this is called outwardly scattered desire.

"[Similarly with the other bases of power: concentration founded on persistence, on intent, and discrimination.]" — *SN 51:20*

13. *Mahaggataṁ.* This term is used, together with "immeasurable / unlimited," in the standard description of the awareness generated in the practice of the *brahmavihāras* (SN 42:8). According to Ven. Anuruddha in MN 127, however, an enlarged mind is not immeasurable. Its range of awareness is larger than the body but still measurable, ranging in distance from the shade of a tree to the earth bounded by the ocean.

14. On the various levels of release, see MN 43 and AN 9:43–45.

15. "Now, what is lack of food for the arising of unarisen *sensual desire,* or for the growth & increase of sensual desire once it has arisen? There is the theme of unattractiveness. To foster appropriate attention to it: This is lack of food for the arising of unarisen sensual desire, or for the growth & increase of sensual desire once it has arisen.

"And what is lack of food for the arising of unarisen *ill will,* or for the growth & increase of ill will once it has arisen? There is the release of the mind [through good will, compassion, empathetic joy, or equanimity]. To foster appropriate attention to that: This is lack of food for the arising of unarisen ill will, or for the growth & increase of ill will once it has arisen.

"And what is lack of food for the arising of unarisen *sloth & drowsiness,* or for the growth & increase of sloth & drowsiness once it has arisen? There is the potential for effort, the potential for exertion, the potential for striving. To foster appropriate attention to them: This is lack of food for the arising of unarisen sloth & drowsiness, or for the growth & increase of sloth & drowsiness once it has arisen.

"And what is lack of food for the arising of unarisen *restlessness & anxiety,* or for the growth & increase of restlessness & anxiety once it has arisen? There is stillness of awareness. To foster appropriate attention to that: This is lack of food

for the arising of unarisen restlessness & anxiety, or for the growth & increase of restlessness & anxiety once it has arisen.

"And what is lack of food for the arising of unarisen *uncertainty,* or for the growth & increase of uncertainty once it has arisen? There are mental qualities that are skillful & unskillful, blameworthy & blameless, gross & refined, siding with darkness & with light. To foster appropriate attention to them: This is lack of food for the arising of unarisen uncertainty, or for the growth & increase of uncertainty once it has arisen." — *SN 46:51*

16. "Develop concentration, monks. A concentrated monk discerns things as they have come to be. And what does he discern as it has come to be?

"The origination & disappearance of form… of feeling… of perception… of fabrications… of consciousness.

"And what is the origination of form… of feeling… of perception… of fabrications… of consciousness? There is the case where one relishes, welcomes, & remains fastened. To what? One relishes form, welcomes it, & remains fastened to it. While one is relishing form, welcoming it, & remaining fastened to it, delight arises. Any delight in form is clinging. With that clinging as a condition there is becoming. With becoming as a condition there is birth. With birth as a condition then aging-&-death, sorrow, lamentation, pain, distress, & despair all come into play. Thus is the origination of this entire mass of suffering & stress. [Similarly with feeling, perception, fabrications, & consciousness.]

"And what is the disappearance of form… of feeling… of perception… of fabrications… of consciousness? There is the case where one does not relish, welcome or remain fastened. To what? One does not relish form, welcome it, or remain fastened to it. While one is not relishing form, welcoming it, or remaining fastened to it, one's delight in form ceases. From the cessation of that delight, clinging ceases. From the cessation of clinging, becoming ceases. From the cessation of becoming, birth ceases. From the cessation of birth, then aging-&-death, sorrow, lamentation, pain, distress, & despair all cease. Thus is the cessation of this entire mass of suffering & stress. [Similarly with feeling, perception, fabrications, & consciousness.]" — *SN 22:5*

17. Ven. Sāriputta: "Suppose that a black ox and a white ox were joined with a single collar or yoke. If someone were to say, 'The black ox is the fetter of the white ox, the white ox is the fetter of the black'—speaking this way, would he be speaking rightly?"

Ven. MahāKoṭṭhita: "No, my friend. The black ox is not the fetter of the white ox, nor is the white ox the fetter of the black. The single collar or yoke by

which they are joined: That is the fetter there."

Ven. Sāriputta: "In the same way, the eye is not the fetter of forms, nor are forms the fetter of the eye. Whatever desire-passion arises in dependence on the two of them: That is the fetter there. The ear is not the fetter of sounds.… The nose is not the fetter of aromas.… The tongue is not the fetter of flavors.… The body is not the fetter of tactile sensations.… The intellect is not the fetter of ideas, nor are ideas the fetter of the intellect. Whatever desire-passion arises in dependence on the two of them: That is the fetter there." — *SN 35:191*

18. "Now, what is the food for the arising of unarisen *mindfulness* as a factor for awakening, or for the growth & increase of mindfulness… once it has arisen? There are qualities that act as a foothold for mindfulness as a factor for awakening. [According to SN 47:16, these are well-purified virtue & views made straight; according to MN 118, they would include the qualities fostered by the sixteen steps of breath meditation.] To foster appropriate attention to them: This is the food for the arising of unarisen mindfulness as a factor for awakening, or for the growth & increase of mindfulness… once it has arisen.

"And what is the food for the arising of unarisen *analysis of qualities* as a factor for awakening, or for the growth & increase of analysis of qualities… once it has arisen? There are qualities that are skillful & unskillful, blameworthy & blameless, gross & refined, siding with darkness & with light. To foster appropriate attention to them: This is the food for the arising of unarisen analysis of qualities as a factor for awakening, or for the growth & increase of analysis of qualities… once it has arisen.

"And what is the food for the arising of unarisen *persistence* as a factor for awakening, or for the growth & increase of persistence… once it has arisen? There is the potential for effort, the potential for exertion, the potential for striving. To foster appropriate attention to them: This is the food for the arising of unarisen persistence as a factor for awakening, or for the growth & increase of persistence… once it has arisen.

"And what is the food for the arising of unarisen *rapture* as a factor for awakening, or for the growth & increase of rapture… once it has arisen? There are mental qualities that act as a foothold for rapture as a factor for awakening. To foster appropriate attention to them: This is the food for the arising of unarisen rapture as a factor for awakening, or for the growth & increase of rapture… once it has arisen.

"And what is the food for the arising of unarisen *calm* as a factor for awakening, or for the growth & increase of calm… once it has arisen? There is

physical calm & there is mental calm. To foster appropriate attention to them: This is the food for the arising of unarisen calm as a factor for awakening, or for the growth & increase of calm… once it has arisen.

"And what is the food for the arising of unarisen *concentration* as a factor for awakening, or for the growth & increase of concentration… once it has arisen? There are themes for calm, themes for non-distraction [these are the four establishings of mindfulness]. To foster appropriate attention to them: This is the food for the arising of unarisen concentration as a factor for awakening, or for the growth & increase of concentration… once it has arisen.

"And what is the food for the arising of unarisen *equanimity* as a factor for awakening, or for the growth & increase of equanimity… once it has arisen? There are mental qualities that act as a foothold for equanimity as a factor for awakening. To foster appropriate attention to them: This is the food for the arising of unarisen equanimity as a factor for awakening, or for the growth & increase of equanimity… once it has arisen." — *SN 46:51*

19. "'This noble truth of stress is to be comprehended' … 'This noble truth of the origination of stress is to be abandoned' … 'This noble truth of the cessation of stress is to be realized' … 'This noble truth of the way of practice leading to the cessation of stress is to be developed.'" — *SN 56:11*

*See also: MN 117; MN 118; MN 119; MN 125; SN 12:66; SN 47:8; SN 47:20; SN 47:40; AN 4:194; AN 4:245; AN 7:63; AN 8:70; AN 10:51*

# *The Wheel-turning Emperor (Excerpt)*
# *Cakkavatti Sutta (DN 26)*

## Introduction

*The body of this sutta consists of a narrative illustrating the power of skillful action. The narrative states that, in the past, unskillful behavior was unknown among the human race. As a result, people lived for an immensely long time—80,000 years—endowed with great beauty, wealth, pleasure, and strength. Over the course of time, though, they began behaving in various unskillful ways. This caused the human life span gradually to shorten, to the point where it now stands at 100 years, with human beauty, wealth, pleasure, and strength decreasing proportionately. In the future, as morality continues to degenerate, human life will continue to shorten to the point were the normal life span is ten years, with people reaching sexual maturity at five. "Among those human beings, the ten courses of action (see AN 10:176) will have entirely disappeared.… The word 'skillful' will not exist, so from where will there be anyone who does what is skillful? Those who lack the honorable qualities of motherhood, fatherhood, contemplative-hood, & brahman-hood will be the ones who receive homage.… Fierce hatred will arise, fierce malevolence, fierce rage, & murderous thoughts: mother for child, child for mother, father for child, child for father, brother for sister, sister for brother."*

*Ultimately, conditions will deteriorate to the point of a "sword-interval," in which swords appear in the hands of all human beings, and they hunt one another like game. A few people, however, will take shelter in the wilderness to escape the carnage, and when the slaughter is over, they will come out of hiding and resolve to take up a life of skillful and virtuous action again. With the recovery of virtue, the human life span will gradually increase again until it reaches 80,000 years, with people attaining sexual maturity at 500. Only three diseases will be known at that time: desire, lack of food, and old age. Another Buddha—Metteyya (Maitreya)—will gain awakening, his monastic Saṅgha*

*numbering in the thousands. The greatest king of the time, Saṅkha, will go forth into homelessness and attain arahantship under Metteyya's guidance.*

*The story, after chronicling the ups and downs of human wealth, life span, etc., concludes with the following lesson on kamma and skillful action.*

* * *

…"Monks, live with yourself as your island, yourself as your refuge, with nothing else as your refuge. Live with the Dhamma as your island, the Dhamma as your refuge, with nothing else as your refuge.[1] And how does a monk live with himself as his island, himself as his refuge, with nothing else as his refuge; with the Dhamma as his island, the Dhamma as his refuge, with nothing else as his refuge? There is the case where a monk remains focused on the body in & of itself—ardent, alert, & mindful—subduing greed & distress with reference to the world. He remains focused on feelings in & of themselves… mind in & of itself… mental qualities in & of themselves—ardent, alert, & mindful—subduing greed & distress with reference to the world. This is how a monk lives with himself as his island, himself as his refuge, with nothing else as his refuge; with the Dhamma as his island, the Dhamma as his refuge, with nothing else as his refuge.

"Wander, monks, in your proper range, your own ancestral territory. When you wander in your proper range, your own ancestral territory, you will grow in long life, beauty, pleasure, wealth, & strength.

"And what constitutes a monk's long life?[2] There is the case where a monk develops the base of power endowed with concentration founded on desire & the fabrications of exertion. He develops the base of power endowed with concentration founded on persistence.… founded on intent.… He develops the base of power endowed with concentration founded on discrimination & the fabrications of exertion. From the development & pursuit of these four bases of power, he can stay (alive) for an eon, if he wants, or for the remainder of an eon.[3] This constitutes a monk's long life.

"And what constitutes a monk's beauty? There is the case where a monk is virtuous. He dwells restrained in accordance with the Pāṭimokkha, consummate in his behavior & sphere of activity. He trains

himself, having undertaken the training rules, seeing danger in the slightest faults. This constitutes a monk's beauty.

"And what constitutes a monk's pleasure? There is the case where a monk—quite secluded from sensuality, secluded from unskillful qualities—enters & remains in the first jhāna: rapture & pleasure born of seclusion, accompanied by directed thought & evaluation. With the stilling of directed thoughts & evaluations, he enters & remains in the second jhāna: rapture & pleasure born of concentration, unification of awareness free from directed thought & evaluation—internal assurance. With the fading of rapture he remains equanimous, mindful, & alert, and senses pleasure with the body. He enters & remains in the third jhāna, of which the noble ones declare, 'Equanimous & mindful, he has a pleasant abiding.' With the abandoning of pleasure & pain—as with the earlier disappearance of elation & distress—he enters & remains in the fourth jhāna: purity of equanimity & mindfulness, neither pleasure nor pain. This constitutes a monk's pleasure.

"And what constitutes a monk's wealth? There is the case where a monk keeps pervading the first direction [the east]—as well as the second direction, the third, & the fourth—with an awareness imbued with good will. Thus he keeps pervading above, below, & all around, everywhere & in every respect the all-encompassing world with an awareness imbued with good will: abundant, expansive, immeasurable, free from hostility, free from ill will.

"He keeps pervading the first direction—as well as the second direction, the third, & the fourth—with an awareness imbued with compassion.... imbued with empathetic joy....

"He keeps pervading the first direction—as well as the second direction, the third, & the fourth—with an awareness imbued with equanimity. Thus he keeps pervading above, below, & all around, everywhere & in every respect the all-encompassing world with an awareness imbued with equanimity: abundant, expansive, immeasurable, free from hostility, free from ill will.

"This constitutes a monk's wealth.

"And what constitutes a monk's strength? There is the case where a monk, through the ending of the mental fermentations, enters & remains

in the fermentation-free awareness-release & discernment-release, having directly known & realized them for himself right in the here & now. This constitutes a monk's strength.

"Monks, I don't envision any other single strength so hard to overcome as this: the strength of Māra.[4] And the adopting of skillful qualities is what causes this merit to increase."[5]

That is what the Blessed One said. Gratified, the monks delighted in the Blessed One's words.

## Notes

1. This can also be translated as: "Live with mental qualities *(dhammas)* as your island, mental qualities as your refuge, with nothing else as your refuge."

2. Literally, "what is in a monk's long life?" This appears to be an idiomatic usage of the locative case. The commentary interprets this idiom as meaning, what *causes* a monk's long life, beauty, etc. From this reading, it explains, for example, that a monk attracts wealth if he develops the four sublime attitudes. While this is true, it seems to cheapen the message of this passage. For a discussion of the four bases of power listed here, see SN 51:15 and SN 51:20.

3. See DN 16, notes 24 and 25.

4. This last passage is related to the opening passage of the sutta, in which the Buddha says, "Wander, monks, in your proper range, your own ancestral territory. When one wanders in his proper range, his own ancestral territory, Māra gains no opening, Māra gains no foothold. And it is because of adopting skillful qualities that this merit increases." See also SN 47:6–7.

5. This is the refrain repeated with each stage in the account of how human life will improve in the aftermath of the sword-interval. Here, "merit" seems to have the meaning it has in Iti 22: "Don't be afraid of acts of merit. This is another way of saying what is blissful, desirable, pleasing, endearing, charming —i.e., acts of merit."

# *The Inspiring Discourse*
# *Pāsādika Sutta (DN 29)*

I have heard that on one occasion the Blessed One was staying among the Sakyans in the mansion in the mango grove of the Sakyan family called Vedhañña [Archer]. And on that occasion Nigaṇṭha Nāṭaputta had just died in Pāvā. On his death, the Nigaṇṭhas had split into two factions. They kept arguing, quarreling, & disputing, stabbing one another with weapons of the mouth: "You don't understand this Dhamma-Vinaya. I understand this Dhamma-Vinaya. How could you understand this Dhamma-Vinaya? You practice wrongly. I practice rightly. I'm consistent. You're inconsistent. What should be said first, you said last. What should be said last, you said first. What you cogitated so long has been turned inside out. Your position has been overthrown. You're trapped, so go try to release your position or disentangle yourself if you can!" Nothing but slaughter, as it were, was being committed among the Nigaṇṭha Nāṭa-sons. Even the lay disciples of Nigaṇṭha Nāṭaputta, dressed in white, seemed disenchanted, disgusted, & repelled by the Nigaṇṭha Nāṭa-sons, and at how that poorly proclaimed Dhamma-Vinaya was poorly expounded, not leading out, not conducive to calming, expounded by one who was not rightly self-awakened, its foundation [now] broken, without an arbiter.[1]

Then Cunda the novice, who had spent the Rains at Pāvā, went to Ven. Ānanda at Sāmagāma and, on arrival, having bowed down to him, sat to one side. As he was sitting there, he said to Ven. Ānanda, "Venerable sir, Nigaṇṭha Nāṭaputta has just died in Pāvā. On his death, the Nigaṇṭhas have split into two factions. They keep arguing, quarreling, & disputing, stabbing one another with weapons of the mouth: 'You don't understand this Dhamma-Vinaya. I understand this Dhamma-Vinaya. How could you understand this Dhamma-Vinaya? You practice wrongly. I practice rightly. I'm consistent. You're inconsistent. What should be said first, you said last. What should be said last, you said first. What you cogitated so long has been turned inside out. Your position has been overthrown. You're

trapped, so go try to release your position or disentangle yourself if you can!' Nothing but slaughter, as it were, is being committed among the Niganṭha Nāṭa-sons. Even the lay disciples of Niganṭha Nāṭaputta, dressed in white, seem disenchanted, disgusted, & repelled by the Niganṭha Nāṭa-sons, and at how that poorly proclaimed Dhamma-Vinaya was poorly expounded, not leading out, not conducive to calming, expounded by one who was not rightly self-awakened, its support [now] broken, without an arbiter."

When this was said, Ven. Ānanda said to Cunda the novice, "Friend Cunda, there is warrant here for talking to the Blessed One. Let's go to the Blessed One and, on arrival, report this matter to him."

"As you say, venerable sir," Cunda the novice responded to Ven. Ānanda. Then Ven. Ānanda & Cunda the novice went to the Blessed One and, on arrival, having bowed down to him, sat to one side. As they were sitting there, Ven. Ānanda said to the Blessed One, "Lord, Cunda the novice, here, has said that Niganṭha Nāṭaputta has just died in Pāvā. … Even the lay disciples of Niganṭha Nāṭaputta, dressed in white, seem disenchanted, disgusted, & repelled by the Niganṭha Nāṭa-sons, and at how that poorly proclaimed Dhamma-Vinaya was poorly expounded, not leading out, not conducive to calming, expounded by one who was not rightly self-awakened, its support broken, without an arbiter."

"That's the way it is, Cunda, with a poorly proclaimed Dhamma-Vinaya, poorly expounded, not leading out, not conducive to calming, expounded by one who is not rightly self-awakened.

## A Poorly-expounded Dhamma-Vinaya

"There is the case, Cunda, where a teacher is not rightly self-awakened, and his Dhamma-Vinaya is poorly proclaimed, poorly expounded, not leading out, not conducive to calming, expounded by one who is not rightly self-awakened. A disciple of that Dhamma does not dwell practicing the Dhamma in accordance with [that] Dhamma, practicing masterfully, living in line with [that] Dhamma, but deviates from it. He is to be told, 'It is a gain for you, friend, well-gained by you, that—when your teacher is not rightly self-awakened, and his Dhamma-Vinaya is poorly proclaimed, poorly expounded, not leading out, not conducive to calming, expounded by one who is not rightly self-awakened—you are one who does not dwell practicing the Dhamma in accordance with the Dhamma, practicing masterfully, living in line with the Dhamma, but deviates from it.' There, Cunda, the teacher is to be criticized, the Dhamma is to be criticized, but the disciple is to be thus praised.

"Whoever might say to such a disciple, 'Come, friend, practice in line with the Dhamma as taught and formulated by your teacher': The person who urged him, the thing urged, and the person who practiced in line with what was urged would all produce much demerit. Why is that? That's the way it is, Cunda, with a poorly proclaimed Dhamma-Vinaya, poorly expounded, not leading out, not conducive to calming, expounded by one who is not rightly self-awakened.

"There is the case, Cunda, where a teacher is not rightly self-awakened, and his Dhamma-Vinaya is poorly proclaimed, poorly expounded, not leading out, not conducive to calming, expounded by one who is not rightly self-awakened. A disciple of that Dhamma dwells practicing the Dhamma in accordance with the Dhamma, practicing masterfully, living in line with the Dhamma, and acts to conform to it. He is to be told, 'It is no gain for you, friend, poorly-gained by you, that—when your teacher is not rightly self-awakened, and his Dhamma-Vinaya, is poorly proclaimed, poorly expounded, not leading out, not conducive to calming, expounded by one who is not rightly self-awakened—you are one who dwells practicing the Dhamma in accordance with [that] Dhamma, practicing masterfully, living in line with [that] Dhamma, and acts to conform to it.' There, Cunda, the teacher is to be criticized, the Dhamma is to be criticized, and the disciple is to be thus criticized.

"Whoever might say to such a disciple, 'Yes, friend, practicing the right way, you will succeed in the right way': The person who praised him, the thing praised, and the person who, being praised, aroused even greater persistence would all produce much demerit. Why is that? That's the way it is, Cunda, with a poorly proclaimed Dhamma-Vinaya, poorly expounded, not leading out, not conducive to calming, expounded by one who is not rightly self-awakened.

### A Well-expounded Dhamma-Vinaya

"There is the case, Cunda, where a teacher is rightly self-awakened, and his Dhamma-Vinaya, is well-proclaimed, well-expounded, leading out, conducive to calming, expounded by one who is rightly self-awakened. A disciple of that Dhamma does not dwell practicing the Dhamma in accordance with the Dhamma, practicing masterfully, living in line with the Dhamma, but deviates from it. He is to be told, 'It is no gain for you, friend, poorly-gained by you, that—when your teacher is rightly self-awakened, and his Dhamma-Vinaya is well-proclaimed, well-expounded, leading out, conducive to calming, expounded by one who is rightly self-awakened—you are one who does not dwell practicing the Dhamma in accordance with the Dhamma, practicing masterfully, living in line with the Dhamma, but deviates from it.' There, Cunda, the teacher is to be praised, the Dhamma is to be praised, but the disciple is to be thus criticized.

"Whoever might say to such a disciple, 'Come, friend, practice in line with the Dhamma as taught and formulated by your teacher': The person who urged him, the thing urged, and the person who practiced in line with what was urged would all produce much merit. Why is that? That's the way it is, Cunda, with a well-proclaimed Dhamma-Vinaya, well-expounded, leading out, conducive to calming, expounded by one who is rightly self-awakened.

"There is the case, Cunda, where a teacher is rightly self-awakened, and his Dhamma-Vinaya, is well-proclaimed, well-expounded, leading out, conducive to calming, expounded by one who is rightly self-awakened. A disciple of that Dhamma dwells practicing the Dhamma in accordance with the Dhamma, practicing masterfully, living in line with the

Dhamma, and acts to conform to it. He is to be told, 'It is a gain for you, friend, well-gained by you, that—when your teacher is rightly self-awakened, and his Dhamma-Vinaya is well-proclaimed, well-expounded, leading out, conducive to calming, expounded by one who is rightly self-awakened—you are one who dwells practicing the Dhamma in accordance with the Dhamma, practicing masterfully, living in line with the Dhamma, and acts to conform to it.' There, Cunda, the teacher is to be praised, the Dhamma is to be praised, and the disciple is to be thus praised.

"Whoever might say to such a disciple, 'Yes, friend, practicing the right way, you will succeed in the right way': The person who praised him, the thing praised, and the person who, being praised, aroused even greater persistence would all produce much merit. Why is that? That's the way it is, Cunda, with a well-proclaimed Dhamma-Vinaya, well-expounded, leading out, conducive to calming, expounded by one who is rightly self-awakened.

## The Complete Holy Life

"There is the case, Cunda, where a teacher has appeared in the world, worthy & rightly self-awakened. And the Dhamma is well-proclaimed, well-expounded, leading out, conducive to calming, expounded by one who is rightly self-awakened. But his disciples have not been instructed in the meaning/goal of the True Dhamma,[2] nor has the complete holy life been entirely disclosed to them, made plain, with all its steps collected, complete with miracles,[3] well-proclaimed as far as human beings & devas. Then their teacher disappears. When a teacher of that sort has died, it is a matter of regret for his disciples. Why is that? Because: 'A teacher has appeared in the world, worthy & rightly self-awakened. And the Dhamma is well-proclaimed, well-expounded, leading out, conducive to calming, expounded by one who is rightly self-awakened. But we have not been instructed in the meaning/goal of the True Dhamma, nor has the complete holy life been entirely disclosed to us, made plain, with all its steps collected, complete with miracles, well-proclaimed as far as human beings & devas, and now our teacher has disappeared.' When a teacher of that sort has died, it is a matter of regret for his disciples.

"But then there is the case, Cunda, where a teacher has appeared in the world, worthy & rightly self-awakened. And the Dhamma is well-proclaimed, well-expounded, leading out, conducive to calming, expounded by one who is rightly self-awakened. His disciples have been instructed in the meaning/goal of the True Dhamma, and the complete holy life has been entirely disclosed to them, made plain, with all its steps collected, complete with miracles, well-proclaimed as far as human beings & devas. Then their teacher disappears. When a teacher of that sort has died, it is a matter of no regret for his disciples. Why is that? Because: 'A teacher has appeared in the world, worthy & rightly self-awakened. And the Dhamma is well-proclaimed, well-expounded, leading out, conducive to calming, expounded by one who is rightly self-awakened. And we have been instructed in the meaning/goal of the True Dhamma, and the complete holy life has been entirely disclosed to us, made plain, with all its steps collected, complete with miracles, well-proclaimed as far as human beings & devas, and now our teacher has disappeared.' When a teacher of that sort has died, it is a matter of no regret for his disciples.

"Now, if a holy life is endowed with those factors, yet there is no teacher who is an elder, of long standing, long gone forth, senior, attained to old age, then a holy life of that sort is incomplete with regard to that factor. But when a holy life is endowed with those factors, and there is a teacher who is an elder, of long standing, long gone forth, senior, attained to old age, then a holy life of that sort is complete with regard to that factor.

"But if a holy life is endowed with those factors, and there is a teacher who is an elder, of long standing, long gone forth, senior, attained to old age, yet there are no elder monk disciples of his that are experienced, trained, mature, attained to security from the yoke, able to teach the True Dhamma, able to trap with the True Dhamma any opposing doctrines that have arisen and—having trapped them—to teach the Dhamma complete with miracles, then a holy life of that sort is incomplete with regard to that factor. But when a holy life is endowed with those factors, and there is a teacher who is an elder, of long standing, long gone forth, senior, attained to old age, and there are elder monk disciples of his who are experienced, trained, mature, attained to security from the yoke, able to teach the True Dhamma, able to trap with the True Dhamma any

opposing doctrines that have arisen and—having trapped them—to teach the Dhamma complete with miracles, then a holy life of that sort is complete with regard to that factor.

"But if a holy life is endowed with those factors, and there is a teacher who is an elder, of long standing, long gone forth, senior, attained to old age, and there are elder monk disciples of his who are experienced, trained, mature, attained to security from the yoke, able to teach the True Dhamma, able to trap with the True Dhamma any opposing doctrines that have arisen and—having trapped them—to teach the Dhamma complete with miracles, yet there are no monk disciples of his of middle standing… there are monk disciples of his of middle standing, yet no junior monk disciples of his… there are junior monk disciples of his, yet no elder nun disciples of his… there are elder nun disciples of his, yet no nun disciples of his of middle standing… there are nun disciples of his of middle standing, yet no junior nun disciples of his… there are junior nun disciples of his, yet no male lay disciples of his, householders wearing white, following the celibate life… there are male lay disciples of his, householders wearing white, following the celibate life, yet no male lay disciples of his, householders wearing white, partaking of sensuality… there are male lay disciples of his, householders wearing white, partaking of sensuality, yet no female lay disciples of his, householders wearing white, following the celibate life… there are female lay disciples of his, householders wearing white, following the celibate life, yet no female lay disciples of his, householders wearing white, partaking of sensuality… there are female lay disciples of his, householders wearing white, partaking of sensuality, yet his holy life has not become powerful, prosperous, detailed, well-populated, wide-spread, proclaimed among devas & human beings… his holy life has become powerful, prosperous, detailed, well-populated, wide-spread, proclaimed among devas & human beings, yet has not attained supremacy in terms of gains & supremacy in terms of status, then a holy life of that sort is incomplete with regard to that factor.

"But when a holy life is endowed with those factors, and there is a teacher who is an elder, of long standing, long gone forth, senior, attained to old age, and there are elder monk disciples of his who are experienced, trained, mature, attained to security from the yoke, able to teach the True

Dhamma, able to trap with the True Dhamma any opposing doctrines that have arisen and—having trapped them—to teach the Dhamma complete with miracles; and there are monk disciples of his of middle standing; there are junior monk disciples of his; there are elder nun disciples of his… nun disciples of his of middle standing… junior nun disciples of his… male lay disciples of his, householders wearing white, following the celibate life… male lay disciples of his, householders wearing white, partaking of sensuality… female lay disciples of his, householders wearing white, following the celibate life; there are female lay disciples of his, householders wearing white, partaking of sensuality; and his holy life has become powerful, prosperous, detailed, well-populated, wide-spread, proclaimed among devas & human beings, and has attained supremacy in terms of gains & supremacy in terms of status, then a holy life of that sort is complete with regard to that factor.

"Cunda, I am now a teacher who has appeared in the world, worthy & rightly self-awakened. And the Dhamma is well-proclaimed, well-expounded, leading out, conducive to calming, expounded by one who is rightly self-awakened. My disciples have been instructed in the meaning/goal of the True Dhamma, and the complete holy life has been entirely disclosed to them, made plain, with all its steps collected, complete with miracles, well-proclaimed as far as human beings & devas. I am now a teacher who is an elder, of long standing, long gone forth, senior, attained to old age.

"There are now elder monk disciples of mine who are experienced, trained, mature, attained to security from the yoke, able to teach the True Dhamma, able to trap with the True Dhamma any opposing doctrines that have arisen and—having trapped them—to teach the Dhamma complete with miracles. There are now[4] monk disciples of mine of middle standing. There are now junior monk disciples of mine. There are now elder nun disciples of mine… nun disciples of mine of middle standing… junior nun disciples of mine… male lay disciples of mine, householders wearing white, following the celibate life… male lay disciples of mine, householders wearing white, partaking of sensuality… female lay disciples of mine, householders wearing white, following the celibate life. There are now female lay disciples of mine, householders wearing white, partaking of sensuality; and my holy life has now become

powerful, prosperous, detailed, well-populated, wide-spread, proclaimed among devas & human beings.

"Cunda, to the extent that I am now a teacher who has appeared in the world, I do not see any other teacher who has attained supremacy in terms of gains & supremacy in terms of status equal to what I have. And to the extent that my community or group has appeared in the world, I do not see any other community that has attained supremacy in terms of gains & supremacy in terms of status, equal to what the Saṅgha of monks has.

"If one speaking rightly were to say, 'a well-expounded, entirely complete, well-proclaimed holy life, consummate in all its aspects, complete in all its aspects, with nothing lacking & nothing in excess,' he would, speaking rightly, say it of this: 'a well-expounded, entirely complete, well-proclaimed holy life, consummate in all its aspects, complete in all its aspects, with nothing lacking & nothing in excess.'

"Udaka Rāmaputta[5] once made this statement: 'Seeing, one doesn't see.' And what is it that, 'seeing, one doesn't see'? One sees the blade of a well-sharpened razor, but not the edge of the razor. This, Cunda, is called, 'seeing, one doesn't see.' But this statement of Uddaka Rāmaputta is base, vulgar, common, ignoble, unprofitable, dealing only with a razor.

"But how would one, speaking rightly, say, 'Seeing, one doesn't see'? One speaking rightly, would say just this: 'Seeing, one doesn't see.' And what is it that, 'seeing, one doesn't see'? Such a well-expounded, entirely complete, well-proclaimed holy life, consummate in all its aspects, complete in all its aspects, with nothing lacking and nothing in excess: This is what one sees. One doesn't see, 'If this were taken away from here, it would become purer.' One doesn't see, 'If this were added here, it would become more complete.' This is called, 'seeing, one doesn't see.'

"Cunda, if one speaking rightly were to say, 'a well-expounded, entirely complete, well-proclaimed holy life, consummate in all its aspects, complete in all its aspects, with nothing lacking and nothing in excess,' he would, speaking rightly, say it of this: 'a well-expounded, entirely complete, well-proclaimed holy life, consummate in all its aspects, complete in all its aspects, with nothing lacking and nothing in excess.'

## That this Holy Life May Long Endure

"Therefore, Cunda, with regard to the qualities I have taught, having directly known them, you should all, having assembled & gathered together, recite & compare[6] meaning with meaning, expression with expression, so that this holy life may long endure & remain steadfast for the benefit, welfare, & happiness of the multitude; out of sympathy for the world; for the benefit, welfare, & happiness of human beings & devas. And which are the qualities I have taught that you should all, having assembled & gathered together, recite & compare meaning with meaning, expression with expression, so that this holy life may long endure & remain steadfast for the benefit, welfare, & happiness of the multitude; out of sympathy for the world; for the benefit, welfare, & happiness of human beings & devas? The four establishings of mindfulness, the four right exertions, the four bases of power, the five faculties, the five strengths, the seven factors for awakening, the noble eightfold path.[7] These are the qualities I have taught that you should all, having assembled & gathered together, recite & compare meaning with meaning, expression with expression, so that this holy life may long endure & remain steadfast for the benefit, welfare, & happiness of the multitude; out of sympathy for the world; for the benefit, welfare, & happiness of human beings & devas. In them, you should train yourselves harmoniously, cordially, without dispute.

"If one of your fellows in the holy life should speak of the Dhamma in the Saṅgha, and if the thought occurs to you, 'Friends, this venerable one has grasped the wrong meaning and picked up the wrong expression,' you should express neither delight nor scorn. Neither delighting nor scorning, you should say to him, 'With regard to this meaning, friend, there are these expressions or those expressions. Which are the more pertinent? And with regard to these expressions, there is this meaning or that meaning. Which is the more pertinent?'

"If he should say, 'Friends, with regard to this meaning, these expressions are more pertinent than those; and with regard to these expressions, this meaning is more pertinent than that,' then he is neither to be praised nor disparaged. Neither praising nor disparaging him, you should show him how to examine that meaning & those expressions.

"If another one of your fellows in the holy life should speak of the Dhamma in the Saṅgha, and if the thought occurs to you, 'Friends, this venerable one has grasped the wrong meaning but picked up the right expression,' you should express neither delight nor scorn. Neither delighting nor scorning, you should say to him, 'With regard to these expressions, there is this meaning or that meaning. Which is the more pertinent?'

"If he should say, 'Friends, with regard to these expressions, this meaning is more pertinent than that,' then he is neither to be praised nor disparaged. Neither praising nor disparaging him, you should show him how to examine that meaning.

"If another one of your fellows in the holy life should speak of the Dhamma in the Saṅgha, and if the thought occurs to you, 'Friends, this venerable one has grasped the right meaning but picked up the wrong expression,' you should express neither delight nor scorn. Neither delighting nor scorning, you should say to him, 'With regard to this meaning, friend, there are these expressions or those expressions. Which are the more pertinent?'

"If he should say, 'Friends, with regard to this meaning, these expressions are more pertinent than those,' then he is neither to be praised nor disparaged. Neither praising nor disparaging him, you should show him how to examine those expressions.

"If another one of your fellows in the holy life should speak of the Dhamma in the Saṅgha, and if the thought occurs to you, 'Friends, this venerable one has grasped the right meaning and picked up the right expression,' saying, 'Excellent,' you should express delight & rejoice in his statement. Expressing delight & rejoicing in his statement, saying, 'Excellent,' you should say to him, 'It's a gain for us, friend, a great gain, that we see a venerable one like you who has entered into the meaning and the expression in this way.'

## The Pleasures of the Holy Life

"Cunda, I don't teach you the Dhamma only for the restraint of effluents in the present life, nor do I teach you the Dhamma only for the warding off of effluents in the afterlife. I teach you the Dhamma both for the restraint of effluents in the present life and for the warding off of effluents in the afterlife.

"Therefore, the robe I have allowed you is enough simply to counteract cold, to counteract heat, to counteract the touch of flies, mosquitoes, wind, sun, & reptiles; simply for the purpose of covering the parts of the body that cause shame.

"The alms food I have allowed you is enough simply for the survival & continuance of this body, for ending its afflictions, for the support of the holy life, thinking, 'Thus will I destroy old feelings (of hunger) and not create new feelings (from overeating). I will maintain myself, be blameless, & live in comfort.'

"The lodgings I have allowed you are enough simply to counteract cold, to counteract heat, to counteract the touch of flies, mosquitoes, wind, sun, & reptiles; simply for protection from the inclemencies of weather and for the enjoyment of seclusion.

"The medicinal requisites used for curing the sick that I have allowed you are enough simply to counteract any pains of illness that have arisen and for maximum freedom from disease.

"Now, it's possible, Cunda, that wanderers of other sects might say, 'The Sakyan-son contemplatives live devoted to the devotion to pleasure.' When they are saying that, the wanderers of other sects should be told, 'Which devotion to pleasure, friends?—for devotion to pleasure has many modes, many permutations.'[8]

"There are four devotions to pleasure, Cunda, that are base, vulgar, common, ignoble, unprofitable, that do not lead to disenchantment, dispassion, cessation, calming, direct knowledge, self-awakening, or unbinding. Which four?

"There is the case where a certain fool finds pleasure & rapture for himself in killing living beings. This is the first devotion to pleasure.

"Further, there is the case where a certain person finds pleasure & rapture for himself in taking what is not given. This is the second

devotion to pleasure.

"Further, there is the case where a certain person finds pleasure & rapture for himself in telling lies. This is the third devotion to pleasure.

"Further, there is the case where a certain person goes about endowed & provided with the five strings of sensuality. This is the fourth devotion to pleasure.

"These are the four devotions to pleasure, Cunda, that are base, vulgar, common, ignoble, unprofitable, that do not lead to disenchantment, dispassion, cessation, calming, direct knowledge, self-awakening, or unbinding.

"Now, it's possible that wanderers of other sects might say, 'The Sakyan-son contemplatives live devoted to these four devotions to pleasure.' They are to be told, 'Not so!' They would not be speaking rightly of you. They would be slandering you with what is unfactual & untrue.

"There are four devotions to pleasure, Cunda, that lead exclusively to disenchantment, dispassion, cessation, calming, direct knowledge, self-awakening, & unbinding. Which four?

"There is the case where a monk, quite secluded from sensuality, secluded from unskillful qualities, enters & remains in the first jhāna: rapture & pleasure born of seclusion, accompanied by directed thought & evaluation. This is the first devotion to pleasure.

"Further, Cunda, with the stilling of directed thoughts & evaluations, the monk enters & remains in the second jhāna: rapture & pleasure born of concentration, unification of awareness free from directed thought & evaluation—internal assurance. This is the second devotion to pleasure.

"Further, Cunda, with the fading of rapture, the monk remains equanimous, mindful, & alert, and senses pleasure with the body. He enters & remains in the third jhāna, of which the noble ones declare, 'Equanimous & mindful, he has a pleasant abiding.' This is the third devotion to pleasure.

"Further, Cunda, with the abandoning of pleasure & pain—as with the earlier disappearance of elation & distress—the monk enters & remains in the fourth jhāna: purity of equanimity & mindfulness, neither pleasure nor pain. This is the fourth devotion to pleasure.

"These are the four devotions to pleasure that lead exclusively to disenchantment, dispassion, cessation, calming, direct knowledge, self-awakening, & unbinding.

"Now, it's possible, Cunda, that wanderers of other sects might say, 'The Sakyan-son contemplatives live devoted to these four devotions to pleasure.' They are to be told, 'That is so!' They would be speaking rightly of you. They would not be slandering you with what is unfactual & untrue.

"It's possible that wanderers of other sects might say, 'Living devoted to these four devotions to pleasure, friends, what fruits, what rewards can be expected?'

"The wanderers of other sects saying that are to be told, 'Living devoted to these four devotions to pleasure, friends, four fruits, four rewards can be expected. Which four?

"'Friends, there is the case where a monk, with the wasting away of (the first) three fetters, is a stream-enterer, certain, never again destined for the lower realms, headed for self-awakening. This is the first fruit, the first reward.

"'Further, friends, the monk—with the wasting away of (the first) three fetters, and with the attenuation of passion, aversion, & delusion—is a once-returner; who, on returning only once more to this world, will make an ending to stress. This is the second fruit, the second reward.

"'Further, the monk—with the wasting away of the five lower fetters—is due to arise spontaneously (in the Pure Abodes), there to totally unbind, destined never again to return from that world. This is the third fruit, the third reward.

"'Further, the monk—with the ending of effluents—enters & remains in the effluent-free awareness-release & discernment-release, having directly known & realized it for himself right in the here & now.

"'Living devoted to these four devotions to pleasure, friends, these four fruits, these four rewards can be expected.'

"Now, it's possible, Cunda, that wanderers of other sects might say, 'The Sakyan-son contemplatives live without an established Dhamma.' The

wanderers of other sects saying that should be told, 'There are, friends, Dhammas taught & formulated by the Blessed One—the one who knows, the one who sees, worthy, & rightly self-awakened—that are not to be transgressed throughout life. Just like a gate post or iron post that is deeply buried, well-planted, immovable, unshakable, in the same way there are Dhammas taught & formulated by the Blessed One—the one who knows, the one who sees, worthy, & rightly self-awakened—that are not to be transgressed throughout life.

"'Friends, an arahant monk whose effluents are ended, who has reached fulfillment, done the task, laid down the burden, attained the true goal, totally destroyed the fetter of becoming, and who is released through right gnosis, cannot possibly transgress nine principles:

"'[1] It is impossible for a monk whose effluents are ended to intentionally deprive a living being of life. [2] It is impossible for a monk whose effluents are ended to take, in the manner of stealing, what is not given. [3] It is impossible for a monk whose effluents are ended to engage in sexual intercourse. [4] It is impossible for a monk whose effluents are ended to tell a conscious lie. [5] It is impossible for a monk whose effluents are ended to consume stored-up sensual things as he did before, when he was a householder.

"'[6] It is impossible for a monk whose effluents are ended to follow a bias based on desire. [7] It is impossible for a monk whose effluents are ended to follow a bias based on aversion. [8] It is impossible for a monk whose effluents are ended to follow a bias based on fear. [9] It is impossible for a monk whose effluents are ended to follow a bias based on delusion.

"'An arahant monk whose effluents are ended, who has reached fulfillment, done the task, laid down the burden, attained the true goal, totally destroyed the fetter of becoming, and who is released through right gnosis, cannot possibly transgress nine principles.'

## The Tathāgata's Knowledge & Vision

"Now, it's possible, Cunda, that some wanderers of other sects might say, 'Gotama the contemplative describes unlimited knowledge & vision with regard to the past, but doesn't describe unlimited knowledge & vision with regard to the future. What is this? How is this?' Those wanderers of other sects construe the sort of knowing that is not knowledge & vision[9] to be the sort of knowing that is knowledge & vision, just like inexperienced fools. The Tathāgata's memory-&-recollection knowledge with regard to the past is such that he recollects whatever he wants. The Tathāgata's knowledge with regard to the future arises born from his awakening: 'This is the last birth. There is now no further becoming.'

"With regard to what is past: If it is unfactual, untrue, & unbeneficial, the Tathāgata does not declare it. If it is factual, true, but unbeneficial, the Tathāgata does not declare it. If it is factual, true, & beneficial, the Tathāgata has a sense of the proper time for giving the answer to that question.

"With regard to what is future…

"With regard to what is present: If it is unfactual, untrue, & unbeneficial, the Tathāgata does not declare it. If it is factual, true, but unbeneficial, the Tathāgata does not declare it. If it is factual, true, & beneficial, the Tathāgata has a sense of the proper time for giving the answer to that question.[10]

"Thus, Cunda, with regard to things that are past, future, & present, the Tathāgata is one who speaks at the proper time, speaks what is true, speaks what is factual, speaks the meaning, speaks Dhamma, speaks Vinaya. Thus he is called the Tathāgata.

"Cunda, whatever in this world—with its devas, Māras, & Brahmās, this generation with its contemplatives & brahmans, its royalty & common people—is seen, heard, sensed, cognized, attained, sought after, pondered by the intellect, that has been fully awakened to by the Tathāgata. Thus he is called the Tathāgata.

"From the night the Tathāgata fully awakens to the unsurpassed right self-awakening until the night he totally unbinds in the unbinding property with no fuel remaining,[11] whatever the Tathāgata has said,

spoken, explained is just so *[tatha]* and not otherwise. Thus he is called the Tathāgata.

"The Tathāgata is one who does in line with *[tatha]* what he teaches, one who teaches in line with what he does. Thus he is called the Tathāgata.

"In this world with its devas, Māras, & Brahmās, this generation with its contemplatives & brahmans, its royalty & common people, the Tathāgata is the unconquered conqueror, all-seeing, the wielder of power. Thus he is called the Tathāgata.[12]

"It's possible, Cunda, that wanderers of other sects might say, 'How is it, friends? Is it the case that *"after death a Tathāgata exists: Only this is true, anything otherwise is worthless"*?' The wanderers of other sects who say this should be told, 'Friends, it is undeclared by the Tathāgata that *"after death a Tathāgata exists: Only this is true, anything otherwise is worthless."*'

"It's possible that wanderers of other sects might say, 'How is it, friends? Is it the case that *"after death a Tathāgata does not exist…"*… *"both exists & does not exist…"*… *"neither does nor doesn't exist: Only this is true, anything otherwise is worthless"*?' The wanderers of other sects who say this should be told, 'Friends, it is undeclared by the Tathāgata that *"after death a Tathāgata neither does nor does not exist: Only this is true, anything otherwise is worthless."*'

"It's possible that wanderers of other sects might say, 'But why, friends, is this undeclared by Gotama the contemplative?' The wanderers of other sects who say this should be told, 'Friends, it isn't connected with the goal, isn't connected with the Dhamma, isn't fundamental to the holy life. It doesn't lead to disenchantment, dispassion, cessation, calming, direct knowledge, self-awakening, unbinding. That's why it's undeclared by the Blessed One.'[13]

"It's possible that wanderers of other sects might say, 'But what, friends, *is* declared by Gotama the contemplative?' The wanderers of other sects who say this should be told, '*"This is stress,"* is declared by the Blessed One. *"This is the origination of stress,"* is declared by the Blessed One. *"This is the cessation of stress,"* is declared by the Blessed One. *"This is the path of practice leading to the cessation of stress,"* is declared by the Blessed One.'

"It's possible that wanderers of other sects might say, 'And why, friends, is this declared by Gotama the contemplative?' The wanderers of other sects who say this should be told, 'This is connected with the goal, is connected with the Dhamma, is fundamental to the holy life. It leads to disenchantment, dispassion, cessation, calming, direct knowledge, self-awakening, unbinding. That's why it's declared by the Blessed One.'

"Cunda, the view-dependencies *[diṭṭhi-nissayā]*[14] concerning beginning-points that I have declared as they are to be declared and as they are not to be declared: Would I [simply] declare them to you? And the view-dependencies concerning endpoints that I have declared as they are to be declared and as they are not to be declared: Would I [simply] declare them to you?

"And which are the view-dependencies concerning beginning-points that I have declared as they are to be declared and as they are not to be declared?[15]

"There are certain contemplatives & brahmans who are of this view, this opinion, 'The self & the cosmos are eternal: Only this is true, anything otherwise is worthless.' There are certain contemplatives & brahmans who are of this view, this opinion, 'The self & the cosmos are not eternal: Only this is true, anything otherwise is worthless.' … 'The self & the cosmos are both eternal & not eternal' … 'The self & the cosmos are neither eternal nor not-eternal' … 'The self & the cosmos are self-made' … 'The self & the cosmos are other-made' … 'The self & the cosmos are both self-made & other-made' … 'Without self-making or other-making, the self & the cosmos are spontaneously arisen: Only this is true, anything otherwise is worthless.'

"There are certain contemplatives & brahmans who are of this view, this opinion, 'Pleasure & pain are eternal: Only this is true, anything otherwise is worthless.' … 'Pleasure & pain are not eternal: Only this is true, anything otherwise is worthless.' … 'Pleasure & pain are both eternal & not eternal' … 'Pleasure & pain are neither eternal nor not-eternal' … 'Pleasure & pain are self-made' … 'Pleasure & pain are other-made' … 'Pleasure & pain are both self-made & other-made' … 'Without self-making or other-making, pleasure & pain are spontaneously arisen: Only this is true, anything otherwise is worthless.'

"As for the contemplatives & brahmans who are of this view, this opinion, 'The self & the cosmos are eternal: Only this is true, anything otherwise is worthless': I, going to them, say, 'Friends, is it the case that this is said, "The self & the cosmos are eternal"? When they say, "Only this is true, anything otherwise is worthless," I don't grant their point. Why is that? Because with regard to that, there are some beings who are percipient otherwise.[16] And I do not see that this doctrine is even equal to mine, so how better? In fact, my doctrine is the better one.

[Similarly with the remaining views.]

"These, Cunda, are the view-dependencies concerning beginning-points that I have declared as they are to be declared and as they are not to be declared. Would I [simply] declare them to you?

"And which are the view-dependencies concerning endpoints that I have declared as they are to be declared and as they are not to be declared?[17]

"There are certain contemplatives & brahmans who are of this view, this opinion, 'After death, the self is possessed of form & free from disease: Only this is true, anything otherwise is worthless.' There are certain contemplatives & brahmans who are of this view, this opinion, 'After death, the self is formless: Only this is true, anything otherwise is worthless.' … 'After death, the self is both possessed of form & formless' … 'After death, the self is neither possessed of form nor formless' … 'After death, the self is percipient' … 'After death, the self is not percipient' … 'After death, the self is both percipient & not percipient' … 'After death, the self is neither percipient nor not percipient' … 'The self is annihilated, destroyed, & does not exist after death: Only this is true, anything otherwise is worthless.'

"As for the contemplatives & brahmans who are of this view, this opinion, 'After death, the self is possessed of form & free from disease: Only this is true, anything otherwise is worthless': I, going to them, say, 'Friends, is it the case that this is said, "After death, the self is possessed of form & free from disease"? When they say, "Only this is true, anything otherwise is worthless," I don't grant their point. Why is that? Because with regard to that, there are some beings who are percipient otherwise.

And I do not see that this doctrine is even equal to mine, so how better? In fact, my doctrine is the better one.

[Similarly with the remaining views.]

"These, Cunda, are the view-dependencies concerning endpoints that I have declared as they are to be declared and as they are not to be declared. Would I [simply] declare them to you?

"It's for the abandoning & transcending of these view-dependencies concerning beginning-points and view-dependencies concerning endpoints that I have thus taught & formulated the four establishings of mindfulness. Which four?

"There is the case where a monk remains focused on the body in & of itself—ardent, alert, & mindful—subduing greed & distress with reference to the world. He remains focused on feelings in & of themselves—ardent, alert, & mindful—subduing greed & distress with reference to the world. He remains focused on the mind in & of itself—ardent, alert, & mindful—subduing greed & distress with reference to the world. He remains focused on mental qualities in & of themselves—ardent, alert, & mindful—subduing greed & distress with reference to the world.[18]

"It's for the abandoning & transcending of these view-dependencies concerning beginning-points and view-dependencies concerning endpoints that I have thus taught & formulated these four establishings of mindfulness."

Now on that occasion Ven. Upavāṇa[19] was standing behind the Blessed One, fanning him. He said to the Blessed One, "It's amazing, lord. It's astounding—how inspiring this Dhamma-sequence is, how very inspiring this Dhamma-sequence is. What is the name of this Dhamma-sequence?"

"In that case, Upavāṇa, you may remember this Dhamma-sequence simply as 'The Inspiring.'"

That is what the Blessed One said. Gratified, Ven. Upavāṇa delighted in the Blessed One's words.

## Notes

1. In other words, Niganṭha Nāṭaputta was the foundation and arbiter for this doctrine while he was alive, but left no foundation or arbiter to take his

place. In contrast, see Ven. Ānanda's statement in MN 106 to the effect that, after the Buddha's passing, the Dhamma was the arbiter among the monks.

2. According to the Commentary, this means that they have not awakened to the meaning/goal *(attha)* of the True Dhamma.

3. See the three miracles discussed in AN 3:61 and DN 11.

4. This "now" appears in the Thai and Sri Lankan editions, but not in the Burmese or PTS editions.

5. One of the Buddha's teachers prior to his awakening. See MN 36.

6. Reading *vicaritabbaṁ* with the Thai edition. The other editions have *na vivaditabbaṁ,* "should not dispute."

7. These are the 37 *bodhi-pakkhiya-dhammas*. For a full account, see *The Wings to Awakening.*

8. The discussion that begins with this paragraph provides an explanation for what is meant by the "middle way" in the Buddha's first sermon. See also the discussion of pleasure and pain in MN 101.

9. Reading *aññāṇadassanaṁ* with the Thai edition. The other editions have *ñāṇadassanaṁ,* "that is knowledge & vision," which doesn't fit into the general message of the text here.

This passage appears to be a response to the claims made by Pūraṇa Kassapa and Nigaṇṭha Nāṭaputta, who taught two different forms of determinism and who both claimed to have infinite knowledge of the cosmos, a knowledge that included knowledge of the past and future, which in their view was already predetermined (AN 9:38, DN 2). The Buddha, however, rejected determinism (see AN 3:63) and instead taught a doctrine of kamma that allowed for the freedom to choose skillful or unskillful courses of action in the present moment. This meant that his knowledge of the future did not encompass all details about the future, as many of those details were contingent on decisions that had not yet been made. But he did have future knowledge of a more specific and more valuable sort: He knew that he would not be reborn. Regardless of how unlimited Pūraṇa Kassapa and Nigaṇṭha Nāṭaputta might claim their knowledge of the future to be, they did not have this sort of knowledge of their own future at all.

Nevertheless, even though the Buddha did not claim total knowledge of the future, he was able to see tendencies in the present that would bear future fruit. For example, in SN 20:7 and AN 5:79–80, he foresees the decline of the Saṅgha and the disappearance of the True Dhamma, but he warns the monks of these coming dangers, not so that they would accept them as inevitable, but so that

they would do what they could to counteract them. This means that the monks would have it in their power to slow these tendencies down. In MN 12, he illustrates his knowledge of the future fate of specific individuals with the analogy of the one-way path *(ekāyana-magga):* When a man is following a one-way path to that leads only to one specific destination, one would know that he will eventually reach that destination. In the same way, the Buddha can see of specific individuals that as long as they follow specific one-way paths of practice, their practice will eventually lead them to the corresponding goals. This knowledge, of course, is dependent on each individual's continuing to follow that path of practice.

10. See MN 58.

11. See Iti 44 and the discussion in *The Mind Like Fire Unbound,* chapter 1.

12. See AN 4:24 and Iti 112.

13. For a discussion of the Buddha's reasons for not answering these questions, see *Skill in Questions,* chapter 8.

14. The refrains that frame the following discussion on view-dependencies contain many variant readings, and unfortunately none of the printed editions sorts out the variants especially well. The Commentary is of no help in this regard, as it addresses itself only to some of the more obvious issues in the discussion, and leaves the less obvious ones untouched. Therefore, this translation is tentative, based on the readings that seem best to me, based both on stylistic grounds and on the way they fit in with the discussions of these views in other suttas.

The term *diṭṭhi-nissaya*, "view dependency," is also found in Ud 6:5.

15. Of the view-dependencies in the following list, the question of whether the self and the world are eternal is treated in DN 1, DN 28, and MN 102, and is mentioned in Ud 6:5; the question of whether the self is self-made, etc., is mentioned in Ud 6:5, as is the question of whether pleasure & pain are eternal; the question of whether pleasure & pain are self-made, etc., is treated in SN 12:18 and SN 12:25, and mentioned in AN 6:95.

The suttas that treat these views, as opposed to those that merely mention them, show how the Buddha would and would not declare them. In all cases, he would not declare them as, "Only this is true, anything otherwise is worthless." He *would* declare or explain them, however, in the sense of showing either how the view is formulated, how it is grasped, or how grasping to the view gets in the way of reaching the deathless. The discussion in DN 1 is the most complex, as it gives a detailed and different treatment for each of the views it covers. However,

DN 1 contains a refrain that treats every view it covers in light of dependent co-arising. This refrain—along with passages from MN 102 and SN 12:25—gives the general thrust of the way in which the Buddha would explain/declare these views.

> "When those contemplatives & brahmans assert various types of theories… on 62 grounds, that is an agitation & vacillation to be felt by those contemplatives & brahmans who, not knowing, not seeing, are immersed in craving.… That comes from contact as a requisite condition.… That they would experience that other than through contact: That isn't possible.… They all experience that through repeated contact at the six sense media. For them, from feeling as a requisite condition comes craving. From craving as a requisite condition comes clinging/sustenance. From clinging/sustenance as a requisite condition comes becoming. From becoming as a requisite condition comes birth. From birth as a requisite condition, then aging-&-death, sorrow, lamentation, pain, distress, & despair come into play. Such is the origination of this entire mass of stress & suffering.
>
> "But when a monk discerns the origination, ending, allure, drawbacks of, & escape from the six sense media, he discerns what is higher than all of this." — *DN 1*

> "Those contemplatives & brahmans who are of this view, this opinion, 'The self & the cosmos are eternal: Only this is true, anything otherwise is worthless': It is impossible that—apart from conviction, apart from liking, apart from unbroken tradition, apart from reasoning by analogy, apart from an agreement through pondering views [see MN 95 and AN 3:66] —they would have their very own pure & clear personal knowledge of that. There being no pure & clear personal knowledge, whatever modicum or sliver of knowledge those venerable contemplatives & brahmans clarify on that matter is said to be clinging on their part. With regard to that—fabricated, gross—there is still the cessation of fabrications: There *is* this.' Knowing that, seeing the escape from it, the Tathāgata has gone beyond it." — *MN 102*

> "Whatever contemplatives & brahmans, teachers of kamma, who declare that pleasure & pain are self-made, even that is dependent on contact. Whatever contemplatives & brahmans, teachers of kamma, who

declare that pleasure & pain are other-made… self-made & other-made… without self-making or other-making, are spontaneously arisen, even that is dependent on contact.

"It isn't possible that any contemplatives & brahmans—teachers of kamma who declare that pleasure & pain are self-made—would be sensitive to pleasure & pain otherwise than through contact. It isn't possible that any contemplatives & brahmans—teachers of kamma who declare that pleasure & pain are other-made… self-made & other-made… without self-making or other-making, are spontaneously arisen —would be sensitive to pleasure & pain otherwise than through contact.

"When there is a body, pleasure & pain arise internally with bodily intention as the cause; or when there is speech, pleasure & pain arise internally with verbal intention as the cause; or when there is intellect, pleasure & pain arise internally with intellectual intention as the cause.

"From ignorance as a requisite condition, then either of one's own accord one fabricates the bodily fabrication on account of which that pleasure & pain arise internally, or because of others one fabricates the bodily fabrication on account of which that pleasure & pain arise internally. Either one fabricates alert the bodily fabrication on account of which that pleasure & pain arise internally; or one fabricates unalert the bodily fabrication on account of which that pleasure & pain arise internally. [Similarly with verbal & intellectual fabrications.]

"Now, ignorance is bound up in these things. From the remainderless fading & cessation of that very ignorance, there no longer exists (the sense of) the body on account of which that pleasure & pain internally arise. There no longer exists the speech… the intellect on account of which that pleasure & pain internally arise. There no longer exists the field, the site, the dimension, or the issue on account of which that pleasure & pain internally arise." — *SN 12:25*

16. As the discussions of these points in DN 1 and DN 28 make clear, there are beings who, even though they can remember past lives, have different memories/perceptions of those lives because of the vagaries of their kamma and the limitations on their memories. Thus they come to different conclusions about where they ultimately came from—and, as is shown in the following section of this sutta, what will become of them after death. The Buddha's larger knowledge of past lives shows that none of the view-dependencies offered here

can be the only truth about the past or the future. And some of them are simply not true: As he says in SN 12:18, it is definitely not true that pleasure & pain are spontaneously arisen; instead, they are dependently co-arisen. And as for beginning points in general, SN 15:3 states that transmigration comes from an inconceivable beginning point; AN 10:61 says that a beginning point for ignorance, such that one might say, "Before this, ignorance did not exist; then it came into play," cannot be discerned.

Instead of basing his teachings on perceptions about the past, the Buddha focuses instead on how suffering is maintained—and can be ended—in the immediate present. His formulation of the four noble truths holds true, and is immediately applicable to the problem of suffering and stress here and now, regardless of what one remembers from the past. These truths also serve the purpose of leading to nibbāna, something that none of these other views can do. This is why his criticism of the other views does not apply to right view, and why his doctrine is superior to any of the view-dependencies discussed here.

17. The view-dependencies in the following list, or close variants, are discussed in DN 1 and MN 102. The first four are discussed in SN 24. The discussions in both DN 1 and MN 102 are quite extended, giving different details for each view, although the refrain in DN 1 is the same here as it is for the view-dependencies dealing with beginning points. A passage from SN 24:37 gives an idea of how it and its companion suttas declare/explain the first four of these views:

> "Monks, there being what, clinging to what, entrenched in what, does this view arise: 'After death, the self is possessed of form & free from disease'?" …
>
> "There being form, clinging to form, entrenched in form, this view arises: 'After death, the self is possessed of form & free from disease.' There being feeling… There being perception… There being fabrications… There being consciousness, clinging to consciousness, entrenched in consciousness, this view arises: 'After death, the self is possessed of form & free from disease.'
>
> "Now what do you think, monks? Is form constant or inconstant?"
>
> "Inconstant, lord."
>
> "And is that which is inconstant easeful or stressful?"
>
> "Stressful, lord."

"And without clinging to what is inconstant, stressful, and subject to change, would this view arise: 'After death, the self is possessed of form & free from disease'?"

"No, lord."

"Thus it is that—there being stress, clinging to stress, entrenched in stress—this view arises, 'After death, the self is possessed of form & free from disease.'"

[Similarly with the remaining aggregates.]

"Now what do you think, monks? Is what is seen, heard, sensed, cognized, attained, sought after, pondered by the intellect constant or inconstant?"

"Inconstant, lord."

"And is that which is inconstant easeful or stressful?"

"Stressful, lord."

"And without clinging to what is inconstant, stressful, and subject to change, would this view arise: 'After death, the self is possessed of form & free from disease'?"

"No, lord."

"Now, when a disciple of the noble ones has abandoned doubt with regard to these six bases [the five aggregates and what is seen, heard, sensed, cognized, attained, sought after, pondered by the intellect], and has abandoned doubt with regard to stress, has abandoned doubt with regard to the origination of stress, has abandoned doubt with regard to the cessation of stress, and has abandoned doubt with regard to the way of practice leading to the cessation of stress, then he is a stream-enterer, certain, never again destined for the lower realms, headed for self-awakening."

In addition, MN 2 makes clear that the Buddha would avoid answering the question of whether there is a self to begin with.

18. See DN 22 and MN 118. See also, *Right Mindfulness.*

19. See SN 46:8 and DN 16.

*See also: DN 15; DN 16; AN 6:55; AN 9:7; AN 9:40; AN 10:93; Ud 5:5*

# *The Discourse for Reciting Together*
# *Saṅgīti Sutta (DN 33)*

## Introduction

*The Buddha's disciples, when listening to the Dhamma, were presented with a challenge: how to best memorize it. The Buddha repeatedly made it clear that memorization was an important part of listening for the sake of their own training. He also made it clear that he wanted to establish the Dhamma and Vinaya for a long time, so his monastic disciples had the added responsibility of memorizing the Dhamma to pass on to others. The Buddha helped by formulating and presenting the Dhamma in a way that made it easy to memorize, such as arranging talks with numerical lists, providing striking similes, and composing verses whose rhythm and word-play made them memorable. But it was up to the disciples to choose the formats in which they would organize their memories of what the Buddha taught.*

*They ended up using a wide variety of formats. In some cases, they memorized whole talks. In others, they memorized dialogues, drawing portraits of the Buddha's interlocutors. In others, they provided numerically arranged catechisms of the Buddha's basic concepts. The different formats had different strengths and weaknesses. The dialogues, for instance, provided context, showing which questions and problems a particular Dhamma teaching was designed to answer. Their character sketches and narratives, sometimes quite vivid, provided human interest that mere lists of dhammas would lack. However, the dialogues were unwieldy in that a great deal of effort had to be put into memorizing details of character, location, and narrative sequence. Catechisms avoided this problem by focusing totally on the words of the Dhamma, without the context of a dialog or similes. For this reason, they were a more efficient form than dialogues for passing along material. This, however, was material stripped of context, so that it was harder to see what role individual teachings might play in the larger context of the path or in the personal context of solving particular problems faced in the practice.*

*It was perhaps because of their complementary strengths and weaknesses that all these formats for shaping the memory of the Buddha's teachings were used and preserved. This seems especially likely in the case of the last two suttas of the Dīgha Nikāya: the present one, DN 33, and the one following it. Most of the other suttas included in the Dīgha are of a literary nature, with some extreme cases consisting almost entirely of descriptive passages with very little Dhamma. Modern scholars have speculated that these suttas were composed with the primary aim of appealing to the populace at large: Their literary style and sophistication made them attractive tools for converting outsiders. In this context, the catechisms in DN 33 and 34 provided compensation: all Dhamma with only a minimum of description. As a result, monastics who memorized the Dīgha would have a large fund of basic Dhamma lists to draw on when giving sermons or seeking guidance for their own practice.*

*There is the question of when DN 33 was composed. Some people have suggested that all the numerically arranged catechisms—these suttas plus suttas like Khp 4, AN 10:27, and AN 10:28—postdated the Buddha. It's obvious that the idea of arranging teachings in this way would occur to his disciples only when there was a large body of material to memorize. Even though people of his time were capable of prodigious feats of memory, not everyone had developed that ability, and it would have made sense to organize lists of teachings in a more streamlined format for their sake. However, the need for this format could easily have made itself felt during the latter part of the Buddha's lifetime. In fact, these catechisms could have been what other suttas were referring to when they mentioned Abhidhamma (Higher Dhamma) or Mātikā (Lists).*

*However, DN 33 raises some special questions in this area. Although the majority of its contents can be traced to other parts of the Canon, it also contains lists that appear nowhere else in the suttas, and some of these lists—such as the threefold classification of form and the three faculties—contain vocabulary found elsewhere in the Canon only in the Abhidhamma Piṭaka. This suggests that, at least in its current incarnation, DN 33 was a later composition. But as to whether it was composed entirely after the Buddha passed away, or if parts were composed earlier, with other parts added later, there's no way of telling. The sutta could have easily grown over the generations because its organization is so open-ended. The lists included in DN 34 are restricted to those whose members perform a set range of functions, whereas to*

*qualify for inclusion in DN 33, a list would need only to contain a number of members ranging from one to ten.*

*Although the material in this sutta is extremely varied, some specific categories stand out. To begin with, the Wings to Awakening—a list of Dhamma lists attributed to the Buddha himself (DN 16)—are included almost in their entirety: almost, because one of the 37 factors in the Wings, the strength of conviction, was for some reason omitted, meaning that the five strengths here are reduced to four. All the dhammas listed in the shorter catechisms—Khp 4, AN 10:27, and AN 10:28—are also included. In addition, there are lists and explanations of virtues needed for the practice, contrasted in many cases with their opposing vices, along with some rudimentary instructions on how the Vinaya is to be followed for the sake of unity within the Saṅgha. There are also lists related to the virtues of the Buddha and his noble disciples, possible destinations of rebirth, the basic concepts of dependent co-arising, the various maps of concentration attainments, the noble attainments, and practices conducive to reaching the noble attainments.*

*So even if this sutta is a later composition, it provides an interesting glimpse of what a group of monastics at a particular time in early Buddhist history saw as the most important of the teachings that a monk should know for his own practice, for the purpose of instructing people at large, and for passing on to succeeding generations.*

### Note

*Some of the lists included in this sutta are fleshed out with explanations that, in many cases, quote almost the entirety of the suttas from which they are drawn; others are given only as lists of terms. In the footnotes, I have not identified the suttas that are extensively quoted here, and instead have focused on providing citations that will explain terms that this sutta does not.*

* * *

I have heard that on one occasion the Blessed One was wandering among the Mallans with a large Saṅgha of monks—approximately 500 monks in all—and arrived at Pāvā, a city of the Mallans. There he stayed near Pāvā in Cunda the silversmith's mango grove. Now, at that time a new reception hall named Ubbhataka had just been built by the Pāvā

Mallans, and it had not yet been dwelled in by any contemplative, brahman, or anyone at all in human form.

The Pāvā Mallans heard, "The Blessed One, they say, wandering among the Mallans with a large Saṅgha of monks—approximately 500 monks in all—has arrived at Pāvā and is staying near Pāvā in Cunda the silversmith's mango grove."

So the Pāvā Mallans went to the Blessed One and, on arrival, having bowed down to him, sat to one side. As they were sitting there they said to him, "Lord, a new reception hall named Ubbhataka has just been built by the Pāvā Mallans, and it has not yet been dwelled in by any contemplative, brahman, or anyone at all in human form. May the Blessed One be the first to use it. When the Blessed One has used it first, the Pāvā Mallans will use it afterwards. That will be for their long-term welfare & happiness."

The Blessed One acquiesced with silence. Sensing his acquiescence, the Pāvā Mallans got up from their seats, bowed down to him, circumambulated him, and then went to the new reception hall. On arrival, they spread it all over with felt rugs, arranged seats, set out a water vessel, and raised an oil lamp. Then they went to the Blessed One and, on arrival, having bowed down to him, stood to one side. As they were standing there they said to him, "Lord, the reception hall has been covered all over with felt rugs, seats have been arranged, a water vessel has been set out, and an oil lamp raised. It is now time for the Blessed One to do as he sees fit."

So the Blessed One—after adjusting his under robe and carrying his bowl & outer robe—went together with the Saṅgha of monks to the reception hall. On arrival he washed his feet, entered the hall, and sat with his back to the central post, facing east. The Saṅgha of monks washed their feet, entered the hall, and sat with their backs to the western wall, facing east, ranged around the Blessed One. The Pāvā Mallans washed their feet, entered the hall, and sat with their backs to the eastern wall, facing west, ranged around the Blessed One. Then the Blessed One—having spent most of the night instructing, urging, rousing, & encouraging the Pāvā Mallans with a Dhamma talk—dismissed them, saying, "The night is far gone, Vaseṭṭhas. Do what you think it is now time to do."

Responding, "As you say, lord," to the Blessed One, the Pāvā Mallans got up from their seats and, bowing down to him & circumambulating him, left.

Then, not long after the Pāvā Mallans had left, the Blessed One—surveying the silent Saṅgha of monks—addressed Ven. Sāriputta, "Sāriputta, the Saṅgha of monks is free of drowsiness. Let yourself be inspired by a Dhamma talk for them. My back aches. I will rest it."

"As you say, lord," Ven. Sāriputta responded to the Blessed One.

Then the Blessed One, having had his outer robe arranged folded in four, lay down on his right side in the lion's sleeping posture, with one foot on top of the other, mindful & alert, having made a mental note to get up.

Now, on that occasion Nigaṇṭha Nāṭaputta had recently died in Pāvā. On his death, the Nigaṇṭhas had split into two factions. They kept arguing, quarreling, & disputing, stabbing one another with weapons of the mouth: "You don't understand this Dhamma-Vinaya. I understand this Dhamma-Vinaya. How could you understand this Dhamma-Vinaya? You practice wrongly. I practice rightly. I'm consistent. You're inconsistent. What should be said first, you said last. What should be said last, you said first. What you cogitated so long has been turned inside out. Your position has been overthrown. You're trapped, so go try to release your position or disentangle yourself if you can!" Nothing but slaughter, as it were, was being committed among the Nigaṇṭha Nāṭa-sons. Even the lay disciples of Nigaṇṭha Nāṭaputta, dressed in white, seemed disenchanted, disgusted, & repelled by the Nigaṇṭha Nāṭa-sons, and at how that poorly proclaimed Dhamma-Vinaya was poorly expounded, not leading out, not conducive to calming, expounded by one who was not rightly self-awakened, its foundation [now] broken, without an arbiter.

So Ven. Sāriputta addressed the monks, "Friends, Nigaṇṭha Nāṭaputta has recently died in Pāvā. On his death, the Nigaṇṭhas have split into two factions.… Even the lay disciples of Nigaṇṭha Nāṭaputta, dressed in white, seem disenchanted, disgusted, & repelled by the Nigaṇṭha Nāṭa-sons, and at how that poorly proclaimed Dhamma-Vinaya was poorly expounded, not leading out, not conducive to calming, expounded by one who was

not rightly self-awakened, its foundation [now] broken, without an arbiter.

"That's the way it is, friends, with a poorly proclaimed Dhamma-Vinaya, poorly expounded, not leading out, not conducive to calming, expounded by one who is not rightly self-awakened. But our Dhamma of the Blessed One is well expounded, leading out, conducive to calming, expounded by one who is rightly self-awakened. So it should all be recited together, without dispute, so that this holy life will endure & last a long time. That will be for the benefit & happiness of many, out of sympathy for the world, for the welfare, benefit, & happiness of devas & human beings.

"And which is our Dhamma of the Blessed One that is well expounded, leading out, conducive to calming, expounded by one who is rightly self-awakened, that should all be recited together, without dispute, so that this holy life will endure & last a long time, and that will be for the benefit & happiness of many, out of sympathy for the world, for the welfare, benefit, & happiness of devas & human beings?

## Ones

"There is, friends, one dhamma that is rightly expounded by the Blessed One—the one who knows, the one who sees, the Worthy One, rightly self-awakened. That should all be recited together, without dispute, so that this holy life will endure & last a long time, and that will be for the benefit & happiness of many, out of sympathy for the world, for the welfare, benefit, & happiness of devas & human beings.

"Which one dhamma?

- "All beings are maintained by nutriment.
- "All beings are maintained by fabrication.

"This, friends, is one dhamma that is rightly expounded by the Blessed One—the one who knows, the one who sees, the Worthy One, rightly self-awakened. That should all be recited together, without dispute, so that this holy life will endure & last a long time, and that will be for the benefit & happiness of many, out of sympathy for the world, for the welfare, benefit, & happiness of devas & human beings.

## Twos

"There are, friends, two dhammas that are rightly expounded by the Blessed One—the one who knows, the one who sees, the Worthy One, rightly self-awakened. Those should all be recited together, without dispute, so that this holy life will endure & last a long time, and that will be for the benefit & happiness of many, out of sympathy for the world, for the welfare, benefit, & happiness of devas & human beings.

"Which two dhammas?

- "Name & form.[1]
- "Ignorance & craving for becoming.
- "The view of becoming & the view of non-becoming.
- "Lack of shame & lack of compunction.
- "Shame & compunction.
- "Being hard to instruct & evil friendship.
- "Being easy to instruct & admirable friendship.
- "Skill in (knowing) offenses & skill in exiting from offenses.
- "Skill in (concentration) attainments & skill in exiting from attainments.
- "Skill in (knowing) properties & skill in attention.
- "Skill in (knowing) sense media & skill in (knowing) dependent co-arising.
- "Skill in (knowing) what is possible & skill in (knowing) what is impossible.
- "Uprightness & gentleness.[2]
- "Endurance & composure.
- "Congeniality & welcoming manners.
- "Harmlessness & purity.
- "Muddled truth & unalertness.
- "Mindfulness & alertness.

- "Unguarded sense doors & not knowing moderation in eating.
- "Guarded sense doors & knowing moderation in eating.
- "Strength of reflection & strength of development.
- "Strength of mindfulness & strength of concentration.
- "Tranquility & insight.
- "The theme of tranquility & the theme of exertion.
- "Exertion & undistractedness.
- "Failure in virtue & failure in view.
- "Consummation in virtue & consummation in view.
- "Purity of virtue & purity of view.
- "Purity of view & the exertion of one with such a view.
- "Terror with regard to the causes for terror & appropriate exertion in one who feels terror.
- "Discontent with regard to skillful qualities & unrelenting exertion.[3]
- "Clear knowing & release.
- "Knowledge with regard to ending (of effluents) & knowledge of (their) non-recurrence.

"These, friends, are the two dhammas that are rightly expounded by the Blessed One—the one who knows, the one who sees, the Worthy One, rightly self-awakened. Those should all be recited together, without dispute, so that this holy life will endure & last a long time, and that will be for the benefit & happiness of many, out of sympathy for the world, for the welfare, benefit, & happiness of devas & human beings.

### Threes

"There are, friends, three dhammas that are rightly expounded by the Blessed One—the one who knows, the one who sees, the Worthy One, rightly self-awakened. Those should all be recited together, without dispute, so that this holy life will endure & last a long time, and that will be for the benefit & happiness of many, out of sympathy for the world, for the welfare, benefit, & happiness of devas & human beings.

"Which three dhammas?

• "Three roots of what is unskillful: greed as a root of what is unskillful, aversion as a root of what is unskillful, delusion as a root of what is unskillful.

• "Three roots of what is skillful: lack of greed as a root of what is skillful, lack of aversion as a root of what is skillful, lack of delusion as a root of what is skillful.

• "Three forms of misconduct: bodily misconduct, verbal misconduct, mental misconduct.

• "Three forms of good conduct: good bodily conduct, good verbal conduct, good mental conduct.[4]

• "Three unskillful thoughts: a thought of sensuality, a thought of ill will, a thought of harmfulness.

• "Three skillful thoughts: a thought of renunciation, a thought of non-ill will, a thought of harmlessness.

• "Three unskillful resolves: a resolve on sensuality, a resolve on ill will, a resolve on harmfulness.

• "Three skillful resolves: a resolve on renunciation, a resolve on non-ill will, a resolve on harmlessness.

• "Three unskillful perceptions: a perception of sensuality, a perception of ill will, a perception of harmfulness.

• "Three skillful perceptions: a perception of renunciation, a perception of non-ill will, a perception of harmlessness.

• "Three unskillful properties: the property of sensuality, the property of ill will, the property of harmfulness.

• "Three skillful properties: the property of renunciation, the property of non-ill will, the property of harmlessness.

• "Three more properties: the property of sensuality, the property of form, the property of formlessness.

• "Three more properties: the property of form, the property of formlessness, the property of cessation.[5]

• “Three more properties: the low property, the middling property, the exquisite property.[6]

• “Three cravings: craving for sensuality, craving for becoming, craving for non-becoming.

• “Three more cravings: craving for sensuality, craving for form, craving for the formless.

• “Three more cravings: craving for form, craving for the formless, craving for cessation.[7]

• “Three (lower) fetters: self-identity view, uncertainty, grasping at habits & practices.

• “Three effluents: the effluent of sensuality, the effluent of becoming, the effluent of ignorance.[8]

• “Three becomings: sensuality-becoming, form-becoming, formless-becoming.

• “Three searches: the search for sensuality, the search for becoming, the search for a holy life.[9]

• “Three types: the ‘I-am-better’ type, the ‘I-am-the-same’ type, the ‘I-am-lower’ type.

• “Three extents: the extent of the past, the extent of the future, the extent of the present.

• “Three limits: the limit of self-identity, the limit of the origination of self-identity, the limit of the cessation of self-identity.[10]

• “Three feelings: a feeling of pleasure, a feeling of pain, a feeling of neither pleasure nor pain.

• “Three forms of stressfulness: the stressfulness of pain, the stressfulness of fabrication, the stressfulness of change.

• “Three accumulations: the accumulation of wrongness with a certain result, the accumulation of rightness with a certain result, an uncertain result.[11]

• “Three doubts[12]: One doubts, is uncertain, is undecided, & is unconfident about the past… about the future… or about the present

right now.

• "Three things the Tathāgata doesn't have to protect against: The Tathāgata, friends, is one of pure bodily conduct. He has no bodily misconduct that he would have to protect (with the thought), 'Don't let anyone else know this of me.' The Tathāgata is one of pure verbal conduct. He has no verbal misconduct that he would have to protect (with the thought), 'Don't let anyone else know this of me.' The Tathāgata is one of pure mental conduct. He has no mental misconduct that he would have to protect (with the thought), 'Don't let anyone else know this of me.'

• "Three impediments: the impediment of passion, the impediment of aversion, the impediment of delusion.

• "Three fires: the fire of passion, the fire of aversion, the fire of delusion.

• "Three more fires: the fire of those to be revered, the fire of the householder, the fire of those worthy of offerings.

• "The threefold classification of form: form with a surface & offering resistance, form with no surface & offering resistance, form with no surface & offering no resistance.

• "Three fabrications: a meritorious fabrication, a demeritorious fabrication, an imperturbable fabrication.

• "Three persons: the person in training [a stream-winner through a non-returner], the person beyond training [an arahant], and the person neither in training nor beyond training.

• "Three elders: the elder through birth, the elder through Dhamma, the elder through convention.

• "Three grounds for the making of merit: the ground for the making of merit composed of giving, the ground for the making of merit composed of virtue, the ground for the making of merit composed of development [of immeasurable goodwill].[13]

• "Three grounds for an accusation: through what is seen, through what is heard, through what is suspected.

• "Three sensual-pleasure rebirths: There are, friends, beings who desire sensual pleasures as they present themselves. They exercise power with

regard to sensual pleasures as they present themselves—such as human beings, some devas, & some beings in lower destinations. This is the first sensual-pleasure rebirth. There are beings, friends, who desire what they have created. They exercise power with regard to sensual pleasures, having created them again & again—such as the Devas Who Delight in Creation. This is the second sensual-pleasure rebirth. There are beings, friends, who desire what is created by others. They exercise power with regard to sensual pleasures created by others—such as the Devas Who Wield Power over the Creations of Others. This is the third sensual-pleasure rebirth.

• "Three blissful rebirths: There are, friends, beings who, having given rise to bliss again & again, dwell in bliss—such as the devas of Brahmā's retinue. This is the first blissful rebirth. There are, friends, beings who are permeated & pervaded, suffused & filled with bliss, so that every now & then they exclaim, 'O, bliss! O, bliss!'—such as the Radiant Devas. This is the second blissful rebirth. There are, friends, beings who are permeated & pervaded, suffused & filled with bliss. They, peacefully, are content, sensitive to mental bliss—such as the Beautiful Black devas. This is the third blissful rebirth.[14]

• "Three types of discernment: the discernment of a person in training, the discernment of a person beyond training, and the discernment of a person neither in training nor beyond training.

• "Three more types of discernment: discernment acquired through learning, discernment acquired through contemplating, discernment acquired through (mental) development.

• "Three weapons: the weapon of learning, the weapon of seclusion, the weapon of discernment.

• "Three faculties: the 'I-will-come-to-know-the-unknown' faculty, the knowledge faculty, the having-knowledge faculty.

• "Three eyes: the eye of the flesh, the divine eye, the eye of discernment.[15]

• "Three trainings: the training in heightened virtue, the training in heightened mind, the training in heightened discernment.[16]

• "Three developments: development of body, development of mind, development of discernment.[17]

• “Three things unsurpassed: unsurpassed vision, unsurpassed practice, unsurpassed release.

• “Three concentrations: concentration with directed thought & evaluation, concentration without directed thought & with a modicum of evaluation, concentration without directed thought & evaluation.

• “Three more concentrations: emptiness concentration, themeless [or: signless] concentration, undirected concentration.[18]

• “Three purities: bodily purity, verbal purity, mental purity.[19]

• “Three forms of sagacity: bodily sagacity, verbal sagacity, mental sagacity.[20]

• “Three forms of skillfulness: skillfulness in (knowing about) going forward, skillfulness in (knowing about) decline, skillfulness in tactics.

• “Three forms of intoxication: intoxication with health, intoxication with youth, intoxication with life.[21]

• “Three governing principles: the self as a governing principle, the world as a governing principle, the Dhamma as a governing principle.[22]

• “Three topics of conversation: One might converse about the past, (saying,) ‘That’s how it was in the past.’ One might converse about the future, (saying,) ‘That’s how it will be in the future.’ One might converse about the present, (saying,) ‘That’s how it is in the present.’[23]

• “Three forms of clear knowing: the clear knowing of the knowledge of previous lifetimes, the clear knowing of the knowledge of the passing away & arising of beings, the clear knowing of the knowledge of the ending of the effluents.[24]

• “Three dwellings: a divine dwelling, a brahmā-dwelling, a noble dwelling.[25]

• “Three marvels: the marvel of psychic power, the marvel of telepathy, the marvel of instruction.[26]

“These, friends, are the three dhammas that are rightly expounded by the Blessed One—the one who knows, the one who sees, the Worthy One, rightly self-awakened. Those should all be recited together, without dispute, so that this holy life will endure & last a long time, and that will

be for the benefit & happiness of many, out of sympathy for the world, for the welfare, benefit, & happiness of devas & human beings.

## Fours

"There are, friends, four dhammas that are rightly expounded by the Blessed One—the one who knows, the one who sees, the Worthy One, rightly self-awakened. Those should all be recited together, without dispute, so that this holy life will endure & last a long time, and that will be for the benefit & happiness of many, out of sympathy for the world, for the welfare, benefit, & happiness of devas & human beings.

"Which four dhammas?

• "Four establishings of mindfulness: There is the case, friends, where a monk remains focused on the body in & of itself—ardent, alert, & mindful—subduing greed & distress with reference to the world. He remains focused on feelings in & of themselves—ardent, alert, & mindful—subduing greed & distress with reference to the world. He remains focused on the mind in & of itself—ardent, alert, & mindful—subduing greed & distress with reference to the world. He remains focused on mental qualities in & of themselves—ardent, alert, & mindful—subduing greed & distress with reference to the world.

• "Four right exertions: There is the case, friends, where a monk generates desire, endeavors, activates persistence, upholds & exerts his intent for the sake of the non-arising of evil, unskillful qualities that have not yet arisen. He generates desire, endeavors, activates persistence, upholds & exerts his intent for the sake of the abandoning of evil, unskillful qualities that have arisen. He generates desire, endeavors, activates persistence, upholds & exerts his intent for the sake of the arising of skillful qualities that have not yet arisen. He generates desire, endeavors, activates persistence, upholds & exerts his intent for the maintenance, non-confusion, increase, plenitude, development, & culmination of skillful qualities that have arisen.

• "Four bases of power: There is the case, friends, where a monk develops the base of power endowed with concentration founded on desire & the fabrications of exertion. He develops the base of power endowed with concentration founded on persistence & the fabrications

of exertion. He develops the base of power endowed with concentration founded on intent & the fabrications of exertion. He develops the base of power endowed with concentration founded on discrimination & the fabrications of exertion.[27]

• "Four jhānas: There is the case, friends, where a monk—quite secluded from sensuality, secluded from unskillful qualities—enters & remains in the first jhāna: rapture & pleasure born of seclusion, accompanied by directed thought & evaluation. With the stilling of directed thoughts & evaluations, he enters & remains in the second jhāna: rapture & pleasure born of concentration, unification of awareness free from directed thought & evaluation—internal assurance. With the fading of rapture, he remains equanimous, mindful, & alert, and senses pleasure with the body. He enters & remains in the third jhāna, of which the noble ones declare, 'Equanimous & mindful, one has a pleasant abiding.' With the abandoning of pleasure & pain—as with the earlier disappearance of elation & distress—he enters & remains in the fourth jhāna: purity of equanimity & mindfulness, neither pleasure nor pain.

• "Four developments of concentration: There is, friends, the development of concentration that, when developed & pursued, leads to a pleasant abiding in the here & now. There is the development of concentration that, when developed & pursued, leads to the attainment of knowledge & vision. There is the development of concentration that, when developed & pursued, leads to mindfulness & alertness. There is the development of concentration that, when developed & pursued, leads to the ending of the effluents.

"And which is the development of concentration that, when developed & pursued, leads to a pleasant abiding in the here & now? There is the case where a monk—quite secluded from sensuality, secluded from unskillful qualities—enters & remains in the first jhāna… the second jhāna… the third jhāna… the fourth jhāna: purity of equanimity & mindfulness, neither pleasure nor pain. This is the development of concentration that, when developed & pursued, leads to a pleasant abiding in the here & now.

"And which is the development of concentration that, when developed & pursued, leads to the attainment of knowledge & vision? There is the

case where a monk attends to the perception of light and is resolved on the perception of daytime (at any hour of the day). Day (for him) is the same as night, night is the same as day. By means of an awareness open & unhampered, he develops a brightened mind. This is the development of concentration that, when developed & pursued, leads to the attainment of knowledge & vision.

"And which is the development of concentration that, when developed & pursued, leads to mindfulness & alertness? There is the case where feelings are known to the monk as they arise, known as they persist, known as they subside. Perceptions are known to him as they arise, known as they persist, known as they subside. Thoughts are known to him as they arise, known as they persist, known as they subside. This is the development of concentration that, when developed & pursued, leads to mindfulness & alertness.

"And which is the development of concentration that, when developed & pursued, leads to the ending of the effluents? There is the case where a monk remains focused on arising & falling away with reference to the five clinging-aggregates: 'Such is form, such its origination, such its passing away. Such is feeling, such its origination, such its passing away. Such is perception, such its origination, such its passing away. Such are fabrications, such their origination, such their passing away. Such is consciousness, such its origination, such its passing away.' This is the development of concentration that, when developed & pursued, leads to the ending of the effluents.[28]

• "Four immeasurables: There is the case, friends, where a monk keeps pervading the first direction [the east] with an awareness imbued with goodwill, likewise the second, likewise the third, likewise the fourth. Thus above, below, & all around, everywhere, in its entirety, he keeps pervading the all-encompassing cosmos with an awareness imbued with goodwill—abundant, enlarged, immeasurable, without hostility, without ill will. He keeps pervading the first direction with an awareness imbued with compassion… empathetic joy… equanimity, likewise the second, likewise the third, likewise the fourth. Thus above, below, & all around, everywhere, in its entirety, he keeps pervading the all-encompassing cosmos with an awareness imbued with equanimity—abundant, enlarged, immeasurable, without hostility, without ill will.

• “Four formlessnesses: There is the case, friends, where a monk—with the complete transcending of perceptions of (physical) form, with the disappearance of perceptions of resistance, and not attending to perceptions of multiplicity, (perceiving,) ‘Infinite space’—enters & remains in the dimension of the infinitude of space. With the complete transcending of the dimension of the infinitude of space, (perceiving,) ‘Infinite consciousness,’ he enters & remains in the dimension of the infinitude of consciousness. With the complete transcending of the dimension of the infinitude of consciousness, (perceiving,) ‘There is nothing,’ he enters & remains in the dimension of nothingness. With the complete transcending of the dimension of nothingness, he enters & remains in the dimension of neither perception nor non-perception.

• “Four supports: There is the case, friends, where a monk, contemplating one thing, associates with it; contemplating one thing, acquiesces to it; contemplating one thing, avoids it; contemplating one thing, subdues it.[29]

• “Four traditions of the noble ones: There is the case, friends, where a monk is content with any old robe cloth at all. He speaks in praise of being content with any old robe cloth at all. He doesn’t, for the sake of robe cloth, do anything unseemly or inappropriate. Not getting cloth, he isn’t agitated. Getting cloth, he uses it unattached to it, uninfatuated, guiltless, seeing the drawbacks (of attachment to it), and discerning the escape from them. He doesn’t, on account of his contentment with any old robe cloth at all, exalt himself or disparage others. Any monk who is diligent, deft, alert, & mindful in this is said to be a monk standing firm in the ancient, original traditions of the noble ones.

“And further, the monk is content with any old almsfood at all. He speaks in praise of being content with any old almsfood at all. He doesn’t, for the sake of almsfood, do anything unseemly or inappropriate. Not getting almsfood, he isn’t agitated. Getting almsfood, he uses it unattached to it, uninfatuated, guiltless, seeing the drawbacks (of attachment to it), and discerning the escape from them. He doesn’t, on account of his contentment with any old almsfood at all, exalt himself or disparage others. Any monk who is diligent, deft, alert, & mindful in this is said to be a monk standing firm in the ancient, original traditions of the noble ones.

"And further, the monk is content with any old lodging at all. He speaks in praise of being content with any old lodging at all. He doesn't, for the sake of lodging, do anything unseemly or inappropriate. Not getting lodging, he isn't agitated. Getting lodging, he uses it unattached to it, uninfatuated, guiltless, seeing the drawbacks (of attachment to it), and discerning the escape from them. He doesn't, on account of his contentment with any old lodging at all, exalt himself or disparage others. Any monk who is diligent, deft, alert, & mindful in this is said to be a monk standing firm in the ancient, original traditions of the noble ones.

"And further, the monk finds pleasure & delight in developing (skillful qualities), finds pleasure & delight in abandoning (unskillful qualities). He doesn't, on account of his pleasure & delight in developing & abandoning, exalt himself or disparage others. Any monk who is diligent, deft, alert, & mindful in this is said to be a monk standing firm in the ancient, original traditions of the noble ones.

• "Four exertions: the exertion to guard, the exertion to abandon, the exertion to develop, & the exertion to maintain.

"And which, friends, is the exertion to guard? There is the case where a monk, on seeing a form via the eye, doesn't grasp at any theme or variations by which—if he were to dwell without restraint over the faculty of the eye—evil, unskillful qualities such as greed or distress might assail him. He practices with restraint. He guards the faculty of the eye. He achieves restraint with regard to the faculty of the eye. [Similarly with the ear, nose, tongue, body, & intellect.] This is called the exertion to guard.

"And which is the exertion to abandon? There is the case where a monk doesn't acquiesce to a thought of sensuality that has arisen (in him). He abandons it, destroys it, dispels it, wipes it out of existence. He doesn't acquiesce to a thought of ill will… a thought of harmfulness… any evil, unskillful qualities that have arisen (in him). He abandons them, destroys them, dispels them, wipes them out of existence. This is called the exertion to abandon.

"And which is the exertion to develop? There is the case where a monk develops mindfulness as a factor for awakening dependent on seclusion, dependent on dispassion, dependent on cessation, resulting in letting go. He develops investigation of qualities… persistence… rapture… calm…

concentration… equanimity as a factor for awakening dependent on seclusion, dependent on dispassion, dependent on cessation, resulting in letting go. This is called the exertion to develop.

"And which is the exertion to maintain? There is the case where a monk maintains a favorable theme of concentration—the skeleton perception, the worm-eaten perception, the livid perception, the festering perception, the falling-apart perception, the bloated perception. This is called the exertion to maintain.[30]

• "Four knowledges: knowledge with regard to the Dhamma, knowledge with regard to inference, knowledge of limitations,[31] knowledge of conventions.

• "Four more knowledges: knowledge with regard to stress, knowledge with regard to the origination of stress, knowledge with regard to the cessation of stress, knowledge with regard to the path of practice leading to the cessation of stress.

• "Four stream-entry factors: association with people of integrity, hearing the True Dhamma, appropriate attention, practice of the Dhamma in accordance with the Dhamma.

• "Four factors of a stream-winner: There is the case where a disciple of the noble ones is endowed with verified confidence in the Awakened One: 'Indeed, the Blessed One is worthy and rightly self-awakened, consummate in knowledge & conduct, well-gone, an expert with regard to the world, unexcelled as a trainer for those people fit to be tamed, the Teacher of divine & human beings, awakened, blessed.'

"He/she is endowed with verified confidence in the Dhamma: 'The Dhamma is well-expounded by the Blessed One, to be seen here & now, timeless, inviting verification, pertinent, to be realized by the wise for themselves.'

"He/she is endowed with verified confidence in the Saṅgha: 'The Saṅgha of the Blessed One's disciples who have practiced well… who have practiced straight-forwardly… who have practiced methodically… who have practiced masterfully—in other words, the four types of noble disciples when taken as pairs, the eight when taken as individual types—they are the Saṅgha of the Blessed One's disciples: worthy of gifts, worthy

of hospitality, worthy of offerings, worthy of respect, the incomparable field of merit for the world.'

"He/she is endowed with virtues that are appealing to the noble ones: untorn, unbroken, unspotted, unsplattered, liberating, praised by the wise, untarnished, leading to concentration.

• "Four fruits of the contemplative life: the fruit of stream-entry, the fruit of once-returning, the fruit of non-returning, the fruit of arahantship.

• "Four properties: the earth property, the liquid property, the fire property, the wind property.[32]

• "Four nutriments: physical food, gross or refined; contact as the second; intellectual intention the third; and consciousness the fourth.[33]

• "Four standing-spots for consciousness: Consciousness, friends, when standing, stands attached to form, supported by form (as its object), landing on form, watered with delight, and exhibits growth, increase, & proliferation. When standing, it stands attached to feeling… to perception… to fabrications, supported by fabrications (as its object), landing on fabrications, watered with delight, and exhibits growth, increase, & proliferation.[34]

• "Four ways of going off course: One goes off course through desire. One goes off course through aversion. One goes off course through delusion. One goes off course through fear.

• "Four arisings of craving: Either with robes as a cause, craving—when arising in a monk—arises, or with almsfood as a cause… or with lodgings as a cause… or with becoming & not-becoming as a cause, craving—when arising in a monk—arises.

• "Four modes of practice: painful practice with slow intuition, painful practice with quick intuition, pleasant practice with slow intuition, pleasant practice with quick intuition.[35]

• "Four more modes of practice: intolerant practice, tolerant practice, self-controlled practice, even practice.[36]

• "Four Dhamma pathways: the non-greed Dhamma pathway, the non-ill will Dhamma pathway, the right mindfulness Dhamma pathway, the

right concentration Dhamma pathway.

• “Four ways of taking on practices: There is, friends, the taking on of a practice that is pleasant in the present but results in pain in the future. There is the taking on of a practice that is painful in the present and results in pain in the future. There is the taking on of a practice that is painful in the present but results in pleasure in the future. There is the taking on of a practice that is pleasant in the present and results in pleasure in the future.[37]

• “Four Dhamma aggregates: the virtue aggregate, the concentration aggregate, the discernment aggregate, the release aggregate.

• “Four strengths: the strength of persistence, the strength of mindfulness, the strength of concentration, the strength of discernment.

• “Four determinations: determination on discernment, determination on truth, determination on relinquishment, determination on stilling.[38]

• “Four ways of answering questions: the question to be answered categorically, the question to be answered with cross-questioning, the question to be answered analytically, the question to be put aside.[39]

• “Four types of kamma: Friends, there is kamma that is dark with dark result. There is kamma that is bright with bright result. There is kamma that is dark & bright with dark & bright result. There is kamma that is neither dark nor bright with neither dark nor bright result, leading to the ending of kamma.[40]

• “Four things to be realized: previous lives, to be realized through mindfulness; the falling away & reappearing of beings, to be realized through the [divine] eye; the eight emancipations, to be realized through the body; the ending of effluents, to be realized through discernment.[41]

• “Four floods: the flood of sensuality, the flood of becoming, the flood of views, the flood of ignorance.

• “Four yokes: the yoke of sensuality, the yoke of becoming, the yoke of views, the yoke of ignorance.

• “Four unyokings: the unyoking of the yoke of sensuality, the unyoking of the yoke of becoming, the unyoking of the yoke of views, the unyoking of the yoke of ignorance.

• “Four ties: the bodily tie of greed, the bodily tie of ill-will, the bodily tie of habits & precepts, the bodily tie of insistence on ‘This is the truth.’

• “Four clingings: clinging to sensuality, clinging to views, clinging to habits & precepts, clinging to doctrines of the self.[42]

• “Four modes of generation: egg-born generation, placenta-born generation, slime-born generation, spontaneous generation.[43]

• “Four descents of the embryo: There is the case, friends, where a certain person descends into the mother’s womb unalert, stays in the mother’s womb unalert, & leaves the mother’s womb unalert. This is the first descent of the embryo. There is the case where a certain person descends into the mother’s womb alert, stays in the mother’s womb unalert, & leaves the mother’s womb unalert. This is the second descent of the embryo. There is the case where a certain person descends into the mother’s womb alert, stays in the mother’s womb alert, & leaves the mother’s womb unalert. This is the third descent of the embryo. There is the case where a certain person descends into the mother’s womb alert, stays in the mother’s womb alert, & leaves the mother’s womb alert. This is the fourth descent of the embryo.[44]

• “Four acquisitions of a self-state [*atta-bhāva]:* Friends, there is the acquisition of a self-state where one goes to a self-state through one’s own intention & not through the intention of another. There is the acquisition of a self-state where one goes to a self-state through the intention of another & not through one’s own intention. There is the acquisition of a self-state where one goes to a self-state both through one’s own intention & through the intention of another. There is the acquisition of a self-state where one goes to a self-state neither through one’s own intention nor through the intention of another.

• “Four purifications of offerings: Friends, there is the offering purified by the donor but not by the recipient. There is the offering purified by the recipient but not by the donor. There is the offering purified neither by the donor nor by the recipient. There is the offering purified both by the donor & by the recipient.

• “Four grounds for the bonds of fellowship: giving, kind words, beneficial help, consistency.

• “Four ignoble modes of speech: telling lies, divisive speech, harsh speech, idle chatter.

• “Four noble modes of speech: abstaining from telling lies, abstaining from divisive speech, abstaining from harsh speech, abstaining from idle chatter.

• “Four more ignoble modes of speech: saying that what has not been seen has been seen, saying that what has not been heard has been heard, saying that what has not been sensed has been sensed, saying that what has not been cognized has been cognized.

• “Four more noble modes of speech: saying that what has not been seen has not been seen, saying that what has not been heard has not been heard, saying that what has not been sensed has not been sensed, saying that what has not been cognized has not been cognized.

• “Four more ignoble modes of speech: saying that what has been seen has not been seen, saying that what has been heard has not been heard, saying that what has been sensed has not been sensed, saying that what has been cognized has not been cognized.

• “Four more noble modes of speech: saying that what has been seen has been seen, saying that what has been heard has been heard, saying that what has been sensed has been sensed, saying that what has been cognized has been cognized.

• “Four persons: There is the case, friends, where a certain person torments himself and is devoted to the practice of torturing himself. There is the case where a certain person torments others and is devoted to the practice of torturing others. There is the case where a certain person torments himself and is devoted to the practice of torturing himself, and also torments others and is devoted to the practice of torturing others. There is the case where a certain person neither torments himself nor is devoted to the practice of torturing himself, neither torments others nor is devoted to the practice of torturing others. Neither tormenting himself nor tormenting others, he dwells in the here-&-now free of hunger, unbound, cooled, sensitive to pleasure, with a Brahmā-like mind.[45]

• “Four more persons: There is the case, friends, where a certain person practices for his/her own benefit but not for the benefit of others. There is

the case where a certain person practices for the benefit of others but not for his/her own benefit. There is the case where a certain person practices neither for his/her own benefit nor for the benefit of others. There is the case where a certain person practices both for his/her own benefit & for the benefit of others.[46]

• "Four more persons: one in darkness who is headed for darkness, one in darkness who is headed for light, one in light who is headed for darkness, and one in light who is headed for light.[47]

• "Four more persons: the unshakeable contemplative, the white-lotus contemplative, the red-lotus contemplative, the most refined contemplative among contemplatives.[48]

"These, friends, are the four dhammas that are rightly expounded by the Blessed One—the one who knows, the one who sees, the Worthy One, rightly self-awakened. Those should all be recited together, without dispute, so that this holy life will endure & last a long time, and that will be for the benefit & happiness of many, out of sympathy for the world, for the welfare, benefit, & happiness of devas & human beings.

### Fives

"There are, friends, five dhammas that are rightly expounded by the Blessed One—the one who knows, the one who sees, the Worthy One, rightly self-awakened. Those should all be recited together, without dispute, so that this holy life will endure & last a long time, and that will be for the benefit & happiness of many, out of sympathy for the world, for the welfare, benefit, & happiness of devas & human beings.

"Which five dhammas?

• "Five aggregates: the form aggregate, the feeling aggregate, the perception aggregate, the fabrication aggregate, the consciousness aggregate.

• "Five clinging-aggregates: the form clinging-aggregate, the feeling clinging-aggregate, the perception clinging-aggregate, the fabrication clinging-aggregate, the consciousness clinging-aggregate.[49]

• “Five strings of sensuality: forms cognizable via the eye—agreeable, pleasing, charming, endearing, enticing, linked with sensual desire; sounds cognizable via the ear… aromas cognizable via the nose… flavors cognizable via the tongue… tactile sensations cognizable via the body—agreeable, pleasing, charming, endearing, enticing, linked with sensual desire.

• “Five (post-mortem) destinations: hell, the animal womb, the realm of hungry ghosts, human beings, devas.

• “Five forms of stinginess: stinginess as to one’s monastery (lodgings), stinginess as to one’s family (of supporters), stinginess as to one’s gains, stinginess as to one’s status, and stinginess as to the Dhamma.[50]

• “Five hindrances: the hindrance of sensual desire, the hindrance of ill will, the hindrance of sloth & drowsiness, the hindrance of restlessness & anxiety, the hindrance of uncertainty.

• “Five lower fetters: self-identification views, uncertainty, grasping at habits & practices, sensual desire, ill will.

• “Five higher fetters: passion for form, passion for what is formless, conceit, restlessness, ignorance.

• “Five training rules: refraining from taking life, refraining from taking what is not given, refraining from sexual misconduct, refraining from telling lies, refraining from distilled & fermented drinks that cause heedlessness.

• “Five impossibilities: It is impossible, friends, for a monk whose effluents are ended to intentionally deprive a living being of life. It is impossible for a monk whose effluents are ended to take, in the manner of stealing, what is not given. It is impossible for a monk whose effluents are ended to engage in sexual intercourse. It is impossible for a monk whose effluents are ended to tell a conscious lie. It is impossible for a monk whose effluents are ended to consume stored-up sensual things as he did before, when he was a householder.

• “Five kinds of loss: loss of relatives, loss of wealth, loss through disease, loss in terms of virtue, loss in terms of views. Friends, it’s not by reason of loss of relatives, loss of wealth, or loss through disease that beings—with the break-up of the body, after death—reappear in a plane

of deprivation, a bad destination, a lower realm, hell. It's by reason of loss in terms of virtue and loss in terms of views that beings—with the break-up of the body, after death—reappear in a plane of deprivation, a bad destination, a lower realm, hell.

• "Five ways of being consummate: being consummate in terms of relatives, being consummate in terms of wealth, being consummate in terms of freedom from disease, being consummate in terms of virtue, being consummate in terms of views. Friends, it's not by reason of being consummate in terms of relatives, being consummate in terms of wealth, or being consummate in terms of freedom from disease that beings—with the break-up of the body, after death—reappear in a good destination, a heavenly world. It's by reason of being consummate in virtue and being consummate in views that beings—with the break-up of the body, after death—reappear in a good destination, a heavenly world.

• "Five drawbacks coming from an unvirtuous person's defect in virtue: There is the case, friends, where an unvirtuous person, defective in virtue, by reason of heedlessness undergoes the loss/confiscation of great wealth. This is the first drawback coming from an unvirtuous person's defect in virtue.

"And further, the bad reputation of the unvirtuous person, defective in virtue, gets spread about. This is the second drawback coming from an unvirtuous person's defect in virtue.

"And further, whatever assembly the unvirtuous person, defective in virtue, approaches—whether of noble warriors, brahmans, householders, or contemplatives—he/she does so abashed & without confidence. This is the third drawback coming from an unvirtuous person's defect in virtue.

"And further, the unvirtuous person, defective in virtue, dies confused. This is the fourth drawback coming from an unvirtuous person's defect in virtue.

"And further, the unvirtuous person, defective in virtue—on the break-up of the body, after death—reappears in a plane of deprivation, a bad destination, a lower realm, hell. This is the fifth drawback coming from an unvirtuous person's defect in virtue.

• “Five rewards coming from a virtuous person’s consummation in virtue: There is the case, friends, where a virtuous person, consummate in virtue, by reason of heedfulness acquires a great mass of wealth. This is the first reward coming from a virtuous person’s consummation in virtue.

“And further, the fine reputation of the virtuous person, consummate in virtue, gets spread about. This is the second reward coming from a virtuous person’s consummation in virtue.

“And further, whatever assembly the virtuous person, consummate in virtue, approaches—whether of noble warriors, brahmans, householders, or contemplatives—he/she does so unabashed & with confidence . This is the third reward coming from a virtuous person’s consummation in virtue.

“And further, the virtuous person, consummate in virtue, dies unconfused. This is the fourth reward coming from a virtuous person’s consummation in virtue.

“And further, the virtuous person, consummate in virtue—on the break-up of the body, after death—reappears in a good destination, a heavenly world. This is the fifth reward coming from a virtuous person’s consummation in virtue.

• “Friends, a monk making an accusation, when wanting to accuse another, may accuse the other after having established five qualities within himself: ‘I will speak at the right time, not at the wrong time. I will say what is factual, not what is not factual. I will speak gently, and not harshly. I will say what is connected with the goal [or: the matter at hand], not what is unconnected to the goal [or: the matter at hand]. I will speak with an attitude of goodwill, and not with inner aversion.’ A monk making an accusation, wanting to accuse another, may accuse the other after having established these five qualities within himself.

• “Five factors for exertion: There is the case, friends, where a monk has conviction, is convinced of the Tathāgata’s awakening: ‘Indeed, the Blessed One is worthy & rightly self-awakened, consummate in clear-knowing & conduct, well-gone, an expert with regard to the cosmos, unexcelled trainer of people fit to be tamed, teacher of devas & human beings, awakened, blessed.’

"He is free from illness & discomfort, endowed with good digestion—not too cold, not too hot, of moderate strength—fit for exertion.

"He is neither fraudulent nor deceitful. He declares himself to the Teacher or to his observant companions in the holy life in line with what he actually is.

"He keeps his persistence aroused for abandoning unskillful qualities & taking on skillful qualities. He is steadfast, solid in his effort, not shirking his duties with regard to skillful qualities.

"He is discerning, endowed with discernment leading to the arising of the goal—noble, penetrating, leading to the right ending of stress.

• "Five Pure Abodes: Aviha (Not Falling Away), Atappa (Untroubled), Sudassa (Good-looking), Sudassī (Clear-seeing), Akaniṭṭha (Peerless).

• "Five non-returners: one unbound in between, one unbound on arrival, one unbound without fabrication (of exertion), one unbound with fabrication (of exertion), one going upstream to the Peerless.[51]

• "Five mental blockages: There is the case, friends, where a monk is doubtful, uncertain, indecisive about the Teacher and is not confident in him. When a monk is doubtful, uncertain, indecisive about the Teacher and is not confident in him, then his mind doesn't tend toward ardency, commitment, perseverance, or exertion. When one's mind doesn't tend toward ardency, commitment, perseverance, or exertion, that is the first mental blockage.

"There is the case where a monk is doubtful, uncertain, indecisive about the Dhamma… about the Saṅgha… about the training…

"There is the case where a monk is angered & unhappy with his fellows in the holy life, his mind rigid & hostile. When a monk is angered & unhappy with his fellows in the holy life, his mind rigid & hostile, then his mind doesn't tend toward ardency, commitment, perseverance, or exertion. When one's mind doesn't tend toward ardency, commitment, perseverance, or exertion, that is the fifth mental blockage.

• "Five bondages of awareness: There is the case, friends, where a monk is not free of passion, desire, love, thirst, fever, or craving for sensual pleasures. When a monk is not free of passion, desire, love, thirst, fever, or craving for sensual pleasures, then his mind doesn't tend toward ardency,

commitment, perseverance, or exertion. When one's mind doesn't tend toward ardency, commitment, perseverance, or exertion, that is the first bondage of awareness.

"And further, there is the case where a monk is not free of passion, desire, love, thirst, fever, or craving for the body… for forms…

"And further, there is the case where a monk, having eaten as much as his belly will hold, remains committed to the pleasure of lying down, the pleasure of contact, the pleasure of drowsiness…

"And further, there is the case where a monk practices the holy life intent on being born in one or another of the deva hosts, (thinking,) 'By this virtue or practice or abstinence or holy life I will be a deva of one sort or another.' When a monk practices the holy life intent on being born in one or another of the deva hosts, (thinking,) 'By this virtue or practice or abstinence or holy life I will be a deva of one sort or another,' then his mind doesn't tend toward ardency, commitment, perseverance, or exertion. When one's mind doesn't tend toward ardency, commitment, perseverance, or exertion, that is the fifth bondage of awareness.

• "Five faculties: the faculty of the eye, the faculty of the ear, the faculty of the nose, the faculty of the tongue, the faculty of the body.

• "Five more faculties: the faculty of pleasure, the faculty of pain, the faculty of happiness, the faculty of distress, the faculty of equanimity.[52]

• "Five more faculties: the faculty of conviction, the faculty of persistence, the faculty of mindfulness, the faculty of concentration, the faculty of discernment.[53]

• "Five properties leading to escape: There is the case, friends, where the mind of a monk, when attending to sensuality, doesn't leap up at sensuality, doesn't grow confident, steadfast, or released in sensuality. But when attending to renunciation, his mind leaps up at renunciation, grows confident, steadfast, & released in renunciation. When his mind is rightly-gone, rightly developed, has rightly risen above, gained release, & become disjoined from sensuality, then whatever effluents, torments, & fevers there are that arise in dependence on sensuality, he is released from them. He doesn't experience that feeling. This is expounded as the escape from sensuality.

"And further, there is the case where the mind of a monk, when attending to ill will, doesn't leap up at ill will, doesn't grow confident, steadfast, or released in ill will. But when attending to non-ill will, his mind leaps up at non-ill will, grows confident, steadfast, & released in non-ill will. When his mind is rightly-gone, rightly developed, has rightly risen above, gained release, & become disjoined from ill will, then whatever effluents, torments, & fevers there are that arise in dependence on ill will, he is released from them. He doesn't experience that feeling. This is expounded as the escape from ill will.

"And further, there is the case where the mind of a monk, when attending to harmfulness, doesn't leap up at harmfulness, doesn't grow confident, steadfast, or released in harmfulness. But when attending to harmlessness, his mind leaps up at harmlessness, grows confident, steadfast, & released in harmlessness. When his mind is rightly-gone, rightly developed, has rightly risen above, gained release, & become disjoined from harmfulness, then whatever effluents, torments, & fevers there are that arise in dependence on harmfulness, he is released from them. He doesn't experience that feeling. This is expounded as the escape from harmfulness.

"And further, there is the case where the mind of a monk, when attending to forms, doesn't leap up at forms, doesn't grow confident, steadfast, or released in forms. But when attending to the formless, his mind leaps up at the formless, grows confident, steadfast, & released in the formless. When his mind is rightly-gone, rightly developed, has rightly risen above, gained release, & become disjoined from forms, then whatever effluents, torments, & fevers there are that arise in dependence on forms, he is released from them. He doesn't experience that feeling. This is expounded as the escape from forms.

"And further, there is the case where the mind of a monk, when attending to self-identification, doesn't leap up at self-identification, doesn't grow confident, steadfast, or released in self-identification. But when attending to the cessation of self-identification, his mind leaps up at the cessation of self-identification, grows confident, steadfast, & released in the cessation of self-identification. When his mind is rightly-gone, rightly developed, has rightly risen above, gained release, & become disjoined from self-identification, then whatever effluents, torments, &

fevers there are that arise in dependence on self-identification, he is released from them. He doesn't experience that feeling. This is expounded as the escape from self-identification.

• "Five openings to release: "There is the case, friends, where the Teacher or a fellow person leading the holy life teaches the Dhamma to a monk. And in whatever way the Teacher or a fellow person leading the holy life teaches the Dhamma to the monk, in just that way the monk, with regard to that Dhamma, is sensitive to the meaning, is sensitive to the Dhamma. In him—sensitive to the meaning, sensitive to the Dhamma—joy is born. When he is joyful, rapture is born. In one who is enraptured at heart, the body grows calm. When the body is calm, one feels pleasure. Feeling pleasure, the mind becomes concentrated. This is the first opening to release.

"And further, it's not that the Teacher or a fellow person leading the holy life teaches the Dhamma to the monk. But the monk teaches the Dhamma to others in detail, as he has heard it, as he has learned it. And in whatever way he teaches the Dhamma to others in detail, as he has heard it, as he has learned it, in just that way the monk, with regard to that Dhamma, is sensitive to the meaning, is sensitive to the Dhamma. In him—sensitive to the meaning, sensitive to the Dhamma—joy is born. When he is joyful, rapture is born. In one who is enraptured at heart, the body grows calm. When the body is calm, one feels pleasure. Feeling pleasure, the mind becomes concentrated. This is the second opening to release.

"And further, it's not that the Teacher or a fellow person leading the holy life teaches the Dhamma to the monk, nor does the monk teach the Dhamma to others in detail, as he has heard it, as he has learned it. But he recites the Dhamma in detail, as he has heard it, as he has learned it. In whatever way he recites the Dhamma in detail, as he has heard it, as he has learned it, in just that way the monk, with regard to that Dhamma, is sensitive to the meaning, is sensitive to the Dhamma. In him—sensitive to the meaning, sensitive to the Dhamma—joy is born. When he is joyful, rapture is born. In one who is enraptured at heart, the body grows calm. When the body is calm, one feels pleasure. Feeling pleasure, the mind becomes concentrated. This is the third opening to release.

"And further, it's not that the Teacher or a fellow person leading the holy life teaches the Dhamma to the monk; nor does the monk teach the Dhamma to others in detail, as he has heard it, as he has learned it; nor does he recite the Dhamma in detail, as he has heard it, as he has learned it. But in his awareness he directs his thoughts to the Dhamma in detail, as he has heard it, as he has learned it; he evaluates it, & mentally examines it. In whatever way he, in his awareness, directs his thoughts to the Dhamma in detail, as he has heard it, as he has learned it, evaluates it, & mentally examines it, in just that way the monk, with regard to that Dhamma, is sensitive to the meaning, is sensitive to the Dhamma. In him —sensitive to the meaning, sensitive to the Dhamma—joy is born. When he is joyful, rapture is born. In one who is enraptured at heart, the body grows calm. When the body is calm, one feels pleasure. Feeling pleasure, the mind becomes concentrated. This is the fourth opening to release.

"And further, it's not that the Teacher or a fellow person leading the holy life teaches the Dhamma to the monk; nor does the monk teach the Dhamma to others in detail, as he has heard it, as he has learned it; nor does he recite the Dhamma in detail, as he has heard it, as he has learned it; nor does he, in his awareness, direct his thoughts to the Dhamma in detail, as he has heard it, as he has learned it, evaluate it, or mentally examine it. But he has well grasped a certain theme of concentration, has attended to it well, sustained it well, has penetrated it well with discernment. In whatever way he has well grasped a certain theme of concentration, has attended to it well, sustained it well, has penetrated it well with discernment, in just that way the monk, with regard to that Dhamma, is sensitive to the meaning, is sensitive to the Dhamma. In him —sensitive to the meaning, sensitive to the Dhamma—joy is born. When he is joyful, rapture is born. In one who is enraptured at heart, the body grows calm. When the body is calm, one feels pleasure. Feeling pleasure, the mind becomes concentrated. This is the fifth opening to release.

• "Five perceptions for the maturing of release: the perception of inconstancy, the perception of stress in what is inconstant, the perception of not-self in what is stressful, the perception of abandoning, the perception of dispassion.[54]

"These, friends, are the five dhammas that are rightly expounded by the Blessed One—the one who knows, the one who sees, the Worthy One,

rightly self-awakened. Those should all be recited together, without dispute, so that this holy life will endure & last a long time, and that will be for the benefit & happiness of many, out of sympathy for the world, for the welfare, benefit, & happiness of devas & human beings.

### Sixes

"There are, friends, six dhammas that are rightly expounded by the Blessed One—the one who knows, the one who sees, the Worthy One, rightly self-awakened. Those should all be recited together, without dispute, so that this holy life will endure & last a long time, and that will be for the benefit & happiness of many, out of sympathy for the world, for the welfare, benefit, & happiness of devas & human beings.

"Which six dhammas?

- "Six internal sense media: the eye as a sense medium, the ear as a sense medium, the nose as a sense medium, the tongue as a sense medium, the body as a sense medium, the intellect as a sense medium.
- "Six external sense media: form as a sense medium, sound as a sense medium, aroma as a sense medium, flavor as a sense medium, tactile sensation as a sense medium, idea as a sense medium.
- "Six classes of consciousness: eye-consciousness, ear-consciousness, nose-consciousness, tongue-consciousness, body-consciousness, intellect-consciousness.
- "Six classes of contact: eye-contact, ear-contact, nose-contact, tongue-contact, body-contact, intellect-contact.
- "Six classes of feeling: feeling born of eye-contact, feeling born of ear-contact, feeling born of nose-contact, feeling born of tongue-contact, feeling born of body-contact, feeling born of intellect-contact.
- "Six classes of perception: perception of forms, perception of sounds, perception of aromas, perception of flavors, perception of tactile sensations, perception of ideas.
- "Six classes of intention: intention for forms, intention for sounds, intention for aromas, intention for flavors, intention for tactile sensations, intention for ideas.

• “Six classes of craving: craving for forms, craving for sounds, craving for aromas, craving for flavors, craving for tactile sensations, craving for ideas.

• “Six types of disrespect: There is the case, friends, where a monk dwells without respect or deference for the Teacher… for the Dhamma… for the Saṅgha… for the training… for heedfulness… for welcoming manners.

• “Six types of respect: There is the case, friends, where a monk dwells with respect & deference for the Teacher… for the Dhamma… for the Saṅgha… for the training… for heedfulness… for welcoming manners.

• “Six types of happiness examination: On seeing a form via the eye, one examines a form that can act as the basis for happiness. On hearing a sound via the ear… On smelling an aroma via the nose… On tasting a flavor via the tongue… On sensing a tactile sensation via the body… On cognizing an idea via the intellect, one examines an idea that can act as the basis for happiness.

• “Six types of distress examination: On seeing a form via the eye, one examines a form that can act as the basis for distress. On hearing a sound via the ear… On smelling an aroma via the nose… On tasting a flavor via the tongue… On sensing a tactile sensation via the body… On cognizing an idea via the intellect, one examines an idea that can act as the basis for distress.

• “Six types of equanimity examination: On seeing a form via the eye, one examines a form that can act as the basis for equanimity. On hearing a sound via the ear… On smelling an aroma via the nose… On tasting a flavor via the tongue… On sensing a tactile sensation via the body… On cognizing an idea via the intellect, one examines an idea that can act as the basis for equanimity.

• “Six conditions conducive to amiability: There is the case, friends, where a monk is set on bodily acts of goodwill with regard to his companions in the holy life, to their faces & behind their backs. This is a condition that is conducive to amiability, that engenders feelings of endearment, engenders feelings of respect, leading to a sense of fellowship, a lack of disputes, harmony, & a state of unity.

"And further, the monk is set on verbal acts of goodwill with regard to his companions in the holy life, to their faces & behind their backs. This, too, is a condition that is conducive to amiability, that engenders feelings of endearment, engenders feelings of respect, leading to a sense of fellowship, a lack of disputes, harmony, & a state of unity.

"And further, the monk is set on mental acts of goodwill with regard to his companions in the holy life, to their faces & behind their backs. This, too, is a condition that is conducive to amiability, that engenders feelings of endearment, engenders feelings of respect, leading to a sense of fellowship, a lack of disputes, harmony, & a state of unity.

"And further, whatever righteous gains the monk may obtain in a righteous way—even if only the alms in his bowl—he does not consume them alone. He consumes them after sharing them in common with his virtuous companions in the holy life. This, too, is a condition that is conducive to amiability, that engenders feelings of endearment, engenders feelings of respect, leading to a sense of fellowship, a lack of disputes, harmony, & a state of unity.

"And further—with reference to the virtues that are untorn, unbroken, unspotted, unsplattered, liberating, praised by the observant, ungrasped at, leading to concentration—the monk dwells with his virtue in tune with that of his companions in the holy life, to their faces & behind their backs. This, too, is a condition that is conducive to amiability, that engenders feelings of endearment, engenders feelings of respect, leading to a sense of fellowship, a lack of disputes, harmony, & a state of unity.

"And further—with reference to the view that is noble, leading outward, that leads those who act in accordance with it to the right ending of suffering & stress—the monk dwells with his view in tune with that of his companions in the holy life, to their faces & behind their backs. This, too, is a condition that is conducive to amiability, that engenders feelings of endearment, engenders feelings of respect, leading to a sense of fellowship, a lack of disputes, harmony, & a state of unity.

• "Six roots of disputes: There is the case, friends, where a monk is angry & spiteful. When a monk is angry & spiteful, he dwells without respect & without deference for the Teacher, for the Dhamma, for the Saṅgha, and does not fulfill the training. He gives rise to a dispute in the

Saṅgha. That dispute will be for the harm & suffering of many, for the detriment, harm, & suffering of devas & human beings. If you see this sort of root of dispute within you or without, friends, you should make an effort for the abandoning of that evil root of dispute. If you don't see this sort of root of dispute within you or without, you should practice for the future non-arising of that evil root of dispute. Thus is its abandoning, thus its future non-arising.

"And further, there is the case where a monk is dismissive & antagonistic… is deceitful & pretentious… is envious & selfish… has evil desires & wrong views… is opinionated, tenacious, & obstinate. When a monk is opinionated, tenacious, & obstinate, he dwells without respect & without deference for the Teacher, for the Dhamma, for the Saṅgha, and does not fulfill the training. He gives rise to a dispute in the Saṅgha. That dispute will be for the harm & suffering of many, for the detriment, harm, & suffering of devas & human beings. If you see this sort of root of dispute within you or without, friends, you should make an effort for the abandoning of that evil root of dispute. If you don't see this sort of root of dispute within you or without, you should practice for the future non-arising of that evil root of dispute. Thus is its abandoning, thus its future non-arising.

• "Six properties: the earth property, the liquid property, the fire property, the wind property, the space property, the consciousness property.[55]

• "Six properties that are means of escape: There is the case, friends, where a monk might say, 'Although goodwill has been developed, pursued, handed the reins, taken as a basis, steadied, consolidated, & well-undertaken by me as my awareness-release, still ill will keeps overpowering my mind.' He should be told, 'Don't say that. You shouldn't speak in that way. Don't misrepresent the Blessed One, for it's not right to misrepresent the Blessed One, and the Blessed One wouldn't say that. It's impossible, there is no way that—when goodwill has been developed, pursued, handed the reins, taken as a basis, steadied, consolidated, & well-undertaken as an awareness-release—ill will would still keep overpowering the mind. That possibility doesn't exist, for this is the escape from ill will: goodwill as an awareness-release.'

"And further, there is the case where a monk might say, 'Although compassion has been developed, pursued, handed the reins, taken as a basis, steadied, consolidated, & well-undertaken by me as my awareness-release, still harmfulness keeps overpowering my mind.' He should be told, 'Don't say that. You shouldn't speak in that way. Don't misrepresent the Blessed One, for it's not right to misrepresent the Blessed One, and the Blessed One wouldn't say that. It's impossible, there is no way that—when compassion has been developed, pursued, handed the reins, taken as a basis, steadied, consolidated, & well-undertaken as an awareness-release—harmfulness would still keep overpowering the mind. That possibility doesn't exist, for this is the escape from harmfulness: compassion as an awareness-release.'

"And further, there is the case where a monk might say, 'Although empathetic joy has been developed, pursued, handed the reins, taken as a basis, steadied, consolidated, & well-undertaken by me as my awareness-release, still resentment keeps overpowering my mind.' He should be told, 'Don't say that. You shouldn't speak in that way. Don't misrepresent the Blessed One, for it's not right to misrepresent the Blessed One, and the Blessed One wouldn't say that. It's impossible, there is no way that—when empathetic joy has been developed, pursued, handed the reins, taken as a basis, steadied, consolidated, & well-undertaken as an awareness-release—resentment would still keep overpowering the mind. That possibility doesn't exist, for this is the escape from resentment: empathetic joy as an awareness-release.'

"And further, there is the case where a monk might say, 'Although equanimity has been developed, pursued, handed the reins, taken as a basis, steadied, consolidated, & well-undertaken by me as my awareness-release, still passion keeps overpowering my mind.' He should be told, 'Don't say that. You shouldn't speak in that way. Don't misrepresent the Blessed One, for it's not right to misrepresent the Blessed One, and the Blessed One wouldn't say that. It's impossible, there is no way that—when equanimity has been developed, pursued, handed the reins, taken as a basis, steadied, consolidated, & well-undertaken as an awareness-release—passion would still keep overpowering the mind. That possibility doesn't exist, for this is the escape from passion: equanimity as an awareness-release.'

"And further, there is the case where a monk might say, 'Although the signless has been developed, pursued, handed the reins, taken as a basis, steadied, consolidated, & well-undertaken by me as my awareness-release, still my consciousness follows the drift of signs.' He should be told, 'Don't say that. You shouldn't speak in that way. Don't misrepresent the Blessed One, for it's not right to misrepresent the Blessed One, and the Blessed One wouldn't say that. It's impossible, there is no way that—when the signless has been developed, pursued, handed the reins, taken as a basis, steadied, consolidated, & well-undertaken as an awareness-release—consciousness would follow the drift of signs. That possibility doesn't exist, for this is the escape from all signs: the signless as an awareness-release.'

"And further, there is the case where a monk might say, 'Although "I am" is gone, and I do not assume that "I am this," still the arrow of uncertainty & perplexity keeps overpowering my mind.' He should be told, 'Don't say that. You shouldn't speak in that way. Don't misrepresent the Blessed One, for it's not right to misrepresent the Blessed One, and the Blessed One wouldn't say that. It's impossible, there is no way that—when "I am" is gone, and "I am this" is not assumed—the arrow of uncertainty & perplexity would keep overpowering the mind. That possibility doesn't exist, for this is the escape from the arrow of uncertainty & perplexity: the uprooting of the conceit, "I am".'

• "Six things that are unsurpassed: unsurpassed vision, unsurpassed hearing, unsurpassed gains, unsurpassed trainings, unsurpassed service, unsurpassed objects of recollection.

• "Six objects of recollection: recollection of the Buddha, recollection of the Dhamma, recollection of the Saṅgha, recollection of virtue, recollection of generosity, recollection of the devas.[56]

• "Six persevering dwellings: There is the case, friends, where a monk, on seeing a form via the eye, is neither gladdened nor saddened, but remains equanimous, mindful, & alert. On hearing a sound via the ear… On smelling an aroma via the nose… On tasting a flavor via the tongue… On sensing a tactile sensation via the body… On cognizing an idea via the intellect, he is neither gladdened nor saddened, but remains equanimous, mindful, & alert.

• "Six births: There is the case, friends, where one born in darkness gives birth to dark qualities. There is the case where one born in darkness gives birth to bright qualities. There is the case where one born in darkness gives birth to unbinding, neither dark nor bright. There is the case where one born in brightness gives birth to bright qualities. There is the case where one born in brightness gives birth to dark qualities. There is the case where one born in brightness gives birth to unbinding, neither dark nor bright.

• "Six perceptions conducive to penetration: the perception of inconstancy, the perception of stress in what is inconstant, the perception of not-self in what is stressful, the perception of abandoning, the perception of dispassion, the perception of cessation.[57]

"These, friends, are the six dhammas that are rightly expounded by the Blessed One—the one who knows, the one who sees, the Worthy One, rightly self-awakened. Those should all be recited together, without dispute, so that this holy life will endure & last a long time, and that will be for the benefit & happiness of many, out of sympathy for the world, for the welfare, benefit, & happiness of devas & human beings.

### Sevens

"There are, friends, seven dhammas that are rightly expounded by the Blessed One—the one who knows, the one who sees, the Worthy One, rightly self-awakened. Those should all be recited together, without dispute, so that this holy life will endure & last a long time, and that will be for the benefit & happiness of many, out of sympathy for the world, for the welfare, benefit, & happiness of devas & human beings.

"Which seven dhammas?

• "Seven noble treasures: the treasure of conviction, the treasure of virtue, the treasure of a sense of shame, the treasure of a sense of compunction, the treasure of listening, the treasure of generosity, the treasure of discernment.[58]

• "Seven factors for awakening: mindfulness as a factor for awakening, analysis of qualities as a factor for awakening, persistence as a factor for awakening, rapture as a factor for awakening, calm as a factor for

awakening, concentration as a factor for awakening, equanimity as a factor for awakening.[59]

• "Seven requisites for concentration: right view, right resolve, right speech, right action, right livelihood, right effort, right mindfulness.[60]

• "Seven untrue dhammas: There is the case, friends, where a monk is without conviction, without a sense of shame, without a sense of compunction, without learning, lazy, one of muddled truth, & undiscerning.

• "Seven true dhammas: There is the case, friends, where a monk has conviction, a sense of shame, a sense of compunction, learning, and is one of aroused persistence, established mindfulness, & discerning.[61]

• "Seven qualities of a person of integrity: There is the case, friends, where a monk is one with a sense of Dhamma, a sense of meaning, a sense of himself, a sense of moderation, a sense of time, a sense of social gatherings, & a sense of distinctions among individuals.[62]

• "Seven grounds for praise: There is the case, friends, where a monk has keen desire to undertake the training & has not discarded his love for undertaking the training in the future. He has keen desire to attend carefully to the Dhamma… to subdue his wants… to find solitude… to arouse persistence… to be mindful & adept… to penetrate (right) view & has not discarded his love for penetrating (right) view in the future.

• "Seven perceptions: the perception of inconstancy, the perception of not-self, the perception of unattractiveness, the perception of drawbacks, the perception of abandoning, the perception of dispassion, the perception of cessation.[63]

• "Seven strengths: the strength of conviction, the strength of persistence, the strength of a sense of shame, the strength of compunction, the strength of mindfulness, the strength of concentration, the strength of discernment.[64]

• "Seven stations of consciousness: Friends, there are beings with multiplicity of body & multiplicity of perception, such as human beings, some devas, & some beings in the lower realms. This is the first station of consciousness.

"There are beings with multiplicity of body & singularity of perception, such as the devas of Brahmā's retinue generated by the first (jhāna). This is the second station of consciousness.

"There are beings with singularity of body & multiplicity of perception, such as the Radiant Devas. This is the third station of consciousness.

"There are beings with singularity of body & singularity of perception, such as the Beautiful Black Devas. This is the fourth station of consciousness.

"There are beings who, with the complete transcending of perceptions of (physical) form, with the disappearance of perceptions of resistance, and not attending to perceptions of multiplicity, (perceiving,) 'Infinite space,' arrive at the dimension of the infinitude of space. This is the fifth station of consciousness.

"There are beings who, with the complete transcending of the dimension of the infinitude of space, (perceiving,) 'Infinite consciousness,' arrive at the dimension of the infinitude of consciousness. This is the sixth station of consciousness.

"There are beings who, with the complete transcending of the dimension of the infinitude of consciousness, (perceiving,) 'There is nothing,' arrive at the dimension of nothingness. This is the seventh station of consciousness.

• "Seven persons worthy of offerings: one (released) both ways, one released through discernment, a bodily witness, one attained to view, one released through conviction, a Dhamma-follower, a conviction-follower.[65]

• "Seven obsessions: the obsession of sensual passion, the obsession of resistance, the obsession of views, the obsession of uncertainty, the obsession of conceit, the obsession of passion for becoming, the obsession of ignorance.

• "Seven fetters: the fetter of sensuality, the fetter of irritation, the fetter of views, the fetter of uncertainty, the fetter of conceit, the fetter of passion for becoming, the fetter of ignorance.

• "Seven means for the settling of issues: For the settling & stilling of issues that have arisen:

"A face-to-face verdict should be given.
"A verdict of mindfulness may be given.
"A verdict of past insanity may be given.
"Acting in accordance with what is admitted.
"Acting in accordance with the majority.
"Acting for his [the accused's] further punishment.
"Covering over as with grass.[66]

"These, friends, are the seven dhammas that are rightly expounded by the Blessed One—the one who knows, the one who sees, the Worthy One, rightly self-awakened. Those should all be recited together, without dispute, so that this holy life will endure & last a long time, and that will be for the benefit & happiness of many, out of sympathy for the world, for the welfare, benefit, & happiness of devas & human beings.

### Eights

"There are, friends, eight dhammas that are rightly expounded by the Blessed One—the one who knows, the one who sees, the Worthy One, rightly self-awakened. Those should all be recited together, without dispute, so that this holy life will endure & last a long time, and that will be for the benefit & happiness of many, out of sympathy for the world, for the welfare, benefit, & happiness of devas & human beings.

"Which eight dhammas?

- "Eight forms of wrongness: wrong view, wrong resolve, wrong speech, wrong action, wrong livelihood, wrong effort, wrong mindfulness, wrong concentration.

- "Eight forms of rightness: right view, right resolve, right speech, right action, right livelihood, right effort, right mindfulness, right concentration.

- "Eight persons worthy of offerings: a stream-winner, one practicing for the realization of the fruit of stream-entry, a once-returner, one practicing for the realization of the fruit of once-returning, a non-returner, one practicing for the realization of the fruit of non-returning, an arahant, one practicing for the realization of arahantship.

• "Eight grounds for laziness: There is the case, friends, where a monk has some work to do. The thought occurs to him: 'I will have to do this work. But when I have done this work, my body will be tired. Why don't I lie down?' So he lies down. He doesn't make an effort for the attaining of the as-yet-unattained, the reaching of the as-yet-unreached, the realization of the as-yet-unrealized. This is the first ground for laziness.

"Then there is the case where a monk has done some work. The thought occurs to him: 'I have done some work. Now that I have done work, my body is tired. Why don't I lie down?' So he lies down. He doesn't make an effort for the attaining of the as-yet-unattained, the reaching of the as-yet-unreached, the realization of the as-yet-unrealized. This is the second ground for laziness.

"Then there is the case where a monk has to go on a journey. The thought occurs to him: 'I will have to go on this journey. But when I have gone on the journey, my body will be tired. Why don't I lie down?' So he lies down. He doesn't make an effort for the attaining of the as-yet-unattained, the reaching of the as-yet-unreached, the realization of the as-yet-unrealized. This is the third ground for laziness.

"Then there is the case where a monk has gone on a journey. The thought occurs to him: 'I have gone on a journey. Now that I have gone on a journey, my body is tired. Why don't I lie down?' So he lies down. He doesn't make an effort for the attaining of the as-yet-unattained, the reaching of the as-yet-unreached, the realization of the as-yet-unrealized. This is the fourth ground for laziness.

"Then there is the case where a monk, having gone for alms in a village or town, does not get as much coarse or refined food as he would like for his fill. The thought occurs to him: 'I, having gone for alms in a village or town, have not gotten as much coarse or refined food as I would like for my fill. This body of mine is tired & unsuitable for work. Why don't I lie down?' So he lies down. He doesn't make an effort for the attaining of the as-yet-unattained, the reaching of the as-yet-unreached, the realization of the as-yet-unrealized. This is the fifth ground for laziness.

"Then there is the case where a monk, having gone for alms in a village or town, gets as much coarse or refined food as he would like for his fill. The thought occurs to him: 'I, having gone for alms in a village or town,

have gotten as much coarse or refined food as I would like for my fill. This body of mine is heavy & unsuitable for work—stuffed with beans, as it were. Why don't I lie down?' So he lies down. He doesn't make an effort for the attaining of the as-yet-unattained, the reaching of the as-yet-unreached, the realization of the as-yet-unrealized. This is the sixth ground for laziness.

"Then there is the case where a monk comes down with a slight illness. The thought occurs to him: 'I have come down with a slight illness. There's a need to lie down.' So he lies down. He doesn't make an effort for the attaining of the as-yet-unattained, the reaching of the as-yet-unreached, the realization of the as-yet-unrealized. This is the seventh ground for laziness.

"Then there is the case where a monk has recovered from his illness, not long after his recovery. The thought occurs to him: 'I have recovered from my illness. It's not long after my recovery. This body of mine is weak & unsuitable for work. Why don't I lie down?' So he lies down. He doesn't make an effort for the attaining of the as-yet-unattained, the reaching of the as-yet-unreached, the realization of the as-yet-unrealized. This is the eighth ground for laziness.

• "Eight grounds for the arousal of energy: There is the case, friends, where a monk has some work to do. The thought occurs to him: 'I will have to do this work. But when I am doing this work, it will not be easy to attend to the Buddha's message. Why don't I make an effort beforehand for the attaining of the as-yet-unattained, the reaching of the as-yet-unreached, the realization of the as-yet-unrealized?' So he makes an effort for the attaining of the as-yet-unattained, the reaching of the as-yet-unreached, the realization of the as-yet-unrealized. This is the first ground for the arousal of energy.

"Then there is the case where a monk has done some work. The thought occurs to him: 'I have done some work. While I was doing work, I couldn't attend to the Buddha's message. Why don't I make an effort for the attaining of the as-yet-unattained, the reaching of the as-yet-unreached, the realization of the as-yet-unrealized?' So he makes an effort for the attaining of the as-yet-unattained, the reaching of the as-yet-unreached, the

realization of the as-yet-unrealized. This is the second ground for the arousal of energy.

"Then there is the case where a monk has to go on a journey. The thought occurs to him: 'I will have to go on this journey. But when I am going on the journey, it will not be easy to attend to the Buddha's message. Why don't I make an effort beforehand for the attaining of the as-yet-unattained, the reaching of the as-yet-unreached, the realization of the as-yet-unrealized?' So he makes an effort for the attaining of the as-yet-unattained, the reaching of the as-yet-unreached, the realization of the as-yet-unrealized. This is the third ground for the arousal of energy.

"Then there is the case where a monk has gone on a journey. The thought occurs to him: 'I have gone on a journey. While I was going on the journey, I couldn't attend to the Buddha's message. Why don't I make an effort for the attaining of the as-yet-unattained, the reaching of the as-yet-unreached, the realization of the as-yet-unrealized?' So he makes an effort for the attaining of the as-yet-unattained, the reaching of the as-yet-unreached, the realization of the as-yet-unrealized. This is the fourth ground for the arousal of energy.

"Then there is the case where a monk, having gone for alms in a village or town, does not get as much coarse or refined food as he would like for his fill. The thought occurs to him: 'I, having gone for alms in a village or town, have not gotten as much coarse or refined food as I would like for my fill. This body of mine is light & suitable for work. Why don't I make an effort for the attaining of the as-yet-unattained, the reaching of the as-yet-unreached, the realization of the as-yet-unrealized?' So he makes an effort for the attaining of the as-yet-unattained, the reaching of the as-yet-unreached, the realization of the as-yet-unrealized. This is the fifth ground for the arousal of energy.

"Then there is the case where a monk, having gone for alms in a village or town, gets as much coarse or refined food as he would like for his fill. The thought occurs to him: 'I, having gone for alms in a village or town, have gotten as much coarse or refined food as I would like for my fill. This body of mine is light & suitable for work. Why don't I make an effort for the attaining of the as-yet-unattained, the reaching of the as-yet-unreached, the realization of the as-yet-unrealized?' So he makes an effort for the

attaining of the as-yet-unattained, the reaching of the as-yet-unreached, the realization of the as-yet-unrealized. This is the sixth ground for the arousal of energy.

"Then there is the case where a monk comes down with a slight illness. The thought occurs to him: 'I have come down with a slight illness. Now, there's the possibility that it could get worse. Why don't I make an effort beforehand for the attaining of the as-yet-unattained, the reaching of the as-yet-unreached, the realization of the as-yet-unrealized?' So he makes an effort for the attaining of the as-yet-unattained, the reaching of the as-yet-unreached, the realization of the as-yet-unrealized. This is the seventh ground for the arousal of energy.

"Then there is the case where a monk has recovered from his illness, not long after his recovery. The thought occurs to him: 'I have recovered from my illness. It's not long after my recovery. Now, there's the possibility that the illness could come back. Why don't I make an effort beforehand for the attaining of the as-yet-unattained, the reaching of the as-yet-unreached, the realization of the as-yet-unrealized?' So he makes an effort for the attaining of the as-yet-unattained, the reaching of the as-yet-unreached, the realization of the as-yet-unrealized. This is the eighth ground for the arousal of energy.

• "Eight grounds for giving: One gives a gift on impulse. One gives a gift from fear. One gives a gift (thinking,) 'He/she gave to me.' One gives a gift (thinking,) 'He/she will give to me.' One gives a gift (thinking,) 'I am cooking. These are not cooking. It's not right, when one is cooking, not to give to those who are not cooking.' One gives a gift (thinking,) 'When this gift has been given, my admirable reputation will spread about.' One gives a gift as an ornament for the mind, as a support for the mind.[67]

• "Eight rebirths from giving: There is the case, friends, where a certain individual gives a gift to a contemplative or a brahman—food, drink, cloth, sandals, garlands, scents, ointments, beds, dwellings, lighting—and he expects a return for what he gave. He sees a prosperous noble warrior, a prosperous brahman, or a prosperous householder going about endowed & provided with the five strings of sensuality. The thought occurs to him, 'O that—with the breakup of the body, after death—I may be reborn among prosperous noble warriors, prosperous brahmans, or prosperous

householders!' He fixes on that thought, determines on that thought, develops that thought. And that thought, released on a low level and not developed to anything higher, leads to rebirth right there. But I say this of a virtuous person, not of an unvirtuous one. A virtuous person's act of directing awareness succeeds through purity.

"And further, a certain person gives a gift to a contemplative or a brahman… He hears, 'The Devas of the Four Great Kings are long-lived, beautiful, & replete with pleasure.' The thought occurs to him, 'O that—with the breakup of the body, after death—I may be reborn among the Devas of the Four Great Kings!' He fixes on that thought, determines on that thought, develops that thought. And that thought, released on a low level and not developed to anything higher, leads to rebirth right there. But I say this of a virtuous person, not of an unvirtuous one. A virtuous person's act of directing awareness succeeds through purity.

"And further, a certain person gives a gift to a contemplative or a brahman… He hears, 'The Devas of the Thirty-three… the Devas of the Hours… the Contented Devas… the Devas Who Delight in Creation… the Devas Who Wield Power Over the Creations of Others are long-lived, beautiful, & replete with pleasure.' The thought occurs to him, 'O that—with the breakup of the body, after death—I may be reborn among the Devas Who Wield Power Over the Creations of Others!' He fixes on that thought, determines on that thought, develops that thought. And that thought, released on a low level and not developed to anything higher, leads to rebirth right there. But I say this of a virtuous person, not of an unvirtuous one. A virtuous person's act of directing awareness succeeds through purity.

"And further, a certain person gives a gift to a contemplative or a brahman—food, drink, cloth, sandals, garlands, scents, ointments, beds, dwellings, lighting—and he expects a return for what he gave. He hears, 'The Devas of Brahmā's Retinue are long-lived, beautiful, & replete with pleasure.' The thought occurs to him, 'O that—with the breakup of the body, after death—I may be reborn among the Devas of Brahmā's Retinue!' He fixes on that thought, determines on that thought, develops that thought. And that thought, released on a low level and not developed to anything higher, leads to rebirth right there. But I say this of a virtuous person, not of an unvirtuous one, of one devoid of passion, not of one

with passion. A virtuous person's act of directing awareness succeeds through purity.

• "Eight worldly conditions: gain, loss, status, disgrace, censure, praise, pleasure, pain.[68]

• "Eight assemblies: a noble warrior assembly, a brahman assembly, a householder assembly, a contemplative assembly, a Four Great Kings assembly, a (Devas of the) Thirty-three assembly, a Māra assembly,[69] a Brahmā assembly.

• "Eight dimensions of (mental) mastery: One percipient of form internally sees forms externally as limited, beautiful & ugly. Mastering them, he is percipient of 'I know; I see.' This is the first dimension of (mental) mastery.

"One percipient of form internally sees forms externally as immeasurable, beautiful & ugly. Mastering them, he is percipient of 'I know; I see.' This is the second dimension of (mental) mastery.

"One percipient of the formless internally sees forms externally as limited, beautiful & ugly. Mastering them, he is percipient of 'I know; I see.' This is the third dimension of (mental) mastery.

"One percipient of the formless internally sees forms externally as immeasurable, beautiful & ugly. Mastering them, he is percipient of 'I know; I see.' This is the fourth dimension of (mental) mastery.

"One percipient of the formless internally sees forms externally as blue, blue in their color, blue in their features, blue in their glow. Just as a flax-flower is blue, blue in its color, blue in its features, blue in its glow, or just as Vārāṇasī muslin, smooth on both sides, is blue, blue in its color, blue in its features, blue in its glow, in the same way one percipient of the formless internally sees forms externally as blue, blue in their color, blue in their features, blue in their glow. Mastering them, he is percipient of 'I know; I see.' This is the fifth dimension of (mental) mastery.

"One percipient of the formless internally sees forms externally as yellow, yellow in their color, yellow in their features, yellow in their glow. Just as a kaṇṇikāra-flower is yellow, yellow in its color, yellow in its features, yellow in its glow, or just as Vārāṇasī muslin, smooth on both sides, is yellow, yellow in its color, yellow in its features, yellow in its glow,

in the same way one percipient of the formless internally sees forms externally as yellow, yellow in their color, yellow in their features, yellow in their glow. Mastering them, he is percipient of 'I know; I see.' This is the sixth dimension of (mental) mastery.

"One percipient of the formless internally sees forms externally as red, red in their color, red in their features, red in their glow. Just as a bandhajīvaka-flower is red, red in its color, red in its features, red in its glow, or just as Vārāṇasī muslin, smooth on both sides, is red, red in its color, red in its features, red in its glow, in the same way one percipient of the formless internally sees forms externally as red, red in their color, red in their features, red in their glow. Mastering them, he is percipient of 'I know; I see.' This is the seventh dimension of (mental) mastery.

"One percipient of the formless internally sees forms externally as white, white in their color, white in their features, white in their glow. Just as the morning star is white, white in its color, white in its features, white in its glow, or just as Vārāṇasī muslin, smooth on both sides, is white, white in its color, white in its features, white in its glow, in the same way one percipient of the formless internally sees forms externally as white, white in their color, white in their features, white in their glow. Mastering them, he is percipient of 'I know; I see.' This is the eighth dimension of (mental) mastery.

• "Eight emancipations: Possessed of form, one sees forms. This is the first emancipation.

"Not percipient of form internally, one sees forms externally. This is the second emancipation.

"One is intent only on the beautiful. This is the third emancipation.

"With the complete transcending of perceptions of (physical) form, with the disappearance of perceptions of resistance, and not attending to perceptions of multiplicity, (perceiving,) 'Infinite space,' one enters & remains in the dimension of the infinitude of space. This is the fourth emancipation.

"With the complete transcending of the dimension of the infinitude of space, (perceiving,) 'Infinite consciousness,' one enters & remains in the

dimension of the infinitude of consciousness. This is the fifth emancipation.

"With the complete transcending of the dimension of the infinitude of consciousness, (perceiving,) 'There is nothing,' one enters & remains in the dimension of nothingness. This is the sixth emancipation.

"With the complete transcending of the dimension of nothingness, one enters & remains in the dimension of neither perception nor non-perception. This is the seventh emancipation.

"With the complete transcending of the dimension of neither perception nor non-perception, one enters & remains in the cessation of perception and feeling. This is the eighth emancipation.

"These, friends, are the eight dhammas that are rightly expounded by the Blessed One—the one who knows, the one who sees, the Worthy One, rightly self-awakened. Those should all be recited together, without dispute, so that this holy life will endure & last a long time, and that will be for the benefit & happiness of many, out of sympathy for the world, for the welfare, benefit, & happiness of devas & human beings.

## Nines

"There are, friends, nine dhammas that are rightly expounded by the Blessed One—the one who knows, the one who sees, the Worthy One, rightly self-awakened. Those should all be recited together, without dispute, so that this holy life will endure & last a long time, and that will be for the benefit & happiness of many, out of sympathy for the world, for the welfare, benefit, & happiness of devas & human beings.

"Which nine dhammas?

• "Nine grounds for hatred: "(Thinking,) 'He has done me harm,' one binds hatred. 'He is doing me harm,' one binds hatred. 'He is going to do me harm,' one binds hatred. 'He has done harm to people who are dear & pleasing to me,' one binds hatred. 'He is doing harm to people who are dear & pleasing to me,' one binds hatred. 'He is going to do harm to people who are dear & pleasing to me,' one binds hatred. 'He has aided people who are not dear or pleasing to me,' one binds hatred. 'He is aiding

people who are not dear or pleasing to me,' one binds hatred. 'He is going to aid people who are not dear or pleasing to me,' one binds hatred.

• "Nine ways of subduing hatred: (Thinking,) 'He has done me harm. But what should I expect?' one subdues hatred. 'He is doing me harm. But what should I expect?' one subdues hatred. 'He is going to do me harm. But what should I expect?' one subdues hatred. 'He has done harm to people who are dear & pleasing to me. But what should I expect?' one subdues hatred. 'He is doing harm to people who are dear & pleasing to me. But what should I expect?' one subdues hatred. 'He is going to do harm to people who are dear & pleasing to me. But what should I expect?' one subdues hatred. 'He has aided people who are not dear or pleasing to me. But what should I expect?' one subdues hatred. 'He is aiding people who are not dear or pleasing to me. But what should I expect?' one subdues hatred. 'He is going to aid people who are not dear or pleasing to me. But what should I expect?' one subdues hatred.

• "Nine abodes for beings: There are beings with multiplicity of body & multiplicity of perception, such as human beings, some devas, and some beings in the lower realms. This is the first abode for beings.

"There are beings with multiplicity of body & singularity of perception, such as the devas of Brahmā's retinue generated by the first (jhāna). This is the second abode for beings.

"There are beings with singularity of body & multiplicity of perception, such as the Radiant Devas. This is the third abode for beings.

"There are beings with singularity of body & singularity of perception, such as the Beautiful Black Devas. This is the fourth abode for beings.

"There are beings who are non-percipient, insensitive, such as the Non-percipient-being Devas. This is the fifth abode for beings.

"There are beings who, with the complete transcending of perceptions of (physical) form, with the disappearance of perceptions of resistance, and not attending to perceptions of multiplicity, (perceiving,) 'Infinite space,' arrive at the dimension of the infinitude of space. This is the sixth abode for beings.

"There are beings who, with the complete transcending of the dimension of the infinitude of space, (perceiving,) 'Infinite consciousness,'

arrive at the dimension of the infinitude of consciousness. This is the seventh abode for beings.

"There are beings who, with the complete transcending of the dimension of the infinitude of consciousness, (perceiving,) 'There is nothing,' arrive at the dimension of nothingness. This is the eighth abode for beings.

"There are beings who, with the complete transcending of the dimension of nothingness, arrive at the dimension of neither perception nor non-perception. This is the ninth abode for beings.

• "Nine inopportune, untimely situations for leading the holy life: There is the case, friends, where a Tathāgata appears in the world, worthy & rightly self-awakened. The Dhamma is taught that leads to stilling, to total unbinding, to self-awakening as declared by One Well-gone. But this person is reborn in hell. This is the first inopportune, untimely situation for leading the holy life.

"And further, there is the case where a Tathāgata appears in the world… but this person is reborn in an animal womb… in the realm of the hungry ghosts… in the host of the asuras… in a certain host of long-lived devas… or he is born in a border region among ignorant barbarians where there is no opening for monks, nuns, male lay followers, or female lay followers to go.…

"Or he is born in the Middle Country [the middle Ganges Valley] but he has wrong views & skewed vision: 'There is nothing given, nothing offered, nothing sacrificed. There is no fruit or result of good or bad actions. There is no this world, no next world, no mother, no father; there are no spontaneously reborn beings; there are no contemplatives or brahmans who, faring rightly & practicing rightly, proclaim this world & the next after having directly known & realized it for themselves.' …

"Or he is born in the Middle Country but he is undiscerning, dull, drooling, incapable of knowing the meaning of what is well-said or ill-said. This is the eighth inopportune, untimely situation for leading the holy life.

"And further, a Tathāgata does not appear in the world, worthy & rightly self-awakened. The Dhamma is not taught that leads to stilling, to

total unbinding, to self-awakening as declared by One Well-gone. This person is born in the Middle Country and is discerning, not dull, not drooling, capable of knowing the meaning of what is well-said or ill-said. This is the ninth inopportune, untimely situation for leading the holy life.

• "Nine step-by-step dwellings: There is the case, friends, where a monk, quite secluded from sensuality, secluded from unskillful qualities, enters & remains in the first jhāna: rapture & pleasure born of seclusion, accompanied by directed thought & evaluation.

"With the stilling of directed thoughts & evaluations, he enters & remains in the second jhāna: rapture & pleasure born of concentration, unification of awareness free from directed thought & evaluation—internal assurance.

"With the fading of rapture, he remains equanimous, mindful, & alert, and senses pleasure with the body. He enters & remains in the third jhāna, of which the noble ones declare, 'Equanimous & mindful, he has a pleasant abiding.'

"With the abandoning of pleasure & pain—as with the earlier disappearance of joy & distress—he enters & remains in the fourth jhāna: purity of equanimity & mindfulness, neither pleasure nor pain.

"With the complete transcending of perceptions of (physical) form, with the disappearance of perceptions of resistance, and not attending to perceptions of multiplicity, (perceiving,) 'Infinite space,' he enters & remains in the dimension of the infinitude of space.

"With the complete transcending of the dimension of the infinitude of space, (perceiving,) 'Infinite consciousness,' he enters & remains in the dimension of the infinitude of consciousness.

"With the complete transcending of the dimension of the infinitude of consciousness, (perceiving,) 'There is nothing,' he enters & remains in the dimension of nothingness.

"With the complete transcending of the dimension of nothingness, he enters & remains in the dimension of neither perception nor non-perception.

"With the complete transcending of the dimension of neither perception nor non-perception, he enters & remains in the cessation of

perception & feeling.

• "Nine step-by-step cessations: When one has attained the first jhāna, the perception of sensuality has ceased. When one has attained the second jhāna, directed thoughts & evaluations [verbal fabrications] have ceased. When one has attained the third jhāna, rapture has ceased. When one has attained the fourth jhāna, in-&-out breaths [bodily fabrications] have ceased. When one has attained the dimension of the infinitude of space, the perception of forms has ceased. When one has attained the dimension of the infinitude of consciousness, the perception of the dimension of the infinitude of space has ceased. When one has attained the dimension of nothingness, the perception of the dimension of the infinitude of consciousness has ceased. When one has attained the dimension of neither perception nor non-perception, the perception of the dimension of nothingness has ceased. When one has attained the cessation of perception & feeling, perceptions & feelings [mental fabrications] have ceased.[70]

"These, friends, are the nine dhammas that are rightly expounded by the Blessed One—the one who knows, the one who sees, the Worthy One, rightly self-awakened. Those should all be recited together, without dispute, so that this holy life will endure & last a long time, and that will be for the benefit & happiness of many, out of sympathy for the world, for the welfare, benefit, & happiness of devas & human beings.

## Tens

"There are, friends, ten dhammas that are rightly expounded by the Blessed One—the one who knows, the one who sees, the Worthy One, rightly self-awakened. Those should all be recited together, without dispute, so that this holy life will endure & last a long time, and that will be for the benefit & happiness of many, out of sympathy for the world, for the welfare, benefit, & happiness of devas & human beings.

"Which ten dhammas?

• "Ten qualities creating a protector: There is the case, friends, where a monk is virtuous. He dwells restrained in accordance with the Pāṭimokkha, consummate in his behavior & sphere of activity. He trains himself, having undertaken the training rules, seeing danger in the

slightest faults. And the fact that he is virtuous… seeing danger in the slightest faults is a quality creating a protector.

"And further, the monk has heard much, has retained what he has heard, has stored what he has heard. Whatever teachings are admirable in the beginning, admirable in the middle, admirable in the end, that—in their meaning and expression—proclaim the holy life that is entirely perfect, surpassingly pure: Those he has listened to often, retained, discussed, accumulated, examined with his mind, & well-penetrated in terms of his views. And the fact that he has heard much… well-penetrated in terms of his views is a quality creating a protector.

"And further, the monk has admirable friends, admirable comrades, admirable companions. And the fact that he has admirable friends, admirable comrades, admirable companions is a quality creating a protector.

"And further, the monk is easy to speak to, endowed with qualities that make him easy to speak to, patient, respectful to instruction. And the fact that he is easy to speak to… respectful to instruction is a quality creating a protector.

"And further, the monk is adept at the various affairs involving his companions in the holy life, is vigorous, quick-witted in the techniques involved in them, is up to doing them or arranging to get them done. And the fact that he is adept at… doing them or arranging to get them done is a quality creating a protector.

"And further, the monk is one who desires the Dhamma, endearing in his conversation, greatly rejoicing in the higher Dhamma & higher Vinaya. And the fact that he is one who desires the Dhamma, endearing in his conversation, greatly rejoicing in the higher Dhamma & higher Vinaya is a quality creating a protector.

"And further, the monk keeps his persistence aroused for abandoning unskillful qualities and for taking on skillful qualities. He is steadfast, solid in his effort, not shirking his duties with regard to skillful qualities. And the fact that he keeps his persistence aroused… not shirking his duties with regard to skillful qualities is a quality creating a protector.

"And further, the monk is content with any old robe cloth at all, any old alms food, any old lodging, any old medicinal requisites for curing sickness at all. And the fact that he is content with any old robe cloth at all, any old alms food, any old lodging, any old medicinal requisites for curing sickness at all is a quality creating a protector.

"And further, the monk is mindful, endowed with excellent proficiency in mindfulness, remembering & recollecting what was done & said a long time ago. And the fact that he is mindful, endowed with excellent proficiency in mindfulness, remembering & recollecting what was done & said a long time ago is a quality creating a protector.

"And further, the monk is discerning, endowed with discernment of arising & passing away—noble, penetrating, leading to the right ending of stress. And the fact that the monk is discerning, endowed with discernment of arising & passing away—noble, penetrating, leading to the right ending of stress—is a quality creating a protector.

• "Ten totality-dimensions: One perceives the earth-totality above, below, all-around: non-dual [*advayaṁ],* immeasurable. One perceives the water-totality… the fire-totality… the wind-totality… the blue-totality… the yellow-totality… the red-totality… the white-totality… the space-totality… the consciousness-totality above, below, all-around: non-dual, immeasurable.

• "Ten unskillful courses of action: taking life, taking what is not given, sexual misconduct, telling lies, divisive speech, harsh speech, idle chatter, greed, ill will, wrong view.

• "Ten skillful courses of action: refraining from taking life, refraining from taking what is not given, refraining from sexual misconduct, refraining from telling lies, refraining from divisive speech, refraining from harsh speech, refraining from idle chatter, non-greed, non-ill will, right view.[71]

• "Ten noble abodes: There is the case, friends, where a monk has abandoned five factors, is endowed with six, guards one, is supported in four, has shaken off idiosyncratic truths, has thoroughly given up searching, is undisturbed in his resolves, is calmed in his bodily-fabrication, is well-released in mind, is well-released in discernment.

"And how has a monk abandoned five factors? There is the case where a monk's sensual desire is abandoned. His ill will… His sloth & torpor… His restlessness & anxiety… His uncertainty is abandoned. This is how a monk has abandoned five factors.

"And how is a monk endowed with six (factors)? There is the case where a monk, on seeing a form via the eye, is neither gladdened nor saddened, but remains equanimous, mindful, & alert. On hearing a sound via the ear… On smelling an aroma via the nose… On tasting a flavor via the tongue… On touching a tactile sensation via the body… On cognizing an idea via the intellect, he is neither gladdened nor saddened, but remains equanimous, mindful, & alert. This is how a monk is endowed with six (factors).

"And how does a monk guard one (factor)? There is the case where a monk is endowed with an awareness guarded by mindfulness. This is how a monk guards one (factor).

"And how is a monk supported in four (ways)? There is the case where a monk, carefully reflecting, associates with one thing, acquiesces to another, avoids another, and subdues another. This is how a monk is supported in four (ways).[72]

"And how has a monk shaken off idiosyncratic truths [*pacceka-sacca]?* There is the case where a monk has shaken off the run-of-the-mill idiosyncratic truths of run-of-the-mill contemplatives & brahmans—in other words, 'The cosmos is eternal,' 'The cosmos is not eternal,' 'The cosmos is finite,' 'The cosmos is infinite,' 'The soul & the body are the same,' 'The soul is one thing and the body another,' 'After death a Tathāgata exists,' 'After death a Tathāgata does not exist,' 'After death a Tathāgata both does & does not exist,' 'After death a Tathāgata neither does nor does not exist.' All of these he has thrown off, shaken off, renounced, vomited up, let go, abandoned, relinquished. This is how a monk has shaken off idiosyncratic truths.

"And how has a monk thoroughly given up searching? There is the case where a monk has abandoned his search for sensuality, has abandoned his search for becoming, and has allayed his search for a holy life. This is how a monk has thoroughly given up searching.

"And how is a monk undisturbed in his resolves? There is the case where a monk has abandoned his resolve for sensuality… his resolve for ill-will… his resolve for harmfulness. This is how a monk is undisturbed in his resolves.

"And how is a monk calmed in his bodily fabrication? There is the case where a monk, with the abandoning of pleasure & pain—as with the earlier disappearance of elation & distress—enters & remains in the fourth jhāna: purity of equanimity & mindfulness, neither pleasure nor pain. This is how a monk is calmed in his bodily fabrication.

"And how is a monk well-released in mind? There is the case where a monk's mind is released from passion, released from aversion, released from delusion. This is how a monk is well-released in mind.

"And how is a monk well-released in discernment? There is the case where a monk discerns, 'Passion is abandoned in me, its root destroyed, made like a palmyra stump, deprived of the conditions of development, not destined for future arising.' He discerns, 'Aversion is abandoned in me, its root destroyed, made like a palmyra stump, deprived of the conditions of development, not destined for future arising.' He discerns, 'Delusion is abandoned in me, its root destroyed, made like a palmyra stump, deprived of the conditions of development, not destined for future arising.' This is how a monk is well-released in discernment.

• "Ten qualities of one beyond training: the right view of one beyond training, the right resolve of one beyond training, the right speech of one beyond training, the right action of one beyond training, the right livelihood of one beyond training, the right effort of one beyond training, the right mindfulness of one beyond training, the right concentration of one beyond training, the right knowledge of one beyond training, the right release of one beyond training.

"These, friends, are the ten dhammas that are rightly expounded by the Blessed One—the one who knows, the one who sees, the Worthy One, rightly self-awakened. Those should all be recited together, without dispute, so that this holy life will endure & last a long time, and that will be for the benefit & happiness of many, out of sympathy for the world, for the welfare, benefit, & happiness of devas & human beings."

Then the Blessed One, having gotten up, said to Ven. Sāriputta, "Excellent, Sāriputta! Excellent! It's excellent how you have spoken to the monks of the sequence for reciting together."

That is what Ven. Sāriputta said, the Teacher approved, and gratified, the monks delighted in Ven. Sāriputta's words.

## Notes

1. See SN 12:2.

2. Reading *maddava* with the Thai. The other editions have *lajjava*, "a sense of conscientiousness."

3. See AN 2:5.

4. See MN 41.

5. See Iti 51, Iti 72, and Iti 73.

6. See Iti 78.

7. This passage shows that the Pali word for craving, *taṇhā*, does not apply exclusively to unskillful desires. See also AN 4:159.

8. See MN 9.

9. See Iti 54–55.

10. See MN 44.

11. An example of wrongness with a certain result would be any of the five grave deeds listed in AN 5:129. An example of rightness with a certain result would be the attainment of stream-entry.

12. Reading *kaṅkhā* with the Thai and Sri Lankan editions. The Burmese edition has *tamā*, "darknesses."

13. See Iti 22 and Iti 27.

14. According to AN 4:123, these three types of devas have mastered, respectively, the first, second, and third jhānas.

15. See Iti 61.

16. See AN 3:90.

17. See MN 36.

18. See MN 121.

19. See AN 3:121–122.

20. See AN 3:123.

21. For the last form of intoxication here, the Thai edition reads *jātimado*, intoxication with birth, but this doesn't follow the text at AN 3:39.

22. See AN 3:40.

23. See SN 42:11.

24. See MN 4.

25. These dwellings are apparently equivalent to the three "high & great beds" listed in AN 3:64. The divine bed consists of the four jhānas; the brahmā bed, the four immeasureables; and the noble bed, the realization that passion, aversion, and delusion are not present in the mind and are not subject to future arising.

26. See DN 11.

27. See SN 51:13 and SN 51:20.

28. For notes on this section, see AN 4:41.

29. See MN 2.

30. See DN 22.

31. Reading *pariccheda-ñāṇaṁ* with the Thai. The Burmese edition has *paricce ñāṇaṁ,* "knowledge with regard to encompassing (the minds of others)"; the Sri Lankan edition has *pariyāye ñāṇaṁ,* "knowledge with regard to sequences."

32. See MN 28.

33. See SN 12:63–64.

34. See SN 22:53–54.

35. See AN 4:162–163.

36. See AN 4:164.

37. See MN 45.

38. See MN 140.

39. See *Skill in Questions*.

40. See AN 4:237.

41. For the eight emancipations, see the section on Eights, below.

42. See MN 11.

43. See MN 12.

44. This point apparently is related to the birth of the bodhisatta, who is said to have been alert at all three stages of the descent of the embryo. See MN 123.

45. See MN 51.

46. See AN 4:96 and AN 4:99.

47. See SN 3:21.

48. See AN 4:87–90.

49. On the distinction between aggregates and clinging-aggregates, see SN 22:48 and SN 22:121.

50. See AN 5:254–259.

51. See AN 3:88, note 3 and note 4.

52. See SN 48:38–39.

53. See SN 48:10.
54. See AN 10:60.
55. See MN 140.
56. See AN 3:71.
57. See AN 10:60.
58. See AN 7:6.
59. See SN 46:52.
60. See MN 117.
61. See MN 53 and AN 7:63.
62. See AN 7:64.
63. See AN 10:60.
64. See AN 7:63.
65. See MN 70.
66. See *The Buddhist Monastic Code*, Volume One, Chapter 11.
67. See also AN 5:34 and AN 7:49.
68. See AN 8:6.
69. Following the Burmese and Sri Lankan editions. The Thai edition reads, *nimmānarati-parisā*, "a Devas Delighting in Creation assembly," a reading that does not fit with the more authoritative reading given in all editions of DN 16.
70. See MN 44.
71. See AN 10:165.
72. See MN 2.

# *Progressing by Tens*
# *Dasuttara Sutta (DN 34)*

## Introduction

*This sutta is the second of the two long catechisms that conclude the Dīgha Nikāya. It is similar to the preceding one in that it organizes its lists in terms of the number of members they contain, from one to ten, like a miniature Aṅguttara Nikāya. It also contains much of the same material as the preceding sutta, ending with the same list: the ten factors of an arahant's path. It differs from the preceding sutta in that it further organizes its lists in terms of ten categories:*

x *dhammas that are very helpful,*

x *dhammas that should be developed,*

x *dhammas that should be comprehended,*

x *dhammas that should be abandoned,*

x *dhammas that are on the side of decline,*

x *dhammas that are on the side of distinction,*

x *dhammas that are hard to penetrate,*

x *dhammas that should be made to arise,*

x *dhammas that should be directly known,*

x *dhammas that should be realized.*

*Four of these categories are derived from the duties appropriate to the four noble truths: comprehending stress, abandoning its origination, realizing its cessation, and developing the path to its cessation.*

*Of the remaining categories, five are clearly related to these four: Dhammas that are very helpful, those on the side of distinction, those that should be made*

*to arise, and those that should be directly known come under the duty to develop. Dhammas on the side of decline come under the duty to abandon.*

*This leaves one category that is somewhat anomalous: dhammas that are hard to penetrate. Unlike the other categories, the dhammas in this category do not all perform similar functions. What they have in common is that they present difficulties: either in being hard to develop, hard to abandon, or hard to realize, or in presenting obstacles to the practice as a whole.*

*Another anomaly is the final category of lists: dhammas that should be realized. Under the four noble truths, the duty of realization falls solely to the cessation of stress and its synonyms, such as release and dispassion. Here, however, many of the lists included in this category do not restrict themselves to release or cessation, but also include step-by-step practices leading to those attainments. In other words, they include practices that, strictly speaking, belong under the category of dhammas to be developed. Also, two of these lists—the eight emancipations and the nine step-by-step cessations—conclude with the cessation of perception and feeling. Some suttas treat this attainment as a step leading inevitably to the ending of the effluents (AN 9:34; AN 9:38–40); others, such as AN 9:31–33, treat it simply as a concentration attainment. In either case, though, it is an attainment that belongs to the path, and so should be developed rather than realized.*

*This sutta also differs from the preceding one in that it contains no material from the Vinaya, and there are proportionally fewer lists that do not appear in other suttas.*

*As is the case with the preceding sutta, this sutta is hard to date. However, unlike that sutta—whose open-ended organization would have allowed succeeding generations to keep adding material to expand it—the tighter organization of this sutta suggests that it was the work of a single generation of compilers, if not a single compiler. Whether the compiler(s) lived in the time of the Buddha or after, there is no way of knowing. But here again we have a sutta that gives an interesting glimpse of what a group of monastics at a time in early Buddhist history saw as the most important of the teachings that a monk should know for his own practice, for the purpose of instructing people at large, and for passing on to succeeding generations.*

* * *

I have heard that on one occasion the Blessed One was staying near Campā on the banks of the Gaggarā Lake with a large community of monks, approximately 500 monks in all. There, Ven. Sāriputta addressed the monks, "Friend monks!"

"Yes, friend," the monks responded to him.

Ven. Sāriputta said,

> "I will teach the Dhamma
> progressing by tens,
> for attaining unbinding,
> for putting an end to suffering & stress,
> for releasing from all ties.

## Ones

"One dhamma, friends, is very helpful. One dhamma should be developed. One dhamma should be comprehended. One dhamma should be abandoned. One dhamma is on the side of decline. One dhamma is on the side of distinction. One dhamma is hard to penetrate. One dhamma should be made to arise. One dhamma should be directly known. One dhamma should be realized.

• "Which one dhamma is very helpful? Heedfulness with regard to skillful qualities: This one dhamma is very helpful.

• "Which one dhamma should be developed? Mindfulness immersed in the body connected with joy[1]: This one dhamma should be developed.

• "Which one dhamma should be comprehended? Contact accompanied by effluents & subject to clinging: This one dhamma should be comprehended.

• "Which one dhamma should be abandoned? The conceit 'I am': This one dhamma should be abandoned.

• "Which one dhamma is on the side of decline? Inappropriate attention: This one dhamma is on the side of decline.

• "Which one dhamma is on the side of distinction? Appropriate attention: This one dhamma is on the side of distinction.

• “Which one dhamma is hard to penetrate? Unmediated concentration of awareness[2]: This one dhamma is hard to penetrate.

• “Which one dhamma should be made to arise? Knowledge of the unprovoked [or: unprovoked knowledge][3]: This one dhamma should be made to arise.

• “Which one dhamma should be directly known? All beings are maintained by nutriment: This one dhamma should be directly known.

• “Which one dhamma should be realized? Unprovoked release of awareness: This one dhamma should be realized.

“These ten dhammas—true, genuine, real, not unreal, not otherwise—have been rightly awakened to by the Tathāgata.

## Twos

“Two dhammas, friends, are very helpful. Two dhammas should be developed. Two dhammas should be comprehended. Two dhammas should be abandoned. Two dhammas are on the side of decline. Two dhammas are on the side of distinction. Two dhammas are hard to penetrate. Two dhammas should be made to arise. Two dhammas should be directly known. Two dhammas should be realized.

• “Which two dhammas are very helpful? Mindfulness & alertness: These two dhammas are very helpful.

• “Which two dhammas should be developed? Tranquility & insight: These two dhammas should be developed.

• “Which two dhammas should be comprehended? Name & form: These two dhammas should be comprehended.

• “Which two dhammas should be abandoned? Ignorance & craving for becoming: These two dhammas should be abandoned.

• “Which two dhammas are on the side of decline? Being hard to instruct & evil friendship: These two dhammas are on the side of decline.

• “Which two dhammas are on the side of distinction? Being easy to instruct & admirable friendship: These two dhammas are on the side of distinction.

• "Which two dhammas are hard to penetrate? The cause & condition for the defilement of beings and the cause & condition for the purification of beings: These two dhammas are hard to penetrate.

• "Which two dhammas should be made to arise? Two knowledges: knowledge of the ending (of the effluents) & knowledge of (their) non-recurrence. These two dhammas should be made to arise.

• "Which two dhammas should be directly known? Two properties: the fabricated property & the unfabricated property.[4] These two dhammas should be directly known.

• "Which two dhammas should be realized? Clear knowing & release: These two dhammas should be realized.

"These twenty dhammas—true, genuine, real, not unreal, not otherwise—have been rightly awakened to by the Tathāgata.

### Threes

"Three dhammas, friends, are very helpful. Three dhammas should be developed. Three dhammas should be comprehended. Three dhammas should be abandoned. Three dhammas are on the side of decline. Three dhammas are on the side of distinction. Three dhammas are hard to penetrate. Three dhammas should be made to arise. Three dhammas should be directly known. Three dhammas should be realized.

• "Which three dhammas are very helpful? Associating with people of integrity, listening to the True Dhamma, practicing the Dhamma in accordance with the Dhamma: These three dhammas are very helpful.

• "Which three dhammas should be developed? Three concentrations: concentration with directed thought & evaluation, concentration without directed thought & with a modicum of evaluation, concentration without directed thought & evaluation. These three dhammas should be developed.

• "Which three dhammas should be comprehended? Three feelings: a feeling of pleasure, a feeling of pain, a feeling of neither pleasure nor pain. These three dhammas should be comprehended.

• “Which three dhammas should be abandoned? Three cravings: craving for sensuality, craving for becoming, craving for non-becoming. These three dhammas should be abandoned.

• “Which three dhammas are on the side of decline? Three roots of what is unskillful: greed as a root of what is unskillful, aversion as a root of what is unskillful, delusion as a root of what is unskillful. These three dhammas are on the side of decline.

• “Which three dhammas are on the side of distinction? Three roots of what is skillful: lack of greed as a root of what is skillful, lack of aversion as a root of what is skillful, lack of delusion as a root of what is skillful. These three dhammas are on the side of distinction.

• “Which three dhammas are hard to penetrate? Three properties for escape: This is the escape from sensuality: renunciation. This is the escape from form: the formless. As for whatever has come into being, is fabricated, & is dependently co-arisen, the escape from that is cessation. These three dhammas are hard to penetrate.

• “Which three dhammas should be made to arise? Three knowledges: knowledge of the past, knowledge of the future, & knowledge of the present. These three dhammas should be made to arise.

• “Which three dhammas should be directly known? Three properties: the property of sensuality, the property of form, the property of the formless. These three dhammas should be directly known.

• “Which three dhammas should be realized? Three forms of clear knowing: the clear knowing of the knowledge of previous lifetimes, the clear knowing of the knowledge of the passing away & arising of beings, the clear knowing of the knowledge of the ending of the effluents.[5] These three dhammas should be realized.

“These thirty dhammas—true, genuine, real, not unreal, not otherwise—have been rightly awakened to by the Tathāgata.

## Fours

"Four dhammas, friends, are very helpful. Four dhammas should be developed. Four dhammas should be comprehended. Four dhammas should be abandoned. Four dhammas are on the side of decline. Four dhammas are on the side of distinction. Four dhammas are hard to penetrate. Four dhammas should be made to arise. Four dhammas should be directly known. Four dhammas should be realized.

• "Which four dhammas are very helpful? Four wheels: living in a civilized land, associating with people of integrity, directing oneself rightly, & having done merit in the past. These four dhammas are very helpful.

• "Which four dhammas should be developed? Four establishings of mindfulness: There is the case, friends, where a monk remains focused on the body in & of itself—ardent, alert, & mindful—subduing greed & distress with reference to the world. He remains focused on feelings in & of themselves—ardent, alert, & mindful—subduing greed & distress with reference to the world. He remains focused on the mind in & of itself—ardent, alert, & mindful—subduing greed & distress with reference to the world. He remains focused on mental qualities in & of themselves—ardent, alert, & mindful—subduing greed & distress with reference to the world. These four dhammas should be developed.

• "Which four dhammas should be comprehended? Four nutriments: physical food, gross or refined; contact as the second; intellectual intention the third; and consciousness the fourth.[6] These four dhammas should be comprehended.

• "Which four dhammas should be abandoned? Four floods: the flood of sensuality, the flood of becoming, the flood of views, the flood of ignorance. These four dhammas should be abandoned.

• "Which four dhammas are on the side of decline? Four yokes: the yoke of sensuality, the yoke of becoming, the yoke of views, the yoke of ignorance. These four dhammas are on the side of decline.

• "Which four dhammas are on the side of distinction? Four unyokings: the unyoking of the yoke of sensuality, the unyoking of the yoke of becoming, the unyoking of the yoke of views, the unyoking of the yoke of ignorance. These four dhammas are on the side of distinction.

• "Which four dhammas are hard to penetrate? Four concentrations: concentration that has a share in decline, concentration that has a share in stability, concentration that has a share in distinction, concentration that has a share in penetration.[7] These four dhammas are hard to penetrate.

• "Which four dhammas should be made to arise? Four knowledges: knowledge with regard to the Dhamma, knowledge with regard to inference, knowledge with regard to encompassing (the minds of others), knowledge of conventions. These four dhammas should be made to arise.

• "Which four dhammas should be directly known? Four noble truths: the noble truth of stress, the noble truth of the origination of stress, the noble truth of the cessation of stress, the noble truth of the path of practice leading to the cessation of stress. These four dhammas should be directly known.

• "Which four dhammas should be realized? Four fruits of the contemplative life: the fruit of stream-entry, the fruit of once-returning, the fruit of non-returning, the fruit of arahantship. These four dhammas should be realized.

"These forty dhammas—true, genuine, real, not unreal, not otherwise—have been rightly awakened to by the Tathāgata.

### Fives

"Five dhammas, friends, are very helpful. Five dhammas should be developed. Five dhammas should be comprehended. Five dhammas should be abandoned. Five dhammas are on the side of decline. Five dhammas are on the side of distinction. Five dhammas are hard to penetrate. Five dhammas should be made to arise. Five dhammas should be directly known. Five dhammas should be realized.

• "Which five dhammas are very helpful? Five factors for exertion: There is the case, friends, where a monk has conviction, is convinced of the Tathāgata's awakening: 'Indeed, the Blessed One is worthy & rightly self-awakened, consummate in clear-knowing & conduct, well-gone, an expert with regard to the cosmos, unexcelled trainer of people fit to be tamed, teacher of devas & human beings, awakened, blessed.'

"He is free from illness & discomfort, endowed with good digestion—not too cold, not too hot, of moderate strength—fit for exertion.

"He is neither fraudulent nor deceitful. He declares himself to the Teacher or to his observant companions in the holy life in line with what he actually is.

"He keeps his persistence aroused for abandoning unskillful qualities & taking on skillful qualities. He is steadfast, solid in his effort, not shirking his duties with regard to skillful qualities.

"He is discerning, endowed with discernment leading to the arising of the goal—noble, penetrating, leading to the right ending of stress.

"These five dhammas are very helpful.

• "Which five dhammas should be developed? Five-factored right concentration: suffusion with rapture, suffusion with pleasure, suffusion with awareness, suffusion with light, the theme of reflection.[8] These five dhammas should be developed.

• "Which five dhammas should be comprehended? Five clinging-aggregates: the form clinging-aggregate, the feeling clinging-aggregate, the perception clinging-aggregate, the fabrication clinging-aggregate, the consciousness clinging-aggregate. These five dhammas should be comprehended.

• "Which five dhammas should be abandoned? Five hindrances: the hindrance of sensual desire, the hindrance of ill will, the hindrance of sloth & drowsiness, the hindrance of restlessness & anxiety, the hindrance of uncertainty. These five dhammas should be abandoned.

• "Which five dhammas are on the side of decline? Five mental blockages: There is the case, friends, where a monk is doubtful, uncertain, indecisive about the Teacher and is not confident in him. When a monk is doubtful, uncertain, indecisive about the Teacher and is not confident in him, then his mind doesn't tend toward ardency, commitment, perseverance, or exertion. When one's mind doesn't tend toward ardency, commitment, perseverance, or exertion, that is the first mental blockage.

"There is the case where a monk is doubtful, uncertain, indecisive about the Dhamma… about the Saṅgha… about the training…

"There is the case where a monk is angered & unhappy with his fellows in the holy life, his mind rigid & hostile. When a monk is angered & unhappy with his fellows in the holy life, his mind rigid & hostile, then his mind doesn't tend toward ardency, commitment, perseverance, or exertion. When one's mind doesn't tend toward ardency, commitment, perseverance, or exertion, that is the fifth mental blockage.

"These five dhammas are on the side of decline.

• "Which five dhammas are on the side of distinction? Five faculties: the faculty of conviction, the faculty of persistence, the faculty of mindfulness, the faculty of concentration, the faculty of discernment. These five dhammas are on the side of distinction.

• "Which five dhammas are hard to penetrate? Five properties leading to escape: There is the case, friends, where the mind of a monk, when attending to sensuality, doesn't leap up at sensuality, doesn't grow confident, steadfast, or released in sensuality. But when attending to renunciation, his mind leaps up at renunciation, grows confident, steadfast, & released in renunciation. When his mind is rightly-gone, rightly developed, has rightly risen above, gained release, & become disjoined from sensuality, then whatever effluents, torments, & fevers there are that arise in dependence on sensuality, he is released from them. He doesn't experience that feeling. This is expounded as the escape from sensuality.

"And further, there is the case where the mind of a monk, when attending to ill will, doesn't leap up at ill will, doesn't grow confident, steadfast, or released in ill will. But when attending to non-ill will, his mind leaps up at non-ill will, grows confident, steadfast, & released in non-ill will. When his mind is rightly-gone, rightly developed, has rightly risen above, gained release, & become disjoined from ill will, then whatever effluents, torments, & fevers there are that arise in dependence on ill will, he is released from them. He doesn't experience that feeling. This is expounded as the escape from ill will.

"And further, there is the case where the mind of a monk, when attending to harmfulness, doesn't leap up at harmfulness, doesn't grow confident, steadfast, or released in harmfulness. But when attending to harmlessness, his mind leaps up at harmlessness, grows confident,

steadfast, & released in harmlessness. When his mind is rightly-gone, rightly developed, has rightly risen above, gained release, & become disjoined from harmfulness, then whatever effluents, torments, & fevers there are that arise in dependence on harmfulness, he is released from them. He doesn't experience that feeling. This is expounded as the escape from harmfulness.

"And further, there is the case where the mind of a monk, when attending to forms, doesn't leap up at forms, doesn't grow confident, steadfast, or released in forms. But when attending to the formless, his mind leaps up at the formless, grows confident, steadfast, & released in the formless. When his mind is rightly-gone, rightly developed, has rightly risen above, gained release, & become disjoined from forms, then whatever effluents, torments, & fevers there are that arise in dependence on forms, he is released from them. He doesn't experience that feeling. This is expounded as the escape from forms.

"And further, there is the case where the mind of a monk, when attending to self-identification, doesn't leap up at self-identification, doesn't grow confident, steadfast, or released in self-identification. But when attending to the cessation of self-identification, his mind leaps up at the cessation of self-identification, grows confident, steadfast, & released in the cessation of self-identification. When his mind is rightly-gone, rightly developed, has rightly risen above, gained release, & become disjoined from self-identification, then whatever effluents, torments, & fevers there are that arise in dependence on self-identification, he is released from them. He doesn't experience that feeling. This is expounded as the escape from self-identification.

"These five dhammas are hard to penetrate.

• "Which five dhammas should be made to arise? Right concentration with knowledges: The knowledge arises right within oneself that 'This concentration is blissful in the present & will result in bliss in the future.'

"The knowledge arises right within oneself that 'This concentration is noble & not connected with the baits of the flesh.'

"The knowledge arises right within oneself that 'This concentration is not obtained by base people.'

"The knowledge arises right within oneself that 'This concentration is peaceful, exquisite, the acquiring of calm, the attainment of unification, not kept in place by the fabrications of forceful restraint.'

"The knowledge arises right within oneself that 'I enter into this concentration mindfully, & mindfully I emerge from it.'

"These five dhammas should be made to arise.

• "Which five dhammas should be directly known? Five openings to release: "There is the case, friends, where the Teacher or a fellow person leading the holy life teaches the Dhamma to a monk. And in whatever way the Teacher or a fellow person leading the holy life teaches the Dhamma to the monk, in just that way the monk, with regard to that Dhamma, is sensitive to the meaning, is sensitive to the Dhamma. In him —sensitive to the meaning, sensitive to the Dhamma—joy is born. When he is joyful, rapture is born. In one who is enraptured at heart, the body grows calm. When the body is calm, one feels pleasure. Feeling pleasure, the mind becomes concentrated. This is the first opening to release.

"And further, it's not that the Teacher or a fellow person leading the holy life teaches the Dhamma to the monk. But the monk teaches the Dhamma to others in detail, as he has heard it, as he has learned it. And in whatever way he teaches the Dhamma to others in detail, as he has heard it, as he has learned it, in just that way the monk, with regard to that Dhamma, is sensitive to the meaning, is sensitive to the Dhamma. In him —sensitive to the meaning, sensitive to the Dhamma—joy is born. When he is joyful, rapture is born. In one who is enraptured at heart, the body grows calm. When the body is calm, one feels pleasure. Feeling pleasure, the mind becomes concentrated. This is the second opening to release.

"And further, it's not that the Teacher or a fellow person leading the holy life teaches the Dhamma to the monk, nor does the monk teach the Dhamma to others in detail, as he has heard it, as he has learned it. But he recites the Dhamma in detail, as he has heard it, as he has learned it. In whatever way he recites the Dhamma in detail, as he has heard it, as he has learned it, in just that way the monk, with regard to that Dhamma, is sensitive to the meaning, is sensitive to the Dhamma. In him—sensitive to the meaning, sensitive to the Dhamma—joy is born. When he is joyful, rapture is born. In one who is enraptured at heart, the body grows calm.

When the body is calm, one feels pleasure. Feeling pleasure, the mind becomes concentrated. This is the third opening to release.

"And further, it's not that the Teacher or a fellow person leading the holy life teaches the Dhamma to the monk; nor does the monk teach the Dhamma to others in detail, as he has heard it, as he has learned it; nor does he recite the Dhamma in detail, as he has heard it, as he has learned it. But in his awareness he directs his thoughts to the Dhamma in detail, as he has heard it, as he has learned it; he evaluates it, & mentally examines it. In whatever way he, in his awareness, directs his thoughts to the Dhamma in detail, as he has heard it, as he has learned it, evaluates it, & mentally examines it, in just that way the monk, with regard to that Dhamma, is sensitive to the meaning, is sensitive to the Dhamma. In him —sensitive to the meaning, sensitive to the Dhamma—joy is born. When he is joyful, rapture is born. In one who is enraptured at heart, the body grows calm. When the body is calm, one feels pleasure. Feeling pleasure, the mind becomes concentrated. This is the fourth opening to release.

"And further, it's not that the Teacher or a fellow person leading the holy life teaches the Dhamma to the monk; nor does the monk teach the Dhamma to others in detail, as he has heard it, as he has learned it; nor does he recite the Dhamma in detail, as he has heard it, as he has learned it; nor does he, in his awareness, direct his thoughts to the Dhamma in detail, as he has heard it, as he has learned it, evaluate it, or mentally examine it. But he has well grasped a certain theme of concentration, has attended to it well, sustained it well, has penetrated it well with discernment. In whatever way he has well grasped a certain theme of concentration, has attended to it well, sustained it well, has penetrated it well with discernment, in just that way the monk, with regard to that Dhamma, is sensitive to the meaning, is sensitive to the Dhamma. In him —sensitive to the meaning, sensitive to the Dhamma—joy is born. When he is joyful, rapture is born. In one who is enraptured at heart, the body grows calm. When the body is calm, one feels pleasure. Feeling pleasure, the mind becomes concentrated. This is the fifth opening to release.

"These five dhammas should be directly known.

• "Which five dhammas should be realized? Five dhamma aggregates: the aggregate of virtue, the aggregate of concentration, the aggregate of

discernment, the aggregate of release, the aggregate of knowledge & vision of release. These five dhammas should be realized.

"These fifty dhammas—true, genuine, real, not unreal, not otherwise—have been rightly awakened to by the Tathāgata.

## Sixes

"Six dhammas, friends, are very helpful. Six dhammas should be developed. Six dhammas should be comprehended. Six dhammas should be abandoned. Six dhammas are on the side of decline. Six dhammas are on the side of distinction. Six dhammas are hard to penetrate. Six dhammas should be made to arise. Six dhammas should be directly known. Six dhammas should be realized.

• "Which six dhammas are very helpful? Six conditions conducive to amiability: There is the case, friends, where a monk is set on bodily acts of goodwill with regard to his companions in the holy life, to their faces & behind their backs. This is a condition that is conducive to amiability, that engenders feelings of endearment, engenders feelings of respect, leading to a sense of fellowship, a lack of disputes, harmony, & a state of unity.

"And further, the monk is set on verbal acts of goodwill with regard to his companions in the holy life, to their faces & behind their backs. This, too, is a condition that is conducive to amiability, that engenders feelings of endearment, engenders feelings of respect, leading to a sense of fellowship, a lack of disputes, harmony, & a state of unity.

"And further, the monk is set on mental acts of goodwill with regard to his companions in the holy life, to their faces & behind their backs. This, too, is a condition that is conducive to amiability, that engenders feelings of endearment, engenders feelings of respect, leading to a sense of fellowship, a lack of disputes, harmony, & a state of unity.

"And further, whatever righteous gains the monk may obtain in a righteous way—even if only the alms in his bowl—he does not consume them alone. He consumes them after sharing them in common with his virtuous companions in the holy life. This, too, is a condition that is conducive to amiability, that engenders feelings of endearment, engenders

feelings of respect, leading to a sense of fellowship, a lack of disputes, harmony, & a state of unity.

"And further—with reference to the virtues that are untorn, unbroken, unspotted, unsplattered, liberating, praised by the observant, ungrasped at, leading to concentration—the monk dwells with his virtue in tune with that of his companions in the holy life, to their faces & behind their backs. This, too, is a condition that is conducive to amiability, that engenders feelings of endearment, engenders feelings of respect, leading to a sense of fellowship, a lack of disputes, harmony, & a state of unity.

"And further—with reference to the view that is noble, leading outward, that leads those who act in accordance with it to the right ending of suffering & stress—the monk dwells with his view in tune with that of his companions in the holy life, to their faces & behind their backs. This, too, is a condition that is conducive to amiability, that engenders feelings of endearment, engenders feelings of respect, leading to a sense of fellowship, a lack of disputes, harmony, & a state of unity.

"These six dhammas are very helpful.

• "Which six dhammas should be developed? Six objects of recollection: recollection of the Buddha, recollection of the Dhamma, recollection of the Saṅgha, recollection of virtue, recollection of generosity, recollection of the devas.[2] These six dhammas should be developed.

• "Which six dhammas should be comprehended? Six internal sense media: the eye as a sense medium, the ear as a sense medium, the nose as a sense medium, the tongue as a sense medium, the body as a sense medium, the intellect as a sense medium. These six dhammas should be comprehended.

• "Which six dhammas should be abandoned? Six classes of craving: craving for forms, craving for sounds, craving for aromas, craving for flavors, craving for tactile sensations, craving for ideas. These six dhammas should be abandoned.

• "Which six dhammas are on the side of decline? Six types of disrespect: There is the case, friends, where a monk dwells without respect or deference for the Teacher… for the Dhamma… for the Saṅgha… for

the training… for heedfulness… for welcoming manners. These six dhammas are on the side of decline.

• "Which six dhammas are on the side of distinction? Six types of respect: There is the case, friends, where a monk dwells with respect & deference for the Teacher… for the Dhamma… for the Saṅgha… for the training… for heedfulness… for welcoming manners. These six dhammas are on the side of distinction.

• "Which six dhammas are hard to penetrate? Six properties that are means of escape: There is the case, friends, where a monk might say, 'Although goodwill has been developed, pursued, handed the reins, taken as a basis, steadied, consolidated, & well undertaken by me as my awareness-release, still ill will keeps overpowering my mind.' He should be told, 'Don't say that. You shouldn't speak in that way. Don't misrepresent the Blessed One, for it's not right to misrepresent the Blessed One, and the Blessed One wouldn't say that. It's impossible, there is no way that—when goodwill has been developed, pursued, handed the reins, taken as a basis, steadied, consolidated, & well undertaken as an awareness-release—ill will would still keep overpowering the mind. That possibility doesn't exist, for this is the escape from ill will: goodwill as an awareness-release.'

"And further, there is the case where a monk might say, 'Although compassion has been developed, pursued, handed the reins, taken as a basis, steadied, consolidated, & well undertaken by me as my awareness-release, still harmfulness keeps overpowering my mind.' He should be told, 'Don't say that. You shouldn't speak in that way. Don't misrepresent the Blessed One, for it's not right to misrepresent the Blessed One, and the Blessed One wouldn't say that. It's impossible, there is no way that—when compassion has been developed, pursued, handed the reins, taken as a basis, steadied, consolidated, & well undertaken as an awareness-release—harmfulness would still keep overpowering the mind. That possibility doesn't exist, for this is the escape from harmfulness: compassion as an awareness-release.'

"And further, there is the case where a monk might say, 'Although empathetic joy has been developed, pursued, handed the reins, taken as a basis, steadied, consolidated, & well undertaken by me as my awareness-release, still resentment keeps overpowering my mind.' He should be told,

'Don't say that. You shouldn't speak in that way. Don't misrepresent the Blessed One, for it's not right to misrepresent the Blessed One, and the Blessed One wouldn't say that. It's impossible, there is no way that—when empathetic joy has been developed, pursued, handed the reins, taken as a basis, steadied, consolidated, & well undertaken as an awareness-release—resentment would still keep overpowering the mind. That possibility doesn't exist, for this is the escape from resentment: empathetic joy as an awareness-release.'

"And further, there is the case where a monk might say, 'Although equanimity has been developed, pursued, handed the reins, taken as a basis, steadied, consolidated, & well undertaken by me as my awareness-release, still passion keeps overpowering my mind.' He should be told, 'Don't say that. You shouldn't speak in that way. Don't misrepresent the Blessed One, for it's not right to misrepresent the Blessed One, and the Blessed One wouldn't say that. It's impossible, there is no way that—when equanimity has been developed, pursued, handed the reins, taken as a basis, steadied, consolidated, & well undertaken as an awareness-release—passion would still keep overpowering the mind. That possibility doesn't exist, for this is the escape from passion: equanimity as an awareness-release.'

"And further, there is the case where a monk might say, 'Although the signless has been developed, pursued, handed the reins, taken as a basis, steadied, consolidated, & well undertaken by me as my awareness-release, still my consciousness follows the drift of signs.' He should be told, 'Don't say that. You shouldn't speak in that way. Don't misrepresent the Blessed One, for it's not right to misrepresent the Blessed One, and the Blessed One wouldn't say that. It's impossible, there is no way that—when the signless has been developed, pursued, handed the reins, taken as a basis, steadied, consolidated, & well undertaken as an awareness-release—consciousness would follow the drift of signs. That possibility doesn't exist, for this is the escape from all signs: the signless as an awareness-release.'

"And further, there is the case where a monk might say, 'Although "I am" is gone, and I do not assume that "I am this," still the arrow of uncertainty & perplexity keeps overpowering my mind.' He should be told, 'Don't say that. You shouldn't speak in that way. Don't misrepresent

the Blessed One, for it's not right to misrepresent the Blessed One, and the Blessed One wouldn't say that. It's impossible, there is no way that—when "I am" is gone, and "I am this" is not assumed—the arrow of uncertainty & perplexity would keep overpowering the mind. That possibility doesn't exist, for this is the escape from the arrow of uncertainty & perplexity: the uprooting of the conceit, "I am".

"These six dhammas are hard to penetrate.

• "Which six dhammas should be made to arise? Six persevering dwellings: There is the case, friends, where a monk, on seeing a form via the eye, is neither gladdened nor saddened, but remains equanimous, mindful, & alert. On hearing a sound via the ear… On smelling an aroma via the nose… On tasting a flavor via the tongue… On sensing a tactile sensation via the body… On cognizing an idea via the intellect, he is neither gladdened nor saddened, but remains equanimous, mindful, & alert. These six dhammas should be made to arise.

• "Which six dhammas should be directly known? Six things that are unsurpassed: unsurpassed vision, unsurpassed hearing, unsurpassed gains, unsurpassed trainings, unsurpassed service, unsurpassed objects of recollection. These six dhammas should be directly known.

• "Which six dhammas should be realized? Six direct knowledges: There is the case, friends, where a monk wields manifold supranormal powers. Having been one he becomes many; having been many he becomes one. He appears. He vanishes. He goes unimpeded through walls, ramparts, and mountains as if through space. He dives in and out of the earth as if it were water. He walks on water without sinking as if it were dry land. Sitting cross-legged he flies through the air like a winged bird. With his hand he touches and strokes even the sun and moon, so mighty and powerful. He exercises influence with his body even as far as the Brahmā worlds.

"He hears—by means of the divine ear-element, purified & surpassing the human—both kinds of sounds: divine & human, whether near or far.

"He discerns the awareness of other beings, other individuals, having encompassed it with his own awareness. He discerns a mind with passion as 'a mind with passion,' and a mind without passion as 'a mind without passion.' He discerns a mind with aversion as 'a mind with aversion,' and a

mind without aversion as 'a mind without aversion.' He discerns a mind with delusion as 'a mind with delusion,' and a mind without delusion as 'a mind without delusion.' He discerns a restricted mind as 'a restricted mind,' and a scattered mind as 'a scattered mind.' He discerns an enlarged mind as 'an enlarged mind,' and an unenlarged mind as 'an unenlarged mind.' He discerns a surpassed mind [one that is not at the most excellent level] as 'a surpassed mind,' and an unsurpassed mind as 'an unsurpassed mind.' He discerns a concentrated mind as 'a concentrated mind,' and an unconcentrated mind as 'an unconcentrated mind.' He discerns a released mind as 'a released mind,' and an unreleased mind as 'an unreleased mind.'

"He recollects his manifold past lives, i.e., one birth, two births, three births, four, five, ten, twenty, thirty, forty, fifty, one hundred, one thousand, one hundred thousand, many eons of cosmic contraction, many eons of cosmic expansion, many eons of cosmic contraction & expansion, (recollecting,) 'There I had such a name, belonged to such a clan, had such an appearance. Such was my food, such my experience of pleasure & pain, such the end of my life. Passing away from that state, I re-arose there. There too I had such a name, belonged to such a clan, had such an appearance. Such was my food, such my experience of pleasure & pain, such the end of my life. Passing away from that state, I re-arose here.' Thus he recollects his manifold past lives in their modes & details.

"He sees—by means of the divine eye, purified and surpassing the human—beings passing away & re-appearing, and he discerns how they are inferior & superior, beautiful & ugly, fortunate & unfortunate in accordance with their kamma: 'These beings—who were endowed with bad conduct of body, speech, & mind, who reviled the noble ones, held wrong views and undertook actions under the influence of wrong views—with the break-up of the body, after death, have re-appeared in a plane of deprivation, a bad destination, a lower realm, hell. But these beings—who were endowed with good conduct of body, speech, & mind, who did not revile the noble ones, who held right views and undertook actions under the influence of right views—with the break-up of the body, after death, have re-appeared in a good destination, a heavenly world.' Thus—by means of the divine eye, purified & surpassing the human—he sees beings passing away & re-appearing, and he discerns how they are inferior

& superior, beautiful & ugly, fortunate & unfortunate in accordance with their kamma.

"Through the ending of the effluents, he enters & remains in the effluent-free awareness-release & discernment-release, having directly known & realized them for himself right in the here-&-now.

"These six dhammas should be realized.

"These sixty dhammas—true, genuine, real, not unreal, not otherwise—have been rightly awakened to by the Tathāgata.

## Sevens

"Seven dhammas, friends, are very helpful. Seven dhammas should be developed. Seven dhammas should be comprehended. Seven dhammas should be abandoned. Seven dhammas are on the side of decline. Seven dhammas are on the side of distinction. Seven dhammas are hard to penetrate. Seven dhammas should be made to arise. Seven dhammas should be directly known. Seven dhammas should be realized.

• "Which seven dhammas are very helpful? Seven noble treasures: the treasure of conviction, the treasure of virtue, the treasure of a sense of shame, the treasure of a sense of compunction, the treasure of listening, the treasure of generosity, the treasure of discernment.[10] These seven dhammas are very helpful.

• "Which seven dhammas should be developed? Seven factors for awakening: mindfulness as a factor for awakening, analysis of qualities as a factor for awakening, persistence as a factor for awakening, rapture as a factor for awakening, calm as a factor for awakening, concentration as a factor for awakening, equanimity as a factor for awakening.[11] These seven dhammas should be developed.

• "Which seven dhammas should be comprehended? Seven stations of consciousness: Friends, there are beings with multiplicity of body & multiplicity of perception, such as human beings, some devas, & some beings in the lower realms. This is the first station of consciousness.

"There are beings with multiplicity of body & singularity of perception, such as the devas of Brahmā's retinue generated by the first

(jhāna). This is the second station of consciousness.

"There are beings with singularity of body & multiplicity of perception, such as the Radiant Devas. This is the third station of consciousness.

"There are beings with singularity of body & singularity of perception, such as the Beautiful Black Devas. This is the fourth station of consciousness.

"There are beings who, with the complete transcending of perceptions of (physical) form, with the disappearance of perceptions of resistance, and not attending to perceptions of multiplicity, (perceiving,) 'Infinite space,' arrive at the dimension of the infinitude of space. This is the fifth station of consciousness.

"There are beings who, with the complete transcending of the dimension of the infinitude of space, (perceiving,) 'Infinite consciousness,' arrive at the dimension of the infinitude of consciousness. This is the sixth station of consciousness.

"There are beings who, with the complete transcending of the dimension of the infinitude of consciousness, (perceiving,) 'There is nothing,' arrive at the dimension of nothingness. This is the seventh station of consciousness.

"These seven dhammas should be comprehended.

• "Which seven dhammas should be abandoned? Seven obsessions: the obsession of sensual passion, the obsession of resistance, the obsession of views, the obsession of uncertainty, the obsession of conceit, the obsession of passion for becoming, the obsession of ignorance. These seven dhammas should be abandoned.

• "Which seven dhammas are on the side of decline? Seven untrue dhammas: There is the case, friends, where a monk is without conviction, without a sense of shame, without compunction, without learning, lazy, one of muddled truth, & undiscerning. These seven dhammas are on the side of decline.

• "Which seven dhammas are on the side of distinction? Seven true dhammas: There is the case, friends, where a monk has conviction, a sense of shame, compunction, learning, and is one of aroused persistence,

established mindfulness, & discerning.[12] These seven dhammas are on the side of distinction.

• "Which seven dhammas are hard to penetrate? Seven qualities of a person of integrity: There is the case, friends, where a monk is one with a sense of Dhamma, a sense of meaning, a sense of himself, a sense of moderation, a sense of time, a sense of social gatherings, & a sense of distinctions among individuals.[13] These seven dhammas are hard to penetrate.

• "Which seven dhammas should be made to arise? Seven perceptions: the perception of inconstancy, the perception of not-self, the perception of unattractiveness, the perception of drawbacks, the perception of abandoning, the perception of dispassion, the perception of cessation.[14] These seven dhammas should be made to arise.

• "Which seven dhammas should be directly known? Seven grounds for praise: There is the case, friends, where a monk has keen desire to undertake the training & has not discarded his love for undertaking the training in the future. He has keen desire to attend carefully to the Dhamma… to subdue his wants… to find solitude… to arouse persistence… to be mindful & adept… to penetrate (right) view & has not discarded his love for penetrating (right) view in the future. These seven dhammas should be directly known.

• "Which seven dhammas should be realized? Seven strengths of one whose effluents are ended: There is the case, friends, where—for a monk whose effluents are ended—the inconstancy of all fabrications is well seen, as it has come to be, with right discernment. The fact that—for a monk whose effluents are ended—the inconstancy of all fabrications is well seen, as it has come to be, with right discernment is a strength of a monk whose effluents are ended by which he knows, 'My effluents are ended.'

"And further, for a monk whose effluents are ended, sensuality is well seen, as it has come to be, with right discernment, as being like a pit of burning embers…

"And further, the heart of a monk whose effluents are ended is bent on seclusion, inclines to seclusion, slopes toward seclusion, delights in

renunciation, and is entirely done with the things that would act as causes for the effluents.…

"And further, for a monk whose effluents are ended, the four establishings of mindfulness are developed, well developed.…

"And further, for a monk whose effluents are ended, the five faculties are developed, well developed.…

"And further, for a monk whose effluents are ended, the seven factors for awakening are developed, well developed.…

"And further, for a monk whose effluents are ended, the noble eightfold path is developed, well developed. The fact that—for a monk whose effluents are ended—the noble eightfold path is developed, well developed, is a strength of a monk whose effluents are ended by which he knows, 'My effluents are ended.'

"These seven dhammas should be realized.

"These seventy dhammas—true, genuine, real, not unreal, not otherwise—have been rightly awakened to by the Tathāgata.

### Eights

"Eight dhammas, friends, are very helpful. Eight dhammas should be developed. Eight dhammas should be comprehended. Eight dhammas should be abandoned. Eight dhammas are on the side of decline. Eight dhammas are on the side of distinction. Eight dhammas are hard to penetrate. Eight dhammas should be made to arise. Eight dhammas should be directly known. Eight dhammas should be realized.

• "Which eight dhammas are very helpful? Eight causes, eight requisite conditions lead to the acquiring of the as-yet-unacquired discernment that is basic to the holy life, and to the increase, plenitude, development, & culmination of that which has already been acquired. Which eight?

"There is the case, friends, where a monk lives in apprenticeship to the Teacher or to a respectable companion in the holy life in whom he has established a strong sense of shame & compunction, love, & respect. This, monks, is the first cause, the first requisite condition that leads to the acquiring of the as-yet-unacquired discernment that is basic to the holy

life, and to the increase, plenitude, development, & culmination of that which has already been acquired.

"As he lives in apprenticeship under the Teacher or under a respectable companion in the holy life in whom he has established a strong sense of shame & compunction, love, & respect, he approaches him at the appropriate times to quiz & cross-question him: 'What, venerable sir, is the meaning of this statement?' He [the Teacher or the respectable companion in the holy life] reveals what is hidden, makes plain what is obscure, and dispels perplexity in many kinds of perplexing things. This is the second cause, the second requisite condition…

"Having heard the Dhamma, he [the student] achieves a twofold seclusion: seclusion in body & seclusion in mind. This is the third cause, the third requisite condition…

"He is virtuous. He dwells restrained in accordance with the Pāṭimokkha, consummate in his behavior & sphere of activity. He trains himself, having undertaken the training rules, seeing danger in the slightest faults. This is the fourth cause, the fourth requisite condition…

"He has heard much, has retained what he has heard, has stored what he has heard. Whatever teachings are admirable in the beginning, admirable in the middle, admirable in the end, that—in their meaning & expression—proclaim the holy life that is entirely perfect, surpassingly pure: Those he has listened to often, retained, discussed, accumulated, examined with his mind, & well penetrated in terms of his views. This is the fifth cause, the fifth requisite condition…

"He keeps his persistence aroused for abandoning unskillful qualities and for taking on skillful qualities. He is steadfast, solid in his effort, not shirking his duties with regard to skillful qualities. This is the sixth cause, the sixth requisite condition…

"When he is in the midst of the Saṅgha he doesn't talk on & on about a variety of things. Either he speaks Dhamma himself or he invites another to do so, and he feels no disdain for noble silence.[15] This is the seventh cause, the seventh requisite condition…

"He remains focused on arising & passing away with regard to the five aggregates: 'Such is form, such its origination, such its disappearance.

Such is feeling… Such is perception… Such are fabrications… Such is consciousness, such its origination, such its disappearance.' This, monks, is the eighth cause, the eighth requisite condition that leads to the acquiring of the as-yet-unacquired discernment that is basic to the holy life, and to the increase, plenitude, development, & culmination of that which has already been acquired.[16]

"These eight dhammas are very helpful.

• "Which eight dhammas should be developed? The noble eightfold path, i.e., right view, right resolve, right speech, right action, right livelihood, right effort, right mindfulness, right concentration.[17] These eight dhammas should be developed.

• "Which eight dhammas should be comprehended? Eight worldly conditions: gain, loss, status, disgrace, censure, praise, pleasure, pain. These eight dhammas should be comprehended.[18]

• "Which eight dhammas should be abandoned? Eight forms of wrongness: wrong view, wrong resolve, wrong speech, wrong action, wrong livelihood, wrong effort, wrong mindfulness, wrong concentration. These eight dhammas should be abandoned.

• "Which eight dhammas are on the side of decline? Eight grounds for laziness: There is the case, friends, where a monk has some work to do. The thought occurs to him: 'I will have to do this work. But when I have done this work, my body will be tired. Why don't I lie down?' So he lies down. He doesn't make an effort for the attaining of the as-yet-unattained, the reaching of the as-yet-unreached, the realization of the as-yet-unrealized. This is the first ground for laziness.

"Then there is the case where a monk has done some work. The thought occurs to him: 'I have done some work. Now that I have done work, my body is tired. Why don't I lie down?' So he lies down. He doesn't make an effort for the attaining of the as-yet-unattained, the reaching of the as-yet-unreached, the realization of the as-yet-unrealized. This is the second ground for laziness.

"Then there is the case where a monk has to go on a journey. The thought occurs to him: 'I will have to go on this journey. But when I have gone on the journey, my body will be tired. Why don't I lie down?' So he

lies down. He doesn't make an effort for the attaining of the as-yet-unattained, the reaching of the as-yet-unreached, the realization of the as-yet-unrealized. This is the third ground for laziness.

"Then there is the case where a monk has gone on a journey. The thought occurs to him: 'I have gone on a journey. Now that I have gone on a journey, my body is tired. Why don't I lie down?' So he lies down. He doesn't make an effort for the attaining of the as-yet-unattained, the reaching of the as-yet-unreached, the realization of the as-yet-unrealized. This is the fourth ground for laziness.

"Then there is the case where a monk, having gone for alms in a village or town, does not get as much coarse or refined food as he would like for his fill. The thought occurs to him: 'I, having gone for alms in a village or town, have not gotten as much coarse or refined food as I would like for my fill. This body of mine is tired & unsuitable for work. Why don't I lie down?' So he lies down. He doesn't make an effort for the attaining of the as-yet-unattained, the reaching of the as-yet-unreached, the realization of the as-yet-unrealized. This is the fifth ground for laziness.

"Then there is the case where a monk, having gone for alms in a village or town, gets as much coarse or refined food as he would like for his fill. The thought occurs to him: 'I, having gone for alms in a village or town, have gotten as much coarse or refined food as I would like for my fill. This body of mine is heavy & unsuitable for work—stuffed with beans, as it were. Why don't I lie down?' So he lies down. He doesn't make an effort for the attaining of the as-yet-unattained, the reaching of the as-yet-unreached, the realization of the as-yet-unrealized. This is the sixth ground for laziness.

"Then there is the case where a monk comes down with a slight illness. The thought occurs to him: 'I have come down with a slight illness. There's a need to lie down.' So he lies down. He doesn't make an effort for the attaining of the as-yet-unattained, the reaching of the as-yet-unreached, the realization of the as-yet-unrealized. This is the seventh ground for laziness.

"Then there is the case where a monk has recovered from his illness, not long after his recovery. The thought occurs to him: 'I have recovered from my illness. It's not long after my recovery. This body of mine is weak

& unsuitable for work. Why don't I lie down?' So he lies down. He doesn't make an effort for the attaining of the as-yet-unattained, the reaching of the as-yet-unreached, the realization of the as-yet-unrealized. This is the eighth ground for laziness.

"These eight dhammas are on the side of decline.

• "Which eight dhammas are on the side of distinction? Eight grounds for the arousal of energy: There is the case, friends, where a monk has some work to do. The thought occurs to him: 'I will have to do this work. But when I am doing this work, it will not be easy to attend to the Buddha's message. Why don't I make an effort beforehand for the attaining of the as-yet-unattained, the reaching of the as-yet-unreached, the realization of the as-yet-unrealized?' So he makes an effort for the attaining of the as-yet-unattained, the reaching of the as-yet-unreached, the realization of the as-yet-unrealized. This is the first ground for the arousal of energy.

"Then there is the case where a monk has done some work. The thought occurs to him: 'I have done some work. While I was doing work, I couldn't attend to the Buddha's message. Why don't I make an effort for the attaining of the as-yet-unattained, the reaching of the as-yet-unreached, the realization of the as-yet-unrealized?' So he makes an effort for the attaining of the as-yet-unattained, the reaching of the as-yet-unreached, the realization of the as-yet-unrealized. This is the second ground for the arousal of energy.

"Then there is the case where a monk has to go on a journey. The thought occurs to him: 'I will have to go on this journey. But when I am going on the journey, it will not be easy to attend to the Buddha's message. Why don't I make an effort beforehand for the attaining of the as-yet-unattained, the reaching of the as-yet-unreached, the realization of the as-yet-unrealized?' So he makes an effort for the attaining of the as-yet-unattained, the reaching of the as-yet-unreached, the realization of the as-yet-unrealized. This is the third ground for the arousal of energy.

"Then there is the case where a monk has gone on a journey. The thought occurs to him: 'I have gone on a journey. While I was going on the journey, I couldn't attend to the Buddha's message. Why don't I make an effort for the attaining of the as-yet-unattained, the reaching of the as-

yet-unreached, the realization of the as-yet-unrealized?' So he makes an effort for the attaining of the as-yet-unattained, the reaching of the as-yet-unreached, the realization of the as-yet-unrealized. This is the fourth ground for the arousal of energy.

"Then there is the case where a monk, having gone for alms in a village or town, does not get as much coarse or refined food as he would like for his fill. The thought occurs to him: 'I, having gone for alms in a village or town, have not gotten as much coarse or refined food as I would like for my fill. This body of mine is light & suitable for work. Why don't I make an effort for the attaining of the as-yet-unattained, the reaching of the as-yet-unreached, the realization of the as-yet-unrealized?' So he makes an effort for the attaining of the as-yet-unattained, the reaching of the as-yet-unreached, the realization of the as-yet-unrealized. This is the fifth ground for the arousal of energy.

"Then there is the case where a monk, having gone for alms in a village or town, gets as much coarse or refined food as he would like for his fill. The thought occurs to him: 'I, having gone for alms in a village or town, have gotten as much coarse or refined food as I would like for my fill. This body of mine is light & suitable for work. Why don't I make an effort for the attaining of the as-yet-unattained, the reaching of the as-yet-unreached, the realization of the as-yet-unrealized?' So he makes an effort for the attaining of the as-yet-unattained, the reaching of the as-yet-unreached, the realization of the as-yet-unrealized. This is the sixth ground for the arousal of energy.

"Then there is the case where a monk comes down with a slight illness. The thought occurs to him: 'I have come down with a slight illness. Now, there's the possibility that it could get worse. Why don't I make an effort beforehand for the attaining of the as-yet-unattained, the reaching of the as-yet-unreached, the realization of the as-yet-unrealized?' So he makes an effort for the attaining of the as-yet-unattained, the reaching of the as-yet-unreached, the realization of the as-yet-unrealized. This is the seventh ground for the arousal of energy.

"Then there is the case where a monk has recovered from his illness, not long after his recovery. The thought occurs to him: 'I have recovered from my illness. It's not long after my recovery. Now, there's the

possibility that the illness could come back. Why don't I make an effort beforehand for the attaining of the as-yet-unattained, the reaching of the as-yet-unreached, the realization of the as-yet-unrealized?' So he makes an effort for the attaining of the as-yet-unattained, the reaching of the as-yet-unreached, the realization of the as-yet-unrealized. This is the eighth ground for the arousal of energy.

"These eight dhammas are on the side of distinction.

• "Which eight dhammas are hard to penetrate? Eight inopportune, untimely situations for leading the holy life: There is the case, friends, where a Tathāgata appears in the world, worthy & rightly self-awakened. The Dhamma is taught that leads to stilling, to total unbinding, to self-awakening as declared by One Well-gone. But this person is reborn in hell. This is the first inopportune, untimely situation for leading the holy life.

"And further, there is the case where a Tathāgata appears in the world… but this person is reborn in an animal womb… in the realm of the hungry ghosts… in a certain host of long-lived devas… or he is born in a border region among ignorant barbarians where there is no opening for monks, nuns, male lay followers, or female lay followers to go.…

"Or he is born in the Middle Country [the middle Ganges Valley] but he has wrong views & skewed vision: 'There is nothing given, nothing offered, nothing sacrificed. There is no fruit or result of good or bad actions. There is no this world, no next world, no mother, no father; there are no spontaneously reborn beings; there are no contemplatives or brahmans who, faring rightly & practicing rightly, proclaim this world & the next after having directly known & realized it for themselves.' …

"Or he is born in the Middle Country but he is undiscerning, dull, drooling, incapable of knowing the meaning of what is well-said or ill-said. This is the seventh inopportune, untimely situation for leading the holy life.

"And further, a Tathāgata does not appear in the world, worthy & rightly self-awakened. The Dhamma is not taught that leads to stilling, to total unbinding, to self-awakening as declared by One Well-gone. This person is born in the Middle Country and is discerning, not dull, not drooling, capable of knowing the meaning of what is well-said or ill-said.

This is the eighth inopportune, untimely situation for leading the holy life.[19]

"These eight dhammas are hard to penetrate.

• "Which eight dhammas should be made to arise? Eight thoughts of a great person: 'This Dhamma is for one who is modest, not for one who is self-aggrandizing. This Dhamma is for one who is content, not for one who is discontent. This Dhamma is for one who is reclusive, not for one who is entangled. This Dhamma is for one whose persistence is aroused, not for one who is lazy. This Dhamma is for one whose mindfulness is established, not for one whose mindfulness is confused. This Dhamma is for one whose mind is concentrated, not for one whose mind is unconcentrated. This Dhamma is for one endowed with discernment, not for one whose discernment is weak. This Dhamma is for one who enjoys non-objectification, who delights in non-objectification, not for one who enjoys & delights in objectification.'[20]

"These eight dhammas should be made to arise.

• "Which eight dhammas should be directly known? Eight dimensions of (mental) mastery: One percipient of form internally sees forms externally as limited, beautiful & ugly. Mastering them, he is percipient of 'I know; I see.' This is the first dimension of (mental) mastery.

"One percipient of form internally sees forms externally as immeasurable, beautiful & ugly. Mastering them, he is percipient of 'I know; I see.' This is the second dimension of (mental) mastery.

"One percipient of the formless internally sees forms externally as limited, beautiful & ugly. Mastering them, he is percipient of 'I know; I see.' This is the third dimension of (mental) mastery.

"One percipient of the formless internally sees forms externally as immeasurable, beautiful & ugly. Mastering them, he is percipient of 'I know; I see.' This is the fourth dimension of (mental) mastery.

"One percipient of the formless internally sees forms externally as blue, blue in their color, blue in their features, blue in their glow. Just as a flax-flower is blue, blue in its color, blue in its features, blue in its glow, or just as Vārāṇasī muslin, smooth on both sides, is blue, blue in its color, blue in its features, blue in its glow, in the same way one percipient of the

formless internally sees forms externally as blue, blue in their color, blue in their features, blue in their glow. Mastering them, he is percipient of 'I know; I see.' This is the fifth dimension of (mental) mastery.

"One percipient of the formless internally sees forms externally as yellow, yellow in their color, yellow in their features, yellow in their glow. Just as a kaṇṇikāra-flower is yellow, yellow in its color, yellow in its features, yellow in its glow, or just as Vārāṇasī muslin, smooth on both sides, is yellow, yellow in its color, yellow in its features, yellow in its glow, in the same way one percipient of the formless internally sees forms externally as yellow, yellow in their color, yellow in their features, yellow in their glow. Mastering them, he is percipient of 'I know; I see.' This is the sixth dimension of (mental) mastery.

"One percipient of the formless internally sees forms externally as red, red in their color, red in their features, red in their glow. Just as a bandhajīvaka-flower is red, red in its color, red in its features, red in its glow, or just as Vārāṇasī muslin, smooth on both sides, is red, red in its color, red in its features, red in its glow, in the same way one percipient of the formless internally sees forms externally as red, red in their color, red in their features, red in their glow. Mastering them, he is percipient of 'I know; I see.' This is the seventh dimension of (mental) mastery.

"One percipient of the formless internally sees forms externally as white, white in their color, white in their features, white in their glow. Just as the morning star is white, white in its color, white in its features, white in its glow, or just as Vārāṇasī muslin, smooth on both sides, is white, white in its color, white in its features, white in its glow, in the same way one percipient of the formless internally sees forms externally as white, white in their color, white in their features, white in their glow. Mastering them, he is percipient of 'I know; I see.' This is the eighth dimension of (mental) mastery.

"These eight dhammas should be directly known.

• "Which eight dhammas should be realized? Eight emancipations: Possessed of form, one sees forms. This is the first emancipation.

"Not percipient of form internally, one sees forms externally. This is the second emancipation.

"One is intent only on the beautiful. This is the third emancipation.

"With the complete transcending of perceptions of (physical) form, with the disappearance of perceptions of resistance, and not attending to perceptions of multiplicity, (perceiving,) 'Infinite space,' one enters & remains in the dimension of the infinitude of space. This is the fourth emancipation.

"With the complete transcending of the dimension of the infinitude of space, (perceiving,) 'Infinite consciousness,' one enters & remains in the dimension of the infinitude of consciousness. This is the fifth emancipation.

"With the complete transcending of the dimension of the infinitude of consciousness, (perceiving,) 'There is nothing,' one enters & remains in the dimension of nothingness. This is the sixth emancipation.

"With the complete transcending of the dimension of nothingness, one enters & remains in the dimension of neither perception nor non-perception. This is the seventh emancipation.

"With the complete transcending of the dimension of neither perception nor non-perception, one enters & remains in the cessation of perception and feeling. This is the eighth emancipation.

"These eight dhammas should be realized.

"These eighty dhammas—true, genuine, real, not unreal, not otherwise—have been rightly awakened to by the Tathāgata.

## Nines

"Nine dhammas, friends, are very helpful. Nine dhammas should be developed. Nine dhammas should be comprehended. Nine dhammas should be abandoned. Nine dhammas are on the side of decline. Nine dhammas are on the side of distinction. Nine dhammas are hard to penetrate. Nine dhammas should be made to arise. Nine dhammas should be directly known. Nine dhammas should be realized.

• "Which nine dhammas are very helpful? Nine dhammas rooted in appropriate attention: In one who is appropriately attentive, joy is born. When one is joyful, rapture is born. In one who is enraptured at heart, the

body grows calm. When the body is calm, one feels pleasure. Feeling pleasure, the mind becomes concentrated. When the mind is concentrated, one knows & sees what has come to be. Knowing & seeing what has come to be, one is disenchanted. Disenchanted, one becomes dispassionate. From dispassion, one is released.

"These nine dhammas are very helpful.

• "Which nine dhammas should be developed? Nine factors of exertion for full purity: the purity-of-virtue factor of exertion for full purity, the purity-of-mind [concentration] factor of exertion for full purity, the purity-of-view factor of exertion for full purity, the purity-of-overcoming-doubt factor of exertion for full purity, the purity-of-knowledge-&-vision-of-what-is-&-is-not the-path factor of exertion for full purity, the purity-of-knowledge-&-vision-of-the-way factor of exertion for full purity, the purity-of-knowledge-&-vision factor of exertion for full purity, the purity-of-discernment factor of exertion for full purity, the purity-of-release factor of exertion for full purity.[21]

"These nine dhammas should be developed.

• "Which nine dhammas should be comprehended? Nine abodes for beings: There are beings with multiplicity of body & multiplicity of perception, such as human beings, some devas, and some beings in the lower realms. This is the first abode for beings.

"There are beings with multiplicity of body & singularity of perception, such as the devas of Brahmā's retinue generated by the first (jhāna). This is the second abode for beings.

"There are beings with singularity of body & multiplicity of perception, such as the Radiant Devas. This is the third abode for beings.

"There are beings with singularity of body & singularity of perception, such as the Beautiful Black Devas. This is the fourth abode for beings.

"There are beings who are non-percipient, insensitive, such as the Non-percipient-being Devas. This is the fifth abode for beings.

"There are beings who, with the complete transcending of perceptions of (physical) form, with the disappearance of perceptions of resistance, and not attending to perceptions of multiplicity, (perceiving,) 'Infinite

space,' arrive at the dimension of the infinitude of space. This is the sixth abode for beings.

"There are beings who, with the complete transcending of the dimension of the infinitude of space, (perceiving,) 'Infinite consciousness,' arrive at the dimension of the infinitude of consciousness. This is the seventh abode for beings.

"There are beings who, with the complete transcending of the dimension of the infinitude of consciousness, (perceiving,) 'There is nothing,' arrive at the dimension of nothingness. This is the eighth abode for beings.

"There are beings who, with the complete transcending of the dimension of nothingness, arrive at the dimension of neither perception nor non-perception. This is the ninth abode for beings.

"These nine dhammas should be comprehended.

• "Which nine dhammas should be abandoned? Nine dhammas rooted in craving: seeking is dependent on craving; acquisition is dependent on seeking;

ascertainment is dependent on acquisition; desire & passion is dependent on ascertainment; attachment is dependent on desire & passion; possessiveness is dependent on attachment; stinginess is dependent on possessiveness; defensiveness is dependent on stinginess; and because of defensiveness, dependent on defensiveness, various evil, unskillful phenomena come into play: the taking up of sticks & knives; conflicts, quarrels, & disputes; accusations, divisive speech, & lies.[22]

"These nine dhammas should be abandoned.

• "Which nine dhammas are on the side of decline? Nine grounds for hatred: "(Thinking,) 'He has done me harm,' one binds hatred. 'He is doing me harm,' one binds hatred. 'He is going to do me harm,' one binds hatred. 'He has done harm to people who are dear & pleasing to me,' one binds hatred. 'He is doing harm to people who are dear & pleasing to me,' one binds hatred. 'He is going to do harm to people who are dear & pleasing to me,' one binds hatred. 'He has aided people who are not dear or pleasing to me,' one binds hatred. 'He is aiding people who are not dear

or pleasing to me,' one binds hatred. 'He is going to aid people who are not dear or pleasing to me,' one binds hatred.

"These nine dhammas are on the side of decline.

• "Which nine dhammas are on the side of distinction? Nine ways of subduing hatred: (Thinking,) 'He has done me harm. But what should I expect?' one subdues hatred. 'He is doing me harm. But what should I expect?' one subdues hatred. 'He is going to do me harm. But what should I expect?' one subdues hatred. 'He has done harm to people who are dear & pleasing to me. But what should I expect?' one subdues hatred. 'He is doing harm to people who are dear & pleasing to me. But what should I expect?' one subdues hatred. 'He is going to do harm to people who are dear & pleasing to me. But what should I expect?' one subdues hatred. 'He has aided people who are not dear or pleasing to me. But what should I expect?' one subdues hatred. 'He is aiding people who are not dear or pleasing to me. But what should I expect?' one subdues hatred. 'He is going to aid people who are not dear or pleasing to me. But what should I expect?' one subdues hatred.

"These nine dhammas are on the side of distinction.

• "Which nine dhammas are hard to penetrate? Nine multiplicities: Dependent on a multiplicity of properties, there arises a multiplicity of contacts. Dependent on a multiplicity of contacts, there arises a multiplicity of feelings. Dependent on a multiplicity of feelings, there arises a multiplicity of perceptions. Dependent on a multiplicity of perceptions, there arises a multiplicity of resolves. Dependent on a multiplicity of resolves, there arises a multiplicity of desires. Dependent on a multiplicity of desires, there arises a multiplicity of fevers. Dependent on a multiplicity of fevers, there arises a multiplicity of searches. Dependent on a multiplicity of searches, there arises a multiplicity of gains.

"These nine dhammas are hard to penetrate.

• "Which nine dhammas should be made to arise? Nine perceptions: the perception of unattractiveness, the perception of death, the perception of loathsomeness in food, the perception of distaste for every world, the perception of inconstancy, the perception of stress in what is inconstant, the perception of not-self in what is stressful, the perception of

abandoning, the perception of dispassion.[23] These nine dhammas should be made to arise.

• "Which nine dhammas should be directly known? Nine step-by-step dwellings: There is the case, friends, where a monk, quite secluded from sensuality, secluded from unskillful qualities, enters & remains in the first jhāna: rapture & pleasure born of seclusion, accompanied by directed thought & evaluation.

"With the stilling of directed thoughts & evaluations, he enters & remains in the second jhāna: rapture & pleasure born of concentration, unification of awareness free from directed thought & evaluation—internal assurance.

"With the fading of rapture, he remains equanimous, mindful, & alert, and senses pleasure with the body. He enters & remains in the third jhāna, of which the noble ones declare, 'Equanimous & mindful, he has a pleasant abiding.'

"With the abandoning of pleasure & pain—as with the earlier disappearance of joy & distress—he enters & remains in the fourth jhāna: purity of equanimity & mindfulness, neither pleasure nor pain.

"With the complete transcending of perceptions of (physical) form, with the disappearance of perceptions of resistance, and not attending to perceptions of multiplicity, (perceiving,) 'Infinite space,' he enters & remains in the dimension of the infinitude of space.

"With the complete transcending of the dimension of the infinitude of space, (perceiving,) 'Infinite consciousness,' he enters & remains in the dimension of the infinitude of consciousness.

"With the complete transcending of the dimension of the infinitude of consciousness, (perceiving,) 'There is nothing,' he enters & remains in the dimension of nothingness.

"With the complete transcending of the dimension of nothingness, he enters & remains in the dimension of neither perception nor non-perception.

"With the complete transcending of the dimension of neither perception nor non-perception, he enters & remains in the cessation of perception & feeling.

"These nine dhammas should be directly known.

• "Which nine dhammas should be realized? Nine step-by-step cessations: When one has attained the first jhāna, the perception of sensuality has ceased. When one has attained the second jhāna, directed thoughts & evaluations [verbal fabrications] have ceased. When one has attained the third jhāna, rapture has ceased. When one has attained the fourth jhāna, in-&-out breaths [bodily fabrications] have ceased. When one has attained the dimension of the infinitude of space, the perception of forms has ceased. When one has attained the dimension of the infinitude of consciousness, the perception of the dimension of the infinitude of space has ceased. When one has attained the dimension of nothingness, the perception of the dimension of the infinitude of consciousness has ceased. When one has attained the dimension of neither perception nor non-perception, the perception of the dimension of nothingness has ceased. When one has attained the cessation of perception & feeling, perceptions & feelings [mental fabrications] have ceased.[24]

"These nine dhammas should be realized.

"These ninety dhammas—true, genuine, real, not unreal, not otherwise—have been rightly awakened to by the Tathāgata.

### Tens

"Ten dhammas, friends, are very helpful. Ten dhammas should be developed. Ten dhammas should be comprehended. Ten dhammas should be abandoned. Ten dhammas are on the side of decline. Ten dhammas are on the side of distinction. Ten dhammas are hard to penetrate. Ten dhammas should be made to arise. Ten dhammas should be directly known. Ten dhammas should be realized.

• "Which ten dhammas are very helpful? Ten qualities creating a protector: There is the case, friends, where a monk is virtuous. He dwells restrained in accordance with the Pāṭimokkha, consummate in his behavior & sphere of activity. He trains himself, having undertaken the training rules, seeing danger in the slightest faults. And the fact that he is virtuous… seeing danger in the slightest faults is a quality creating a protector.

"And further, the monk has heard much, has retained what he has heard, has stored what he has heard. Whatever teachings are admirable in the beginning, admirable in the middle, admirable in the end, that—in their meaning and expression—proclaim the holy life that is entirely perfect, surpassingly pure: Those he has listened to often, retained, discussed, accumulated, examined with his mind, & well penetrated in terms of his views. And the fact that he has heard much… well penetrated in terms of his views is a quality creating a protector.

"And further, the monk has admirable friends, admirable comrades, admirable companions. And the fact that he has admirable friends, admirable comrades, admirable companions is a quality creating a protector.

"And further, the monk is easy to speak to, endowed with qualities that make him easy to speak to, patient, respectful to instruction. And the fact that he is easy to speak to… respectful to instruction is a quality creating a protector.

"And further, the monk is adept at the various affairs involving his companions in the holy life, is vigorous, quick-witted in the techniques involved in them, is up to doing them or arranging to get them done. And the fact that he is adept at… doing them or arranging to get them done is a quality creating a protector.

"And further, the monk is one who desires the Dhamma, endearing in his conversation, greatly rejoicing in the higher Dhamma & higher Vinaya. And the fact that he is one who desires the Dhamma, endearing in his conversation, greatly rejoicing in the higher Dhamma & higher Vinaya is a quality creating a protector.

"And further, the monk keeps his persistence aroused for abandoning unskillful qualities and for taking on skillful qualities. He is steadfast, solid in his effort, not shirking his duties with regard to skillful qualities. And the fact that he keeps his persistence aroused… not shirking his duties with regard to skillful qualities is a quality creating a protector.

"And further, the monk is content with any old robe cloth at all, any old alms food, any old lodging, any old medicinal requisites for curing sickness at all. And the fact that he is content with any old robe cloth at

all, any old alms food, any old lodging, any old medicinal requisites for curing sickness at all is a quality creating a protector.

"And further, the monk is mindful, endowed with excellent proficiency in mindfulness, remembering & recollecting what was done & said a long time ago. And the fact that he is mindful, endowed with excellent proficiency in mindfulness, remembering & recollecting what was done & said a long time ago is a quality creating a protector.

"And further, the monk is discerning, endowed with discernment of arising & passing away—noble, penetrating, leading to the right ending of stress. And the fact that the monk is discerning, endowed with discernment of arising & passing away—noble, penetrating, leading to the right ending of stress is a quality creating a protector.

"These ten dhammas are very helpful.

• "Which ten dhammas should be developed? Ten totality-dimensions: One perceives the earth-totality above, below, all-around: non-dual *[advayaṁ],* immeasurable. One perceives the water-totality… the fire-totality… the wind-totality… the blue-totality… the yellow-totality… the red-totality… the white-totality… the space-totality… the consciousness-totality above, below, all-around: non-dual, immeasurable. These ten dhammas should be developed.

• "Which ten dhammas should be comprehended? Ten sense media: the sense medium of the eye, the sense medium of forms; the sense medium of the ear, the sense medium of sounds; the sense medium of the nose, the sense medium of aromas; the sense medium of the tongue, the sense medium of flavors; the sense medium of the body, the sense medium of tactile sensations. These ten dhammas should be comprehended.

• "Which ten dhammas should be abandoned? Ten forms of wrongness: wrong view, wrong resolve, wrong speech, wrong action, wrong livelihood, wrong effort, wrong mindfulness, wrong concentration, wrong knowledge, wrong release. These ten dhammas should be abandoned.

• "Which ten dhammas are on the side of decline? Ten unskillful courses of action: taking life, taking what is not given, sexual misconduct,

telling lies, divisive speech, harsh speech, idle chatter, greed, ill will, wrong view. These ten dhammas are on the side of decline.

• "Which ten dhammas are on the side of distinction? Ten skillful courses of action: refraining from taking life, refraining from taking what is not given, refraining from sexual misconduct, refraining from telling lies, refraining from divisive speech, refraining from harsh speech, refraining from idle chatter, non-greed, non-ill will, right view.[25] These ten dhammas are on the side of distinction.

• "Which ten dhammas are hard to penetrate? Ten noble abodes: There is the case, friends, where a monk has abandoned five factors, is endowed with six, guards one, is supported in four, has shaken off idiosyncratic truths, has thoroughly given up searching, is undisturbed in his resolves, is calmed in his bodily-fabrication, is well released in mind, is well released in discernment.

"And how has a monk abandoned five factors? There is the case where a monk's sensual desire is abandoned. His ill will… His sloth & torpor… His restlessness & anxiety… His uncertainty is abandoned. This is how a monk has abandoned five factors.

"And how is a monk endowed with six (factors)? There is the case where a monk, on seeing a form via the eye, is neither gladdened nor saddened, but remains equanimous, mindful, & alert. On hearing a sound via the ear… On smelling an aroma via the nose… On tasting a flavor via the tongue… On touching a tactile sensation via the body… On cognizing an idea via the intellect, he is neither gladdened nor saddened, but remains equanimous, mindful, & alert. This is how a monk is endowed with six (factors).

"And how does a monk guard one (factor)? There is the case where a monk is endowed with an awareness guarded by mindfulness. This is how a monk guards one (factor).

"And how is a monk supported in four (ways)? There is the case where a monk, carefully reflecting, associates with one thing, acquiesces to another, avoids another, & subdues another. This is how a monk is supported in four (ways).[26]

"And how has a monk shaken off idiosyncratic truths *[pacceka-sacca]*? There is the case where a monk has shaken off the run-of-the-mill idiosyncratic truths of run-of-the-mill contemplatives & brahmans—in other words, 'The cosmos is eternal,' 'The cosmos is not eternal,' 'The cosmos is finite,' 'The cosmos is infinite,' 'The soul & the body are the same,' 'The soul is one thing and the body another,' 'After death a Tathāgata exists,' 'After death a Tathāgata does not exist,' 'After death a Tathāgata both does & does not exist,' 'After death a Tathāgata neither does nor does not exist.' All of these he has thrown off, shaken off, renounced, vomited up, let go, abandoned, relinquished. This is how a monk has shaken off idiosyncratic truths.

"And how has a monk thoroughly given up searching? There is the case where a monk has abandoned his search for sensuality, has abandoned his search for becoming, and has allayed his search for a holy life. This is how a monk has thoroughly given up searching.

"And how is a monk undisturbed in his resolves? There is the case where a monk has abandoned his resolve for sensuality… his resolve for ill-will… his resolve for harmfulness. This is how a monk is undisturbed in his resolves.

"And how is a monk calmed in his bodily fabrication? There is the case where a monk, with the abandoning of pleasure & pain—as with the earlier disappearance of elation & distress—enters & remains in the fourth jhāna: purity of equanimity & mindfulness, neither pleasure nor pain. This is how a monk is calmed in his bodily fabrication.

"And how is a monk well released in mind? There is the case where a monk's mind is released from passion, released from aversion, released from delusion. This is how a monk is well released in mind.

"And how is a monk well released in discernment? There is the case where a monk discerns, 'Passion is abandoned in me, its root destroyed, made like a palmyra stump, deprived of the conditions of development, not destined for future arising.' He discerns, 'Aversion is abandoned in me, its root destroyed, made like a palmyra stump, deprived of the conditions of development, not destined for future arising.' He discerns, 'Delusion is abandoned in me, its root destroyed, made like a palmyra stump, deprived

of the conditions of development, not destined for future arising.' This is how a monk is well released in discernment.

"These ten dhammas are hard to penetrate.

• "Which ten dhammas should be made to arise? Ten perceptions: the perception of unattractiveness, the perception of death, the perception of loathsomeness in food, the perception of distaste for every world, the perception of inconstancy, the perception of stress in what is inconstant, the perception of not-self in what is stressful, the perception of abandoning, the perception of dispassion, the perception of cessation.[27] These ten dhammas should be made to arise.

• "Which ten dhammas should be directly known? Ten grounds for abolishing: In one of right view, wrong view is abolished. The many evil, unskillful qualities that come into play with wrong view as their condition are also abolished, while the many skillful qualities that have right view as their condition go to the culmination of their development. In one of right resolve, wrong resolve is abolished.... In one of right speech, wrong speech is abolished.... In one of right action, wrong action is abolished.... In one of right livelihood, wrong livelihood is abolished.... In one of right effort, wrong effort is abolished.... In one of right mindfulness, wrong mindfulness is abolished.... In one of right concentration, wrong concentration is abolished.... In one of right knowledge, wrong knowledge is abolished.... In one of right release, wrong release is abolished. The many evil, unskillful qualities that come into play with wrong release as their condition are also abolished, while the many skillful qualities that have right release as their condition go to the culmination of their development.

"These ten dhammas should be directly known.

• "Which ten dhammas should be realized? Ten qualities of one beyond training: the right view of one beyond training, the right resolve of one beyond training, the right speech of one beyond training, the right action of one beyond training, the right livelihood of one beyond training, the right effort of one beyond training, the right mindfulness of one beyond training, the right concentration of one beyond training, the right knowledge of one beyond training, the right release of one beyond training. These ten dhammas should be realized.

"These one hundred dhammas—true, genuine, real, not unreal, not otherwise—have been rightly awakened to by the Tathāgata."

That is what Ven. Sāriputta said. Gratified, the monks delighted in Ven. Sāriputta's words.

## Notes

1. See SN 16:11, note 6.

2. This concentration, mentioned in Sn 2:1, is apparently equivalent to the concentration that is the fruit of gnosis, mentioned in AN 9:37.

3. *Akuppa.* This term is sometimes translated as "unshakable," but it literally means, "unprovoked." The reference is apparently to the theory of *dhātu,* or properties underlying physical or psychological events in nature. The physical properties according to this theory are four: earth (solidity), liquid, heat, and wind (motion). Three of them—liquid, heat, & wind—are potentially active. When they are aggravated, agitated, or provoked—the Pali term here, *pakuppati,* is used also on the psychological level, where it means angered or upset—they act as the underlying cause for natural activity. When the provocation ends, the corresponding activity subsides. (See the description of the physical properties in MN 28.)

A similar theory attributes the irruption of mental states to the provocation of the properties of sensuality, form, or formlessness.

> "In dependence on the property of sensuality there occurs the perception of sensuality. In dependence on the perception of sensuality there occurs the resolve for sensuality… the desire for sensuality… the fever for sensuality… the quest for sensuality. Searching for sensuality, monks, an uninstructed run-of-the-mill person conducts himself wrongly through three means: through body, through speech, & through mind."—*SN 14:12*

Even unbinding is described as a property (Iti 44). However, there is a crucial difference in how unbinding is attained, in that the unbinding property is not provoked. Any events that depend on the provocation of a property are inherently unstable and inconstant, subject to change when the provocation ends. But because true release is not caused by the provocation of anything, it is not subject to change.

Thus, knowledge of the unprovoked or unprovoked knowledge would be knowledge of unbinding.

4. See AN 3:47–48.

5. See MN 4.

6. See SN 12:63–64.

7. See AN 4:179.

8. See AN 5:28.

9. See AN 3:71.

10. See AN 7:6.

11. See SN 46:52.

12. See MN 53 and AN 7:63.

13. See AN 7:64.

14. See AN 10:60.

15. The second jhāna.

16. See AN 8:2.

17. See SN 45:8.

18. See AN 8:6.

19. These are identical with the nine inopportune, untimely situations for leading the holy life listed in DN 33, omitting one situation: The Tathāgata appears in the world, but one is reborn at that time as an asura.

20. For more detail on the thoughts of a great person, see AN 8:30. For more information on objectification, see the Introduction to MN 18.

21. See MN 24 for a discussion of the first seven of these purities.

22. See DN 15.

23. See AN 10:60.

24. See MN 44.

25. See AN 10:165.

26. For a discussion of the things to be acquiesced to, avoided, and destroyed, see MN 2.

27. See AN 10:60.

# *Glossary*

## Pali-English

*Abhidhamma:* (1) In the discourses of the Pali Canon, this term simply means "higher Dhamma," and a systematic attempt to define the Buddha's teachings and understand their interrelationships. (2) A later collection of treatises collating lists of categories drawn from the teachings in the discourses, added to the Canon several centuries after the Buddha's life.

*Ājīvaka:* An ascetic belonging to any one of a group of schools that, for various reasons, taught that morality was nothing more than a social convention and that human action was either unreal, totally predetermined, or powerless to effect results. See DN 2.

*Arahant:* A "worthy one" or "pure one;" a person whose mind is free of defilement and thus is not destined for further rebirth. A title for the Buddha and the highest level of his noble disciples.

*Āsava:* Effluent; fermentation. Four qualities—sensuality, views, becoming, and ignorance—that "flow out" of the mind and create the flood of the round of death and rebirth.

*Asura:* A member of a race of beings who, like the Titans in Greek mythology, battled the devas for sovereignty in heaven and lost.

*Bhikkhu:* A Buddhist monk.

*Bodhisatta:* "A being (striving) for awakening;" the term used to describe the Buddha before he actually became Buddha, from his first aspiration to Buddhahood until the time of his full awakening. Sanskrit form: Bodhisattva.

*Brahman:* In common usage, a brahman is a member of the priestly caste, which claimed to be the highest caste in India, based on birth. In a specifically Buddhist usage, "brahman" can also mean an arahant, conveying the point that excellence is based, not on birth or race, but on the qualities attained in the mind.

*Brahmā:* An inhabitant of the heavenly realms of form or formlessness.

*Deva:* Literally, "shining one." An inhabitant of the terrestrial or heavenly realms higher than the human.

*Dhamma:* (1) Event; action; (2) a phenomenon in & of itself; (3) mental quality; (4) doctrine, teaching; (5) *nibbāna* (although there are passages describing nibbāna as the abandoning of all dhammas). Sanskrit form: *Dharma.*

*Gandhabba:* (1) A celestial musician, the lowest level of celestial deva. (2) A being about to take birth.

*Gotama:* The Buddha's clan name.

*Indra (Inda):* King of the devas of the Heaven of the Thirty-three. Another name for Sakka.

*Jhāna:* Mental absorption. A state of strong concentration focused on a single sensation or mental notion. This term is derived from the verb *jhāyati,* which means to burn with a steady, still flame.

*Kamma:* Intentional act. Sanskrit form: *Karma.*

*Māra:* The personification of temptation and all forces, within and without, that create obstacles to release from *saṁsāra.*

*Meru:* A mountain at the center of the universe where devas are said to dwell.

*Nāga:* A magical serpent, technically classed as a common animal, but possessing many of the powers of a deva, including the ability to take on human shape. Sometimes this term is used metaphorically, in the sense of "Great One," to indicate an arahant.

*Nibbāna:* Literally, the "unbinding" of the mind from passion, aversion, and delusion, and from the entire round of death and rebirth. As this term also denotes the extinguishing of a fire, it carries connotations of stilling, cooling, and peace. "Total nibbāna" in some contexts denotes the experience of awakening; in others, the final passing away of an arahant. Sanskrit form: Nirvāṇa.

*Nigaṇṭha:* Literally, one without ties. An ascetic in the Jain religion.

*Pali:* The name of the Canon that forms the basis for the Theravāda and, by extension, the language in which it was composed.

*Paṭicca-samuppāda:* Dependent co-arising; dependent origination. A map showing the way ignorance and craving interact with the aggregates *(khandha)* and sense media *(āyatana)* to bring about stress and suffering. As the interactions are complex, there are several different versions of paṭicca samuppāda given in the suttas. In the most common one (given, for example, in SN 12:2), the map starts with ignorance. In another common one (given here in DN 15), the map starts with the interrelation between name *(nāma)* and form *(rūpa)* on the one hand, and sensory consciousness on the other.

*Pāṭimokkha:* Basic code of monastic discipline, composed of 227 rules for monks and 311 for nuns.

*Pavāraṇā:* Invitation; a monastic ceremony marking the end of the rains retreat on the full moon in October. During the ceremony, each monk invites his fellow monks to accuse him of any offenses they may have suspected him of having committed.

*Rāhu:* An asura who, according to legend, tried to swallow the sun. He is now a head with no body who still tries to swallow the sun and moon—thus causing solar and lunar eclipses—but his lack of a body means that such eclipses last only a short while.

*Rakkhasa:* A fierce spirit said to dwell in bodies of water.

*Sakka:* King of the devas of the Heaven of the Thirty-three. Another name for Indra.

*Sakya:* The Buddha's family name.

*Samaṇa:* Contemplative. Literally, a person who abandons the conventional obligations of social life in order to find a way of life more "in tune" *(sama)* with the ways of nature.

*Saṁsāra:* Transmigration; the process of wandering through repeated states of becoming, with their attendant death and rebirth.

*Saṁvega:* A sense of chastened dismay over the meaninglessness and futility of life as it is ordinarily lived, combined with a strong sense of urgency in looking for a way out.

*Saṅgha:* On the conventional *(sammati)* level, this term denotes the communities of Buddhist monks and nuns. On the ideal *(ariya)* level, it

denotes those followers of the Buddha, lay or ordained, who have attained at least stream-entry.

*Stūpa:* A memorial to a dead person, derived from the form of a burial mound.

*Sutta:* Discourse. Sanskrit form: *sūtra.*

*Tādin:* "Such," an adjective to describe one who has attained the goal. It indicates that the person's state is indefinable but not subject to change or influences of any sort.

*Tathāgata:* Literally, "one who has become authentic *(tatha-āgata)* or is truly gone *(tathā-gata)*": an epithet used in ancient India for a person who has attained the highest religious goal. In Buddhism, it usually denotes the Buddha, although occasionally it also denotes any of his arahant disciples.

*Uposatha:* Observance day, coinciding with the full moon, new moon, and half moons. Lay Buddhists often observe the eight precepts on this day. Monks recite the Pāṭimokkha on the full moon and new moon uposathas.

*Vinaya:* The monastic discipline, whose rules and traditions comprise six volumes in printed text. The Buddha's own term for the religion he founded was "this Dhamma & Vinaya."

*Yakkha:* Spirit; a lower level of deva—sometimes friendly to human beings, sometimes not—often dwelling in trees or other wild places.

## English-Pali

Although I have tried to be as consistent as possible in rendering Pali terms into English, there are a few cases where a single English term will not do justice to all the meanings of a Pali term. Although the rule of one English equivalent per one Pali word makes for consistency, any truly bilingual person will know that such a rule can create ludicrous distortions in translation. Thus, while I have generally tried to avoid using one English term to translate two different Pali terms, there are cases where I have found it necessary to render single Pali terms with two or more English terms, depending on context. *Citta* in some cases is rendered as mind, in others as heart, and in still others as intent. Similarly, *loka* is rendered either as cosmos or world, *manas* as intellect or heart, *āyatana* as medium or dimension, *upādāna* as clinging or sustenance, and dhamma as phenomenon, quality, or principle. If you see the word *heart* in a prose passage, it is translating *citta;* if in a passage of poetry, it is translating *manas.*

Also, for some of the Pali terms playing a central role in the teaching, I have chosen equivalents that do not follow general usage. In the following list I have marked these equivalents with asterisks. Explanations for these choices are provided at the end of the list.

acceptance — *upasampadā*

acquisition — *upadhi*

aggregate — *khandha*

alertness — *sampajaññña*

appropriate attention — *yoniso manasikāra*

ardency — *ātappa*

awakening — *bodhi*

awareness — *cetas*

awareness-release — *cetovimutti*

becoming — *bhava*

clear knowing — *vijjā*

clinging* — *upādāna*

compunction — *ottappa*

contemplative — *samaṇa*
conviction — *saddhā*
cosmos — *loka*
craving — *taṇhā*
dependent co-arising — *paṭicca samuppāda*
desire — *chanda*
dimension — *āyatana*
directed thought — *vitakka*
discern — *pajānāti*
discernment — *paññā*
discernment-release — *paññāvimutti*
discrimination — *vimaṁsā*
disenchantment — *nibbidā*
dispassion — *virāga*
dissonant — *visama*
effluent* — *āsava*
emptiness — *suññatā*
enlightened one* — *dhīra*
establishing of mindfulness — *satipaṭṭhāna*
evaluation — *vicāra*
fabricated — *saṅkhata*
fabrication — *saṅkhāra*
fetter — *saṅyojana*
gnosis — *aññā*
goodwill — *mettā*
habit — *sīla*
harmonious* — *sama*
heart — *manas; citta*

identity — *sakkāya*
inconstant* — *anicca*
insight — *vipassanā*
intellect — *manas*
intent — *citta*
intention — *cetanā*
medium — *āyatana*
mind — *citta*
non-fashioning — *atammayatā*
not-self — *anattā*
objectification* — *papañca*
obsession* — *anusaya*
origination — *samudaya*
perception — *saññā*
persistence — *viriya*
phenomenon — *dhamma*
precept — *sīla*
property — *dhātu*
quality — *dhamma*
release — *vimutti*
resolve — *saṅkappa*
self-awakening — *sambodhi*
self-identification — *sakkāya*
sensuality — *kāma*
shame — *hiri*
skillful — *kusala*
stream-entry — *sotāpatti*
stress* — *dukkha*

sustenance* — *upādāna*

theme — *nimitta*

tranquility — *samatha*

transcendent — *lokuttara*

unbinding* — *nibbāna*

unfabricated — *asaṅkhata*

virtue — *sīla*

world — *loka*

*Acquisition: Upadhi* literally means "belongings," "baggage," "paraphernalia." In the suttas, it means the mental baggage that the mind carries around. The Cūḷaniddesa, a late canonical work, lists ten types of *upadhi:* craving, views, defilement, action, misconduct, nutriment (physical and mental), irritation, the four physical properties sustained in the body (earth, water, wind, and fire), the six external sense media, and the six forms of corresponding sensory consciousness. The state without *upadhi* or acquisitions is unbinding.

*Aggregate:* Any of the five types of phenomena that serve as objects of clinging and as bases for a sense of self: form, feeling, perception, mental fabrications, and consciousness.

*Becoming:* The processes of giving rise, within the mind, to states of being that allow for physical or mental birth on any of three levels: the level of sensuality, the level of form, and the level of formlessness.

*Clinging/sustenance:* The Pali term *upādāna,* which is used both on the physical and psychological levels, carries a double meaning on both levels. On the physical level, it denotes both the fuel of a fire and to the fire's act of clinging to its fuel. On the psychological level, it denotes both the sustenance for becoming that the mind clings to, and to the act of clinging to its sustenance. To capture these double meanings, I have sometimes rendered *upādāna* as clinging, sometimes as sustenance, and sometimes as both.

*Enlightened one:* Throughout these suttas I have rendered *buddha* as "Awakened," and *dhīra* as "enlightened." As Jan Gonda points out in his book, *The Vision of the Vedic Poets,* the word *dhīra* was used in Vedic and

Buddhist poetry to mean a person who has the heightened powers of mental vision needed to perceive the "light" of the underlying principles of the cosmos, together with the expertise to implement those principles in the affairs of life and to reveal them to others. A person enlightened in this sense may also be awakened in the formal Buddhist sense, but is not necessarily so.

*Fabrication: Saṅkhāra* literally means "putting together," and carries connotations of jerry-rigged artificiality. It is applied to physical and to mental processes, as well as to the products of those processes. Various English words have been suggested as renderings for *saṅkhāra,* such as "formation," "determination," "force," and "constructive activity." However, "fabrication," in both of its senses, as the process of fabrication and the fabricated things that result, seems the best equivalent for capturing the connotations as well as the denotations of the term.

*Harmonious* and *Dissonant:* Throughout ancient cultures, the terminology of music was used to describe the moral quality of people and acts. Dissonant intervals or poorly-tuned musical instruments were metaphors for evil; harmonious intervals and well-tuned instruments were metaphors for good. In Pali, the term *sama*—"even"—describes an instrument tuned on-pitch; *visama* means off-pitch. AN 6:55 contains a famous passage where the Buddha reminds Soṇa Koḷivisa—who had been over-exerting himself in the practice—that a lute sounds appealing only if the strings are neither too taut nor too lax, but "evenly" tuned. This same terminology came to be applied to human actions, with the connotation that good actions were not only appealing, but also in tune with the true nature of the laws of action.

*Inconstant:* The usual rendering for *anicca* is "impermanent." However, the antonym of the term, *nicca,* carries connotations of constancy and reliability; and as *anicca* is used to emphasize the point that conditioned phenomena are unreliable as a basis for true happiness, this seems a useful rendering for conveying this point.

*Objectification:* The term *papañca* has entered popular usage in Buddhist circles to indicate obsessive, runaway thoughts that harass the mind. But in the suttas, the term is used to indicate, not the amount of thinking that harasses the mind, but the categories used in a particular type of thinking that harasses the mind and extends outward to create conflict with others.

Sn 4:14 states that the root of the categories of *papañca* is the perception, "I am the thinker." From this self-objectifying thought, in which one takes on the identity of a being, a number of categories can be derived: being/not-being, me/not-me, mine/not-mine, doer/done-to, feeder/food. This last pair of categories comes from the fact that, as a being, one has to lay claim to food, both physical and mental, to maintain that being (Khp 4). Thinking in terms of these categories inevitably leads to conflict, as different beings fight over their food. Because this harassment and conflict come from a self-objectifying thought that leads to the objectification of others as well, *objectification* seems to be the best English equivalent for *papañca.*

*Obsession: Anusaya* is usually translated as "underlying tendency" or "latent tendency." These translations are based on the etymology of the term, which literally means, "to lie down with." However, in actual usage, the related verb *(anuseti)* means to be obsessed with something, for one's thoughts to return and "lie down with it" (or, in our idiom, to "dwell on it") over and over again.

*Stress:* The Pali term *dukkha,* which is traditionally translated in the commentaries as, "that which is hard to bear," is notorious for having no truly adequate equivalent in English, but stress—in its basic sense as a strain on body or mind—seems as close as English can get. In the Canon, *dukkha* applies both to physical and to mental phenomena, ranging from the intense stress of acute anguish or pain to the innate burdensomeness of even the most subtle mental or physical fabrications.

*Unbinding:* Because *nibbāna* is used to denote not only the Buddhist goal, but also the extinguishing of a fire, it is usually rendered as "extinguishing" or, even worse, "extinction." However, a close look at ancient Indian views of the workings of fire (see *The Mind Like Fire Unbound)* shows that people of the Buddha's time felt that a fire, in going out, did not go out of existence but was simply freed from its agitation and attachment to its fuel. Thus, when applied to the Buddhist goal, the primary connotation of *nibbāna* is one of release and liberation. According to the commentaries, the literal meaning of the word *nibbāna* is "unbinding," and as this is a rare case where the literal and contextual meanings of a term coincide, this seems to be the ideal English equivalent.

# Table of Contents


Titlepage 1
Quotation 2
Copyright 3
Abbreviations 4
Acknowledgements 6
Introduction 8
A Note on the Translations 12
DN 1 The Brahmā Net | Brahmajāla Sutta 39
Introduction 39
Beginning of Sutta 46
The Lesser Section on Virtue 49
The Intermediate Section on Virtue 51
The Great Section on Virtue 53
View Standpoints 57
Theorists about the Past 57
Theorists about the Future 74
Agitation & Vacillation 84
Conditioned by Contact 86
No Other Possibility 87
Dependent Co-arising 89
The Net 90
DN 2 The Fruits of the Contemplative Life | Sāmaññaphala Sutta 97
Introduction 97
The King’s Question 100
Non-action 101
Purification through Wandering-on 102
Annihilation 103

Non-relatedness 104
Fourfold Restraint 105
Evasion 106
The First Visible Fruit of the Contemplative Life 107
The Second Visible Fruit of the Contemplative Life 109
Higher Fruits of the Contemplative Life 110
The Lesser Section on Virtue 111
The Intermediate Section on Virtue 112
The Great Section on Virtue 114
Sense Restraint 118
Mindfulness & Alertness 118
Contentedness 118
Abandoning the Hindrances 118
The Four Jhānas 120
Insight Knowledge 122
The Mind-made Body 123
Supranormal Powers 124
Clairaudience 125
Mind Reading 126
Recollection of Past Lives 127
The Passing Away & Re-appearance of Beings 128
The Ending of Effluents 129
DN 9 About Poṭṭhapāda | Poṭṭhapāda Sutta 133
Introduction 133
DN 11 To Kevaṭṭa | Kevaṭṭa Sutta 152
Introduction 152
The Miracle of Psychic Power 153
The Miracle of Telepathy 154
The Miracle of Instruction 154
Abandoning the Hindrances 155
The Four Jhānas 157
Insight Knowledge, etc. 158

Conversations with the devas 160
DN 12 To Lohicca | Lohicca Sutta 166
Abandoning the Hindrances 173
The Four Jhānas 175
Insight Knowledge, etc. 176
DN 15 The Great Causes Discourse | Mahā Nidāna Sutta 178
Introduction 178
Aging-&-Death 181
Birth 182
Becoming 182
Clinging 182
Craving 183
Dependent on Craving 183
Feeling 185
Contact 185
Name-&-Form 186
Consciousness 186
Delineations of a Self 187
Non-Delineations of a Self 188
Assumptions of a Self 189
The Monk Released 190
Seven Stations of Consciousness 191
Eight Emancipations 192
DN 16 The Great Total Unbinding Discourse | Mahā Parinibbāna Sutta 197
Introduction 197
[ I ] 202
[ II ] 217
[ III ] 226
[ IV ] 240
[ V ] 251
[ VI ] 263

DN 20 The Great Meeting | Mahā Samaya Sutta 283
Introduction 283
DN 21 Sakka's Questions (Excerpt) | Sakka-pañha Sutta 294
Introduction 294
DN 22 The Great Establishing of Mindfulness Discourse | Mahā Satipaṭṭhāna Sutta 305
Introduction 305
A. Body 310
B. Feelings 313
C. Mind 314
D. Mental Qualities 315
E. Conclusion 324
DN 26 The Wheel-turning Emperor (Excerpt) | Cakkavatti Sutta 335
Introduction 335
DN 29 The Inspiring Discourse | Pāsādika Sutta 339
A Poorly-expounded Dhamma-Vinaya 340
A Well-expounded Dhamma-Vinaya 342
The Complete Holy Life 343
That this Holy Life May Long Endure 348
The Pleasures of the Holy Life 349
The Tathāgata's Knowledge & Vision 353
DN 33 The Discourse for Reciting Together | Saṅgīti Sutta 365
DN 34 Progressing by Tens | Dasuttara Sutta 426
Glossary 470
Pali-English 470
English-Pali 473